United Nations Economic Commission for Europe
Steering Committee on Education for Sustainable Development,
Fourteenth meeting

Outcomes of the first meeting and of the subsequent work
of the Ad hoc group for Strategic Planning: the draft
concept note for the post-2019 implementation
framework:

*Entrepreneurship, Employment, Innovation and ESD*

Geneva, 2 and 3 May 2019

Tatyana Shakirova,
CAREC ESD Programme manager

www.carececo.org
Entrepreneurship Employment and Innovation: the team

The teams of experts and supporters:

1. **Boglarka Ivanegova**, Senior state adviser at the Ministry of the Environment of the Slovak Republic

2. **Nevena Cabrilo**, Head of Department for International Cooperation and Public Relation at the Bureau for Educational Services of Montenegro

3. **Nino Gokhelashvili**, Head of Sustainable Development Division at Ministry of Environmental Protection and Agriculture, Georgia

4. **Prof Daniella Tilbury**, HMGOG Commissioner for Sustainable Development Honorary Fellow, University of Cambridge

5. **Tatyana Shakirova**, Manager of ESD Programme, the Regional Environmental Centre for Central Asia (CAREC)
1. Introduction
2. Learner competences for the 21st century
3. An active engagement of youth in learning and society
4. This proposal promotes 5 key areas for the active engagement of youth
   a) Innovation and Entrepreneurship
   b) Youth and Research and innovations
   c) Vocational Skills Training & Entrepreneurship
   d) Entrepreneurship and entrepreneurs
   e) Conceptual linkage between Innovation and Entrepreneurship
5. Challenges:
   a) Global challenges in education
   b) Unemployment and education
6. How can UNECE SC contribute? What activities, suggestions and actions can be undertaken till 2030 from the UNECE ESD SC
   i. To provide a guiding framework for 21st C competences
   ii. Representation at UNECE SC Meetings
   iii. Share the Good Practice Initiatives by:
   iv. VET and Green Economy: Digital Skills for Future
7. And finally...looking to learning from others
   ESD Major Programs in Ethiopia
   Experience of the Regional Centers of Expertise (RCEs) on ESD
Approaches and methodology

1. Desk research:
   - Terminology
   - Definitions
   - Inter-linkages between different concepts and definitions

2. Youth as a Target Group from the point of view of:
   - Youth’ role in social changes – agents of changes
   - Youth’ role in innovations – creativity, digital skills, motivation, “out of box” way of thinking
   - Youth entrepreneurship & Youth’ employment – green skills, new jobs, competences-based approach, skills for future, demanded by market

3. Good practices and examples:
   - Experience of the Regional Centers of Expertise (RCEs) on ESD

4. UNECE role and inputs until 2030

5. Partnership & cooperation – uniting efforts
Background: why Youth is a Target Group in this strand?

- According to the UN data (https://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/youth/), today more than one billion people fall within the age bracket 18 to 35, the largest group ever to make the transition to adulthood. Their numbers are expected to grow—between 2015 and 2030 alone, about 1.9 billion young people are projected to turn 15 years old.

- Connected to each other like never before, in the context of digital connectivity breakthroughs, young people are capable to contribute to the resilience of their communities, proposing innovative solutions to societal challenges and driving social progress.

- They are also agents of change, mobilizing to advance the Sustainable Development Goals to improve the lives of people and the health of the planet.

- Young people have the potential and motivation to drive the sustainable development movement and young activists and leaders, are both beneficiaries and drivers of this action area.

- Youth are also an important consumer group and the habits they develop now will have a major impact on future consumption patterns and societal transformations in general.
Entrepreneurship, Employment, Innovation and ESD: introduction

Youth, entrepreneurship, employment and innovation
The youth sector plays a vital role the transition towards a more sustainable future. Young people’s vision and energy can be the force that can drive dynamically the rest of society to new sustainable lifestyles and provide innovative solutions and alternatives for Sustainable Development. Investing on youth society, the world invests on the future. For doing that it is important young generation to have the skills and competencies to think out of the box, to be engaged and participate to decision making, to connect, to interact, to intervene for changing things to the better and according to SDGs as a global challenge and demand. ESD, as a transformational process, has a central role to educate, inspire and motivate young people to take actions for more resilient and sustainable communities.

Questions started our work in the group Entrepreneurship, Employment, Innovation and ESD:
• What is the state of play with regards to ESD and youth in your country?
• Which values and competencies are needed to engage and motivate youth with SDGs?
• How can ESD enhance youth creativity and ideas to move on sustainable Entrepreneurship and innovation?
• In which ways ESD can eliminate youth unemployment;
• In which direction VET education should be oriented for empowering youth to work with more sustainable patterns in industry, trade and market?
• How can Ad Hoc Group assist with upscaling efforts and ensuring more effective outcomes in this sector?
A. Introduction

68. In the 21st Century, our world is experiencing rapid change with global challenges becoming ever more complex. In this context, the support for, and empowerment of, youth is more important than ever.

69. ESD is needed to prepare young people to respond to this changing world, to motivate them to work towards solutions and to co-create more sustainable futures.

70. For that, as SDG 4.7 points out, young people need to acquire knowledge and skills needed to promote sustainable development. To enable a change in education for sustainability, it is necessary to strengthen partnerships and coordination between governments, civil society, business sector and youth themselves.

71. This proposal seeks to inform and promote the European Union Council Recommendation of 22 May 2018 on key competences for lifelong learning (Text with EEA relevance) (2018/C 189/01).

72. To provide opportunities for people to introduce and improve the Entrepreneurship competence which refers to the capacity to act upon opportunities and ideas, and to transform them into values for others. It is founded upon creativity, critical thinking and problem solving, taking initiative and perseverance and the ability to work collaboratively in order to plan and manage projects that are of cultural, social or financial value.
Strand 4: Entrepreneurship, employment, innovation and ESD

B. Definition for entrepreneurship and innovation
73. Entrepreneurship is held to promote wealth creation through innovation. Innovation and entrepreneurship can be seen as both a process and the corresponding outcome. It was emphasised that the concepts of change, innovation and creativity have been largely ignored by entrepreneurship researchers and vice versa, although, in their view they are integral components of entrepreneurship and a basic requirement for entrepreneurship research to become a more important management research field.

C. Achievements on entrepreneurship, employment, innovation and education for sustainable development
1. Learner competences for the 21st century
74. Learners’ competences for the future are defined as the 21st century skills that enable young learners to adopt sustainable lifestyles; to make informed decisions and choices and be responsible for their actions. In recent years there have been multiple initiatives to define what skills and competencies are necessary for youth to thrive. However, there is a need to translate definitions into practical frameworks and for guidance how they could be implemented. Scholars agree that the development of national frameworks containing clear-cut definitions of 21st century competences and addressing strategies to support and regulate its implementation and assessment are needed. They should be able to constantly learn, develop their knowledge about “green” and ICT technologies, enable the exchange of experiences, techniques and tools, build capacity and develop new skills for the new generation of graduates and, finally, make effective, environmentally friendly decisions in the future.
2. An active engagement of youth in learning and society

75. **ESD is about preparing the learner for an active role in society** oriented towards sustainability. In a context of active citizenship in society a key point of ESD is to develop a deep understanding of which sustainability issues are at stake, now and in the future. Sustainability issues are characterised by complexity and uncertainty, and as a result ESD needs to evolve itself in order to be able to provide skills and competences that enable to cope with this complexity and uncertainty. To deal with future sustainability issues, societies need to become flexible, adaptive and resilient.

This proposal promotes five key areas for the active engagement of youth:

**Innovation and entrepreneurship**

76. **Youth entrepreneurship must be recognised as a key factor in economic development** in the next period and a means of improving wellbeing, preventing brain drain and tackling unemployment. Students need to experience what it would be like to run a business, increase confidence and think about business ideas or starting their own business in accordance to SDGs and green technologies. It helps youth to develop skills such as critical thinking, problem solving, creativity, planning and organization.

77. There is a common definition of innovation in the OECD’s Oslo manual: An ‘innovation’ is the implementation of a new or significantly improved product (goods or service), or process, a new marketing method, or a new organisational method in business practices, workplace organisation or external relations. It involves a change that creates new conditions for economic activity, either for individual companies, on a market or globally. There are four descriptions of entrepreneurship that have become dominant in the research: the entrepreneur as an innovator (Schumpeter), as an arbitrager/creator of balance, as a bearer of uncertainty (Frank Knight), and the entrepreneur as a coordinator (Jean-Baptiste Say). Schumpeter’s innovator is the definition that makes the most distinct connection between entrepreneurship, innovations and economic growth.
Youth and research and innovations

78. It is critically important to engage youth in research, innovations exchange and support their innovative ideas in business. Today there are many activities supported various innovative research clusters and project incubators, which enable students and young professionals to think creatively. Young entrepreneurs could be encouraged to undertake science to benefit society, perhaps in the areas of economy, environment, water and agriculture. This promotes deployment and application of innovative environmental policies, approaches and techniques.

4. Vocational skills training and entrepreneurship

79. ESD and TVET play a great role in development of Youth’ skills and competences demanded by market. What our young people do today will create the foundations for what our economies will do tomorrow. Youth have difficulties in the labour market because of lack of work relevant skills, lack of information and connections for acquiring appropriate skills. Vocational skills training and entrepreneurship interventions aim at developing equitable hands on skills and entrepreneurial skills that can ensure equitable access to labour market which are directly linked with gainful employment opportunities for underprivileged youth.

5. Entrepreneurship and entrepreneurs

80. The entrepreneurship plays an important role of in economy and society. In a highly interconnected world, building a culture that supports entrepreneurship and equipping young people with entrepreneurial mind sets and competences is crucial for the job creation and economic growth. Entrepreneurship as a competence applies to all spheres of life. It enables citizens to nurture their personal development, to actively contribute to social development, to enter the job market as employee or as self-employed, and to start-up or scale-up ventures which may have a cultural, social or commercial motive.
Conceptual linkage between innovation and entrepreneurship

81. Entrepreneurship and innovation are two common concepts in the political discussion and are often mentioned as conditions for economic growth and sustainable development. *Entrepreneurship is held to promote wealth creation through innovation.* Innovation and entrepreneurship can be seen as both a process and the corresponding outcome. The concepts of change, innovation and creativity are integral components of entrepreneurship and a basic requirement for entrepreneurship research to become a more important management research field.

D. Challenges on entrepreneurship, employment, innovation and education for sustainable development

1. Global challenges in education

82. Present and future global complexities mean that all learners must be equipped throughout their lives to navigate unexpected challenges. Whereas there has been very rapid technological change over the last 30 years, *education systems in many states have remained largely unchanged* over the last century. New technologies and innovations can be disruptive, but they also offer exciting opportunities to enhance the delivery of these skills and values. An important challenge is that *such education and learning need to be delivered effectively and appropriately*, taking account of different contextual conditions and demands, and without causing or reinforcing societal harms such as increasing inequality and conflict. It is also important that it delivers first for the most disadvantaged, taking especial note of gender, disability, age, ethnicity and other such potential axes of disadvantage.
83. An additional key challenge facing committed or applied research for ESD is a disconnect between the range of key actors and agencies and often poorly integrated roles that they perform. Even when academics, teachers, students, community representatives, companies and other stakeholders conform to a common vision about the future, the specific responsibilities and restrictions of their roles can mitigate against an adaptive transition that draws upon and generates social learning.

2. Unemployment and education

84. The study of entrepreneurship is still in its infancy. Barriers to evolutionary advances in entrepreneurship include the field's uneven development, its lack of consistency of terminology or method, and its relative isolation from developments in key informing fields. Young people worldwide are more likely to work longer hours under informal, intermittent and insecure work arrangements, characterized by low productivity, meagre earnings and reduced labour protection. In developing countries, young people, especially young women, make up the bulk of the underemployed and working poor in the informal economy in both rural and urban areas. Self-employment is often a survival strategy to generate some income for subsistence.
Activities, suggestions and actions that can be undertaken by the Steering Committee for the entrepreneurship, employment, innovation and ESD strand until 2030

1. **To provide a guiding framework for 21st century competences**

(a) Operational definition for the 21st century competences, which would allow for better planning and assessment of those across age levels and subjects.

(b) Clear identification between core subjects and 21st century competences.

(c) Compile information of publicly accessible tools to support entrepreneurship, employment and innovation and ESD (Digital Competence Framework for citizens (DigComp) and the Entrepreneurship Competence Framework (EntreComp), sharing of reports like the Global Entrepreneurship Monitor report, etc.).

(i) **Recommendations for educational staff** (managers, teachers, support staff) on how to nurture sustainable entrepreneurial mindsets in their students.

(ii) **Recommendations for government** - what can decision-makers do to support youth sustainable entrepreneurship.
Activities, suggestions and actions that can be undertaken by the Steering Committee for the entrepreneurship, employment, innovation and ESD strand until 2030

1. **To provide a guiding framework for 21st century competences**
   
   (a) Operational definition for the 21st century competences, which would allow for better planning and assessment of those across age levels and subjects.

   1. **Clear goal is very important! More time for discussion! Ultimate objective!**
   2. **Expert group: in-kind contribution on volunteer basis! Expand the group! New ideas are welcome! Fast-responding group**

3. **Urgent need for our leaners – 21st century competences – how to start with this activity:**

   - What are the 1st steps for this activity: to link the competences with the global challenges, 17 SDGs – thematic areas of 17 SDGs
   - To link the competences with the UNECE educators competences for ESD, to focus on 8-9 competences; reduce the number of competences;
   - We could reduce educators’ competences, address to 21st century competences – 8- or 9 competences – its easier to address them
   - We should link learners’ and educators’ competences and Link Educators and students;
   - In which way we could link all these sets of competence? All levels of education!

4. **We could create network of Youth and share these competences documents, social media?**

   - We have to start asking youth how do want to learn better, to have their opinion is first thing
   - We should know how to address – which groups of youth?
   - Questionnaire for Youth! Ask them! Is boring! Youth networks start from SDGs! They are ding SDGs work! To discuss engagement mechanisms! Better to work with Youth councils, students council,

   We should have one or two questions! Interactive stories, cartoon!

   (b) Clarity of distinction between core subjects and 21st century competences
Activities, suggestions and actions that can be undertaken by the Steering Committee for the entrepreneurship, employment, innovation and ESD strand until 2030

2. Representation at the Steering Committee meetings:

85. It is crucial for youth to become agents of change. They should have a greater say in decision-making in issues that directly affect them. ECE Steering Committee on ESD could become a pioneer in opening up the discussion so that the voices of youth representatives could be heard. This could take various forms - having youth delegates present and actively taking part in the meetings of the Steering Committee, national focal points should be expected to consult with youth representatives, etc.

- How we could address these groups? How we could define to areas to work on? How we could discuss with youth these areas? How translate this into specific actions?
- To create one questionnaire for the youth, what competences the Youth needs? We will start with that! Social media, letters to ministries, NFPs role in dissemination of the Questionnaire via their ESD networks
- After receiving their feedback – we will have a starting point of this activity. Volunteers from Azerbaijan, CAREC, Georgia, etc.
- To invite students, NGOs, inter. organisations, and youth organizations to the next SC
- Next SC meeting we will give a session to Youth, Voice of youth! One from each the sub-regions! Youth International networks!
Activities, suggestions and actions that can be undertaken by the Steering Committee for the entrepreneurship, employment, innovation and ESD strand until 2030

3. Share the good practice initiatives by: 2025-2030 – too late, 2020-2021! Not publication, but online collection of practices, we could develop a framework on how to work on this collection of Youth participation. Competences should be translated into actions!

(a) Creating digital platforms with Role Model;
(b) Improving and regularly updating ECE website plus address social media - Facebook
(c) Sharing educational guidelines for the students, teachers, schools, universities, etc.;
(d) Bringing the good practice initiative to a higher level -
(e) Organizing conference, competition, exchanging programs, etc. for youth;
(f) Investigating the potential of the scorecard to be used as quality framework for training providers;
(g) Organizing webinars to support dialogue and the dissemination and development of project experiences and outcomes.

Employers – dual system, connect business sector!

Proposals: 2 years, shorten list
Activities, suggestions and actions that can be undertaken by the Steering Committee for the entrepreneurship, employment, innovation and ESD strand until 2030

4. Vocational education and training and the green economy

86. Preparing teachers of vocational education system for work with graduates to meet challenges of market, green economy, green jobs and development new skills and competences for SD is important for which concrete policy recommendations for educational systems and capacity building activities with more emphasis to teachers’ qualification raising is essential.

87. The most important is to bridge the gap between the world of learning and the world of work through vocational training and hands on learning systems to ensure that training and local opportunities are complementary. Young people have a great deal to offer their societies and Involvement of youth in environmental protection efforts can foster changes at household level as well as at community level.

• Smooth Transition from one level of education to the other one – all levels schools, TVET, Higher educations should be linked, all the levels of education
• The employers – ask for the business sector’ suggestions for their needs in case of graduates’ competences
• Education should create some alternatives to the business models: UNITAR good practices – limited outreach, interested businesses; creation the business network, green business, Business council for SD, KAPUR, UNESCO UNIVOK center; their ideas re very important for this activity
5. Digital skills for the future

88. The Europe 2020 Strategy aims to create the conditions for smart, sustainable and inclusive growth. One of the areas it targets is education. Each of the areas is changing fast through the digitalisation of our society. *People need digital competence to be able to participate and benefit from digital opportunities* - but also to mitigate possible risks. This is clearly a challenge that must be addressed today. Almost half (44.5%) of the EU population aged between 16 and 74 has insufficient digital skills, as demonstrated by the EU-wide Digital Economy and Society Index (DESI) indicator on "digital skills", based on 2015 Eurostat data.

*It is a horizontal issue! It should be removed from here – we have a special group on digital skills – strand 3!*
Entrepreneurship Employment, Innovation and ESD: main questions

Questions started our work in the group Youth, entrepreneurship, employment and innovation:

• What is the state of play with regards to ESD and youth in your country?

• Which values and competencies are needed to engage and motivate youth with SDGs?

• How can ESD enhance youth creativity and ideas to move on sustainable Entrepreneurship and Innovation?

• In which ways ESD can eliminate youth unemployment?

• In which direction VET education should be oriented for empowering youth to work with more sustainable patterns in industry, trade and market?

• How can Ad Hoc Group assist with upscaling efforts and ensuring more effective outcomes in this sector?
Youth, Entrepreneurship Employment and Innovation: additional questions

• Do we take into consideration the youth’ needs, when we make political decisions? *(Consultations, debates, Round Tables with Youth)*
• Do we give to the youth enough opportunities to make decisions or have influence on decision-making? *(Youth forums, Youth events, etc.)*
• Do we have enough education programs for bringing together youth groups’ representatives with business community and help in employment of the youth? *(SCR programs)*
• Do we present any platforms for exchange by experiences and opinions by Youth and young leaders at the international for a *(examples of Youth platforms and networks)*?
• Do we understand that today we need to help to develop the youth’ capacity, skills and competences in secondary, vocational and higher education systems for better and sustainable future?
• Do we have enough projects and funds covering the Youth’ needs and priorities?
• What the UNECE Steering Committee for ESD could do in a practical and visible way to meet the Youth needs and expectations? *(Outline of the draft workplan for the post-2019 implementation framework)*
• How we could promote and support the Youth’ initiatives in UNECE sub-regions and countries?
• Which UN agencies, international organizations and donors communities could be our partners and share examples of work with Youth?
• How to use the experience developed in the UNECE region and widely disseminate/ replicate in the other countries of the region and globally? *(Good practices collection, UNECE workshop on Youth’s support)*
List of references


List of references


14. CAREC Concept of the Innovation Cluster in Tashkent, 2018

15. Applied educating systems, 21st Century skills are 12 abilities that today’s students need to succeed in their careers during the Information Age, [https://www.aeseducation.com/careercenter21/what-are-21st-century-skills](https://www.aeseducation.com/careercenter21/what-are-21st-century-skills)


17. COUNCIL RECOMMENDATION of 22 May 2018 on key competences for lifelong learning (Text with EEA relevance) (2018/C 189/01).

Thank you!

tshakirova@carececo.org
+ 7 701 337 4946