ECE/CEP/AC.13/2018/4

## Economic and Social Council

## Economic Commission for Europe

Committee on Environmental Policy

**United Nations Economic Commission for Europe Steering Committee on Education for Sustainable Development**

**Thirteenth meeting**
Geneva, 3 and 4 May 2018
Item 6 of the provisional agenda
**Preparations for the next (2017–2019) mandatory reporting cycle under the Strategy**

### Format for reporting on the implementation of the UNECE Strategy for Education for Sustainable Development (2017–2019)

*Summary*

By its terms of reference, the United Nations Economic Commission for Europe (ECE) Steering Committee for Education for Sustainable Development is charged with monitoring progress in the implementation of the UNECE Strategy for Education for Sustainable Development (ECE/CEP/BATUMI.CONF/2016/11, annex II, para. 4 (d)).

On 1 October 2018, States participating in the Strategy are due to submit their national implementation reports. Reports are expected to reflect the progress made in the implementation of the Strategy at the national or State level during the next implementation phase (2017–2019). The present document sets out the format for reporting (annex I). The set of indicators, on which the reporting format is based, was developed by the ECE Expert Group on Indicators for Education for Sustainable Development. The reporting format has been updated by the secretariat in consultation with the Bureau to meet the reporting needs of the current phase.

Based on national reports submitted, the secretariat will prepare a synthesis report in 2019, highlighting progress made, identifying challenges and drawing up recommendations. The synthesis report is vital for monitoring the progress made since the previous implementation phases and setting future priorities for implementing the Strategy and is expected to be presented at the fourteenth meeting of the Steering Committee in 2019.

# Contents

# Introduction

1. The present document presents a format for reporting on implementation of the UNECE Strategy for Education for Sustainable Development for the next implementation phase (2017–2019). It was developed based on the procedure for the review of implementation of the Strategy contained in the draft workplan for 2017–2019 (ECE/CEP/AC.13/2018/3). The reporting format also takes into account the two previous reporting exercises in 2010 and 2014, the related reporting templates (ECE/CEP/AC.13/2009/10 and ECE/CEP/AC.13/2014/5, respectively) and the feedback from countries following those exercises on the workability and feasibility of the indicators and the requested information for reporting.

2. In addition, the workplan for implementation of the current phase of the Strategy sets out the timeline for the reporting exercise in 2018 (ibid, para. 46).

3. The set of indicators was developed by the ECE Expert Group on Indicators for Education for Sustainable Development set up by the High-level Meeting of Environment and Education Ministries (Vilnius, 17–18 March 2005). Three complementary progress reports provide information on the development of the indicators (see CEP/AC.13/2005/9, ECE/CEP/AC.13/2006/5 and ECE/CEP/AC.13/2008/4).

4. In 2014, to reflect the requirements the third phase (2011–2015) of the Strategy's initial implementation period (2005–2015), in consultation with the Expert Group on Indicators the secretariat introduced the following changes to the reporting template developed by the Group:

(a) The reporting template was updated to use the revised International Standard Classification of Education (ISCED), as adopted by United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) member States in 2011;

(b) To gather important analytical information for the implementation of education for sustainable development (ESD) after the third phase of implementation came to an end, countries were given the possibility to add concluding remarks, i.e., on the main successes, challenges and implications for future implementation for each of the Strategy's objectives;

(c) Where appropriate, references to educator competences in ESD as developed by the ECE Expert Group on Competences were added (indicator 3.1);

(d) Where appropriate, references to the priority action areas as adopted by the Steering Committee at its seventh meeting (Geneva, 1–2 March 2012) (ECE/CEP/AC.13/2012/2, para. 48) were included (indicator 2.3);

(e) Descriptive remarks on indicators that referred only to phases I and II of the first implementation period were revised to reflect the requirements of phase III, i.e., focusing on an analysis of implementation and implementation outcomes;

(f) Issue 9 of the 2010 reporting template ("Describe any assistance needed to improve implementation") was revised to read "Future implementation of education for sustainable development", focusing on priorities for the future ESD implementation framework.

5. In 2018, to reflect the requirements and priorities of the 2017–2019 implementation phase, outlined in the framework for the future implementation of the Strategy (ECE/BATUMI.CONF/2016/11), in consultation with the Bureau, the secretariat has introduced the following changes to the 2014 reporting template developed by the Expert Group:

(a) The tables with ISCED levels provided in the "yes/no" part of indicators 1.2.2, 2.2.1, 2.3.1, 2.3.2, 2.3.3, 2.4.1 and 4.2.2 have been updated to reflect the growing interest in technical and vocational education and training by adding the relevant ISCED programme orientation category for vocational education,

as follows: 25. Lower secondary vocational education; 35. Upper secondary vocational education; 45. Post-secondary non-tertiary vocational education; 55. Short-cycle tertiary vocational education. Similarly, the tables containing a breakdown by ISCED levels provided in appendixes I (a), (b) and (c) and appendix III have been also updated with the inclusion of these additional levels 25, 35, 45 and 55 for vocational education. Countries are invited to assess these levels if they have relevant information and data;

(b)     The title of indicator 1.3 "National policies support synergies between processes related to sustainable development (SD) and ESD" has been revised to read "National policies support synergies between processes related to the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), sustainable development (SD) and ESD";

(c)     A new sub-indicator 1.3.1 "Does your country have a stand- alone 'sustainable development', 'global understanding', 'international understanding' policy, plan or law in place, in each case using 'sustainable development' language?" has been added;

(d)     Former sub-indicator 1.3.1 "Is ESD part of SD policy(ies) if these exist in your country?" has been renamed as sub-indicator 1.3.2;

(e)     A new sub-indicator 2.4.2 "Which of the following dimensions of learning is your country planning to reinforce in student assessment or examinations in the next five years, in relation to ESD?" has been added, which includes the following options for an answer: (a) Knowledge; (b) Skills and competencies; (c) Values and attitudes; (d) Behaviours; (e) None; and (f) No information available;

(f)     Issue 9 of the 2014 reporting template ("Future implementation of education for sustainable development") has been revised to read "Describe any assistance needed in implementing the Strategy in your countries", as the political mandate for the future implementation of the Strategy has since been agreed at the High-level Meeting of Education and Environment Ministries in 2016;

(g)     Appendix I (a) has been revised and several new themes have been added to the listing of proposed themes, as follows: "Sustainable lifestyles"; "Gender equality"; "Oceans and sea"; "Renewable energy"; "Sustainable cities and communities"; and "Culture's contribution to sustainable development". Also, several themes have been revised as follows: "Ethics and philosophy" has been revised to read "Environmental ethics and philosophy"; "Citizenship, democracy and governance" has been revised to read "Global citizenship, democracy and governance"; "Environmental protection (waste management, etc.) has been revised to read "Environmental protection (waste management, environmental monitoring, risk assessment, etc.)"; "Climate change" has been revised to read "Climate change and desertification"; and "Economics" has been revised to read "Economic growth and good jobs".

6. The main elements of the reporting procedure are as follows:

(a) ECE member States should prepare reports through a transparent consultative process involving all relevant stakeholders at the national or State level;

(b) Although the "yes/no" part of sub-indicators was required to be reported on in the initial phase I (2007) and the "descriptive" part in phase II (by 2010) and phase III (by 2015), countries are encouraged to report on the full set of indicators at the end of each phase, to the extent possible, in line with a country's progress in implementing the Strategy for ESD;

(c) Thirty-eight member States reported on a voluntary basis by preparing reports for the Environment for Europe Ministerial Conference in Batumi in 2016. Thirty-six member States submitted national implementation reports for the Environment for Europe Ministerial Conference in Belgrade in 2007, and 36 member States responded to the first formal call for reporting in 2010. Countries are requested to prepare an updated version of their most recent report for 2018;

(d) Reports should be submitted to the secretariat electronically in Word format. The text should be in English. Member States are also encouraged to provide the text in the two other official languages of ECE, French and Russian. Reports will be made available in the languages in which they are received. No editing will be provided;

(e) The deadline for submission of reports to the secretariat, taking into account United Nations document management procedures, is 1 November 2018;

(f) The ECE secretariat will post the reports on its website;

(g) The ECE secretariat will prepare a synthesis report for 2019, highlighting achievements, identifying challenges and drawing conclusions regarding future ESD implementation. It is expected that the reporting results will be presented at the fourteenth meeting of the Steering Committee in 2019;

(h) Key stakeholders are encouraged to provide the secretariat with their reports on programmes or activities that support the implementation of the Strategy.

7. The key documents for the preparation of the 2018 national implementation reports include the following:

(a) The UNECE Strategy for Education for Sustainable Development (CEP/AC.13/2005/3/Rev.1);

(b) The format for reporting presented in annex I to the present document;

(c) The guidance for reporting on the implementation of the UNECE Strategy for Education for Sustainable Development (ECE/CEP/AC.13/2009/5);

(d) The first progress report on the implementation of the Strategy (2005–2007), "Learning from each other: achievements, challenges and the way forward" (ECE/BELGRADE.CONF/2007/INF/3-ECE/CEP/AC.13/2007/2 and Add.1 and Corr.1);

(e) The second evaluation report on the implementation of the Strategy (2008–2010), "Learning from each other: achievements, challenges and ways forward" (ECE/CEP/AC.13/2012/3);

(f) The third evaluation report on the implementation of the Strategy (2011–2015), "Learning from each other: achievements, challenges and ways forward" (ECE/CEP/AC.13/2016/3);

(g) The publication: Ten Years of the UNECE Strategy for Education for Development — Evaluation Report on the Implementation of the UNECE Strategy for Education for Sustainable Development from 2005 to 2015 (ECE/CEP/179).

8. A proposed timeline for reporting is provided in annex II to the present document.

## Annex I

### Format for reporting on implementation of the UNECE Strategy for Education for Sustainable Development

#### Implementation phase: 2017–2019

The following report is submitted on behalf of the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic in accordance with the decision of the ECE Steering Committee on Education for Sustainable Development.

Name of officer (national focal point) responsible for submitting the report: Duishenova Jyldyz

Signature:

Date: November 1st, 2018

Full name of the institution: The State Agency on Environmental Protection and Forestry under the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic.

Postal address: 142 Gorky Str., Bishkek 720005

Telephone: +996 312 549123

Email: duishenova.j@gmail.com

Website: www.ecology.gov.kg

Contact officer for national report (if different from above):

A.    Provide brief information (not more than half a page) on the process by which this report has been prepared, including information on which types of public authorities were consulted or contributed to its preparation, how the stakeholders were consulted and how the outcome of this consultation was taken into account and on the material used as a basis for the report.

☐ Governmental institutions (please specify)  State Agency for Environmental Protection and Forestry of the Kyrgyz Republic, Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic

☐ Stakeholders: Academy of Public Administration under the President of the Kyrgyz Republic, Osh Humanitarian Pedagogical Institute, Republican Institute for Advanced Studies and Retraining of Teachers, Republican Children and Youth Center for Ecology, Local History and Tourism, Primary Vocational Education Agency at the Ministry of Education and Science and others

☐ NGOs (please specify) BIOM, Yrystan and others.

☐ Academia (please specify) Kyrgyz Academy of Education, Academy of Public Administration under the President of the Kyrgyz Republic, Osh Humanitarian Pedagogical Institute, Republican Institute for Advanced Studies and Retraining of Teachers and others.

☐ Business (please specify) _____

☐ Other (please specify) _____


B.    Report any particular circumstances that help clarify the context of the report — for example, whether the decision-making structure is federal and/or decentralized, and whether financial constraints are a significant obstacle to implementation. (This information should not exceed half a page.)

The Kyrgyz Republic declared its commitment to the UNECE Strategy on ESD in March 2005 at a high-level meeting in Vilnius. Since then, national documents on sustainable development have been adopted. Nevertheless, many initiatives on ESD in the country are implemented with the support of international organizations and projects. Most of the initiatives remain unrealized due to lack of sufficient funding.

| Issue[1] 1. | Ensure that policy, regulatory and operational frameworks support the promotion of ESD |
|---|---|
| *If necessary, provide relevant information on your country situation regarding this specific objective (up to 1,500 characters with spaces).* | |
| **Indicator 1.1** | **Prerequisite measures are taken to support the promotion of ESD** |
| Sub-indicator 1.1.1 | Is the UNECE Strategy for ESD available in your national[2] language(s)? |
| Yes ☒ No ☐ | *Please specify languages.* **Kyrgyz language** |
| Sub-indicator 1.1.2 | Have you appointed a national focal point to deal with the UNECE Strategy for ESD? |
| Yes ☒ No ☐ | *If yes, please specify in which ministry(ies)/department(s) the focal point(s) is(are) located.* <br> **The State Agency on Environmental Protection and Forestry under the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic** |
| Sub-indicator 1.1.3 | Do you have a coordinating body for implementation of ESD? |
| Yes ☒ No ☐ | *Please specify its mandate and coordinating mechanism. Please also specify whether its mandate covers implementation of the UNECE Strategy for ESD.* |
| Sub-indicator 1.1.4 | Do you have a national implementation plan for ESD? |
| Yes ☒ No ☐ | *Please specify whether this plan includes implementation of the UNECE Strategy for ESD and please indicate the Internet address where it is accessible.* <br><br> There is no specific national implementation plan for ESD. However, ESD and Environmental Education issues are reflected in the following National strategy and policy documents: <br> 1. The Concept of Ecological Safety in the Kyrgyz Republic <br> 2. The Concept of Kyrgyzstan as a Green Economy Country <br> 3. The Concept of Sustainable Development of the Issyk-Kul Environmental and Economic System 2020 <br> 4. Priorities for the Protection of Biodiversity in the Kyrgyz Republic in 2013-2023, and the Action Plan for 2013-2017 <br> 5. The National Strategy on Conservation of Snow Leopard in the Kyrgyz Republic 2013-2023, and the Action Plan for 2013-2017 <br> 6. The Programme on Stopping the use of Ozone-depleting chemicals in 2016-2020 (Phase 3) <br> 7. Priority Trends on Adaptation to Climate Change in the Kyrgyz Republic <br> 8. The Concept of Forestry Development in the Kyrgyz Republic <br> 9. The National Sustainable Development Strategy of the Kyrgyz Republic in 2013-2017, approved by the Presidential Decree no. 11, dated January 21st, 2013; section 4.1. "Education and Science Sectoral Reform" <br> 10. Priorities on Wetlands Conservation in the Kyrgyz Republic 2023, and the Action Plan for 2013-2017 <br> 11. The Concept of Education Development in the Kyrgyz Republic 2020 <br><br> At the present, a range of national strategy and policy documents on sustainable development are being drafted. <br><br> • NATIONAL DEVELOPMENT STRATEGY OF THE KYRGYZ REPUBLIC 2018-2040 |

---

1 Issues 1 to 6 herein are in accordance with the objectives (a)-(f) set out in the UNECE Strategy for ESD (CEP/AC.13/2005/3/Rev.1, para. 7).

2 For countries with a federal government structure, all references to "national" apply to "State", as appropriate. In this context, "data at the national level" means aggregated data received from sub-State entities.

| Sub-indicator 1.1.5 | Are there any synergies at the national level between the ECE ESD process, the Global Action Programme on Education for Sustainable Development as follow-up to the United Nations Decade of Education for Sustainable Development after 2014,[3] and other policy processes relevant to ESD? |
|---|---|
| | National Strategic Documents on Sustainable Development. |
| Yes ☒  No ☐ | *Please specify and list major documents.* |
| | National Sustainable Development Strategy documents; Draft Ecological Code of the Kyrgyz Republic contains a chapter on ESD and Environmental Education. |
| **Indicator 1.2** | **Policy, regulatory and operational frameworks support the promotion of ESD** |
| Sub-indicator 1.2.1 | Is ESD reflected in any national policy[4] document(s)? |
| Yes ☒  No ☐ | *Please specify and list any major document(s).* |
| | The National Sustainable Development Strategy 2013-2017, Section 4.1.; approved by the Presidential Decree no. 11, dated January 21st, 2013; |
| | Programme and the Action Plan of the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic on the NSDS Implementation, Section 4.2.; approved by the Government's Resolution no.218, dated April 30th, 2013; approved by the Parliamentary Resolution no.3694-V, dated December 18th, 2013; |
| | Government's Resolution no.201, dated March 23rd, 2012; |
| | The Concept of Education Development in the Kyrgyz Republic 2020; |
| | The Education Development Strategy in the Kyrgyz Republic 2012-2020. |

---

[3] See A/69/76.

[4] Policy documents may include national strategies, plans, programmes, guidelines and the like.

| Sub-indicator 1.2.2 | Is ESD: (a) addressed in relevant national education legislation/regulatory document(s); and (b) included in your national curricula and/or national standards, ordinances or requirements at all levels of formal education, as understood by your education system in accordance with ISCED?[5] |
|---|---|
| | The adoption of the National Sustainable Development Strategy (NSDS) has revised the top priorities and the existing state policies trends, including in the area of state services. The concept of sustainable development is based on the cross section of and equal allocation of political attention to the domains of society, environment and economy. Such policies include social and economic development measure, social justice measure, environmental management, ecological safety and sustainable use of resources. |
| | NSDS sets the following tasks for the education sector: In Section 4.1. Education and Science Sector Reform it states "It is important to highlight revision of school education contents, introduction of subject-relevant standards for new generation, provision of textbooks, as well as creation of inductive conditions for the development of information technologies, especially in remote schools. It is necessary to create a safe, tolerant and culturally diverse education environment in each school, to ensure inclusivity of the education system, and to ensure access to education for children with special needs and for children from socially vulnerable families… The top priority of contemporary teaching activity should focus on shaping of spiritual and moral fundamentals of personality through cultural and spiritual values and national traditions. Upbringing and education should be naturally intertwined processes… Any, even the most progressive education contents, would render itself useless unless new education technologies are introduced." |
| | ESD issues are incorporated into the state standard of higher pedagogical education. |
| | In addition, the Kyrgyz Education Academy works on incorporating ESD issues and SDG 2030 into the contents of teaching through the state education standard of school education, curricula, etc. |
| a) Yes ☒  No ☐ <br> b) Yes ☒  No ☐ | *If yes, please specify details for (a) and (b).* <br><br> *Please also fill in the table by ticking (✔) as appropriate.* |

| ISCED levels 2011 | a) Yes | b) Yes |
|---|---|---|
| 0. Early childhood education | X | |
| 1. Primary education | X | |
| 2. Lower secondary education | X | |
| 25. Lower secondary vocational education | X | |
| 3. Upper secondary education | | |
| 35. Upper secondary vocational education | | |
| 4. Post-secondary non-tertiary education | | |
| 45. Post-secondary non-tertiary vocational education | | |
| 5. Short-cycle tertiary education | | |

---

5  See http://uis.unesco.org/en/topic/international-standard-classification-education-isced.

| | 55. Short-cycle tertiary vocational education | | |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| | 6. Bachelor's or equivalent level | X | |
| | 7. Master's or equivalent level | | |
| | 8. Doctoral or equivalent level | | |

| Sub-indicator 1.2.3 | Are non-formal and informal ESD addressed in your relevant national policy and/or regulatory document(s) and operational frameworks? |
| --- | --- |
| Yes ☒ No ☐ | *Please specify.* <br> • The National Sustainable Development Strategy of the Kyrgyz Republic in 2013-2017, approved by the Presidential Decree no. 11, dated January 21st, 2013; section 4.1. "Education and Science Sectoral Reform"; <br> • Programme and the Action Plan of the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic on the NSDS Implementation, Section 4.2.; approved by the Government's Resolution no.218, dated April 30th, 2013; approved by the Parliamentary Resolution no.3694-V, dated December 18th, 2013; <br> • The Concept of Ecological Safety in the Kyrgyz Republic; <br> • The Concept of Kyrgyzstan as a Green Economy Country; <br> • The Concept of Sustainable Development of the Issyk-Kul Environmental and Economic System 2020; <br> • Priorities for the Protection of Biodiversity in the Kyrgyz Republic in 2013-2023, and the Action Plan for 2013-2017; <br> • The National Strategy on Conservation of Snow Leopard in the Kyrgyz Republic 2013-2023, and the Action Plan for 2013-2017; <br> • The Programme on Stopping the use of Ozone-depleting chemicals in 2016-2020 (Phase 3) <br> • Priority Trends on Adaptation to Climate Change in the Kyrgyz Republic; <br> • The Concept of Forestry Development in the Kyrgyz Republic; <br> • The National Sustainable Development Strategy of the Kyrgyz Republic in 2013-2017, approved by the Presidential Decree no. 11, dated January 21st, 2013; section 4.1. "Education and Science Sectoral Reform"; <br> • Priorities on Wetlands Conservation in the Kyrgyz Republic 2023, and the Action Plan for 2013-2017; <br> • The Concept of Education Development in the Kyrgyz Republic 2020. |
| Sub-indicator 1.2.4 | Is public awareness in relation to ESD addressed in relevant national document(s)? |
| Yes ☒ No ☐ | *Please specify.* <br> The National Sustainable Development Strategy of the Kyrgyz Republic in 2013-2017 (approved by the Presidential Decree no. 11, dated January 21st, 2013) addresses this issue, as well as the following documents: <br> 1.    The Concept of Ecological Safety in the Kyrgyz Republic <br> 2.    The Concept of Kyrgyzstan as a Green Economy Country <br> 3.    The Concept of Sustainable Development of the Issyk-Kul Environmental and Economic System 2020 <br> 4.    Priorities for the Protection of Biodiversity in the Kyrgyz Republic in 2013-2023, and the Action Plan for 2013-2017 <br> 5.    The National Strategy on Conservation of Snow Leopard in the Kyrgyz Republic 2013-2023, and the Action Plan for 2013-2017 <br> 6.    The Programme on Stopping the use of Ozone-depleting chemicals in 2016-2020 (Phase 3) |

| | |
|---|---|
| | 7.     Priority Trends on Adaptation to Climate Change in the Kyrgyz Republic<br>8.     The Concept of Forestry Development in the Kyrgyz Republic<br>9.     The National Sustainable Development Strategy of the Kyrgyz Republic in 2013-2017, approved by the Presidential Decree no. 11, dated January 21st, 2013; section 4.1. "Education and Science Sectoral Reform"<br>10.   Priorities on Wetlands Conservation in the Kyrgyz Republic 2023, and the Action Plan for 2013-2017<br>11.   The Concept of Education Development in the Kyrgyz Republic 2020<br>These documents foresee all public awareness issues, including ESD issues. |
| Sub-indicator 1.2.5 | Does a formal structure for interdepartmental[6] cooperation relevant to ESD exist in your Government? |
| Yes ☒  No ☐ | *Please specify.*<br>The National Council on Sustainable Development under the President of the Kyrgyz Republic (Resolution of the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic no.251, dated November 24th, 2012). |
| Sub-indicator 1.2.6 | Does a mechanism for multi-stakeholder cooperation on ESD exist with the involvement of your Government?[7] |
| Yes ☒  No ☐ | *Please specify.*<br>The National Council on Sustainable Development was created to serve as a political platform for national consultations and reaching agreement on the issues of sustainable development of Kyrgyzstan. The Council is composed of representatives of political parties, key state agencies, business community, international donor organizations, and stakeholder civil society groups. |
| Sub-indicator 1.2.7 | Are public budgets and/or economic incentives available specifically to support ESD? |
| Yes ☒  No ☐ | *Please specify.*<br>Public budgets are allocated under the funding devoted to education standard based teaching. In addition, the Republic's Environmental Protection and Forestry Development Fund allocates funding to promote ESD annually. |
| **Indicator 1.3** | **National policies support synergies between processes related to the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), sustainable development (SD) and ESD** |
| Sub-indicator 1.3.1 | Does your country have a stand☐alone "sustainable development", "global understanding", "international understanding" policy, plan or law in place, in each case using "sustainable development" language? |
| Yes ☒  No ☐ | *Please specify.*<br>The National Sustainable Development Strategy (NSDS) 2013-2017; Programme and Action Plan of the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic on the NSDS Implementation, Section 4.2, approved by the Government's Resolution no.218, dated April 30th, 2013, approved by the Parliamentary Resolution no.3694-V, dated December 18th, 2013. |
| Sub-indicator 1.3.2 | Is ESD part of SD policy(ies) if these exist in your country? |
| Yes ☒  No ☐ | *Please specify.*<br>*Yes, it is. The Kyrgyz Republic declared its commitment to fulfil SDG 2030. It is part of the following policies: The National* |

---

6  Between State bodies.
7  For an explanation, see paragraph 46 of the UNECE Strategy for ESD.

| | |
|---|---|
| | *Sustainable Development Strategy (NSDS) 2013-2017; Programme and Action Plan of the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic on the NSDS Implementation, Section 4.2, approved by the Government's Resolution no.218, dated April 30th, 2013, approved by the Parliamentary Resolution no.3694-V, dated December 18th, 2013.* <br><br> ESD issues are incorporated into the state standard of higher pedagogical education. There are activities aimed at introducing ESD issues to the school curriculum; the work is carried out in cooperation with the Kyrgyz Education Academy. <br><br> In addition, the Kyrgyz Education Academy currently works to integrate the ESD issues and SDG 2030 into the contents of education through state education standard of school teaching, curricula, teaching materials, etc. With the UNESCO support, the ESD and SDG 2030 issues are being included to the system of teacher training and re-training. |
| *Concluding remarks on issue 1* | *Please provide any concluding remarks you may have concerning the implementation of issue 1, which corresponds to objective (a) under the Strategy, namely, to ensure that policy, regulatory and operational frameworks support the promotion of ESD* |
| | *Please address in particular the following questions:* <br><br> – *Which actions and/or initiatives have been particularly successful and why?* <br><br> – *What challenges did your country encounter when implementing this objective?* <br><br> – *What other considerations have to be taken into account in future ESD implementation concerning this objective?* <br><br> At the moment, the education system in the Kyrgyz Republic consists of early childhood education for children between 3 and 6 years old; primary education (forms 1 to 4); lower secondary education (forms 5 to 9); upper secondary education (forms 10 and 11); as well as, three levels of vocational education: lower secondary, upper secondary and post-secondary vocational education. <br><br> In addition to the formal education sector, there are many informal education institutes and organizations that offer supplementary education, professional development and retraining in compliance with the market needs and requirements. In 2014, education funding amounted to 6.5% of GDP as compared to 5.8% in 2010. Education expenses as compared to the general expenses of the national budget increased from 18.6% in 2010 to 21.4% in 2014. However, the structure of budgetary education expenses has not been optimised yet due to the lack of resources: about 85% of allocated funds cover salaries, utility bills and other maintenance services; only 10 to 15% of allocated funding is directed towards schools development. It should be noted that while literacy rate for the population between 15 to 24 years old is quite high (99.7%), the quality of education is a source of considerable discontent. Studies of functional literacy of students demonstrated that more than 60% of 4th form students and 80% of 8th form students do not have basic literacy skills. Outdated contents, lack of textbooks and weak development of information technologies challenge the task of providing quality education services to school students. Teacher qualification plays an important role to ensure the quality of education. More than 80% of school teachers in the Kyrgyz Republic have higher education. However, pilot testing of teachers demonstrated that only 62% of teachers passed the test; the rest have proved to be insufficiently competent in their subject. There is a need to improve the existing approaches to preparing future teachers, as well as the need to amend the qualification attribution system in order to diversify education services and ensure better accounting of teacher/educator needs through offering professional development vouchers. In the area of early childhood education the key challenge is school catchment. In 2012, the Ministry of Education and Science reported that the school catchment rate was 15.6%. This was considered a significant achievement given that in the early 2000s the school catchment rate was 11%. <br><br> For the secondary school education level, the key issues are accessibility and quality of education. Location and infrastructure of schools (generally, there are enough schools) do not fully meet the requirements of the |

population. According to the data provided by nongovernmental and international organizations, 3 to 6% of school age children either do not attend school altogether or have to miss school due to, for instance, agricultural fieldwork. Generally, the existing education system is not well adjusted to students with special needs or children from socially vulnerable families. As an outcome, there is a risk of excluding a significant proportion of young Kyrgyz citizens from the education system, which, in the long run, will decrease the potential of human resources of Kyrgyzstan. Transition from education to work is a process that is complicated with the lack of an established occupational guidance system and an underdeveloped labour market. Job hunting is often made difficult due to low competencies of graduates. Secondary and post-secondary vocational training increases employment opportunities. According to the European Training Foundation of 2012, 63.4% graduates got employed in the first five years after graduating from secondary or post-secondary vocational education courses. 26.9% of people with general primary and secondary education only got employed. Correspondingly, 12.4% and 16.7% stayed unemployed. It was noted that graduates of secondary and post-secondary vocational education courses are more successful in finding jobs than university graduates. Nevertheless, vocational training does not always guarantee sufficient qualification for domestic, regional and global labour markets.

Improving the contents of education to ensure sustainable development. Standardisation of education at all levels has started in mid-90s and was aimed to ensure constitutional guarantees of quality education. Implementation of national education standard is obligatory to all educational institutions with no regard to teaching format. However, the education standard sets "the mandatory minimum on the contents of fundamental education programmes", but does not focus on competencies of students. Hence, the top priority of global teaching science nowadays focuses on the need to form a new generation standard, which represents an essential requirement of state and society to create a certain type of graduate, who possesses a set of competencies required for contemporary life. This standard defines outcomes of teaching and learning based on "pedagogically adapted social experience of humankind", which includes understanding urgent contemporary issues, and, among them, the issues of sustainable development. In March 2005, the Kyrgyz Republic together with other countries has officially committed itself to implement the UN ECE's Strategy on Education for Sustainable Development, as well as the UN Decade on Education for Sustainable Development. The important nature of ESD issues was reflected in such normative and legal acts as the National Framework Standard (Curriculum) for General School Education; the Concept of Ecological Safety; and, the Concept of Education for Sustainable Development.

National guidelines were developed on incorporation of sustainable development and green economy issues into policies and programmes of schools and higher education institutions. These materials are based on the rick experience of various organizations working in the area of sustainable development in the Kyrgyz Republic. Public networks and associations focusing on education for sustainable development were created. These networks now cover early childhood education organizations, schools and higher education institutions and help them further the ideas of sustainable development, biodiversity conservation, environmental safety, etc. Pilot projects aiming to creating environmentally friendly education facilities (through ensuring energy efficiency, use of renewable energy sources, sustainable water management, etc.) emerged. Transition to new competency based standard should ensure gradual shift from incorporating sustainable development issues into the education to shaping education for sustainable development. Sustainable development issues are present in the draft subject standards (curriculums) for all education areas. They facilitate transition from science- or subject-centric approach to competency based approach. The competency approach is based on changing knowledge, skills and attitudes of students through prism of competencies, which represent dynamic parameter tied to age relevant psychological changes on one hand and to state and society's expectations with regard to the education system on the other hand. There is ongoing work on implementing sustainable development ideas as part of subject curricula and standards of teaching and learning in the Kyrgyz Republic. The existing subject curricula and new generation standards of teacher education are improved with taking into consideration sustainable development principles, energy efficiency and security. This work takes place under the framework of competence based

|  | education supported with the Framework National Standard (Curriculum). There are plans to create favourable learning environment for children with special needs. Priorities for future include the incorporation of sustainable development themes into all levels of education (climate change, energy efficiency, renewable energy resources, environmental safety, prevention of emergencies, etc.) and the green economy principles in order to form education for sustainable development model. Other tasks include the implementation of social and healthcare inclusivity in education; development of new generation standard for secondary and post-secondary vocational training that would meet the education market's demands, take into consideration sustainable development and green economy; development and issue of teaching materials with taking into consideration sustainable development and green economy. Corresponding amendments and additions to the existing normative and legal acts will be required to ensure legal fundament for adult lifelong education. Education for sustainable development also requires teacher training. Teacher teams tasked to develop and test new teaching materials will need to be formed and trained. There should be communication platforms to discuss competency based standard based on the sustainable development principles. Training courses and learning packages on education for sustainable development will need to be developed for supplementary education structures for school and university students of Kyrgyzstan (eco-clubs, lecture halls, interest groups, etc.). Information campaigns on raising awareness on education for sustainable development at the local, regional and national level will be required too. |
|---|---|

| Issue 2 | Promote SD through formal, non-formal and informal learning |
|---|---|

*If necessary, provide relevant information on your country situation regarding this specific objective (up to 1,500 characters with spaces).*

| Indicator 2.1 | SD key themes are addressed in formal education |
|---|---|
| Sub-indicator 2.1.1 | Are key themes of SD[8] addressed explicitly in the curriculum/programme of study at various levels[9] of formal education? |

| Yes ☒ No ☐ | *Please specify what SD issues are important in the country (i.e., biodiversity, gender, consumption/production, etc.) and how they are addressed in the curricula*<br>1. Interconnectedness of society, economy and environment.<br><br>2. Citizenship, human rights and responsibility, including gender aspects.<br><br>3. Needs and rights of future generations.<br><br>4. Cultural, social and biological diversity.<br><br>5. Quality of life, equality and social justice.<br><br>6. Sustainable changes and development within the capacity of ecosystems.<br><br>Issues 1, 2 and 5 were included to the subject standards for all levels of school education, effective since 2005. At the moment, new generation standards (curricula) are being developed with taking into consideration all sustainable development aspect. The new standards have started been introduced since 2011/12 academic year in the first forms of all Kyrgyz schools and currently active for the entire primary education system. From 2015 updated standards for lower and upper secondary school (5th form and higher) have been gradually introduced. These issues are also part of the standards for secondary and higher vocational training (baccalaureate) developed in 2012/13. The SD issues will also be included to the 2013/14 standards for master's level.<br><br>*Please update the table in appendix I (a) that was used for implementation phases II and III under this sub-indicator, as appropriate, and indicate the results in the box below in accordance with the rating scale set out in the appendix.*<br><br>| A | B | C | D | E | F |<br>|---|---|---|---|---|---|<br>| ☐ | ☐ | ☒ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | |

| Sub-indicator 2.1.2 | Are learning outcomes (skills, attitudes and values) that support ESD addressed explicitly in the curriculum[10]/programme of study at various levels of formal education? |
|---|---|

| Yes ☒ No ☐ | *Please specify what competences as learning outcomes are important in your country.*<br><br>The State Educational Standard of the Secondary General Education of the Kyrgyz Republic approved by Govern- |

---

[8] For details, see paragraph 15 of the UNECE Strategy for ESD.

[9] For the State or federal level, where relevant.

[10] Idem.

ment Resolution no.403, dated July 21st, 2014, identifies three key competencies: Information competence, social and communicative competence, and self-organization and problem solution competence.

Paragraph 13 of the Standard notes that:

The State Educational Standard ensures developing personal traits of student based on the following values:

☐ - Patriotism, respect to national traditions and careful attitude to the cultural and natural riches of Kyrgyzstan;

☐ - Understanding and adopting basic democratic and civil rights and freedoms, awareness of the moral point of freedom in its integral connection to responsibility, and ability to make and stand for personal decision;

☐ - Understanding and adopting the value of cultural diversity as the fundament of tolerant behaviour in social, political and cultural life, affiliation with mother language and culture with simultaneous adoption of cultural and spiritual values of the peoples of one's country and world;

☐ - Self-respect and ability to realise one's personal potential, readiness to proactive work that ensures personal welfare in the current social and economic conditions;

☐ - Commitment to sustainable development principles, prevention of negative social and environmental consequences of technological development, safety norms and healthy lifestyle.

Based on the State Standard (approved by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic in 2009 and by the Government in 2014), new generation subject standards have been developed. These standards define subject competencies, which include the above mentioned values as part of expected education outcomes.

They are also part of the currently developed learning outcomes requirements of the new generation standards for lower secondary and upper secondary education.

For example, "Native Studies" subject competencies for primary school include the following:

☐ Ability to observe and categorise, pose questions and identify cause and effect

☐ Ability to explain the world around us, work with information, analyse and evaluate various occurrences and events

☐ Ability to investigate and set problems

☐ Ability to use and explain how to use correctly technologies to improve quality of life

☐ Ability to discuss and appreciate historical events, be proud of traditions and customs of Kyrgyzstan

☐ Ability to create, draw and develop ideas on geography, social and environmental matters

☐ Ability to work independently, be aware of one's rights, bear responsibility for one's actions, health, etc., make decisions, and develop self-esteem.

☐ Ability to communicate with others (take into account other people's opinions)

☐ Ability to work in team and interact with others in a multi-ethnic society

☐ Ability to carry out one's responsibilities as Kyrgyz citizen.

Other subjects incorporate ESD issues in similar way.

The State Education Standard for Higher Professional Education lists 8 directions of teacher training (baccalaureate) that recommend teaching materials for teacher training.

*Please update the table in appendix I (b) that was used for implementation phases II and III under this sub-indicator, as appropriate, and indicate the results in the box below in accordance with the rating scale set out in the appendix.*

| | A | B | C | D | E | F |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | ☐ | ☐ | ☒ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ |

| | |
|---|---|
| Sub-indicator 2.1.3 | Are teaching and learning methods that support ESD addressed explicitly in the curriculum[11] or programme of study at various levels of formal education? |
| Yes ☒ No ☐ | *Please specify which methods are of particular significance in your country. Please also specify for non-formal education, as appropriate.* <br><br> The State Educational Standard of the Secondary General Education of the Kyrgyz Republic in Section 3 "Requirements on Structure and Process of Teaching" notes the following: <br><br> • The requirements on conditions of the standard implementation, in particular with regard to education process, are set in order to achieve the identified objectives of the standard. <br> • Results oriented teaching process aiming to develop individual competencies in students requires using various activities to shape students' proactive approach their personal learning. Learning technology is an instrument to include students in the activities that would develop their capacity. <br> • Technological approach to education engages student in a range of new interactions, which include peer-to-peer interaction (in pairs or groups), constructive interaction (either individual or in group) with teacher; and, independent work with various types of information. <br> • Learning technologies increases students' independence in learning and encourages their responsibility for outcomes of their education. In this regards, Kyrgyz schools increasingly use interactive learning technologies, project activities, which also include sustainable social and environmental development. This process is less wide-spread, but still present in the vocational training system of the Kyrgyz Republic. <br><br> *In compliance with the model of state education standard of primary vocational training approved by the Government Resolution no. 41, dated January 22nd, 2018, graduate of mainstream primary vocational training course should be able to:* <br> - *Have **general competencies** compliant with qualification level acquired in the course of comprehensive teaching and educational process;* <br> - *Have **professional competencies** compliant with the basic types of professional activities;* <br> - *In the area of **personal development**, the key purpose of basic vocational training is shaping the following social and personal qualities of student: determination, good organizational skills, diligence, responsibility, civic consciousness, good communication skills, tolerance, and cultural progress.* <br><br> *In addition, draft curriculum on civic values is being developed for primary vocational training institutions.* |
| | *Please also update the table in appendix I (c) that was used to report on implementation phases II and III, as appropriate, and indicate the results in the box below in accordance with the rating scale set out in the appendix.* |
| **Indicator 2.2** | **Strategies to implement ESD are clearly identified** |
| Sub-indicator 2.2.1 | Is ESD addressed through: (a) existing subjects[12] only?; (b) a cross-curriculum approach?; (c) the provision of specific subject programmes and courses?; (d) a stand-alone project?[13]; (e) other approaches? |

---

11 Idem.

a) Yes ☒ No ☐
b) Yes ☒ No ☐
c) Yes ☒ No ☐
d) Yes ☒ No ☐
e) Yes ☒ No ☐

*Please specify for different levels of education system in accordance with ISCED by ticking ( ✓ ) in the table as appropriate.*

| ISCED levels 2011 | a) Yes | b) Yes | c) Yes | d) Yes | e) Yes |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 0. Early childhood education | X | | | X | |
| 1. Primary education | X | X | | | |
| 2. Lower secondary education | X | X | X | X | |
| 25. Lower secondary vocational education | X | X | X | X | |
| 3. Upper secondary education | | | | | |
| 35. Upper secondary vocational education | | | | | |
| 4. Post-secondary non-tertiary education | | | | | |
| 45. Post-secondary non-tertiary vocational education | | | | | |
| 5. Short-cycle tertiary education | | | | | |
| 55. Short-cycle tertiary vocational education | X | X | | X | |
| 6. Bachelor's or equivalent level | | | | | |
| 7. Master's or equivalent level | | | | | |
| 8. Doctoral or equivalent level | | | | | |

*Please also provide information about the incentives on the national level for implementing (a), (b), (c), (d), and (e).*

| **Indicator 2.3** | **A whole-institution approach[14] to SD/ESD is promoted** |
|---|---|
| Sub-indicator 2.3.1 | Do educational institutions[15] adopt a "whole-institution approach" to SD/ESD? |

Yes ☐ No ☒

*The Steering Committee has adopted as one priority action area that every school adopts an ESD school plan by 2019.[16] ESD school plans are one means to implement a whole-institution approach. Please provide information on the implementation of this priority action area in your country.*

At the moment, there are no specific plans on education for sustainable development. In 2014, the Concept on Up-bringing School and Other Students of the Kyrgyz Republic 2020, which aims to implement the values set forth in the National Sustainable Development Strategy of the Kyrgyz Republic. A part of the Concept focuses on environ-

---

12  E.g., geography or biology. For higher education, "subject" means "course".

13  A project is interpreted as a discrete activity with its own time allocation rather than a teaching or learning method.

14  A "whole institution approach" means that all aspects of an institution's internal operations and external relationships are reviewed and revised in the light of SD/ESD principles. Within such an approach each institution would decide on its own actions, addressing the three overlapping spheres of Campus (management operations); Curriculum; and Community (external relationships).

15  For higher education institutions: whole-university, whole-college or whole-faculty approach (including inter-faculty approaches).

16  See paragraph 20 of the framework for the future implementation of the UNECE Strategy for Education for Sustainable Development.

mental, civic and multicultural upbringing, which facilitates ESD objectives, tasks and principles. Each Kyrgyz school has its own implementation plan for this Concept.

*Also, please provide information for all levels of your education system in accordance with ISCED by ticking (✔) in the table as appropriate and specify for non-formal and informal education, as appropriate.*

| **ISCED levels 2011** | *Yes* |
|---|---|
| 0. Early childhood education | |
| 1. Primary education | |
| 2. Lower secondary education | |
| 25. Lower secondary vocational education | |
| 3. Upper secondary education | |
| 35. Upper secondary vocational education | |
| 4. Post-secondary non-tertiary education | |
| 45. Post-secondary non-tertiary vocational education | |
| 5. Short-cycle tertiary education | |
| 55. Short-cycle tertiary vocational education | |
| 6. Bachelor's or equivalent level | |
| 7. Master's or equivalent level | |
| 8. Doctoral or equivalent level | |

| Sub-indicator 2.3.2 | Are there any incentives (guidelines, award scheme, funding, technical support) that support a whole-institution approach to SD/ESD, including the implementation of ESD school plans? |
|---|---|
| Yes ☐  No ☒ | *If yes, please specify what schemes are available for all levels of your education system.*<br><br>*Please also provide information on all education levels in accordance with ISCED by ticking (✔) in the table as appropriate.* |

| ISCED levels 2011 | *Yes* |
|---|---|
| 0. Early childhood education | |
| 1. Primary education | |
| 2. Lower secondary education | |
| 25. Lower secondary vocational education | |
| 3. Upper secondary education | |
| 35. Upper secondary vocational education | |
| 4. Post secondary non-tertiary education | |
| 45. Post-secondary non-tertiary vocational education | |
| 5. Short-cycle tertiary education | |
| 55. Short-cycle tertiary vocational education | |
| 6. Bachelor's or equivalent level | |
| 7. Master's or equivalent level | |
| 8. Doctoral or equivalent level | |

*Please also specify for non-formal and informal education, as appropriate. If relevant information is available please also specify (provide examples).*

| Sub-indicator 2.3.3 | Do institutions/learners develop their own SD/ESD indicators for their institution/organization? |
|---|---|
| Yes ☒  No ☐ | *Please specify (i.e., provide examples of how this is done) for formal institutions as well as for non-formal institutions.*<br><br>*Please also indicate for all levels of your education system in accordance with ISCED, by ticking (✔) in the table as appropriate:*<br><br>*(a) For formal institutions:* |

| ISCED levels 2011 | Yes |
|---|---|
| 0. Early childhood education | |
| 1. Primary education | |
| 2. Lower secondary education | |
| 25. Lower secondary vocational education | |
| 3. Upper secondary education | |
| 35. Upper secondary vocational education | |
| 4. Post-secondary non-tertiary education | X |
| 45. Post-secondary non-tertiary vocational education | |
| 5. Short-cycle tertiary education | X |
| 55. Short-cycle tertiary vocational education | |
| 6. Bachelor's or equivalent level | |
| 7. Master's or equivalent level | |
| 8. Doctoral or equivalent level | |

*(b) For non-formal institutions:*

| ISCED levels 2011 | Yes |
|---|---|
| 0. Early childhood education | |
| 1. Primary education | |
| 2. Lower secondary education | |
| 25. Lower secondary vocational education | |
| 3. Upper secondary education | |
| 35. Upper secondary vocational education | |
| 4. Post-secondary non-tertiary education | |
| 45. Post-secondary non-tertiary vocational education | |
| 5. Short-cycle tertiary education | |
| 55. Short-cycle tertiary vocational education | |
| 6. Bachelor's or equivalent level | |
| 7. Master's or equivalent level | |
| 8. Doctoral or equivalent level | |

| Indicator 2.4 | ESD is addressed by quality assessment/enhancement systems |
|---|---|
| Sub-indicator 2.4.1 | (a) Are there any education quality assessment/enhancement systems?:[17] (b) Do they address ESD?; (c) Are there any education quality assessment/enhancement systems that address ESD in national systems? |

| a) Yes ☐ No ☒ <br> b) Yes ☐ No ☒ <br> c) Yes ☐ No ☒ | *Please elaborate.* <br><br> *Also, please specify for various levels of your education system in accordance with ISCED, by ticking ( ✓ ) in the table as appropriate.* |

| ISCED levels 2011 | a) Yes | b) Yes | c) Yes |
|---|---|---|---|
| 0. Early childhood education | | | |
| 1. Primary education | | | |
| 2. Lower secondary education | | | |
| 25. Lower secondary vocational education | | | |
| 3. Upper secondary education | | | |
| 35. Upper secondary vocational education | | | |
| 4. Post-secondary non-tertiary education | | | |
| 45. Post-secondary non-tertiary vocational education | | | |
| 5. Short-cycle tertiary education | | | |
| 55. Short-cycle tertiary vocational education | | | |
| 6. Bachelor's or equivalent level | | | |
| 7. Master's or equivalent level | | | |
| 8. Doctoral or equivalent level | | | |

*Please also specify for non-formal and informal education, as appropriate. If relevant data are available, please also specify this data (i.e., provide examples on how the data was compiled).*

---

17 For higher education institutions: either national centres for quality assessment in higher education or cooperation with general quality assessment agencies, such as the European Foundation for Quality Management (EFQM).

| Sub-indicator 2.4.2 | Which of the following dimensions of learning is your country planning to reinforce in student assessment/examinations in the next five years, in relation to ESD?: (a) Knowledge, (b) Skills and competencies; (c) Values and attitudes; (d) Behaviours; (e) None; (f) No information available. |
|---|---|

| a) Yes ☐ No ☐ <br> b) Yes ☐ No ☐ <br> c) Yes ☐ No ☐ <br> d) Yes ☐ No ☐ <br> e) Yes ☐ No ☐ <br> f) Yes ☐ No ☐ | *Please elaborate.* <br> *Also, please specify for various levels of your education system in accordance with ISCED, by ticking ( ✓ ) in the table as appropriate.* |

| ISCED levels 2011 | a) | b) | c) | d) | e) | f) |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | *Yes* | *Yes* | *Yes* | *Yes* | *Yes* | *Yes* |
| 0. Early childhood education | | | | | | X |
| 1. Primary education | | | | | | X |
| 2. Lower secondary education | | | | | | X |
| 25. Lower secondary vocational education | | | | | | X |
| 3. Upper secondary education | | | | | | X |
| 35. Upper secondary vocational education | | | | | | X |
| 4. Post-secondary non-tertiary educa-tion | | | | | | X |
| 45. Post-secondary non-tertiary voca-tional education | | | | | | X |
| 5. Short-cycle tertiary education | | | | | | X |
| 55. Short-cycle tertiary vocational educa-tion | | | | | | X |
| 6. Bachelor's or equivalent level | | | | | | X |
| 7. Master's or equivalent level | | | | | | X |
| 8. Doctoral or equivalent level | | | | | | X |

*Please also specify for non-formal and informal education, as appropriate. If relevant data are available, please also specify this data (i.e., provide examples on how the data was compiled).*

| **Indicator 2.5** | **ESD methods and instruments for non-formal and informal learning are in place to assess changes in knowledge, attitude and practice** |
|---|---|

| | |
|---|---|
| Sub-indicator 2.5.1 | Are SD issues addressed in informal and public awareness-raising activities? |
| Yes ☒ No ☐ | *Please specify and provide information on new developments and good practice examples.*<br>• Environmental, local heritage and tourism interest groups in schools of Kyrgyzstan<br>• Annual All Republic Workshop on ESD under the UN ESD Decade for assistant principals on upbringing of the vocational training system of the Kyrgyz Republic.<br>• Environmental conferences for school children of the Bishkek City and Chuy Region.<br>• All Republic Environmental Competition "Towards Green Economy via Eco-Friendly Education Facilities!" for students of vocational training institutions.<br>• The Republican Children's and Youth Center for Ecology, Regional Studies and Tourism (RCYCERST) with the support of the State Agency of Environmental Protection and Foresty (SAEPF) regularly publishes information brochures on environmental protection in order raise awareness of the importance of environment.<br>• Public awareness campaign "Protection yourself from the sun" in children's summer camps.<br>• Public awareness campaign on the International Day for the Preservation of the Ozone Layer aimed at school teachers and students is organized by the Ozone Centre of the Kyrgyz Republic in cooperation with SAEPF and RCYCERST.<br>• SAEPF runs annual environmental action "Parks and National Reserves March" with the support of Public Foundation Yrystan and other public and educational organizations in the Kyrgyz Republic.<br>• Distance course on Sustainable Development of Mountainous Regions for school students. Environmental education and upbringing is part of extracurricular activities for school and university students, as well as a mean of raising awareness and educating local communities and the larger public groups (Public Foundation Taalim-Forum). The activities included organization of educational trips around the country for school students, fieldwork teaching through deep dive in local geographic, social and cultural environment, distance courses and summer schools aimed to develop comprehensive holistic thinking, publication of educational and developmental literature on biodiversity and cultural diversity conservation for students and general public, festivals on eco-friendly culture and raising public awareness on such issues as clean environment and ethical consumption. |
| Sub-indicator 2.5.2 | Is there any support for work-based learning (e.g., for small companies, farmers, trade unions, associations) which addresses SD issues? |
| Yes ☒ No ☐ | *Please specify and provide information on new developments and good practice examples.*<br>In the last years, civil and public organizations have become very active and they regularly run various environmental protection events in the Kyrgyz Republic. The Government of the Kyrgyz Republic together with civil society organizations initiated eco action Taza Jashoo. SAEPF researches opportunities to incorporate ESD and green economy into the vocational training system and training of teachers in the vocational training system.<br>In addition, international organizations supported development of SDG and ESD training course for civil service at master's level. |
| Sub-indicator 2.5.3 | Are there any instruments (e.g., research, surveys, etc.) in place to assess the outcomes of ESD as a result of non-formal and informal learning? |
| Yes ☐ No ☒ | *Please specify in particular which instruments were the most effective in assessing the outcomes of ESD as a result of non-formal or informal learning.* |

| Indicator 2.6 | ESD implementation is a multi-stakeholder process[18] |
|---|---|
| Sub-indicator 2.6.1 | Is ESD implementation a multi-stakeholder process? |
| Yes ☒ No ☐ | *Please specify the main stakeholders and the main impacts that those stakeholders had/have on implementation. Please update the information provided in the previous table for appendix II as appropriate.* Each year there are information theme-specific exhibitions and various public awareness events on sustainable development, energy efficiency, climate change and environmental safety for students and teachers from all regions of the country. These events are held in cooperation with nongovernmental organizations. In the course of these events, participants can access consultations, tailored information brochures and posters on above-mentioned topics. Teaching materials for master's level education and a range of teaching books with ESD principles were published with the financial and organizational support of the Education Reform Programme of the Soros Foundation-Kyrgyzstan under the higher education reform assistance project and with the support of the international SPARE project of the Norwegian Society for the Conservation of Nature and the Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs and BIOM: |
| | • The State Education Standard of Higher Education in 8 tracks of teacher education (baccalaureate) approved by the Pedagogic Directorate of the Ministry of Education of the Kyrgyz Republic. |
| | • Teaching materials to prepare bachelor degree holders on the subjects of science and pedagogy. |
| | • Teaching materials for master's level courses on psychology of education, contemporary issues of science and education, and history of world civilizations. |
| | • Guidelines on teacher school placement. |
| | • School placement log book for teachers in training. Experience on introduction of ESD principles to the higher education system was shared with the representatives of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic, largest universities of Bishkek, Naryn, Talas, Osh and Issyk-Kul regions, as well as to the members of the National Council on Education Reform. Meeting were held to discuss education issues under the framework of the Programme of Transition to sustainable development in 2013-2017. Also, there were discussions on prospects of introducing ESD and resources management to the university teacher training. New state standards of teacher training at baccalaureate level and teaching materials on competency based approach were presented. With the support of the UNDP and under the framework of the practical component, brochures on "Recommendations on building energy efficient ovens" and "How to make your house warm" were issued in Russian and Kyrgyz. Also, bilingual posters "Solar Power Stations", "Solar Energy", "Solar Photovoltaic Electric Stations", "Micro hydro power electric stations", "Save Lowland Forests of Kyrgyzstan", "Solar Energy for Kyrgyzstan", "Natural Ecosystems are Fundament of Sustainable Development", "Red Book Flora of Kyrgyzstan", "Biodiversity of Issyk-Kul: Rare and Nearly Extinct Species", and "Stable Climate – Healthy Nation" were issued. The environmental movement BIOM issues information bulletins in Kyrgyz and Russian "Information Bulletin of School Project on Conservation of Resources and Energy" no.1, information bulletin "Climate Change" no.2, information bulletin Energy Efficiency"no.3, information bulletin "Sustainable Development and Biodiversity" no.4. BIOM also issued "Water as a Resource" no.5 in Russian and prepares information bulletin "Safe School" no.6. In addition the following teaching materials were published: teaching book for forms 9-11 "Energy and Environment", guidelines for teachers of forms 9-11 "Energy and Environment", guidelines for supervising teachers on classroom hours in |

---

18  For higher education institutions: this covers the issue of university "outreach" (meaning a wide spectrum from regional integration, business cooperation and transdisciplinarity to eco-procurement and research-education-cooperation).

| | forms 8-11, and guidelines on running extracurricular activities and science interest groups on sustainable development, energy efficiency and environmental safety. |
|---|---|
| *Concluding remarks on issue 2* | *Please provide any concluding remarks you may have concerning the implementation of issue 2, which corresponds to objective (b) under the Strategy, namely to promote sustainable development through formal, non-formal and informal learning.* |
| | *Please address in particular the following questions:*<br><br>– *Which actions and/or initiatives have been particularly successful and why?*<br><br>– *What challenges did your country encounter when implementing this objective?*<br><br>– *What other considerations have to be taken into account in future ESD implementation concerning this objective?*<br><br>ESD implementation as a multi stakeholder process in the Kyrgyz Republic can be considered satisfactory because events of this kind highlight both strong and weak aspects of the process. The past events, such as conferences, seminars, round tables, public discussions and environmental actions, increase the potential of stakeholders and key implementers. In future, it is important to ensure funding opportunities when including ESD to the state programmes. |
| **Issue 3** | **Equip educators with the competence to include SD in their teaching** |
| *If necessary, provide relevant information on your country situation regarding this specific objective (up to 1,500 characters with spaces).* | |
| **Indicator 3.1** | **ESD is included in the training[19] of educators** |
| Sub-indicator 3.1.1 | Is ESD a part of educators' initial training?[20] |
| Yes ⊠ No ☐ | *In particular specify which ESD competences[21] are explicitly included in the study programmes.* The State Educational Standard for Secondary General Education of the Kyrgyz Republic describes three key competencies. In accordance with the categories of resources that are used by a person in personal and professional spheres (information resources, other people and groups of people, personal qualities and capabilities of a person himself/herself), one can indicate the following key competences:<br><br>1) Information competence - assumes the ability of a person to work with information: to search purposefully for missing information, to compare individual fragments, to possess the skills for making holistic analysis and hypotheses. It allows a person to make conscious decisions based on the critically meaningful information;<br><br>2) Social and communicative competence - the willingness to relate own intentions and wishes with the interests of other people and social groups, to defend own points of view in a civilized manner based on the recognition of the diversity of positions and respect for the values (religious, ethnic, professional, personal) of other people. Willingness to receive the necessary information through a dialogue and present it verbally and in writing to resolve personal, social, and professional |

---

19  ESD is addressed by content and/or by methodology.

20  For higher education institutions: the focus is here on existing teacher training at universities/colleges regarding SD and ESD for university/college teachers.

21  For a set of core competences in ESD please see the report by the ECE Expert Group on Competences, *Learning for the future: Competences in Education for Sustainable Development* (ECE/CEP/AC.13/2011/6), available online from http://www.unece.org/education-for-sustainable-development-esd/publications.html.

|  | problems. It allows to use the resources of other people and social institutions for solving own problems;<br>3)   Competence "Self-organization and resolution of problems" - readiness to detect contradictions in information, educational and life situations and to resolve them using various methods, independently or in interaction with other people, as well as to make decisions about further actions.<br><br>The State Educational Standard for Higher Vocational Education in 8 areas of Pedagogical Education (Bachelor degree) has the following competences:<br><br>•   Readiness to create a developing environment for training and education in accordance with the principles of person-centered education and to form a safe educational environment for learning and sustainable development;<br>•   Knowledge and acceptance of different attitudes, worldviews, and cultural diversities. The State Educational Standard for Higher Vocational Education in the areas of Pedagogical Education (Master's degree program) the following competences are presented:<br>•   General pedagogical competencies: Ability to use the existing educational opportunities and to create a safe educational environment for learning and sustainable development;<br>•   Special pedagogical competencies: Understanding of the values of inclusive education, readiness to take into account various points of view that are important for coordinating ideas about a sustainable future; Knowledge of the peculiarities of personal development in a multicultural environment (cultural diversity and multilingualism), ability to form an environment conducive to the satisfaction of cultural needs and cultural development of certain groups of the population.<br><br>In addition, since 2016, the Kyrgyz Republic has been implementing the UNESCO project "Sustainability Begins with Teachers in Central Asia". Within the framework of this Project, five educational institutions are engaged in the integration of the issues of SDG 2030, in particular, goals 4.7 into the system of training and retraining of teaching staff.<br><br>The leading universities take part in this Project: the Academy of Public Administration under the President of the Kyrgyz Republic (APAPKR), the Republican Institute for Advanced Training and Retraining of Teachers (RIATRT), the Institute for Advanced Studies and Personnel Training named after Rakhimova (IASPT) , the Osh Humanitarian Pedagogical Institute and the Kyrgyz Academy of Education (KAE). |
|---|---|
| Sub-indicator 3.1.2 | Is ESD a part of the educators' in-service training?[22] |
| Yes ☒   No ☐ | *In particular specify which ESD competences are explicitly included in training programmes. Please also specify to what extent the training programmes are mandatory or optional.*<br><br>Annually, on-job trainings for improvement of teachers' competences are conducted in all regions of Kyrgyzstan and in the city of Bishkek. These trainings and seminars are also conducted to integrate the ESD issues (Education for sustainable development) into the subjects, teaching by these teachers. These seminars are organized by State Agency for Environment Protection and Forestry of the Kyrgyz Republic (SAEPF KR) in partnership with the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic (MOS KR), Republican Children and Youth Centre for Environment, Local History and Tourism (RCEHT), the Kyrgyz Academy of Education (KAE), the Ozone Center of the Kyrgyz Republic, non-governmental and international organizations.<br>Teachers receive a set of informational materials to use in classes and extracurricular activities. Teachers elaborate |

---

22  For higher education institutions: the focus is here on existing in-service training programmes regarding SD and ESD for university/college teachers in their own universities/colleges.

lessons by using posters, newsletters, and teaching aids.

Methodological seminars on key topics of ESD are held annually in Bishkek in partnership with the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic for methodologists of Regional Institutes and Education Centers from Chui, Naryn, Issyk-Kul, Osh, Jalal-Abad, Talas regions and the city of Bishkek in the fields of physics, chemistry, biology and geography.

In the framework of the UNESCO Project "Sustainability Begins with Teachers of Central Asia" five educational institutions are engaged in the integration of SDG 2030, in particular, goals 4.7 into the system of training and retraining of teaching staff. The following universities take part in the Project: the Academy of Public Administration under the President of the Kyrgyz Republic, the Republican Institute for Advanced Training and Retraining of Teachers, the Institute for Advanced Studies and Personnel Training named after Rakhimova, Osh Humanitarian Pedagogical Institute and the Kyrgyz Academy of Education. The seminars on how to integrate ESD and SDG 4.7 into the teaching subjects were conducted for teachers in the Russian and Kyrgyz languages.

*Please also update the information provided under the phase III national implementation reporting in appendix III.*

| Sub-indicator 3.1.3 | Is ESD a part of training of leaders and administrators of educational institutions? |
|---|---|
| Yes ☒ No ☐ | *Please specify which ESD competences are explicitly included in training programmes. Please also specify to what extent the training programmes are accessible and whether they are mandatory or optional.*<br><br>The Kyrgyz Academy of Education (Bishkek), as well as the Educational Institutions and Education Centers (all 7 oblasts of the Kyrgyz Republic are covered), the RSMC (Republican Scientific and Methodological Center) of Initial Vocational Education, which are engaged in the professional development of educators, carry out Teacher Training Programs. Further training is carried out, according to the Law "On Education", at least once in 5 years. Directors and Vice-Principles of general educational institutions are delivered both, the lectures on management in education, etc., related to the performance of their functional duties, and the lectures aimed at familiarizing with the key documents of the country, including the National Strategy for Sustainable Development. The training programs include the competences in the field of organizational activity and environmental-sustainable development issues in general. |
| **Indicator 3.2** | **Opportunities exist for educators to cooperate on ESD** |
| Sub-indicator 3.2.1 | Are there any networks/platforms of educators and/or leaders/administrators who are involved in ESD in your country? |
| Yes ☒ No ☐ | *Please specify.*<br><br>• The network of schools and universities of the Ozone Center of the Kyrgyz Republic annually issues informational, educational and methodological resources for teachers in the framework of environmental educational activities on ESD and the protection of the ozone layer. The network is very extensive and active.<br>• Republican Children and Youth Centre for Environment, Local History and Tourism (RCEHT) – implements its activities in the territory of the country. It includes more than 2000 schools that are actively working in such areas as education for sustainable development, environmental education, local history, and tourism. Annually, within the |

| | |
|---|---|
| | framework of the national environmental campaign "Live, the Earth", "Marsh of Parks", the national seminars for secondary school teachers are held. During these seminars, teachers receive the information about the ESD issues, enhancement of the competences of teachers on the ESD, as well as integration of the ESD items into the curricula and training courses of special topics.<br>• International educational institution "SAPAT", which includes 14 Kyrgyz-Turkish lyceums.<br>• The SPARE School Network (School Project on the use of Resources and Energy). Each school received sets of informational-educational materials on sustainable development, energy efficiency and climate change, environmental safety, sanitation, etc.<br>• Network of "Schools and Universities on Water Quality in Kyrgyzstan", etc.<br>• The AKMENA school network - helps schools to integrate sustainability issues into the curricula of such subjects such as physics, biology, chemistry, geography, and mathematics, as well as to develop environmental projects, to conduct researches, and to make exciting discoveries that promote the sustainable lifestyle of teachers and parents; The UNESCO Network of schools; The Healthy Schools Network helps to promote knowledge and skills of healthy lifestyles in schools, refusal from smoking, drinking alcohol and improving one's health; university/college teachers in their own universities/colleges.<br>• The School Network of the Taalim Forum NGO - contributes to the preservation of traditional knowledge, dissemination of the knowledge received through implementing training programs and application of the knowledge on environmental protection;<br>• "Peremena" deals with civic education, human rights, environmental and economic debates, interactive teaching methods for teachers, a network of schools and universities for human rights, etc.<br><br>RCE- Kyrgyzstan (Regional Center of Expertise on Education for Sustainable Development) was created as a platform aimed at combining the efforts of various organizations to develop education for the preservation of mountain ecosystems, ESD, sustainable development, biodiversity conservation and the revival of national environmental traditions in the system of local self-government. However, it did not achieve the goals set fully due to lack of funding and the necessary expertise. Currently the network is not functioning actively. |
| Sub-indicator 3.2.2 | Are ESD networks/platforms supported by the Government in any way?[23] |
| Yes ☒  No ☐ | *Please specify how, listing the major ones, and describing them as appropriate.*<br>Every year, RFNPFD (the Republican Fund for Nature Protection and Forestry Development) under the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic, functioning under SAEPF KR, allocates funds for the Republican Children and Youth Centre for Environment, Local History and Tourism (RCEHT) and others to conduct activities on ESD and environmental education - "March of Parks and Reserves", seminars and trainings on environmental education and ESD, etc. |
| *Concluding remarks issue 3* | *Please provide any concluding remarks you may have concerning the implementation of issue 3, which corresponds to objective (c) under the Strategy, namely to equip educators with the competence to include sustainable development in their teaching.* |
| | *Please address in particular the following questions:*<br><br>– *Which actions and/or initiatives have been particularly successful and why?*<br>– *What challenges did your country encounter when implementing this objective?*<br>– *What other considerations have to be taken into account in future ESD implementation concerning this objec-* |

---

23  Including assistance through direct funding, in-kind help, political and institutional support.

| | *tive?* |
|---|---|
| | Teachers' competences are enhanced mainly by the SAEPF, the Kyrgyz Academy of Education (KAE), Academy of Public Administration under the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic (APAG KR), Republican Institute for Advanced Studies and Retraining of Pedagogical Workers under the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic (RIASRPW) , Institute for Advanced Training and Retraining of Personnel, Osh State Pedagogical Institure, RSMC (Republican Scientific Methodological Center) of initial vocational education, as well as by the civil sector. This process involving a wide range of stakeholders in the Kyrgyz Republic can be considered as satisfactory. |
| | The workshops and trainings for teachers make a positive contribution to enhancing capacities of teachers in ESD. |
| | However, support by the Government and increased funding, as well as the organization of ongoing education courses for teachers in all regions of the country could give a powerful impetus for a more successful implementation of ESD at all levels of education. |
| | In the future, it is necessary to anticipate funding when ESD issues are included in state programs. |
| **Issue 4** | **Ensure that adequate tools and materials for ESD are accessible** |
| *If necessary, provide relevant information on your country situation regarding this specific objective (up to 1,500 characters with spaces).* | |
| **Indicator 4.1** | **Teaching tools and materials for ESD are produced** |
| Sub-indicator 4.1.1 | Does a national strategy/mechanism for encouragement of the development and production of ESD tools and materials exist? |
| Yes ☐ No ☒ | *Please describe.* |
| Sub-indicator 4.1.2 | Is public (national, subnational, local) authority money invested in this activity? |
| Yes ☒ No ☐ | *Please specify to what extent public money is invested in this activity, by providing an indication of the amount (in United States dollars (USD)) for annual expenditures on ESD-related research and development.* |
| | Annually, the RFNPFD (the Republican Fund for Nature Protection and Forestry Development) under the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic allocates FINANCIAL RESOURCES (about 25 thousand US dollars_ for the production and development of training materials, and holding events, seminars and conferences. |
| **Indicator 4.2** | **Quality control mechanisms for teaching tools and materials for ESD exist** |
| Sub-indicator 4.2.1 | Do you have quality criteria and/or quality guidelines for ESD-related teaching tools and materials that are: (a) supported by public authorities?; (b) approved by public authorities?; (c) tested and recommended for selection by educational institutions? |
| a) Yes ☒ No ☐<br>b) Yes ☒ No ☐<br>c) Yes ☐ No ☒ | *Please specify.*<br><br>In 2006, the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic approved the "Regulations and Practical Guidelines for Evaluating of the Content and Structure of Textbooks of the New Generation".<br><br>The document defines the development principles and parameters for the evaluation of textbooks and manuals for secondary schools:<br><br>1. Reflection of universal human values<br>2. Development of human capacities |

| | 3. Compliance with the state educational standards, etc. |
| | Each parameter has a number of indicators, for example: |
| | • Multiculturalism<br>• Gender Sensitivity<br>• Human rights<br>• Citizenship<br>• The secular nature of the interpretation of materials<br>• Political correctness<br>• Stimulation of educational and cognitive activity (development of competencies)<br>• Orientation on life skills, etc. |
| | In March 2014, the Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic adopted an order "On the Revision of the Regulations and Practical Guidelines for Evaluating Textbooks of the New Generation". It describes the need to improve the document "taking into account the requirements of the National Sustainable Development Strategy and the Program and Action Plan of the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic to implement the National Strategy for Sustainable Development ", as well as the State Educational Standard and subject standards of the new generation. |
| | Accordingly, the assessment indicators related to the implementation of the sustainable development issues in textbooks and teaching materials will be strengthened. |
| | In 2012, the Kyrgyz Academy of Education (KAE) approved a document on assessment of the Learning and Teaching Support Kit for the schools, which provides specific criteria for evaluating of textbooks. The document defines the design principles and parameters for the evaluation of textbooks and manuals for secondary schools. |

| Sub-indicator 4.2.2 | Are ESD teaching tools and materials available: (a) in national languages?; (b) for all levels of education according to ISCED? |
|---|---|
| a) Yes ☒  No ☐<br>b) Yes ☒  No ☐ | *Please specify. If the answer is yes for (b), please specify by ticking (✔) in the table as appropriate.* |

| ISCED levels 2011 | *Yes* |
|---|---|
| 0. Early childhood education | X |
| 1. Primary education | X |
| 2. Lower secondary education | X |
| 25. Lower secondary vocational education | X |
| 3. Upper secondary education | |
| 35. Upper secondary vocational education | |
| 4. Post-secondary non-tertiary education | |
| 45. Post-secondary non-tertiary vocational education | |
| 5. Short-cycle tertiary education | |
| 55. Short-cycle tertiary vocational education | |
| 6. Bachelor's or equivalent level | X |
| 7. Master's or equivalent level | X |
| 8. Doctoral or equivalent level | X |
| 9. No information available | |

| **Indicator 4.3** | **Teaching tools and materials for ESD are accessible** |
|---|---|
| Sub-indicator 4.3.1 | Does a national strategy/mechanism for dissemination of ESD tools and materials exist? |
| Yes ☐  No ☒ | *Please describe and in particular highlight which measures are the most efficient for dissemination.* |
| Sub-indicator 4.3.2 | Is public authority money invested in this activity? |
| Yes ☐  No ☒ | *Please specify to what extent by providing an indication of the amount in USD, and please also mention any other significant sources of funding.* |
| Sub-indicator 4.3.3 | Are approved ESD teaching materials available through the Internet? |

| | |
|---|---|
| Yes ☒ No ☐ | *Please describe and name in particular official Internet sites.*<br>http://elearning.carececo.org<br>http://www.biom.kg,<br>http://www.spareworld.org<br>http://edu-resource.net/,<br>http://csip.asia<br>http://www.akmena.org<br>http://www.taalimforum.kg<br>etc. |
| Sub-indicator 4.3.4 | Is a register or database of ESD teaching tools and materials in the national language(s): (a) accessible through the Internet?; (b) provided through other channels? |
| a) Yes ☒ No ☐<br>b) Yes ☒ No ☐ | *For (a) and (b) please specify and mention by whom it was established and by whom it is managed.*<br>Practically the majority of the resources are created with the support of international organizations and are managed by state and public organizations that own the resources. |
| *Concluding remarks on issue 4* | *Please provide any concluding remarks you may have concerning the implementation of issue 4, which corresponds to objective (d) under the Strategy, namely, to ensure that adequate tools and materials for ESD are accessible.* |
| | *Please address in particular the following questions:*<br>– *Which actions and/or initiatives have been particularly successful and why?*<br>– *What challenges did your country encounter when implementing this objective?*<br>- *What other considerations have to be taken into account in future ESD implementation concerning this objective?* |
| **Issue 5** | **Promote research on and development of ESD** |

*If necessary, provide relevant information on your country situation regarding this specific objective (up to 1,500 characters with spaces).*

The science. The Ministry of Education and Science conducts a policy in the field of science to strengthen the scientific and technological capacity and increase the contribution of science and technology in solving the socio-economic problems of the Kyrgyz Republic.

The science management system is focused on three institutions:
• MES,
• National Academy of Sciences of the Kyrgyz Republic,
• Kyrgyzpatent.

The regulatory support of the development of science is determined by the laws of the Kyrgyz Republic "On Science and the Basis of the State Scientific and Technical Policy", "On the System of Scientific and Technical Information", etc.

However, these laws mainly identify institutional problems of the functioning of science. Besides, they do not clearly define actions that would be aimed at supporting the introduction of innovations in science, new forms of organization of scientific activity, etc. The personnel issue in the field of science is largely related to economic problems, including the aging of the laboratory equipment and the inability to perform modern research there; a decline in the prestige of scientific activity; poorly established system of search and selection of talented young people to attract them to scientific activities, and, as a result, the aging of scientific personnel, the weakening of the previously existing scientific schools.

The Program and Action Plan of the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic for the implementation of NSDS (section 4.2) is approved by the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic on April 30, 2013 No. 218, approved by the resolution of the Jogorku Kenesh of the Kyrgyz Republic of December 18, 2013 No. 3694-V

The subject of fundamental and applied researches is focused on the problems of sustainable development of the country and the transition to a "green economy" (by 2015 - at least 50% of topics) Priority 3: "Reorienting the field of science, including university studies, to work with a specific customer, focused on the promotion of sustainable development of the country" is planned to advance through the following objectives: (i) the introduction of the achievements of fundamental and applied sciences into the practice to ensure the sustainable development of the country; (ii) functional analysis of scientific institutions; (iii) training of young people to carry out research activities. To solve the first objective, it is planned to implement the following activities: (i) develop a regulatory-legal framework that allows the universities to use at least 10% of the amount of money from the special funds to conduct researches; (ii) elaborate priority areas for the development of science, including the projects that are economically significant for the sustainable development of the country (based on the universities and research institutes under the universities). To solve the second objective, the following activities will be implemented: (i) optimize the number and topics (subject matters) of the researches; (ii) recognize PhD diplomas of foreign universities that are in the main world rankings; (iii) attract foreign specialists and Kyrgyz people having international experience in the framework of international projects for teaching in higher education institutions of Kyrgyzstan and managing the graduate students, as well as participating in the dissertation commissions; (iv) modernize the science management system for the sustainable development of the industry and implementation of a coherent policy in the field of research; (v) create research institutes on the basis of universities; (vi) ensure the regulatory legal framework for the creation and operation of the Science Fund for accumulating funds to conduct researches and to ensure fulfillment of the innovative researches through open competition; (vii) ensure the documentation of the results of scientific works, the constant replenishment of the databases with scientific, technical and personnel information. To train young people for conducting researches (the third objective) the following activities will be implemented: (i) create a system for searching and selecting talented young people for involving in scientific activities; (ii) for conducting researches attract the young scientists who had internships or studied at foreign universities or other educational (scientific) institutions, as well as researchers (iii) introduce the citation index of the Kyrgyz scientists in the process of examining scientific projects and evaluating activities of scientists

| Indicator 5.1 | Research[24] on ESD is promoted |
|---|---|
| Sub-indicator 5.1.1 | Is research that addresses content and methods for ESD[25] supported? |
| Yes ☐ No ☒ | *Please specify in particular the most important outcomes of supported research.* |
| Sub-indicator 5.1.2 | Does any research evaluate the outcome of the implementation of the UNECE Strategy for ESD? |
| Yes ☐ No ☒ | *Please specify which subjects were investigated and list major reports.* |

---

24 These include support from various sources, such as State, local authorities, business and non-governmental organizations or institutions.

25 E.g., concepts; formation of attitudes and values; development of competencies, teaching and learning; school development; implementation of information communications technology; and means of evaluation, including socioeconomic impacts.

| Sub-indicator 5.1.3 | Are post-graduate programmes available:<br>(1) On ESD:[26] (a) for the master's level?; (b) for the doctorate level?;<br>(2) Addressing ESD: (a) for the master's level?; (b) for the doctorate level? |
|---|---|
| 1)<br>a) Yes ☐ No ☒<br>b) Yes ☐ No ☒<br><br><br><br>2)<br>a) Yes ☐ No ☒<br>b) Yes ☐ No ☒ | *Please specify what programmes are available and list the most important academic dissertations that address ESD.* |
| Sub-indicator 5.1.4 | Are there any scholarships supported by public authorities for post-graduate research in ESD: (a) for the master's level; (b) for the doctorate level? |
| a) Yes ☐ No ☒<br>b) Yes ☐ No ☒ | *Please provide information on (a) and (b).* |
| **Indicator 5.2** | **Development of ESD is promoted** |
| Sub-indicator 5.2.1 | Is there any support for innovation and capacity-building in ESD practice?[27] |
| Yes ☒ No ☐ | *Please specify what main projects were/are being implemented to that end.* |
| **Indicator 5.3** | **Dissemination of research results on ESD is promoted** |
| Sub-indicator 5.3.1 | Is there any public authority support for mechanisms[28] to share the results of research and examples of good practices in ESD[29] among authorities and stakeholders? |
| Yes ☐ No ☒ | *Please specify and provide information about where published research and dissertations are accessible.* |

---

26 ESD is addressed by substance and/or by approach.

27 Activities may include projects, action research, social learning and multi-stakeholder teams.

28 E.g., conferences, summer schools, journals, periodicals, networks.

29 E.g., the "participatory approach"; links to local, regional and global problems; an integrative approach to environmental, economic and social issues; an orientation to understanding, preventing and solving problems.

| Sub-indicator 5.3.2 | Are there any scientific publications: (a) specifically on ESD?;(b) addressing ESD? |
|---|---|
| a) Yes ☒ No ☐<br>b) Yes ☒ No ☐ | *Please name the major publications for (a) and (b).*<br><br>*1.* Report on implementation of the UNECE Strategy for education for sustainable development in Kyrgyz Republic. Within the frame work of the UN Decade of EfSD (2005-2014). 2007 http://www.unece.org/env/esd/Implementation/reportsGov/pilot/Kyrgyzstan_eng.pdf<br>2. Sharing public opinion and informing the public about environmental ptotection issues by carrying out annual ecological ac tivities "Tenirim koldosun" by means of interdepartmental and intersectoral cooperation. Duishenova J., Amanaliyev M. www.unece.org/env/esd/GoodPractices/Submissions/Countries/Kyrgyzstan/National%20Agency%20for%20Environmenal%20Protection%20and%20Forestry/National%20Agency%20for%20Environmental%20Protection%20and%20Forestry_e.pdf<br>3. Duyshenova D., Postnova E. Progress review in education for sustainable development in the Kyrgyz Republic. – BHU Bulletin<br>4. Regional network of partners of the CAREC Environmental Education Programme is widening. New contacts with heads of Career Enhanc ement Institutes (CEI) of Uzbekistan, Kazakhstan, Tajikistan and Kyrgyzstan have been set up as with a new targ et group. http://www.carec.kz/english/news/06.07.2007/06.07.2007.htm<br>5. The concept of environmental safety of the Kyrgyz Republic. State Agency for Environmental Protection and Forestry under the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic.<br>6. Duyshenova Zh., Sadykova Ch. M .. Education for Sustainable Development in Kyrgyzstan. RCE-Kyrgyzstan II Republican Congress of Teachers<br>7. Duishenova Jyldyz, Sadykova Chinara M. "Kyrgyzstan Regional Centers of Expertise on Education for Sustainab le Develo p-ment implementation with priority to Mountain ecosystems conservation" Eco-Peace UNEP Leadership programme (Korea, Seoul) February 2008<br>8. Sadykova Chinara, Duishenova Jyldyz "RCE Kyrgyzstan implementation" book chapter in "RCE in Practice: Case Studies of the Regional Centres of Expertise on Education for Sustainable Development" this book will be present on III RCE International Conference in Barcelona Spain July 2008.<br>9. Domashov I.A., Kirilenko A.V., Korotenko V.A., Postnova E.A. School of Sustainable Development.<br>10. RCE Kyrgyzstan Factsheet website: http://www.ias.unu.edu/resource_centre/RCE%20Kyrgyzstan%20 -%20Russian.pdf.<br>11. RCE Kyrgyzstan Factsheet website - Englsih, Russian and kyrgyz version http://www.ias.unu.edu/resource_centre/RCE%20Kyrgyzstan.pdf.<br>12. Karasayeva A.Kh., Shukurov E.J., Rodina E.M., Sadykova Ch.M., Duyshenova Zh.K. Sustainable Development. Manual for teachers of higher education institutions of the Kyrgyz Republic on the implementation of the goals and principles of ESD. PA AKMENA "Steps towards sustainable schools", Manual<br>13. KEN WEBSTER'S BOOK and E. POSTNOVA "Common sense and stability"<br>14. Manual for higher education institutions, PA KAYBEREN Aigul Kerimkulovna Bekbolotova<br>15. Eco-sanitation Mannual / BIOM Guidelines<br>16. "Energy and the Environment" – Guidelines of BIOM and others.<br>17. "Analytical review of the ESD integration and green economy issues into the VET system", RCE-RG and OA AKMENA in partnership with SAEPF and Helvetas support, 2013<br>18. Duishenova Zh.K., Sadykova Ch.M., Chokoeva B.N. "Transition to a "green economy" in the Kyrgyz Republic and small busi-ness: the role of education for sustainable development". Analytical review. B: 2015, 144 p.<br>19. Educational and educational activities in protected areas. Duishenova Zh.K., Shilonosova E.V., B: 2016<br>20. V.A.Korotenko, Zh.K. Duyshenova, A.V. Kirilenko, I.A. Khaliy. Education for Sustainable Development in the Kyrg yz Repub-lic. Analit Review - Bishkek,<br>21. Steady patterns of behavior. Amanaliev MK, B: |

| | |
|---|---|
| *Concluding remarks on issue 5* | *Please provide any concluding remarks you may have concerning the implementation of issue 5, which corresponds to objective (e) under the Strategy, namely, to promote research on and development of ESD.* |
| | – *Which actions and/or initiatives have been particularly successful and why?*<br>– *What challenges did your country encounter when implementing this objective?*<br>– *What other considerations have to be taken into account in future ESD implementation concerning this objective?* |
| | The activities in this direction are carried out by many participants of the ESD process in the country with the assistance of the State Agency for Environment Protection and Forestry of the Kyrgyz Republic and international donor organizations, but insufficient funding does not allow implementing this activity fully. |

| Issue 6 | Strengthen cooperation on ESD at all levels within the ECE region |
|---|---|
| *If necessary, provide relevant information on your country situation regarding this specific objective (up to 1,500 characters with spaces).* ||
| **Indicator 6.1** | **International cooperation on ESD is strengthened within the ECE region and beyond** |
| Sub-indicator 6.1.1 | Do your public authorities cooperate in or support international[30] networks on ESD? |
| Yes ☒ No ☐ | *Please specify concrete networks and explain who supports these networks.*<br>CAREC, EECCA, IACSD, CAI, CA WG ESD, Osh Humanitarian Pedagogical Institute, RCE network under the UN University in Japan, etc. |
| Sub-indicator 6.1.2 | Do educational institutions or organizations (formal and non-formal) in your country participate in international networks related to ESD?<br><br>*Spare BIOM Network,* RCE-Network under the UN University in Japan, etc. |
| Yes ☒ No ☐ | *Please specify. List major networks.* |
| Sub-indicator 6.1.3 | Are there any state, bilateral and/or multilateral cooperation mechanisms or agreements that include an explicit ESD component? |
| Yes ☒ No ☐ | *Please specify and list the major ones.*<br>CA WG ESD, CAREC, CAI, IACSD, EECCA, IBE |
| Sub-indicator 6.1.4 | Does your Government take any steps to promote ESD in international forums outside the ECE region? |
| Yes ☐ No ☒ | *Please list and describe.* |

---

30  In this context, international associations, working groups, programmes, partnerships, etc., means those at the global, regional and subregional levels.

| | |
|---|---|
| *Concluding remarks on issue 6* | *Please provide any concluding remarks you may have concerning the implementation of issue 6, which corresponds to objective (f) under the Strategy, namely, to strengthen cooperation on ESD at all levels within the ECE region* |
| | *Please address in particular the following questions:*<br><br>- *Which actions and/or initiatives have been particularly successful and why?*<br><br>- *What challenges did your country encounter when implementing this objective?*<br><br>- *What other considerations have to be taken into account in future ESD implementation concerning this objective?*<br><br>The lack of financial resources does not allow the Government of our country to take active steps to promote the ESD issues in international forums outside the UNECE region. |
| **Issue 7** | **Foster conservation, use and promotion of knowledge of indigenous peoples, as well as local and traditional knowledge, in ESD** |

*Provide relevant information on your country situation regarding this specific issue (up to 2,000 characters with spaces). Please be as specific as possible.*

At the level of pre-school education, according to the standard "Pre-school education and child care": 6. The orientation of the content of pre-school education and child care is aimed at:
• familiarizing children with human values, folk customs and traditions;
• social adaptation of the child;

The standard in chapter 4. "Principles of educational activities of the Preschool Educational Institution" states that: 4.4. The pre-school educational organization and persons who provide education and care services for children of pre-school age take into account individual needs and fulfill the following obligations:
• Selection of resources for carrying out educational activities and games, providing the acquisition of practical experience, functional literacy, allowing children to develop fully and comprehensively;
• The traditional materials (felt, skin, leather) are used for such activities as "Acquaintance with the world around", "Designing, application", "Drawing (collage)".
• In the school training course "Korkom Onor" ("Artistic Creativity", the standard was approved in 2005, the standard of the new generation for grades 1-4. - in 2010) (grades 1-7), children learn about the national dwelling (yurt), traditional costume, national ornament, for a number of lessons traditional materials are used to familiarize with elements of a number of national crafts (working with felt, leather, cheegrass, embroidery), using natural traditional dyes, etc.

The Partner Network of Organizations has been operating in the country in the field of traditional knowledge for the preservation of biological and cultural diversity. The projects of the Network are supported by the Christensen Fund and other donor organizations. Activities include conducting  researches on documenting traditional knowledge, providing educational activities through seminars, summer schools, etc., holding festivals, issuing relevant information and educational publications, supporting custodians of traditional knowledge, developing and creating training courses for students on traditional knowledge. Regular regional and international festivals are held, including "Flowering Apricot" (PF "Bio-Muras", Batken Oblast), "Kiyiz Duino", (PF "Min-Kyal") to support artisans of Issyk-Kul Oblast, "Shyrdak" - support for artisans, "Salbuurun" - the revival of traditional hunting with hunting dogs, eagles and archery at a gallop, as well as other activities aimed at supporting local producers and craftsmen. "Karagat" festival (Issyk-Kul oblast) is held with the support of the Alliance of Central Asian Mountain Communities, etc. The Bio-KG Organic Agriculture Movement: holding forums and supporting local producers. The network of community-based organizations "Kyrgyz el Akyl kazyna" is engaged in the collection and preservation of traditional knowledge and the strengthening of local communities (Rural Development Fund). The organization of pastoral schools for farmers teaches people on the use of traditional knowledge in improvement of the socio-economic development of local communities, the sustainable use of pasture resources, growing and harvesting of medicinal herbs, and improvement of landscapes. In the system of vocational training, the Rural Development Fund introduced additional curricula on traditional games, nomadic cuisine, and traditional spiritual values.

The nomadic civilization coexisted harmoniously with the nature. The nomads did not influence on the change in the terrestrial landscape by adapting it to the ecological niche of their residence. The culture and traditions of the nomads were not only militaristic, on the contrary to stereotypes, the nomads spent their free time, holidays, and parties (toi), playing various sports competitions of a physical and intellectual nature. These games have been preserved until today. The Kyrgyz Republic conducts the World Nomad Games (WNG) since 2014 (every two years - 2016, 2018). The World Nomad Games - international ethnic sport games. The basis of the competition was the folk games of the historically nomadic people of Central Asia. WNG make an invaluable contribution to the development of the country.

*What role does this issue play in ESD implementation in your country? Please provide updated information to indicate changes over time.*

| Issue 8 | Describe any challenges and obstacles encountered in the implementation of the Strategy |
|---|---|

*Provide relevant information on your country situation regarding this specific issue (up to 2,000 characters with spaces). Please be as specific as possible.*

Despite of the satisfactory promotion of the ESD issues in the Kyrgyz Republic, in the country as a whole, as well as in the regions, there is still a great need in the expert, advisory and financial support for the ESD process. In implementing the Strategy, the country faced a number of problems and obstacles related to the lack of the necessary experts and resource (financial) capacity. Till nowadays, for many international donor organizations, ESD has not become a priority in their activities, which creates certain difficulties in more successful implementation of the Strategy. It would be good if the UNECE could have risen the status of this issue to a higher level. It would give a powerful impetus to new initiatives in the field of ESD both in the country and in the regions as a whole.

*Please in particular discuss any challenges and obstacles encountered that were not yet mentioned in the concluding remarks on the implementation of the Strategy's main objectives (issues 1–6).*

| Issue 9 | Describe any assistance needed in implementing the Strategy in your countries |
|---|---|

*Provide relevant information on your country situation regarding this specific issue (up to 2,000 characters with spaces). Please be as specific                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             as                                                                                                                                                                                               possible.*
Yes, the National Sustainable Development Strategy of the Kyrgyz Republic for 2013-2017, adopted and approved by the President of the Kyrgyz Republic, suggests that the implementation of ESD will continue to be supported in the country after completing the 3 rd phase of the UNECE Strategy on ESD and the ESD decade. In addition, the Coordination Council of Education for Sustainable Development (CCESD) has been established in the Kyrgyz Republic. The text of the CCESD is translated into the state language and posted on the website www.unece.org. Every year, a number of the state and public organizations implement projects in the field of various aspects of ESD.

However, to promote ESD more effectively, as well as to achieve SD goals, it is necessary to apply new approaches at the global and regional levels (UN and UNECE), as well as to implement target financing of the ESD initiatives and activities in Kyrgyzstan.

# Appendix I (a)

## Indicator 2.1, sub-indicator 2.1.1

Please specify which key themes of SD are addressed explicitly in the curriculum/programme of study at various levels of formal education by filling in the table below. *(Please tick (✔) relevant themes for each level. Use the blank rows to insert additional themes that are considered to be key themes in addressing learning for SD.)*

Also, could you specify which specific themes are of critical importance in your country and why?

| Some key themes covered by sustainable development | ISCED Levels 2011 | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | *0* | *1* | *2* | *25* | *3* | *35* | *4* | *45* | *5* | *55* | *6* | *7* | *8* |
| Peace studies (e.g., international relations, security and conflict resolution, partner-ships) | X | X | X | | X | | | | | | X | | |
| Environmental ethics and philosophy | | | X | | X | | | | | | | | |
| Global citizenship, democracy and governance | | | X | | X | | | | | | X | | |
| Sustainable lifestyles | X | X | X | | X | | | | | | X | | |
| Human rights (e.g., gender and racial and intergenerational equity) | | X | X | | X | | | | | | X | | |
| Poverty alleviation | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Cultural diversity | | | | | X | | | | | | | | |
| Gender equality Repetition | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Biological and landscape diversity | | | | | X | | | | | | | | |
| Environmental protection (waste management, environmental monitoring, risk as-sessment, etc.) | | | X | | X | | | | | | | | |
| Ecological principles/ecosystem approach | | | | | X | | | | | | X | | |
| Natural resource management (e.g., water, soil, mineral, fossil fuels) | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Climate change and desertification | | | | | | | | | | | X | | |
| Personal and family health (e.g., HIV/AIDS, drug abuse) | | | X | | X | | | | | | | | |
| Environmental health (e.g., food and drinking; water quality; pollution) | | | | | | | | | | | | | |

| Some key themes covered by sustainable development | ISCED Levels 2011 | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | 0 | 1 | 2 | 25 | 3 | 35 | 4 | 45 | 5 | 55 | 6 | 7 | 8 |
| Corporate social responsibility | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Production and/or consumption patterns | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Economic growth and good jobs | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Rural/urban development | | | X | | | | | | | | | | |
| Oceans and sea | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Renewable energy | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Sustainable cities and communities | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Culture's contribution to sustainable development | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| **Total** | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Other (countries to add as many as needed) | | | | | | | | | | | | | |

*Note*: Your response will reflect the variety of ESD themes distributed across the ISCED levels. The distribution is more important than the raw number of ticks. The number of ticks may be used for your own monitoring purposes.

The scoring key for this table (maximum 153 ticks; "other" categories not counted) is:

| No. of ticks | 0–9 | 10–16 | 17–39 | 40–75 | 76–112 | 113–153 |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Scale | A | B | C | D | E | F |
| | | | X | | | |

# Appendix I (b)

## Indicator 2.1, sub-indicator 2.1.2

Please specify the extent to which the following broad areas of competence that support ESD are addressed explicitly in the curriculum[31] or programme of study at various levels of formal education, by filling in the table below. *(Please tick (✓) relevant expected learning outcomes for*

---

[31] At the state level, where relevant.

*each level. Use the blank rows to insert additional learning outcomes (skills, attitudes and values) that are considered to be key outcomes in your country in learning for SD.)*

**Table of learning outcomes**

| Competence | Expected outcomes | 0 | 1 | 2 | 25 | 3 | 35 | Pa | 5 | Pa | 5 | Pa | Pa | Pa |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Learning to learn**<br><br>Does education at each level enhance learners' capacity for: | - posing analytical questions/critical thinking? | | X | | | X | | | | | | | | |
| | - understanding complexity/systemic thinking? | | | | | X | | | | | | | | |
| | - overcoming obstacles/problem-solving? | X | X | | | X | | | | | | | | |
| | - managing change/problem-setting? | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | - creative thinking/future-oriented thinking? | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | - understanding interrelationships across disciplines/holistic approach? | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | **Total** | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | - other? (*countries to add as many as needed*) | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| **Learning to do**<br>Does education at each level enhance learners' capacity for: | - applying learning in a variety of life-wide contexts? | X | X | X | | X | | | | | | | | |
| | - decision-making, including in situations of uncertainty? | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | - dealing with crises and risks? | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | - acting responsibly? | | X | X | | X | | | | | | | | |
| | - acting with self-respect? | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | - acting with determination? | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | **Total** | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | - other? (*countries to add as many as needed*) | | | | | | | | | | | | | |

Header span: *1) ISCED Levels*

*Note*: Your response will reflect the variety of ESD themes distributed across the ISCED levels. The distribution is more important than the raw number of ticks. The number of ticks may be used for your own monitoring purposes.

The scoring key for this table (maximum 207 ticks; "other" not counted) is:

| No. of ticks | 0–11 | 12–21 | 22–53 | 54–105 | 106–156 | 157–207 |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Scale | A | B | C | D | E | F |
| | | | X | | | |

# Appendix I (c)

## Indicator 2.1, sub-indicator 2.1.3

Please indicate the teaching/learning methods used for ESD at the different ISCED levels. *(Please tick (✓) relevant teaching or learning methods for each level. Use the blank rows to insert additional teaching or learning methods that are considered to be key methods in your country in teaching and learning for sustainable development.)*

**Table of teaching-learning methods**

| Some key ESD teaching/learning methods proposed by the Strategy[a] | ISCED Levels | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | *0* | *1* | *2* | *25* | *3* | *35* | *Разде* | *Разде 5* | *Разде* | *Разде 5* | *Разде* | *Разде* | *Разде* |
| Discussions | | | X | | X | | | | | | | | |
| Conceptual and perceptual mapping | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Philosophical inquiry | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Value clarification | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Simulations; role playing; games | X | X | X | | X | | | | | | | | |
| Scenarios; modelling | | | X | | X | | | | | | | | |
| Information and communication technology (ICT) | | | X | | X | | | | | | | | |
| Surveys | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Case studies | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Excursions and outdoor learning | X | X | X | | X | | | | | | | | |
| Learner-driven projects | | | X | | X | | | | | | | | |
| Good practice analyses | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Workplace experience | | X | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Problem-solving | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| **Total** | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Other (*countries to add as many as needed*) | | | | | | | | | | | | | |

*Note*: Your response will reflect the variety of ESD themes distributed across the ISCED levels. The distribution is more important than the raw number of ticks. The number of ticks may be used for your own monitoring purposes.

  [a] Please refer to paragraph 33 (e) of the UNECE Strategy for ESD.

The scoring key for this table (maximum 126 ticks; "other" not counted) is:

| No. of ticks | 0–8 | 9–42 | 43–53 | 54–76 | 77–98 | 99–126 |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Scale | A | B | C | D | E | F |
| | | X | | | | |

# Appendix II

## Indicator 2.6, sub-indicator 2.6.1

Please specify to what extent ESD implementation is a multi-stakeholder process by filling in the table below. Please provide examples of good practice. *(Please tick (✔) in both tables (a) and (b) to indicate what types of education stakeholders are involved.)*

Table (a)
**According to the UNECE Strategy for ESD**

| Stakeholders | Classification by UNECE Strategy for ESD | | |
|---|---|---|---|
| | *Formal* | *Non-formal* | *Informal* |
| NGOs | + | + | + |
| Local government | | | |
| Organized labour | | | |
| Private sector | + | + | + |
| Community-based | | | |
| Faith-based | | | |
| Media | | + | |
| Total | | | |
| Other (*countries to add as many as needed*) | | | |

The scoring key for this table (maximum 21 ticks; "other" not counted) is:

| No. of ticks | 0–1 | 2 | 3–5 | 6–10 | 11–15 | 16–21 |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Scale | A | B | C | D | E | F |
| | | | X | | | |

**Table (b)**
According to United Nations Decade of ESD

| Stakeholders | Classification by United Nations Decade of ESD | | | | |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| | *Public aware-ness* | *Quality educa-tion* | *Reorienting education* | *Training* | *Social learn-ing* |
| NGOs | + | + | + | + | + |
| Local government | | | + | | |
| Organized labour | | | | | |
| Private sector | | | | | |
| Community-based | | | | | |
| Faith-based | + | | | | |
| Media | | | | | |
| Total | | | | | |
| Other (*countries to add as many as needed*) | | | | | |

The scoring key for this table (maximum 35 ticks; "other" not counted) is:

| No. of ticks | 0–5 | 6–11 | 12–17 | 18–23 | 24–29 | 30–35 |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Scale | A | B | C | D | E | F |
| | | X | | | | |

# Appendix III

## Indicator 3.1, sub-indicator 3.1.3

Please specify to what extent ESD is a part of the initial and/or in-service educator's training, by filling in the table below by ticking (✓) as appropriate.

| ISCED levels | Percentage of education professionals who have received training[a] to integrate ESD into their practice | |
| --- | --- | --- |
| | *Educators* | *Leaders/administrators[b]* |

| | Initial[c] | | | | | | In service[d] | | | | | | In service[e] | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | **A** | **B** | **C** | **D** | **E** | **F** | **A** | **B** | **C** | **D** | **E** | **F** | **A** | **B** | **C** | **D** | **E** | **F** |
| 0. Early childhood education | X | | | | | | | | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | | | | | | |
| 1. Primary education | X | | | | | | | | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | | | | | | |
| 2. Lower secondary education | X | | | | | | | | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | | | | | | |
| 25. Lower secondary vocational education | X | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 3. Upper secondary education | X | | | | | | | | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | | | | | | |
| 35. Upper secondary vocational education | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 4. Post-secondary non-tertiary education | | | | | | | | | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | | | | | | |
| 45. Post-secondary non-tertiary vocational education | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 5. Short-cycle tertiary education | | | | | | | | | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | | | | | | |
| 55. Short-cycle tertiary vocational education | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 6. Bachelor's or equivalent level | X | | | | | | | | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | | | | | | |
| 7. Master's or equivalent level | X | | | | | | | | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | | | | | | |
| 8. Doctoral or equivalent level | X | | | | | | | | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | | | | | | |
| 9. No information available | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Non-formal | X | | | | | | | | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | | | | | | |
| Informal | X | | | | | | | | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | | | | | | |

[a] Training is understood to include at least one day (a minimum of five contact hours).
[b] See paras. 54 and 55 of the UNECE Strategy for ESD.

<sup>c</sup> Please indicate the number of educators who have received initial training on ESD as a percentage of the total number of educators by the reporting date.

<sup>d</sup> Please indicate the number of educators who have received training on ESD as a percentage of the total number of educators who received in-service teacher training by the reporting date.

<sup>e</sup> Please indicate the number of leaders/administrators who have received training on ESD as a percentage of total number of leaders/administrators who received in-service teacher training by the reporting date.

The scoring key for this table (maximum 100%) is:

| Percentage of educated trainers | 0–5 | 6–10 | 11–25 | 26–50 | 51–75 | 76–100 |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Scale | A | B | C | D | E | F |
| | | | | X | | |

# Appendix IV

# Summary and self-assessment by countries

Please specify the status of efforts to implement the sub-indicators listed in the table below by ticking (✔) as appropriate.

On the basis of the answers to the sub-indicators, please self-assess the status of the implementation of the respective indicator in your country.

If feasible, please specify the methodology used for the self-assessment.

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Indicator 1.1** | **Prerequisite measures are taken to support the promotion of ESD** | ☐ Not started | ☐ In progress | ☐ Developing | ☐ Completed |
| **Indicator 1.2** | **Policy, regulatory and operational frameworks support the promotion of ESD** | ☐ Not started | ☐ In progress | ☐ Developing | ☐ Completed |
| **Indicator 1.3** | **National policies support synergies between processes related to SD and ESD** | ☐ Not started | ☐ In progress | ☐ Developing | ☐ Completed |
| **Indicator 2.1** | **SD key themes are addressed in formal education** | ☐ Not started | ☐ In progress | ☐ Developing | ☐ Completed |
| **Indicator 2.2** | **Strategies to implement ESD are clearly identified** | ☐ Not started | ☐ In progress | ☐ Developing | ☐ Completed |
| **Indicator 2.3** | **A whole-institution approach to ESD/SD is promoted** | ☐ Not started | ☐ In progress | ☐ Developing | ☐ Completed |
| **Indicator 2.4** | **ESD is addressed by quality assessment/enhancement systems** | ☐ Not started | ☐ In progress | ☐ Developing | ☐ Completed |
| **Indicator 2.5** | **ESD methods and instruments for non-formal and informal learning are in place to assess changes in knowledge, attitude and practice** | ☐ Not started | ☐ In progress | ☐ Developing | ☐ Completed |
| **Indicator 2.6** | **ESD implementation is a multi-stakeholder process** | ☐ Not started | ☐ In progress | ☐ Developing | ☐ Completed |
| **Indicator 3.1** | **ESD is included in the training of educators** | ☐ Not started | ☐ In progress | ☐ Developing | ☐ Completed |
| **Indicator 3.2** | **Opportunities exist for educators to cooperate on ESD** | ☐ Not started | ☐ In progress | ☐ Developing | ☐ Completed |

| Indicator 1.1 | Prerequisite measures are taken to support the promotion of ESD | ☐ Not started | ☐ In progress | ☐ Developing | ☐ Completed |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Indicator 4.1 | Teaching tools and materials for ESD are produced | ☐ Not started | ☐ In progress | ☐ Developing | ☐ Completed |
| Indicator 4.2 | Quality control mechanisms for teaching tools and materials for ESD exist | ☐ Not started | ☐ In progress | ☐ Developing | ☐ Completed |
| Indicator 4.3 | Teaching tools and materials for ESD are accessible | ☐ Not started | ☐ In progress | ☐ Developing | ☐ Completed |
| Indicator 5.1 | Research on ESD is promoted | ☐ Not started | ☐ In progress | ☐ Developing | ☐ Completed |
| Indicator 5.2 | Development of ESD is promoted | ☐ Not started | ☐ In progress | ☐ Developing | ☐ Completed |
| Indicator 5.3 | Dissemination of research results on ESD is promoted | ☐ Not started | ☐ In progress | ☐ Developing | ☐ Completed |
| Indicator 6.1 | International cooperation on ESD is strengthened within the ECE region and beyond | ☐ Not started | ☐ In progress | ☐ Developing | ☐ Completed |

## Annex II

## Proposed timeline for reporting

The proposed timeline for the preparation and submission of national implementation reports set out below aims to facilitate the reporting exercise at the national level. Member States are asked to respect the deadline of 1 November 2018 to ensure sufficient time for the preparation of the report on progress in implementation during the first post-2015 phase of implementation of the Strategy at the regional level, and the reflection of any review of implementation in the discussions on education for sustainable development within the framework of the Steering Committee.

| National preparation process | Time required | Tentative timing |
|---|---|---|
| First draft of the report | 1 month | June 2018 |
| Multi-stakeholder consultation on the draft | 1–2 months | July-August 2018 |
| Final report preparation (including translation, where required) | 1 month | September 2018 |
| Deadline for submission of national implementation reports to ECE | | 1 October 2018 |