

**To: Members of the Bureau of the UNECE Expert Group on Resource Classification**

From: David MacDonald and Charlotte Griffiths

Conference Calls of the Bureau of the Expert Group on Resource Classification (EGRC)  
13 April 2015  
APPROVED MINUTES

Present on 9am BST 13 April Call:

1. David MacDonald (Chair)
2. Karin Ask (petroleum sector)
3. Roger Dixon (CRIRSCO)
4. Gioia Falcone (geothermal sector and academia)
5. Jim Ross (petroleum sector)
6. Charlotte Griffiths (UNECE)

Present on 3pm BST 13 April Call:

1. David MacDonald (Chair)
2. Tunde Arisekola (NGSA)
3. Paul Bankes (CRIRSCO) *representing Roger Dixon*
4. Dan Diluzio (SPE)
5. David Elliott (financial reporting sector)
6. Kjell Reidar Knudsen (NPD)
7. John Ritter (SPEE)
8. Jim Ross (petroleum sector)
9. Hari Tulsidas (IAEA)
10. Brad Van Gosen (USGS)
11. Claudia Wulz (European Commission)
12. Charlotte Griffiths (UNECE)

Observer:

Slavko Solar (European Commission)

Apologies:

1. Fatih Birol (IEA)
2. Mucella Ersoy (Turkish Coal Enterprises)
3. Michael Lynch-Bell (Chair ex-officio)
4. Igor Shpurov (First Vice Chair, GKZ Russian Federation)
5. Adichat Surinkum (CCOP)
6. Danny Trotman (financial reporting sector)
7. Narendra Verma (petroleum sector)

**Draft Agenda**

1. Approval of draft agenda (attachment 1)
2. Draft minutes of Bureau calls 24 & 25 February 2015 (attachment 2)
3. EGRC Sixth Session Update
  - Outline for Resource Classification Week (attachment 3)
  - Detailed Timeline for EGRC Sixth Session (attachment 4)
  - List of Informal Documents for Sixth Session (attachment 5)
4. Draft EGRC Work Plan for 2016-2017 (attachment 6)
5. Draft Conclusions and Recommendations for EGRC Sixth Session (attachment 7)

6. Revised CRIRSCO Bridging Document and TAG Recommendation (circulated on 7 April 2015)
7. Technical Advisory Group update
  - TAG report and presentation to EGRC (circulated on 1 April 2015)
8. Update on application of UNFC-2009 to nuclear fuel resources
  - draft guidelines for application of UNFC-2009 to uranium and thorium projects (circulated on 2 April 2015)
9. Update on application of UNFC-2009 to renewable energy resources
  - Minutes of Task Force Call of 5 March 2015 (attachment 8)
10. Update on E-axis Sub-Group
11. EGRC Resourcing Strategy
12. Bureau Meeting on 29 April
13. Any other business

**Documentation:**

1. Draft agenda for Bureau Calls on 13 April 2015
2. Draft Minutes of 24 & 25 February 2015 Bureau Calls
3. Outline for Resource Classification Week EGRC sixth session final provisional agenda
4. Detailed Timeline for EGRC Sixth Session
5. List of Informal Documents for Sixth Session
6. Draft EGRC Work Plan for 2016-2017
7. Draft Conclusions and Recommendations for EGRC Sixth Session
8. Minutes of Renewables Task Force Call of 5 March 2015

**Item 1. Approval of Draft Agenda**

Documentation: Draft agenda for Bureau Calls on 13 April 2015

1. The agenda was adopted without amendment

**Item 2. Draft minutes of Bureau calls 24–25 February 2015**

Documentation: Draft minutes of Bureau Calls of 24–25 February 2015

2. The draft minutes as circulated on 5 March were adopted without amendment.

**Item 3. EGRC Sixth Session update**

(i) Outline for Resource Classification Week

3. The outline for the EGRC Week 2015 was reviewed. The Bioenergy Working Group meeting has been moved from the afternoon of Thursday 30 April to the afternoon of Wednesday 29 April. It was noted that there are number of overlapping events taking place, in particular on 28 April with the UNFC Workshop, the UNECE and IAEA UNFC Consultancy Meeting and the TAG meetings all being held at that day. There were no comments or requests for amendments.

(ii) Detailed Timeline for EGRC Sixth Session

4. The draft detailed timeline was reviewed. The representative of CRIRSCO advised that during his presentation on the Competent Person under agenda item 8 he would cover the perspective of all stakeholders and not just companies. The timeline will be amended to reflect this.

5. No other changes to the timeline were proposed.

(iii) List of Informal Documents for Sixth Session

6. For clarification, the Chair explained what is meant by an informal or room document is a document that has no official UN status i.e. it does not bear a UN document symbol number and nor is it posted to the UN Central Document System (ODS) which means they are not part of the official record of the meeting. Informal documents are not translated by UN translators. These documents are prepared to facilitate the work of the Expert Group either by providing an update on the work of a sub-group e.g. the TAG annual report or to facilitate discussion on a specific topic but they

7. The draft list of informal documents for the sixth session was reviewed. Two documents have already been posted: E-Axis Sub-Group draft ToR (INF.7) and the Education and Outreach Report (INF.4). The remaining documents will be discussed under forthcoming agenda items for the call.

8. Gioia Falcone requested that the White Paper - Progress Update: International Geothermal Association (IGA) Working Group for the Development of Geothermal Specifications for the UNFC-2009 be included as an informal document for the EGRC meeting. Bureau members agreed to this.

(iv) Sponsors for Reception and Coffee Breaks

9. The sponsors to date were reviewed. Bureau members were encouraged to contribute funds no matter how small in order to allow a reception to be held on 29 April.

(v) Registration

10. The Chair noted that over 150 experts are now registered, with a good spread of minerals and petroleum experts and some renewables from around the world. Badges will automatically be issued to all participants from 28 April – 1 May (with the exception of the 10 or so experts coming in for the UNECE-IAEA consultancy meeting on 27 April who will be issued with a badge for the full week).

**Item 4. Draft EGRC Work Plan for 2016-2017**

11. The draft EGRC work plan for 2016-2017 was reviewed. The Chair noted that the draft text circulated incorporates all feedback received by Bureau members. The draft text has additionally been circulated to Frank Denelle, Chair of the Renewables Task Force and to John Etherington, Chair of the TAG, in order to ensure feedback from both those sub-groups. The Chairs of all other sub-groups are Bureau members.

12. A Bureau member drew attention to the use of the term “concrete activities”. The secretariat advised that this is a commonly used term at UNECE in relation terms of reference and work plans for expert groups. The wording appears in the mandate and the terms of reference for the EGRC as approved by UNECE member States and therefore cannot be changed.

13. It was noted that text needs to be included related to the work on the E axis. The feedback from the Renewables Task Force was reviewed and will be incorporated.

14. A revised text will be circulated to the Bureau on 14 or 15 April. The revised text will be circulated to UNECE member States at latest on 16 April.

15. The Chair underlined that comments can also be made during the EGRC meeting. The proposal is to introduce the draft work plan on Wednesday morning (29 April) and request feedback from members over the course of Wednesday and Thursday so that a revised text can be presented to the EGRC on Friday morning and discussed in detail on Friday afternoon. The goal is for the EGRC to agree on its work plan for 2016-2017 before the end of the sixth session. The EGRC will recommend the work plan for endorsement by the Committee on Sustainable Energy and then final approval by the Executive Committee on UNECE.

#### **Item 5. Draft Conclusions and Recommendations for EGRC Sixth Session**

16. The Chair advised that the draft text circulated incorporates all feedback received from Bureau members to date. It has also been circulated to the Chair of the Renewables Task Force and to the Chair of the TAG for comment. As with the draft Work Plan, draft conclusions and recommendations need to be circulated to UNECE member States at latest on 16 April.

17. The Chair confirmed that the intent is for the EGRC to agree the conclusions and recommendations after each agenda item as the sixth session progresses. This approach has worked well for previous EGRC meetings and is now the policy followed by other energy expert groups and the Committee on Sustainable Energy.

18. A number of Bureau members expressed their concern at conclusions and recommendations being drafted ahead of the discussions during the meeting. The Chair confirmed that conclusions and recommendations are drafted ahead of the meeting by the Bureau of the Expert Group in order to facilitate progress during the meeting. They are not intended in any way to prejudice the discussions at the Sixth Session, but rather to provide a draft text which will be updated as the meeting progresses

19. The representative of CRIRSCO expressed his concern over the text “The Expert Group recommended that the Chair request a representative from the Expert Group to join as an observer on the CRIRSCO and SPE committees working on updates to the CRIRSCO Template and PRMS.” It was agreed that this paragraph would be modified along the following lines “*The Expert Group recommended that a formal mechanism be established with CRIRSCO and SPE to ensure that the Expert Group and the Bureau is able to monitor and discuss any potential revisions being considered with regard to planned updates to the CRIRSCO Template and PRMS.*”

20. The feedback from the Renewables Task Force was reviewed; it was noted that only draft geothermal specifications would be ready for the seventh session.

21. Bureau members discussed in detail the needed duration of the next EGRC meeting. There was consensus that one full day is needed to focus on education and training issues. In view of the expanding scope of UNFC, there was consensus that it is not possible to hold the main EGRC meeting discussions over less than three days. It was therefore agreed to recommend that the next EGRC meetings continue to be held over four days.

## **Item 6: Revised CRIRSCO Bridging Document and TAG Recommendation**

22. The Chair noted that the revised CRIRSCO Bridging Document and the accompanying revised TAG Recommendation were circulated on 7 April 2015.
23. The Chair drew attention to the comments circulated by Jim Ross on 8 April:
- (a) The link at footnote 1 goes to the 2006 version of the Template. The previous draft linked to the 2014 version. It needs to be the 2013 version!
  - (b) Page 4, second paragraph, the reference to “shall” regarding recovery or yield factors has (again) been changed to “should”. It must be “shall”, as it is specified in the Series 42 version of the BD and as previously discussed (in accordance with Generic Specification F).
  - (c) In Section C, there is a reference to Generic Specification R (as a possible subdivision of F3). Since it has been agreed that a BD “shall not limit in any way the use of the full granularity of UNFC-2009, this sentence is superfluous and could be deleted. Alternatively, it would be appropriate to refer to other Generic Specifications, such as P, which may also be used (as a possible subdivision of G4). This sentence in Section C should either be deleted or it should be expanded to include reference to Generic Specification P as well as R.
24. Bureau members discussed the proposed changes and agreed to them. In Section C, it was agreed that the reference to Generic Specification R should be deleted. No other changes were proposed.
25. The representative of CRIRSCO agreed to update the Bridging Document accordingly and circulate to the TAG Chair and the Secretariat.
26. The Bureau reviewed the TAG Recommendation circulated on 7 April. The Recommendation was accepted subject to the changes outlined in paragraphs 23 and 24 above being made.
27. The representative of CRIRSCO was thanked for preparing the revised Bridging Document and the TAG was also thanked for reviewing the text. The Chair noted that this is the first time that one of the UNFC-2009 Bridging Documents has been updated.

## **Item 7. Technical Advisory Group update**

28. The TAG Annual Report to the EGRC and the accompanying presentation to be delivered by the TAG Chair to the EGRC as circulated on 1 April 2015 were reviewed. The TAG will next meet on 28 April in the afternoon to finalize the presentation.
29. The Chair noted that a number of Bureau members have sent positive feedback and supported the TAG report and presentation.
30. The representative of the Renewables Task Force on the Bureau advised that the section in the TAG report relating to the future work of the Task Force needed to be updated. She offered to liaise with the Task Force Chair and provide a revised text.
31. It was noted that the TAG is currently focussing on preparing for the meeting with GKZ during the morning of Tuesday 28 April. A number of Bureau members have agreed to

attend the meeting and/or provide support including the SPE and SPEE representatives, the Chair of the E-Axis Sub-Group and Naomi Boness from Chevron/SEG will also participate.

32. The TAG has prepared feedback on the new Russian Federation Classification System of 2013 first draft mapping to UNFC-2009 which is currently being reviewed by TAG members. The TAG review of the Russian Federation Classification System of 2013 to UNFC-2009 mapping submitted by the GKZ on 17 March 2015 has identified a number of issues around comparability. The underlying challenge is that UNFC-2009 (and PRMS) is a project-based system whereas the Russian Federation Classification System of 2009 appears to be an accumulation- or geological-based classification system. TAG members have raised that it would be useful to have graphical representations of the Russian Federation Classification System of 2013 classification of fields and discoveries. It was noted that as the new Russian Federation Classification System is not project based it cannot be mapped to UNFC-2009 and will have to be bridged.

33. The Chair thanked the Chair of the TAG and the other members for their time and efforts.

#### **Item 8. Update on application of UNFC-2009 to nuclear fuel resources**

34. The draft guidelines for application of UNFC-2009 to uranium and thorium projects were circulated on 2 April and the eight case studies were circulated separately due to the file size. A number of Bureau members have provided positive support for the documents and agreed that they can be issued as informal documents for the EGRC Sixth Session.

35. The feedback provided by the representative of SPEE on 10 April was noted: “These Guidelines appear more comprehensive than just mere guidelines considering the background information, but all the better. In respect to both the Guidelines and the Case Studies, a potential opportunity I see is the development of an outline to follow for either document, thereby breeding consistency and ease of review.

36. The Bureau expressed support for an outline being developed for the format of Guidelines and the Case Studies, noting that this was done for bridging documents. The Bureau noted that discussions with the Renewables Task Force are also needed on the format of documents.

37. There was a long discussion as to whether the case studies should be included with the guidelines. There was general consensus that those case studies that illuminate the guidelines should be included. The representatives of IAEA and USGS agreed that this issue would be discussed in the UNECE and IAEA Consultancy Meeting 27-28 April. It was agreed that the draft Guidelines and the case studies could be posted to the EGRC Sixth Session documents pages as two separate documents.

38. Discussion also took place on the need for clarity on which documents need to be reviewed by the Technical Advisory Group (TAG) i.e. which are approved documents and which are not. There was consensus that the TAG should review and approve Bridging Documents and Guidelines. As case studies and other mappings are not part of the UNFC system they do not need to be reviewed/approved. A Bureau member noted the need for care with material posted to the UNFC website, it should be absolutely clear what is an official part of the UNFC and what is not.

39. The Chair thanked the Chair of the Task Force and the other members for their time and efforts in developing the case studies and the guidance.

#### **Item 9. Update on application of UNFC-2009 to renewable energy resources**

40. The Chair noted that the following minutes were circulated:

- Minutes of RE Task Force call of 11 February were circulated on 5 March
- Minutes of RE Task Force Calls of 5 March were circulated with docs for the call

41. A short update was provided by the representative of the Renewables Task Force. The Task Force is focusing on preparing its session at the EGRC Sixth Session which will include:

- Presentation of Draft Generic RE Specifications and TF's response to public comments
- Project status & way forward (2016/17 work plan)
- Geothermal status (incl. IGA presentation)
- Bioenergy status

42. The development of bioenergy and geothermal specifications is progressing.

43. The Geothermal Working Group has prepared a White Paper – Progress Update of the IGA Working Group for the development of geothermal specifications for UNFC-2009. This paper will be presented at the World Geothermal Congress in Melbourne (by the Chair of the IGA R&R Committee) just prior to the Sixth Session and then at the Sixth Session.

44. The SPE Swiss Section Lecture on 30 April will focus on application of UNFC to renewables.

45. The Chair thanked the Chair of the Task Force and the other members for their time and efforts.

#### **Item 10. Update on E-axis Sub-Group**

46. The Chair of the Sub-Group provided a short update. The Sub-Group membership is heavily weighted with solid minerals experts and petroleum experts continue to be sought, in particular from South Africa/Africa. He also noted that he has been talking with the World Bank whilst looking to identify any published guidelines on environmental and social issues.

47. The draft Terms of Reference for the Sub-Group will be presented to the EGRC Sixth Session for discussion and approval. A revised text of paragraph 17 under “Deliverables” was proposed and accepted as follows:

“17. A progress report, including the Terms of Reference developed by the Sub-Group, will be presented at the 2015 Expert Group meeting. The objective is to present recommendations on the development of detailed guidelines at the 2016 annual meeting of the Expert Group. These recommendations may include the need for additional work, the results of which would be presented at subsequent annual meetings.”

48. The first meeting of the Sub-Group is planned during the lunch break on Wednesday 29 April.

49. The Chair thanked the Chair of the Task Force and the other members for their time and efforts in developing the draft specifications.

**Item 11. EGRC Resourcing Strategy**

50. The Chair noted that the small group working on this comprises:

- EGRC Chair
- Director, UNECE Sustainable Energy Division
- Sigurd Heiberg
- Michael Lynch-Bell
- Slavko Solar
- Claudia Wulz and

51. A conference call was held with the working group in March to discuss possible strategies. Michael has developed a strawman which is currently being reviewed.

**Item 12. Bureau Meeting on 29 April**

52. During EGRC Sixth Session, a meeting of the Bureau will be organized over dinner on Wednesday 29 April after the cocktail reception.

53. Additional meetings of the Bureau will be organized during the EGRC Sixth Session as may be needed, most likely at 6pm on Thursday 30 April to discuss the draft Work Plan for 2016-2017, the draft conclusions and recommendations and the draft meeting report.

**Item 13: Any Other Business**

(i) TAG Chair and Bureau Membership

54. The issue of whether the Chair of the Technical Advisory Group should be a member of the Bureau or not was discussed. Many members were not in favour unless the TAG Chair was elected in his/her own right as a member of the Bureau by the EGRC. A number of Bureau members were in favour citing that the TAG is an important sub-group of the EGRC and the Chair should be involved in and aware of the Bureau discussions between EGRC meetings.

55. Following detailed discussion, there was agreement that the TAG Chair should be invited to join the EGRC Bureau as an observer. This will be included in the draft Conclusions and Recommendations for the Sixth Session.

(ii) Update from NGS Representative

56. The representative of the Nigerian Geological Survey Agency advised that his participation at the Sixth Session is uncertain. The new Government has imposed a ban on all foreign trips. He also advised that a presentation on the UNFC will be invited at the 52<sup>nd</sup> Nigerian Mining and Geosciences Society Conference to be held in 2016.

\*\*\*\*\*