



Schweizerische Eidgenossenschaft
Confédération suisse
Confederazione Svizzera
Confederaziun svizra

Swiss Confederation

Federal Office for the Environment FOEN

при финансовой поддержке
Федерального офиса Швейцарии
по окружающей среде



UNECE



**WORKSHOP ON
THE TRANSBOUNDARY ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT
ASSESSMENT (EIA)**

IN CENTRAL ASIAN COUNTRIES

2 – 3 November 2017



WORKSHOP REPORT

November

2017

Content:

1. Background
2. Workshop objectives
3. Approach and methodology
4. Summary of the Workshop outcomes
5. Workshop conclusions
6. Workshop evaluation
7. Public visibility of the event

Annex 1: Workshop agenda

Annex 2: Workshop evaluation form analysis

Annex 3: List of Participants

1. Background

At its third session (Cavtat, Croatia, 1-4 June 2004), the Meeting of the Parties to the Convention on Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) in a Transboundary Context (Espoo Convention) requested the development of guidance on the practical application of the Convention in the Eastern Europe, the Caucasus and Central Asian subregion. Guidelines for Central Asia were initially developed in 2005 by the Regional Environmental Centre for Central Asia with financial support from Switzerland, and were later revised in 2007. The Meeting of the Parties took note of these Guidelines at its fourth session (Bucharest, 19–21 May 2008).

The 2014-2017 workplan mandated the update of the Guidelines on Environmental Impact Assessment in a Transboundary Context for Central Asian Countries, in conjunction with efforts to raise the awareness of national officials in Central Asian countries with regard to transboundary EIA. A project to update the Guidelines, taking into account national legal and institutional developments and international practice, is being financed by Switzerland, with Kyrgyzstan as the lead country for the activity.

The discussions regarding the update of the Guidelines raised a number on EIA procedure in a transboundary context. Therefore the secretariat to the Convention agreed with the Government of Switzerland to organize the subregional event to address existing questions and outline further steps in updating the Guidelines.

The workshop gathered 21 participants including the representatives of the Central Asian countries – Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, and Uzbekistan¹ - coming from central authorities responsible for environmental protection, agencies / authorities involved in environmental review(expertise) procedures and other organisations engaged in preparing the Guidelines on EIA in a Transboundary Assessment for Central Asia. International EIA and SEA experts from Poland, Czech Republic, Russian Federation and Ukraine and representatives of the UNECE secretariat delivered presentations and facilitated discussions and practical group work.

The workshop was organized back-to-back the second sub-regional workshop: Sharing experience with introducing SEA and EIA in selected countries of Eastern Europe and the Caucasus, organized within the EU funded "Greening Economies in the Eastern Neighbourhood" (EaP GREEN) programme. The two events had a joint session on 2 November 2017 when the participants the EaP GREEN countries i.e. Armenia, Azerbaijan, Belarus, Georgia, the Republic of Moldova and Ukraine, joined the representatives of the Central Asian countries, and shared the lessons learned from the SEA/EIA related legislative reforms carried out in Eastern Europe and the Caucasus in the last three years.

The event was organized by the UNECE secretariat with the assistance of consultants and the Ukrainian non-governmental organization 'Law-Making and Information Technologies Institute'. The funding has been secured by the Government of Switzerland to support preparation of the

¹ The representatives of Turkmenistan did not manage to attend the event.

'Guidelines on the application of transboundary EIA procedures in Central Asian countries'. The workshop has been held in Glebovka Hotel, Kyiv Oblast, Ukraine.

The Agenda of the event, the event evaluation results, and the List of Participants are attached to this report as Annex 1, Annex 2 and Annex 3, respectively.

The photos of the event are found throughout this report.

2. Workshop objectives

The key aim of the sub-regional workshop was to provide the participants from the five Central Asian countries with an opportunity to:

- (a) learn about the experience of the countries of Eastern Europe and the Caucasus in reforming their national environmental assessment systems and the practical application of the transboundary EIA procedure as stipulated by the Espoo Convention;
- (b) discuss the role of the Espoo Convention as a tool for sub-regional cooperation;
- (c) consider the consistency between the Convention and environmental impact assessment within State ecological expertise in countries of Eastern Europe, the Caucasus and Central Asia;
- (d) identify existing challenges related to the application to transboundary EIA in the sub-region and actions needed to address these challenges;
- (e) agree on the next steps for the finalization of the update of the 'Guidelines on the application of transboundary EIA procedures in Central Asian countries', involving, as required, preparation of a supplementary annex (Annex 3) reviewing national legislative frameworks on EIA vis-à-vis the Espoo Convention.

3. Approach and methodology

The workshop utilized a highly interactive design and included a short theoretical block followed by experience -exchange sessions, extensive practical works in groups on the specific case study assignments and follow-up thematic discussions (see below).

4. Summary of the Workshop outcomes

Ms. Elena Santer, UNECE secretariat to the Espoo Convention and its Protocol on SEA, opened the joint event by welcoming the participants. She introduced the aim and objectives of the joint

day, which constituted the last day of the **Workshop on Sharing experience with introducing strategic environmental assessment (SEA) and environmental impact assessment (EIA) in selected countries of Eastern Europe, the Caucasus, and Central Asia** and the first day of the **Workshop on transboundary environmental impact assessment for Central Asian countries**. After introducing the country delegations to each other, she emphasised the uniqueness of the joint event which brought together the representative of six EaP GREEN countries and five Central Asian countries and created a dedicated platform for the exchange of experiences.

Following this, the countries, in turn, made their presentations about their experience with developing the legislative frameworks for SEA and EIA. They covered, inter alia, the following points:

- a general approach when carrying out the legislative reforms of the national environmental assessment system (e.g., some countries decided to separate SEA and EIA procedures, while others decided to keep them together);
- an explanation of how the existing / new SEA and EIA legislative frameworks relate to the EU legislation;
- the main drivers of developing (and adopting) the new legislation (e.g. cases at the Espoo Implementation Committee, EU Association Agreement, etc.);
- challenges experienced during the legislative reform;
- a description of the procedural steps within the new EIA and SEA systems.

Ms. Elena Santer, UNECE secretariat to the Espoo Convention and its Protocol on SEA, opened Day 2 of the event by summarising the activities of the previous day (note: the participant of this workshop took active part in the last day of the sub-regional workshop **Sharing experience with introducing strategic environmental assessment (SEA) and environmental impact assessment (EIA) in selected countries of Eastern Europe, the Caucasus, and Central Asia**, held in the same venue on 31 October – 2 November 2017, as described above). She highlighted the variety of ways and approaches the countries of the Caucasus and Eastern Europe have taken when planning and implementing their legislative reforms in EIA and SEA, including institutional arrangements for applying EIA and SEA.



During the next session, Jerzy Jendroska, international legal expert to UNECE, and Ms. Elena Santer, UNECE secretariat, introduced a hypothetical oil refinery case study to the participants and ask them to elaborate on the procedure of transboundary EIA, including consultations, for each participating country. The work in groups was facilitated by the international SEA, EIA and legal consultants to UNECE (Mr. Martin Smutny, Dr. Marina Khotuleva, Dr. Maia Gachecheladze-Bozhesku, Mr. Michal Musil, and Mr. Andriy Andrushevych).

After working in country groups, the workshop participants presented the results. In particular, each country presented its transboundary EIA procedure step-by-step based on the existing or draft legislation (where available, e.g. there is no such regulations in Uzbekistan).



Each presentation was followed by extensive discussions that revolved around:

- The need to have a land plot allocated before any project design work can start and an EIA can be conducted. Project planning cases and examples from the participating countries have been presented and discussed;
- Design change management procedures and the implications the changes may have on the EIA in general and on EIA in a transboundary context in particular. It has been noted that while the EIA needs to rely on the information that is available in the project design documentation, in practice it may happen that the EIA report does not properly reflect the project design and its changes. In such cases, the competent expertise authority that relies on the EIA report might not see the discrepancies in the assessment.
- Different perceptions of a ‘final decision’ (whether it is a conclusion of the Ecological Expertise, a construction permit or the final set of documents including the EIA report, technical project design, etc.).
- Detailed discussion of the project planning and EIA planning and management issues. E.g., in case some countries have a specific requirement to conduct additional steps in assessment such as a pre-EIA (e.g., a ‘pred-OVOS’ in Kazakhstan), then how this can be merged with the transboundary EIA procedures.
- The timing of the procedural steps of the transboundary EIA, e.g., how much time is needed to process and respond to a notification, how much time is needed to issue a notification, etc.
- The roles of state / public authorities in the transboundary EIA (other than environmental authorities), e.g., in many countries all international correspondence should be processed and issued / accepted by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs.
- Implications of the involvement of other state / public authorities in the transboundary EIA in terms of timing and responsibilities.



The second half of the day was devoted to the review and discussion of the latest version of the 'Guidelines on EIA in a Transboundary Context for Central Asian countries'. Mr. Andriy Andrusevych, international legal expert to UNECE, and Ms. Zhanel Karina, Central Asia Regional Environmental Center, have presented the work on the preparation/updating and review of the Guidelines and raised a number of questions to the participants. For instance, as presented by Mr. Andriy Andrusevych, Figure 1 with the transboundary EIA process steps was streamlined and edited to make it clearer for the future users of the Guidelines; the definition of the 'final decision' has been added to the glossary, 'identification of interested parties' has been added and so forth. The participants had no comments on the changes and welcomed the improvements.

Mr. Zhanel Karina continued the session with the presentation of the CAREC's position on the coverage and content of the Guidelines. She outlined a number of recommendations about further improvement of the Guidelines. These, inter alia, included a greater focus on the integrity of the document, integration of the comparative analysis of the EIA procedural steps in five Central Asian countries into the Guidelines, interpretation of the Guidelines in the contexts of each country, evaluation of applicability of the recommendations provided in the Guidelines in the context of the national legislation of each country – such step required additional time and human resources -, development of specific recommendations on transboundary EIAs for the Central Asian Countries that are not Parties to the Espoo Convention. The representative from UNECE highlighted that the work carried out under the workplan of the Convention should be implemented to promote application of the Convention in the sub-region and ultimate ratification of the instrument by the beneficiary countries.

Following this, the discussion evolved about the advantages and disadvantages of transforming the existing Part II of the Guidelines into a commentary to Part I of the Guidelines. The participants have advocated both approaches.

In conclusion of the event, Ms. Elena Santer summarised the key issues discussed during the workshop and expressed gratitude to all the participants and the organizers. The trainers distributed the certificates of participation to all the participants.

5. Workshop conclusions

The workshop was carried out as it had been planned and, following the prepared agenda, it fulfilled its objectives (as reflected also in evaluation by the participants – see section 6). During the workshop, the participants also discussed the draft Guidelines and the propositions towards its improvement. Thus, as a result of the workshop, the participants have:

- got familiar with the experience of the countries of Eastern Europe and the Caucasus in reforming their national environmental assessment systems and the practical application of the transboundary EIA procedure as stipulated by the Espoo Convention;
 - discussed the role of the Espoo Convention as a tool for sub-regional cooperation;
 - considered the consistency between the Convention and EIA within State ecological expertise in countries of Eastern Europe, the Caucasus and Central Asia;
 - identified existing challenges related to the application to transboundary EIA in the sub-region and actions needed to address these challenges;
-

- agreed on the next steps for the finalization of the update of the 'Guidelines on the application of transboundary EIA procedures in Central Asian countries', involving, as required, a preparation of a supplementary annex (Annex 3 to the Guidelines) that would contain a review of national legislative frameworks on EIA vis-à-vis the Espoo Convention.

The country group work presentations and follow-up discussions have allowed the participants from various countries of Central Asia better understand the differences and similarities of the national procedures pertaining to the transboundary EIA, the respective legal requirements and actual or potential challenges and limitations.

During the workshop, the participants also discussed the draft Guidelines and the propositions towards its improvement.

The participants of the third sub-regional workshop agreed that the draft Guidelines to be presented to the UNECE Working Group on EIA and SEA at its seventh session (Geneva, 28-30 May 2018) should contain only general and specific recommendations on carrying out the transboundary environmental impact assessment procedure in Central Asian countries, definitions and the list of the activities based on the Convention. They also agreed that to facilitate the practical application in the sub-region of the transboundary EIA procedures in line with the Espoo Convention the other parts should be reworked in more practical way. In other words, the draft guidelines should be complemented subsequently with:

(a) an explanatory note providing further practical details, and where possible existing practice, on implementing specific articles of the Convention, or a detailed model of a bilateral agreement for the implementation of the Espoo Convention;

(b) specific recommendations on how to align the national legislation with the Convention based on reviews of national legislation of each of the Central Asian countries with regard to compliance with the provisions of the Convention;

(c) awareness raising and capacity building activities to promote the benefits of transboundary EIA as a tool for greening economies and to share practical examples efficient implementation of the Convention among the decision-makers in all Central Asian countries, in particular in the context of one belt one road initiative.

The representative of the UNECE secretariat confirmed that some limited funding is available from Switzerland to develop recommendations for aligning the national legislation with the Convention and to prepare either an explanatory note or a model bilateral agreement. She indicated that the new activities could be carried out starting from the second quarter of 2018. She further invited the participants to communicate the results of the workshop to their governments and provide the feedback to the secretariat regarding their priorities for further work. In addition, the participants discussed the possibilities for the awareness raising events at the national and sub-regional level. They highlighted the importance of organising a short session and a side event on application of the transboundary EIA procedure (and as relevant SEA) within the Environmental Forum of the Central Asian Countries (June 2018, Uzbekistan) highlighting the role of this

instruments in the context of Belt and Road initiative. UNECE and CAREC were invited to establish close cooperation in this realm.

6. Workshop evaluation

The workshop participants were provided with evaluation forms to present their feedback to the organizers. In total 9 out of 12 distributed questionnaires have been recovered and analysed. The summary of the results is presented below (for the complete overview of the results see Annex 2).

The overall participants' evaluation was very positive, the participants reported that:

- The topic was important (the average grade is 2.78 from 3 as maximum);
- The delivery of information was clear (the average grade is 2.56 from 3 as maximum);
- The practical exercises was reported as very useful by most of the participants (the average grade is 2.67 from 3 as maximum)
- Further, the most useful for the participants were the following elements of the workshop:
 - (i) Experience of the Caucasus and the Eastern European countries in implementing the Protocol on SEA and the Espoo Convention;
 - (ii) Experience of the Caucasus and the Eastern European countries in developing SEA and EIA legislation;
 - (iii) Discussion of the Guidelines on the transboundary EIA for the Central European countries;
 - (iv) Exchange of opinions on and discussion of the state ecological expertise processed in the neighbouring countries; and
 - (v) Discussions with the international experts.

The participants were invited to share their vision of the next steps and actions necessary to further support the implementation of SEA and EIA in their countries. They formulated these as follows:

- Pilot project to test how the legislation of the Republic of Tajikistan can be used in the context of a transboundary OVOS;
 - Legal reforms and improvements, and possibly amendments to the legislation to align it with the provisions of the Espoo convention;
 - Capacity-building and awareness raising activities;
 - Development of recommendations about the changes to be done to the national legislation;
 - Provision of standards and methods of SEA in order to reduce the environmental risks of the implementation of the initiative 'One belt – one road';
 - Enhancement of a dialogue between the Central Asian countries; and
 - Adoption of the Guidelines by the Decree of the Ministry (Kazakhstan).
-

In terms of practical and logistical arrangements, the workshop was evaluated high (the highest value is 4):

- Travel arrangements – the average grade is 3.56;
- Content of Logistical Note - the average grade is 4;
- Accommodation - the average grade is 4;
- Training facilities (room & equipment) - the average grade is 3.56; and
- Translation - the average grade is 3.56.

For further details please see Annex 2.

The participants believed that the workshop was “useful and fruitful” and that “it was well organized and delivered”. They did not provide any improvement proposals except for suggesting that such workshops should be longer in duration so that more interesting and practical topics can be covered.

7. Public visibility of the event

The information about the training event has been spread to reach a wider range of the interested public via the following sources:

- News page of the Ministry of Ecology and Natural Resources of Ukraine <https://menr.gov.ua/news/31851.html>
 - Aarhus Center, Kyiv, Ukraine <https://www.facebook.com/OrhusCentrKyiv/posts/1456086217808116>
 - Environmental conservation program of New Country (Ukraine) <https://www.facebook.com/groups/1519277714993494/permalink/1957409691180292/>
 - Institute of Green Economy (Ukraine) <http://green-economics.org.ua/seminar-trening-obmin-dosvidom-shhodo-vprovadzhennya-strategichno%D1%97-ekologichno%D1%97-ocinki-seo-i-ocinki-vplivu-na-dovkillya-ovd-v-vibraniy-kra%D1%97-nax-sxidno%D1%97-yevropi-kavkazu-ta-centr/>.
-

Annex 1: Workshop agenda

Workshop on transboundary environmental impact assessment for Central Asian countries

2 November 2017

*to be conducted together with the representatives of the countries of the Caucasus and
Eastern Europe²*

Hotel Glebovka, Kiev region, Ukraine

09:00 – 09:45	Introduction of the participants Aims of the meeting Brief introduction to the Convention on Environmental Impact Assessment in a Transboundary Context (Espoo Convention) and its Protocol on Strategic Environmental Assessment (Protocol on SEA) <i>Ms. Elena Santer, UNECE secretariat to the Espoo Convention) and the Protocol on SEA</i>
09:45 – 10:00	Short introduction of the delegations from the Caucasus and the Eastern Europe Introduction to the case study on transboundary SEA in energy sector for the participants from the Central Asia <i>Facilitated by Elena Santer, UNECE</i>
10:00 – 11:00	Case study on transboundary strategic environmental assessment (SEA) in energy sector Representatives of the countries of the Caucasus and Eastern Europe will present the results of their assessment of the case study carried out based on their national legislative framework. Representatives from Central Asian countries will be invited to provide observations regarding the proposed transboundary procedure and reflect on feasibility of application of proposed approach to SEA in the Central Asian sub-region. <i>Facilitated by Jerzy Jendroska, international legal expert, Maia Gachecheladze Bozhesku, UNECE consultant and Elena Santer, UNECE</i>
11:00 – 11:30	Coffee break
11:30 – 12:30	Case study on transboundary SEA in energy sector (continuation) <i>Facilitated by Jerzy Jendroska, international legal expert, Maia Gachecheladze Bozhesku, UNECE consultant and Elena Santer, UNECE</i>

² The Caucasus countries include: Armenia, Azerbaijan, Georgia; the countries of Eastern Europe for the purpose of this document include: Belarus, the Republic of Moldova, Ukraine; the countries of Central Asia – Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, Uzbekistan.

<p>12:30 – 13:00</p>	<p>Concluding session on transboundary SEA <i>The representative of the Central Asian countries will be invited to comment on the outline of the project proposal on raising awareness on SEA at the national and regional level in the countries of Central Asia prepared by the secretariat based on the 2016 needs assessment exercise.</i> <i>Facilitated by Jerzy Jendroska, international legal expert and Elena Santer, UNECE</i></p>
<p>13:00 - 14:00</p>	<p>Lunch</p>
<p>14:00 – 14:20</p>	<p>Developing national legislation on environmental impact assessment (EIA) and SEA, Part i.</p> <p>Overview of the legislative developments in the countries of the Caucasus, Central Asia and Eastern Europe (10 minutes) <i>Presentation: Elena Santer, UNECE</i></p> <p>Main legislative ‘dilemmas’ including differences between EIA and SEA legislative frameworks <i>Presentation: Jerzy Jendroska (10 minutes)</i></p>
<p>14:20 - 15:30</p>	<p>Developing national legislation on EIA and SEA, Part ii. Exchange of experiences between the countries of the Caucasus, Central Asia and Eastern Europe</p> <p>Countries of Central Asia will be invited to present an overview of their EIA related legislative frameworks outlining recent or planned developments (following the home assignment).</p> <p>Countries of the Caucasus and Eastern Europe will be invited to share their experiences with the legislative reforms in EIA and SEA, outlining the process of the legislative reforms and the content of EIA and SEA legislation, including institutional arrangements for EIA and SEA, field of application, screening, scoping, preparation and quality control of EIA and SEA reports, consultations with the relevant authorities and public at the national level and in the transboundary context (following the home assignment).</p> <p><i>Facilitated by Jerzy Jendroska, international legal expert, Michal Musil, UNECE consultant and Elena Santer, UNECE</i></p>
<p>14:30 – 15:30</p>	<p>Exchange of experiences between the countries of the Caucasus, Central Asia and Eastern Europe (continued)</p> <p><i>Facilitated by Jerzy Jendroska, international legal expert, Michal Musil, UNECE consultant and Elena Santer, UNECE</i></p>
<p>15:30 – 16:00</p>	<p>Coffee break</p>
<p>16:00 – 17:25</p>	<p>Developing national legislation on EIA and SEA, Part iii. Lessons learned from the legislative reforms carried out in the countries of the Caucasus, Eastern Europe and Central Asia since 2013 and the way forward</p>

	<i>Facilitated by Jerzy Jendroska, international legal expert, Michal Musil, UNECE consultant and Elena Santer, UNECE</i>
17:25– 17:30	Closing of the day <i>Facilitated by Elena Santer UNECE secretariat</i>

3 October 2017

with participation of the Central Asian Countries only

Hotel Glebovka, Kiev region, Ukraine

09:00– 09:15	Reflections on the day 1 <i>Elena Santer, UNECE secretariat to the Espoo Convention and its Protocol on SEA</i>
09:15– 10:15	Case example on transboundary EIA consultations in Central Asian countries (oil refinery) - Introduction to the assignment - Preparation of country's presentations <i>Facilitated by Jerzy Jendroska, international legal expert and Elena Santer, UNECE secretariat</i>
10:15– 11:00	Case study on transboundary EIA in Central Asian countries (oil refinery) - Presentations by the countries and discussion, Part i. <i>Facilitated by Maia Gachecheladze-Bizhesku, UNECE consultant</i> <i>Feedback by Jerzy Jendroska, international legal expert and consultants to UNECE</i>
11:00– 11:30	Coffee break
11:30 – 12:30	Case study on transboundary EIA in Central Asian countries (oil refinery) - Presentations by the countries and discussion, Part ii. <i>Facilitated by Maia Gachecheladze-Bizhesku, UNECE consultant</i> <i>Feedback by Jerzy Jendroska, international legal expert and consultants to UNECE</i>
12:30– 13:00	Concluding session on transboundary EIA consultations in Central Asian countries <i>Facilitated by Jerzy Jendroska, international legal expert</i>
13:00– 14:00	Lunch
14:00 – 15:30	Guidelines on EIA in a Transboundary Context for Central Asian countries, Part i.: overview of the activities carried out so far and review of the content of the Guidelines <i>Presentations by Zhanel Karina, Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation and Andriy Andrusevych, international legal expert</i> <i>Facilitated by Elena Santer, UNECE secretariat</i>
15:30– 16:00	Coffee break
16:00– 17:00	Guidelines on EIA in a Transboundary Context for Central Asian countries, Part ii.: Discussion on the way forward

	<i>Facilitated by Elena Santer, UNECE secretariat and Andriy Andrushevych, international legal expert</i>
17:00– 17:30	Concluding session <i>Facilitated by Elena Santer, UNECE secretariat and Jerzy Jendroska, international legal expert</i>

Annex 2: Workshop evaluation

The results obtained from the participants through the questionnaires are presented below in a structure following the format of the evaluation questionnaires. In total 9 evaluation forms (out of 12 distributed) were recovered and analysed. Figures indicate the number of participants giving specific answers.

1. Please, indicate how important and relevant was the workshop topic for you?

1 (not important) - 0 2 (important) - 2 3 (very important) – 7

2. Please, indicate how clear and understandable was the delivery of information for you (mark):

1 – (Absolutely not clear) 0; 2 (clear) 4 3 (absolutely clear) 5

3. What, in your view, was the most useful at the workshop?

NB: many of the participants provided more than one response

#	Statement	No of participants
	Learning about experience in reforming the SEA and EIA legislation in Georgia, Ukraine and Azerbaijan	1
	Discussion of the Guidelines on the transboundary EIA for the Central European countries	2
	Experience of other countries in developing SEA and EIA legislation	2
	Experience of the Caucasus and the Eastern European countries in implementation of the Protocol on SEA and the Espoo Convention	1
	Group work under the supervision of international experts that has allowed to reveal some gaps in the national legislations of each of the Central Asian country	1
	Explanation of the OVOS procedure and of the provision of the Espoo Convention	1
	Exchange of opinions on and discussion of the state ecological expertise processed in the neighbouring countries	2
	Discussions with the international experts	2

4. Did you find the practical exercises useful?

1 (not useful) 2 (useful) 3 3 (very useful) - 6

5. What next steps and actions you see as the most important to further support the implementation of SEA and EIA in your home country?

#	Statement	No of participants
	Pilot project to test how the legislation of the Republic of Tajikistan can be used in the context of a transboundary OVOS	1
	Legal reforms and improvements	4
	Amendments to the legislation to align it with the provisions of the Espoo convention	1
	Capacity-building and awareness raising	2
	Recommendations about the changes to the done to the national legislation	1
	Provision of standards and methods of SEA in order to reduce the environmental risks of the implementation of the initiative 'One belt – one road'	1
	Enhancement of a dialogue between the CA countries	1
	If we want to become a party to the Convention, we will have to revise the national legislation	1
	Adoption of the Guidelines by the Decree of the Ministry (Kazakhstan)	1

6. What are your proposals to improve delivery of similar workshops?

#	Statement	No of participants
	Increase the duration of such workshops and the number of practical points to be covered	2
	The workshop was very useful and fruitful, it was well organized and delivered	1

7. How would you evaluate the practical and logistical arrangements?

Please tick a relevant cell.

	<i>Very good</i>	<i>Good</i>	<i>Moderate</i>	<i>Poor</i>
<i>Travel arrangements</i>	7	2		
<i>Content of Logistical Note</i>	9			
<i>Accommodation</i>	9			
<i>Training facilities (room & equipment)</i>	7	2		
<i>Translation</i>	7	2		

Assigned values: very good – 4; good – 3, moderate – 2 and poor – 1.

Annex 3: List of Participants

Application of EIA in a transboundary context in Central Asian countries

Sub-regional workshop

2-3 November 2017

Hotel Glebovka, Kiev region, Ukraine

Start Date: Thursday, November 2, 2017

End Date: Friday, November 3, 2017

Participants: 21

Female participants: 13

Mr. Azamat ALIMBAYEV Vice-Chairman Committee on environmental regulation and control Ministry of Energy of the Republic of Kazakhstan	19, Kabanbai Batyr ave 010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan Phone: 87172740307 E-mail: a.alimbaev@energo.gov.kz
Ms. Aigul MADENOVA Chief Expert Committee on environmental regulation and control Ministry of Energy of the Republic of Kazakhstan	19, Kabanbai Batyr ave 010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan Phone: 87172740358 E-mail: a.madenovav@energo.gov.kz
Ms. Olga Melnik Head of Division, Department on «Green Economy» Ministry of Energy of the Republic of Kazakhstan	19, Kabanbai Batyr ave 010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan Phone: +77172740283 Email: o.melnik@energo.gov.kz
Ms. Madina IBRASHEVA Team Leader, UNECE component of the Green Economy Project on setting up the national strategic environmental assessment system in Kazakhstan	52 Kenesay, ap.92 010000 Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan Mobile: +77017279762 E-mail: mibrasheva@mail.ru
Ms. Zhanel Karina Environmental specialist, EMP, The Regional Environmental Centre for Central Asia	40 Orbita-1, Almaty Republic of Kazakhstan Mobile: 87785045071 E-mail: zhkarina@carececo.org
Ms. Rakiya KALYGULOVA Senior Specialist of the State Ecological Expertise Department State Agency on Environment Protection and Forestry under the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic	142, Gor'kogo Str., 720001 Bishkek, Kyrgyz Republic Phone: +996 312 900 814 Email: kalygulova@mail.ru
Ms. Zhamalkan KADOEVA Senior Specialist Legislative Support Department	142, Gor'kogo Str., 720001 Bishkek, Kyrgyz Republic Phone: +996 312 900662

State Agency on Environment Protection and Forestry under the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic

Email: min-eco@elcat.kg,
jamal.kadoeva@gmail.com

Mr. Dzhaliil KHALILOV
Head EIA Division Committee of Environment Protection under the Government of the Republic of Tajikistan

5/1 Shamsi Str.,
734034 Dushanbe, Tajikistan
Fax: +992 37 2362561
Email: muzafar1961@rambler.ru
khalilov1955@mail.ru

Mr. Khusrav MAHMADULLOEV
Head State Ecological Expertise Committee of Environment Protection under the Government of the Republic of Tajikistan

5/1 Shamsi Str.,
734034 Dushanbe, Tajikistan
Phone: +992 37 2362561
Email: muzafar1961@rambler.ru
khalilov1955@mail.ru

Mr. Adkham KURBONOV
Chief Specialist, "Center of the State Ecological Expertise" under the State Committee for Environment Protection of the Republic of Uzbekistan

2A, Tuitepa Str.
1000047 Tashkent, Uzbekistan
Phone: +99871 2070770 (int. 2019#)
Email: boshdavekoekspertiza@uznature.uz

Mr. Aziz MUMINOV
Chief Specialist, "Center of the State Ecological Expertise" under the State Committee for Environment Protection of the Republic of Uzbekistan

2A, Tuitepa Str.
1000047 Tashkent, Uzbekistan
Phone: +99871 2070770 (int.2010#)
Email: a.muminov@uznature.uz

Mr. Andriy Andrusevych
UNECE consultant

42 Ac. Sakharov str., apt. 509,
79012, Lviv ,Ukraine
Phone: + 38032242 22 84
Email: andriy.andrusevych@rac.org.ua

Ms. Galyna Sierova
Acting Director of the NGO "Law-making and Information Technologies Institute", Organizers

35 Mytropolyyta V.Lipkivskogo Str.,
03035 Kyiv, Ukraine
Phone: + 380442063180
Email: galina_serova@ukr.net

Ms. Anna Prymak
Manager, NGO "Law-making and Information Technologies Institute", Organizers

35 Mytropolyyta V.Lipkivskogo Str.,
03035 Kyiv, Ukraine
Phone: + 380442063180
Email: lawmaking2014@gmail.com

Ms. Lyudmila Davydova
Manager, NGO "Law-making and Information Technologies Institute", Organizers

35 Mytropolyyta V.Lipkivskogo Str.,
03035 Kyiv, Ukraine
Phone: + 380442063180
Email: lawmaking2014@gmail.com

Ms. Elena Santer
UNECE secretariat to the Espoo Convention and its Protocol on SEA

Email: elena.santer@unece.org

Mr.Martin Smutny

Consultant to UNECE

Email: Martin.Smutny@unece.org

Ms. Maia Gachechiladze-Bozhesku

Consultant to UNECE

Director, Ecoline International Ltd.

Email: mgachechiladze@ecoline-eac.com

Ms. Olena Borysova

Consultant to UNECE

Email: borysova.olena@gmail.com

Ms. Marina Khotuleva

Director at Ecoline EAC

Email: marina_khotuleva@eac-ecoline.ru

Mr. Jerzy Jendroška

International legal expert

Email: jerzy.jendroska@jib.com.pl
