Dual citizenship trends and their implication for the collection of migration statistics

Jason Schachter, Statistician
United Nations Economic Commission for Europe
UNECE/Eurostat Work Session on Migration Statistics
Chisinau, Republic of Moldova, 10-12 September, 2014
Introduction

- Increased globalization=>increased international migration
  - “Free” movement of people
  - Increased naturalization
  - Increased inter-country marriages and children
  - More countries allow “dual” citizenship, blurring of single “citizenship” concept

=> Presumed increase in number of dual citizens

- Any implication for migration statistics?
  - Citizenship-based
    - Data exchange: use of immigration statistics from countries of destination to measure emigration from countries of origin?
Other Research Questions

- To what extent are data on dual citizens collected by countries?
  - To what extent is it released?
- What is the magnitude of dual citizens?
  - Increasing over time?
- What are the characteristics of dual citizens?
  - Age
  - Sex
  - Country of origin
  - Other: mobility, education, labour force participation, etc.?
- Impact
  - Integration of migrants, diaspora engagement, etc.
Pathways toward Dual Citizenship

- Naturalization, while retaining citizenship of previous country
  - If allowed by country of origin and/or destination
- Born to parents of two different nationalities
- Children of immigrants born in destination country
- Ancestry
  - Grandparent
    - Italy (one paternal great grandfather)

- Number eligible for dual citizenship much greater than actual number
Reasons for Growth

- Large and circular migration flows
- Growing rates of naturalization
- “Jus sanguinis” in national legislation
- Children from increasing international marriages
- Reduction in warfare and military conscription
- Expansion of international human rights regime

- Increased acceptance over time (at least fewer countries forbidding it)
  - Many with restrictions
Swiss Marriage Example

Figure 1. Marriages by nationality in Switzerland: 1980-2012

Source: Swiss Federal Statistical Office
Acceptance of Dual Citizenship among UNECE countries (2013)

Acceptance of Dual Citizenship among UNECE countries

Source: UN Population Policy Database
Potential Impact on Migration Statistics

- Country of Citizenship vs. Country of Birth
  - Flows still usually reported by citizenship

- Use of immigration statistics to estimate (validate) emigration flows
  - 2009 UNECE Task Force

- When enter/leave country counted as citizen of that country
  - Potentially underestimates emigrants using immigration data from receiving countries
Swiss-Italian Example

- Migration Flows of Italian citizens to Switzerland: 1995 to 2003

![Bar chart showing migration flows from 1995 to 2003 between Switzerland and Italy. The chart compares immigration and emigration data provided by Switzerland and Italy, respectively. The x-axis represents years from 1995 to 2003, and the y-axis represents the number of persons.]
Magnitude of Dual Citizenship

- Lack of information on number of dual citizens
- Internationally recommended to be collected on censuses, but only about half of UNECE region does
  - Not in France, Germany, Italy, and the United States (though dual citizenship allowed)
- Information often missing from population registers
- Sometimes included on national household surveys (but sample size limitations)
- IF collected, often combined with nationals and/or not publically available
### Table 2. Stock of Dual-Citizens for Countries by Year (and percentage of resident population)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>2001</th>
<th>2006</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>Note</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Albania</td>
<td>28,309 (1.0%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Albanian and other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Armenia</td>
<td>9,015 (0.3%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Armenia and other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bulgaria</td>
<td>22,150 (0.3%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>870,255 (2.8%)</td>
<td>944,695 (2.9%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Multiple citizenship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Croatia</td>
<td>44,349 (1.0%)</td>
<td>84,855 (2.0%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finland</td>
<td>15,000 (0.3%) (2000)</td>
<td>54,912 (1.0%) (2010)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Finnish and other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hungary</td>
<td></td>
<td>88,906 (0.9%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Hungary and other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ireland</td>
<td>49,299 (1.3%)</td>
<td>45,123 (1.0%)</td>
<td>55,905 (1.2%)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Irish and other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montenegro</td>
<td></td>
<td>4,527 (0.7%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Montenegró and other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td>1,100,000 (6.6%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Dutch and other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poland</td>
<td>444,930 (1.2%)</td>
<td>327,400 (0.8%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Poland and other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portugal</td>
<td>127,253 (1.2%)</td>
<td>244,745 (2.0%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>All dual citizens</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romania</td>
<td>23,340 (0.1%)</td>
<td>43,005 (0.2%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>All dual citizens</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serbia</td>
<td>281,548 (0.4%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Serbia and other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slovakia</td>
<td>8,203 (0.2%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Multiple citizenship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>159,000 (0.4%) (2002)</td>
<td>577,270 (1.2%) (2012)</td>
<td>804,800 (1.8%)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Spanish and other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td>495,296 (6.9%) (2000)</td>
<td>688,561 (10.3%) (2012)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Swiss and other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK (England, Wales)</td>
<td></td>
<td>613,940 (1.1%)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>UK and other (passport)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. Incomplete due to use of register for many respondents
2. Census estimate, LFS estimate for same year was 624,000
3. 15 years and older only
- Number varies by country and population size
  - 1 million (Netherlands, Canada) to 8,000 (Slovakia)
  - 10% of Swiss population, 7% Dutch.
  - LT 1% in Bulgaria, Hungary, Montenegro, Romania, Serbia, Slovakia
  - Many large immigration receiving countries missing

- Trend: rapidly growing (growth in all countries: 100% or more between census periods)
  - Spain X5 between 2002 and 2014
  - Netherlands (Finland) tripled 1995 and 2009
Characteristics of Dual Citizens

- Limited characteristics publically released (age, sex, country of 2\textsuperscript{nd} citizenship)
- Characteristics differ by country context
  - Younger (Spain, Switzerland)
  - Older (Montenegro)
  - Female (Montenegro, Switzerland)
  - Male (Armenia)
  - New immigrants (Netherlands)
  - Neighboring countries (Albania, Armenia, Poland, Switzerland)
  - Former colonial/linguistic ties (Spain, Canada)
To what extent are immigration statistics hampered?

- Lack of data to determine impact
  - Stock data to evaluate flows
- In general, small percentage of population (except Switzerland, Netherlands), thus not likely to impact
- But in near future…
  - Rapidly growing population
  - If more mobile than general population
  - As more countries accept dual citizenship
  - Could impact citizen-based immigration data to measure emigration flows or size of diaspora
Implications and Future Work

- Still a need for increased data collection
  - Add questions to census, surveys, or other data sources
- Test accuracy of data received
  - To what extent do respondents accurately report dual-national status? (under or overreported?)
- Include dual citizenship information on publically released data
- Analysis of data at country level
  - Size, characteristics, impact of dual citizens