

Distr.  
GENERAL

Working paper 5 Add.2  
14 November 2006

ENGLISH ONLY

**UNITED NATIONS STATISTICAL COMMISSION and EUROPEAN COMMISSION  
ECONOMIC COMMISSION FOR EUROPE STATISTICAL OFFICE OF THE  
CONFERENCE OF EUROPEAN STATISTICIANS EUROPEAN COMMUNITIES  
(EUROSTAT)**

Joint UNECE/Eurostat Work Session on Migration Statistics  
organised in collaboration with UNFPA  
Edinburgh, Scotland, 20-22 November 2006

Item 3 of the provisional agenda

## THE CHALLENGES OF MEASURING EMIGRATION AND REMITTANCES

### Session 3.1: Measuring emigration through immigration data

Report of the Data Exchange exercise to measure emigration through immigration data of  
receiving countries.

Data Analysis Report, Group 2\*  
(France, Portugal, Spain, United Kingdom)

Submitted by UNECE/Eurostat Task Force on Measuring Emigration Using Data

## I. INTRODUCTION

1. In the framework of the UNECE/Eurostat Task Force on Measuring Emigration Using Data Collected by the Receiving Country, four clusters of countries were organized, in order to promote a more effective data exchange. One of them gathered France, Portugal, Spain and the United Kingdom, designated as Group 2. It is the description and analysis of data exchanged in this group of countries that is the object of the current report. The methodology used in this work was the same as for the other groups of countries. A first round of data collection was made, regarding data on migration flows. A set of eight common tables, used as templates, was sent to the individual countries, to be filled in with the national statistical information. A second round of data collection regarded migration stocks, including two sets of tables. Each of these rounds

---

\* This paper has been prepared by João Peixoto (ISEG/INE Portugal), Cláudia Pina and Paula Paulino (INE Portugal) at the invitation of the secretariat.

also included the filling of information sheets with metadata, i.e., methodological information about the data inscribed in the tables. A first draft version of the current report, including the integration and analysis of the data, was sent to the individual countries, in order to obtain corrections and new insights.

2. This report is organised as follows. First, the availability of data is reviewed, taking into account the information provided by the countries. Second, a review of the metadata is made, displaying the wide diversity of elements existing in this field. Third, an exercise of data comparability is carried out, highlighting the similitude and, above all, the discrepancies between the different sets of data. Finally, some conclusions are drawn. It must be noted that, given the time constraints existing for the whole exercise, it is probable that not all the available information was exchanged and that some shortcomings may exist in the current report. Further comments from the countries involved are welcome, in order to prepare an improved version.

## **II. DATA AVAILABILITY**

### **II.1. Flows**

3. Data availability for countries of Group 2, regarding migration flows, is displayed in Table 1.1. In almost all cases, for each table filled by the countries, only one source was provided. The exception was the UK, which sent one of the tables (residence one year ago by place of birth) both derived from the census and Labour Force Survey. However, it is known that diverse sources may produce the same information in other cases. The most obvious example is precisely the question on residence one year ago, that can be provided by both the census and labour force surveys (LFS). It can be admitted that countries have provided the most reliable sources of information, from their point of view, to this exercise of data collection. Eventually, some of the data corresponded to the more readily available information, since most of the data required the production of special and complex tabulations.

4. Taking these notes into consideration, some remarks can be made:

(a) There is a wide variation in the types of sources available. Even among so few and geographical close countries, widely diverse sources can be found: census, permits (Alien and Borders Service – Portugal), registers (Residential Variation Statistics / Pádrón – Spain), LFS and other surveys (International Passenger Survey – IPS, UK, and Emigration Survey – IMMS, an indirect survey of emigrants adopted in Portugal). Another variation results from the concrete set of data sent by the countries. For example, whilst France only provided census data for all tables, UK mostly provided survey data (LFS and IPS).

(b) Countries provided data for most of the tables. However, the more relevant absence of information regards emigration flows: France does not have information on out-flows, Portugal does not provide data by sex and age (due to large sampling errors), and Spain displays this information only since 2002.

<b>TABLE 1.1</b>								
<b>Data Availability by Source From Group 2 - Flows (*)</b>								
	<b>Table 1.</b> Residence one year ago by place of birth	<b>Table 2.</b> Residence one year ago by citizenship	<b>Table 3.</b> Immigrants by country of last permanent residence (arrived last 10 years)	<b>Table 4.</b> Immigrants by country of birth (arrived last 10 years)	<b>Table 5.</b> Immigrants by country of citizenship (arrived last 10 years)	<b>Table 6.</b> Emigrants by country of next residence	<b>Table 7.</b> Emigrants by country of birth	<b>Table 8.</b> Emigrants by country of citizenship
<b>Member countries Group 2</b>	<b>Data sources</b>							
<b>France</b>	Census (1999 - res.1990)	Census (1999 - res.1990)	Census (1999)	Census (1999)	Census (1999)	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
<b>Portugal</b>	Census (2001/1991)	Census (2001/1991)	Aliens and Borders Service (res.perm.-inflows)	Aliens and Borders Service (res.perm.-inflows)	Aliens and Borders Service (res.perm.-inflows)	IMMS	n.a.	Aliens and Borders Service (res.perm.-outflows)
<b>Spain</b>	Census (2001/1991)	Census (2001/1991)	Resid. Variation Statistics (Padrón)	Resid. Variation Statistics (Padrón)	Resid. Variation Statistics (Padrón)	Resid. Variation Statistics (Padrón)	Resid. Variation Statistics (Padrón)	Resid. Variation Statistics (Padrón)
<b>United Kingdom</b>	LFS (2005/2004) and Census (2001/1991) (**)	LFS (2005/2004)	IPS (2005/2004)	IPS (2005/2004)	IPS (2005/2004)	IPS (2005/2004)	IPS (2005/2004)	IPS (2005/2004)

Notes: (\*) The tables mentioned in the first line of this table were the ones defined as templates for the data exchange exercise. Its numbering has no relation with the one of the current report.  
(\*\*) For 1991, Census data is only available to Great Britain. Only in 2001 data include the whole UK.

(c) Some of the data provided have evident limitations. Survey data – as in the case of the UK (LFS and IPS) and in the case of Portugal (IMMS) - have problems of reliability for small flows, as it is often the case of particular migration flows. For example, UK has indicated that LFS figures must be dealt with carefully: only estimates superior to 10 000 can be considered statistically robust. Other sources only cover specific sub-populations, as is the case of permits, which regard foreign population. For example, annual figures for inflows in Portugal respect only to non-nationals.

## II.2. Stocks

5. Regarding data on migration stocks, the variety of sources did not conceal a more frequent unavailability. The situation is portrayed in Table 1.2. The first set of tables respected to population by country of birth and citizenship. In this case, all countries, except France, provided information, using varied sources. Portugal and Spain used the Census 2001. Portugal also displayed information according to the LFS (1995 until 2005) and the foreign permit system (Alien and Borders Service), whilst Spain sent information derived from the registers (Residential Variation Statistics / Padrón, 1996-2005). The UK only used the LFS to provide information between 1995 and 2005.

6. The second set of tables regarded population by country of birth, country of birth of parents and citizenship. In this case, only Spain provided some sparse information, derived from the 2001 Census.

	<b>Table 1.</b> Population by country of birth and citizenship	<b>Table 2.</b> Population by country of birth, country of birth of parents and citizenship
<b>Member countries Group 2</b>	<b>Data sources</b>	
<b>France</b>	n.a.	n.a.
<b>Portugal</b>	Census (2001) and Aliens and Borders Service and LFS	n.a.
<b>Spain</b>	Census (2001) and Resid. Variation Statistics (Padrón)	Census (2001)
<b>United Kingdom</b>	LFS	n.a.

Note: (\*) The tables mentioned in the first line of this table were the ones defined as templates for the data exchange exercise. Its numbering has no relation with the one of the current report.

### III. DATA SOURCES AND DEFINITIONS

7. As could be expected, given the previous comparative work made about migration statistics in the European Union <sup>1</sup>, there was a wide variety in sources and concepts amongst the countries involved in this exercise. The metadata provided by the countries helped to portray the diverse and complex situations in this field. Some of the information must be coupled with the one displayed in other comparative studies in order to have a more in-depth picture. It is known that sources are multiple, as well as definitions vary, inside and between countries. Taking the information provided for the current exercise, the situation is the following:

#### (a) France

France only provided information derived from its 1999 Census, respecting to migration inflows. No information was transmitted for outflows – it is known that emigration data are not available in French statistics -, as well as for migration stocks. The main population universe used in the census is the resident population. Data on inflows were captured through the retrospective question (in this case, about residence in 1990), as well as through a question on the year of arrival in France. “Immigrants” are defined as individuals born in a foreign country and possessing foreign citizenship at birth. At the census moment, these individuals can be either French by acquisition or foreigners.

#### (b) Portugal

Portugal used, for migration flows, information derived from the Census (1991 and 2001), the Aliens and Borders Service and the Emigration Survey – IMMS. In the Census, the main population universe is the resident population. However, in the case of foreign population, only individuals living in the country for more than one year were considered. No definition of “immigrant” exists in the census. Data from the Aliens and Borders Service respect only to foreigners having a legal status in the country. Inflows are captured through application to residence permits, and outflows (of foreigners) equivalent to the end of permits due to voluntary departure. Data from the IMMS, mainly obtained through indirect means (survey of emigrants not living in the dwellings), uses the standard emigration definitions (permanent and temporary) of the United Nations. Finally, data on migration stocks also were extracted from the LFS, where the population universe is the resident population, but only the one living in private households.

#### (c) Spain

Spain reported data from the Census (1991 and 2001) and the Residential Variation Statistics (Pádrón). In the Census, the population universe is the resident population living in family dwellings. External immigrants are defined as individuals whose former place of usual residence was in another country. The Padrón, a population register, considers as population universe all the registered individuals; each

---

<sup>1</sup> The more recent and extensive overview is the one of M. Poulain, N. Perrin and A. Singleton (eds.), *Thesim: Towards Harmonised European Statistics on International Migration*, Louvain-la-Neuve, Presses Universitaires de Louvain, 2006.

individual living in Spain is obliged to register at the Padrón of the municipality where he/she lives (regardless of the duration of stay). Immigrants and emigrants are individuals that changed their usual residence to or from a Spanish municipality.

(d) United Kingdom

In the UK, most information came from the LFS and the International Passenger Survey (IPS). The LFS population universe and concepts follow the standard European Union procedures, whilst the concepts of immigrant and emigrant used in the IPS are equivalent to the United Nations recommendations.

#### **IV. DATA COMPARABILITY**

##### **IV.1. Place of residence one year before / Migration flows**

8. Data regarding the comparison of sources with the “place of residence one year before” question (retrospective question) with sources on migration flows are displayed on Table 2. The criterion used to build this table was to compare data from the more recent retrospective question (census or LFS) with data on inflows for the more approximate year. This means that this was only a tentative comparison, since the periods are not identical<sup>2</sup>.

9. Regularities are not easy to observe, since in some cases the figures are very divergent, whilst in others they are similar. The largest divergence occurs in the case of Portugal. In this case, data from census are systematically larger than data on inflows. The explanation regards the type of populations considered. Whilst census considers the whole population moving into the country (both non-nationals and nationals), inflows only consider foreigners (figures are based on resident permits’ applications). This means that whenever the inflow of nationals is relevant (for example, return migration or medium-term shuttle migration), data based on residence permits are very limited.

---

<sup>2</sup> The UK provided data on residence one year ago from the LFS and the Census. For this analysis, only the LFS was considered.

TABLE 2

Place of residence one-year before vs. migration flows

FRANCE

n.a.

PORTUGAL

France Spain UK

(question 1 yr before Census 2001 / flows 2000)

Persons residing in country A who resided in country B one-year before	19196	3177	3974
Persons who migrated from country B to country A (as recorded in country A)	524	1344	833
Persons who migrated from country B to country A (as recorded in country B)	n.a.	n.a.	3797

Citizens of country B residing in country A who resided elsewhere one-year before	1739	1625	1314
Citizens of country B who migrated to country A (as recorded in country A)	577	1349	868

Persons born in country B and residing in country A who resided elsewhere one-year before	5818	1736	1498
Persons born in country B who migrated to country A (as recorded in country A)	545	1285	800

SPAIN

France Portugal UK

(question 1 yr before Census 2001 / flows 2000)

Persons residing in country A who resided in country B one-year before	6530	1914	11419
Persons who migrated from country B to country A (as recorded in country A)	7408	3297	12385
Persons who migrated from country B to country A (as recorded in country B)	n.a.	337	18440

Citizens of country B residing in country A who resided elsewhere one-year before	3835	1687	9941
Citizens of country B who migrated to country A (as recorded in country A)	4231	2955	10891

Persons born in country B and residing in country A who resided elsewhere one-year before	3995	1594	9817
Persons born in country B who migrated to country A (as recorded in country A)	4517	2950	10915

UK

France Portugal Spain

(question 1 yr before LFS 2005 / flows IPS 2004)

Persons residing in country A who resided in country B one-year before	16454	1413	18109
Persons who migrated from country B to country A (as recorded in country A)	15040	5750	12820
Persons who migrated from country B to country A (as recorded in country B)	n.a.	858	2233

Citizens of country B residing in country A who resided elsewhere one-year before	11998	3493	9406
Citizens of country B who migrated to country A (as recorded in country A)	10768	5132	8327

Persons born in country B and residing in country A who resided elsewhere one-year before	14183	2020	10315
Persons born in country B who migrated to country A (as recorded in country A)	9165	4874	9600

10. In the cases of Spain and UK, data are more similar. Regarding Spain, census data is always inferior to data from the municipal registers (Pádrón). Since the universe is the same, disparities may result from different degrees of coverage (better in registers) and/or from slightly different definitions of resident population (maybe more widely adopted in registers). Regarding the UK, since the main available sources are surveys (LFS and IPS), disparities may simply result from sampling problems <sup>3</sup>.

11. In short, difficulties for a rigorous measuring of immigrants exist even inside the same country. The use of retrospective questions (residence one year before), captured by census or LFS, gives a more or less different picture than using sources on annual migration flows. Differences tighten when the same population universe is used, particularly regarding nationals and non-nationals.

#### **IV.2. Migration flows from the perspective of the host / sending country**

12. Matrixes of flows from the perspective of the host and sending countries, between 1995 and 2004, are displayed in Tables 3.1 to 3.6. The criterion used to build these tables for particular pairs of countries was to gather data about country of previous or next residence.

13. Many of these tables are incomplete. This is mainly the case for tables cross-examining the case of France, given the absence of data on emigration in this country. Further difficulties on the French case result from the fact that annual inflows were only provided for the period 1995-1998. Spain adds further voids, since data for emigration was only provided for the period 2002-2004.

14. Whenever there is some possibility of comparison, the gaps are usually wide. Some comparable data between France and the UK reveal large discrepancies regarding flows going from the UK to France. Immigration data, captured by the French Census, are usually more than four times lower than the corresponding figures given by the British IPS (data for the period 1995-1997). Conceptual differences seem not enough to explain this gap.

---

<sup>3</sup> It is not possible to produce conclusions about France, since no figures on residence one year before were available. The 1999 Census data, provided by France, corresponded to residence in 1990.







TABLE 3.4

## Migration flows between Portugal - Spain

Country of previous residence

	1995	1996	1997	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004
<b>From Portugal to Spain</b>										
<i>Immigration data (Spain)</i>	813	631	1121	1635	2304	3297	3244	3958	5505	8523
<i>Emigration data (Portugal)</i>	498	0	420	584	211	337	249	404	0	1612
<i>Difference (abs. Value)</i>	315	631	701	1051	2093	2960	2995	3554	5505	6911
<i>Difference %</i>	38,7	100,0	62,5	64,3	90,8	89,8	92,3	89,8	100,0	81,1
<b>From Spain to Portugal</b>										
<i>Immigration data (Portugal)</i>	59	75	103	260	1169	1344	1161	805	552	384
<i>Emigration data (Spain)</i>	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	1105	627	790
<i>Difference (abs. Value)</i>	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	-300	-75	-406
<i>Difference %</i>	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	(37,3)	(13,6)	(105,7)
<b>Net flows Spain - Portugal</b>										
<i>Portugal data</i>	-439	75	-317	-324	958	1007	912	401	552	-1228
<i>Spain data</i>	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	2853	4878	7733
<i>Absolute Difference (abs. Value)</i>	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	3254,0	5430,0	6505,0

TABLE 3.5

**Migration flows between Portugal - UK***Country of previous residence*

	1995	1996	1997	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004
--	------	------	------	------	------	------	------	------	------	------

**From Portugal to UK**

<i>Immigration data (UK)</i>	1197	1344	4979	4271	557	2385	2133	1685	8772	5750
<i>Emigration data (Portugal)</i>	436	1170	2325	584	233	675	502	881	2187	858
<i>Difference (abs. Value)</i>	761	174	2654	3687	324	1710	1631	804	6585	4892
<i>Difference %</i>	63,6	12,9	53,3	86,3	58,2	71,7	76,5	47,7	75,1	85,1

**From UK to Portugal**

<i>Immigration data (Portugal)</i>	46	46	82	237	681	833	798	879	948	678
<i>Emigration data (UK)</i>	2952	928	1519	4602	1444	3797	...	2082	409	3262
<i>Difference (abs. Value)</i>	-2906	-882	-1437	-4365	-763	-2964	#VALUE!	-1203	539	-2584
<i>Difference %</i>	(6.317,4)	(1.917,4)	(1.752,4)	(1.841,8)	(112,0)	(355,8)	#VALUE!	(136,9)	56,9	(381,1)

**Net flows UK - Portugal**

<i>Portugal data</i>	-390	-1124	-2243	-347	448	158	296	-2	-1239	-180
<i>UK data</i>	-1755	416	3460	-331	-887	-1412	#VALUE!	-397	8363	2488
<i>Absolute Difference (abs. Value)</i>	2145,0	708,0	1217,0	678,0	439,0	1254,0	#VALUE!	399,0	7124,0	2308,0

TABLE 3.6

**Migration flows between Spain - UK***Country of previous residence*

	1995	1996	1997	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004
--	------	------	------	------	------	------	------	------	------	------

**From Spain to UK**

<i>Immigration data (UK)</i>	6933	9606	7249	12186	4965	5644	2886	13122	15493	12820
<i>Emigration data (Spain)</i>	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	5083	2335	2233
<i>Difference (abs. Value)</i>	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	8039	13158	10587
<i>Difference %</i>	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	61,3	84,9	82,6

**From UK to Spain**

<i>Immigration data (Spain)</i>	1812	1520	3554	5498	9102	12385	17114	27249	34177	46518
<i>Emigration data (UK)</i>	10019	5169	10820	9858	10661	18440	22394	36746	37658	34181
<i>Difference (abs. Value)</i>	-8207	-3649	-7266	-4360	-1559	-6055	-5280	-9497	-3481	12337
<i>Difference %</i>	(452,9)	(240,1)	(204,4)	(79,3)	(17,1)	(48,9)	(30,9)	(34,9)	(10,2)	26,5

**Net flows UK - Spain**

<i>Spain data</i>	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	22166	31842	44285
<i>UK data</i>	-3086	4437	-3571	2328	-5696	-12796	-19508	-23624	-22165	-21361
<i>Absolute Difference (abs. Value)</i>	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	1458,0	9677,0	22924,0

15. Portugal and the UK also reveal large discrepancies. Regarding flows from the UK to Portugal, Portuguese figures are exceedingly lower, by a factor that almost reaches 5 in 2004. In this case, differences clearly result from the universe under observation, since Portugal only registers foreign individuals who sought to obtain residence permits. Regarding flows in the opposite direction, the gaps are again wide, revealing larger values from the UK perspective. In this case, differences are hard to explain, since the universes and concepts (permanent immigration, following the UN recommendation) are the same.

16. At the contrary, some cases are similar. This mainly occurs when comparing Spain and UK, particularly flows from UK to Spain. Discrepancies between immigration and emigration figures seem to erode with time: ranges of variation do not overcome plus or minus 35% since 2001. Both series of data capture the very strong growth of migration directed to Spain. These similarities occur despite differences in sources (register in Spain, survey in the UK) and apparent differences in concepts. However, the gap is much larger when considering migration in the opposite direction – from Spain to the UK.

17. In short, despite widespread differences in figures, no clear regularities seem to arise from this set of tables. Voids caused by the lack of data and differences in sources and concepts hinder better comparability. However, significant changes in migration seem sometimes to be captured by distinct methods of observation (as occurs in migration from the UK to Spain).

### **IV.3. Country of citizenship / country of birth**

18. Data on country of citizenship and country of birth are displayed in Tables 4 and 5.1 to 5.6. They may sometimes be considered as a proxy of the country of origin / destination.

19. From the observation of tables, it can be concluded that large differences between those variables are apparent: figures on country of previous / next residence, country of birth and country of citizenship may be remarkably different, depending on each concrete situation.

20. Figures in Table 4 indicate that a given flow between two countries may vary deeply according to the above-mentioned variables. In almost every case, a given number of migrants going from one country to another (say, country A to country B) includes significant amounts of citizens of A, B and third countries, and individuals born in A, B and third countries.

**TABLE 4**

**Place of residence one-year before data collection**

*Persons currently residing in country A and residing in country B one-year before*

**FRANCE**

n.a.

**PORTUGAL**

2001 Census

	France	Spain	UK
1a) Citizens of country B	1561	1471	1091
1b) Citizens of country A	17341	1389	2697
1c) Citizens of other countries	294	317	186

1) TOTAL (Persons whose country of previous residence was country B)	19196	3177	3974
--	-------	------	------

2a) Persons born in country B	5412	1551	1307
2b) Persons born in country A	13347	1183	2159
2c) Persons born in other countries	437	443	508

2) TOTAL (Persons whose country of previous residence was country B)	19196	3177	3974
--	-------	------	------

**SPAIN**

2001 Census

	France	Portugal	UK
1a) Citizens of country B	3057	1364	9163
1b) Citizens of country A	2990	398	1643
1c) Citizens of other countries	483	152	613

1) TOTAL (Persons whose country of previous residence was country B)	6530	1914	11419
--	------	------	-------

2a) Persons born in country B	3379	1331	9208
2b) Persons born in country A	2471	355	1413
2c) Persons born in other countries	680	228	798

2) TOTAL (Persons whose country of previous residence was country B)	6530	1914	11419
--	------	------	-------

**UK**

LFS 2005

	France	Portugal	Spain
1a) Citizens of country B	5757	855	8274
1b) Citizens of country A	5905	558	9835
1c) Citizens of other countries	4792	0	0

1) TOTAL (Persons whose country of previous residence was country B)	16454	1413	18109
--	-------	------	-------

2a) Persons born in country B	6815	855	8603
2b) Persons born in country A	5434	558	8578
2c) Persons born in other countries	4205	0	928

2) TOTAL (Persons whose country of previous residence was country B)	16454	1413	18109
--	-------	------	-------

21. In some cases, flows are clearly dominated by a single category, but even here some heterogeneity remains. For example, flows from France to Portugal are dominated by Portuguese nationals; however, many of them were born in France. Furthermore, these inflows also include French citizens born in France (maybe some of Portuguese descent) and other groups. Flows from the UK to Spain are also dominated by a single category, namely British citizens mostly born in the UK. But even here other significant groups are present: citizens and native-born of Spain and third countries. The most remarkable heterogeneity is the one of flows from France to the UK: these include, in almost equal proportions, citizens and native-born from the UK, France and third-countries.

22. Data in Tables 5.1 to 5.6, resulting from sources on annual migration flows, give a similar picture of this heterogeneity of movements. It may be admitted that the largest variety of flows occurs, in the first place, between countries that have had a long tradition of migration between each other, such as France, at the one hand, and Portugal and Spain, at the other. In the second place, it occurs in regions where a high circulation of people and activities takes place, such as between France and the UK. More recent and isolated movements seem to be more “monochromatic”, as occurs with the flow of citizens and native-born from the UK to Spain or with Portuguese to Spain.

23. In short, data by country of previous / next residence, at the one hand, and country of citizenship and birth, at the other, may be very different. The use of one variable cannot be considered as a good proxy of other <sup>4</sup>.

---

<sup>4</sup> Given the wide gaps on data for total inflows, data on sex and age structures of migrants were not analysed at this stage.



TABLE 5.2

## Migration flows France-Spain

	1995	1996	1997	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004
<b>Immigrants to France (as registered in France)</b>										
1) whose country of previous residence is Spain	1279	1283	1372	3351	...	...	...	...	...	...
2) who were citizens of Spain	1456	1394	1600	3757	...	...	...	...	...	...
3) who were born in Spain	1383	1335	1558	3623	...	...	...	...	...	...
(1) - (2)	-177	-111	-228	-406	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!
(1) - (3)	-104	-52	-186	-272	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!
(2) - (3)	73	59	42	134	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!
<b>Emigrants from France (as registered in France)</b>										
1) whose country of next residence is Spain	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
2) who were citizens of Spain	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
3) who were born in Spain	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
(1) - (2)	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!
(1) - (3)	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!
(2) - (3)	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!
<b>Immigrants to Spain (as registered in Spain)</b>										
1) whose country of previous residence is France	2895	2395	4610	5686	6702	7408	6437	8200	8847	11205
2) who were citizens of France	798	746	1897	2690	3346	4231	4948	5459	5899	9912
3) who were born in France	1239	1076	2348	3099	3769	4517	4717	5420	5818	9427
(1) - (2)	2097	1649	2713	2996	3356	3177	1489	2741	2948	1293
(1) - (3)	1656	1319	2262	2587	2933	2891	1720	2780	3029	1778
(2) - (3)	-441	-330	-451	-409	-423	-286	231	39	81	485
<b>Emigrants from Spain (as registered in Spain)</b>										
1) whose country of next residence is France	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	3316	2474	2154
2) who were citizens of France	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	238	242	783
3) who were born in France	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	512	414	785
(1) - (2)	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	3078	2232	1371
(1) - (3)	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	2804	2060	1369
(2) - (3)	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	-274	-172	-2

**TABLE 5.3**

**Migration flows France-UK**

	1995	1996	1997	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004
<b>Immigrants to France (as registered in France)</b>										
1) whose country of previous residence is UK	2686	3165	3703	7362	...	...	...	...	...	...
2) who were citizens of UK	3097	3760	4148	8391	...	...	...	...	...	...
3) who were born in UK	2912	3401	3880	7926	...	...	...	...	...	...
(1) - (2)	-411	-595	-445	-1029	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!
(1) - (3)	-226	-236	-177	-564	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!
(2) - (3)	185	359	268	465	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!
<b>Emigrants from France (as registered in France)</b>										
1) whose country of next residence is UK	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
2) who were citizens of UK	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
3) who were born in UK	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
(1) - (2)	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!
(1) - (3)	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!
(2) - (3)	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!
<b>Immigrants to UK (as registered in UK)</b>										
1) whose country of previous residence is France	19103	10954	26279	16803	22909	23739	22618	16172	27767	15040
2) who were citizens of France	12101	11686	21042	15287	13607	14668	16208	10608	21198	10768
3) who were born in France	9990	9598	18805	14113	14351	13106	15915	9994	22733	9165
(1) - (2)	7002	-732	5237	1516	9302	9071	6410	5564	6569	4272
(1) - (3)	9113	1356	7474	2690	8558	10633	6703	6178	5034	5875
(2) - (3)	2111	2088	2237	1174	-744	1562	293	614	-1535	1603
<b>Emigrants from UK (as registered in UK)</b>										
1) whose country of next residence is France	12578	14787	17648	11776	19775	18869	16068	19452	23643	19235
2) who were citizens of France	3596	6012	9135	7319	13984	10871	7400	6078	7192	3431
3) who were born in France	4639	6296	7863	7518	13595	9525	6921	6308	6086	5485
(1) - (2)	8982	8775	8513	4457	5791	7998	8668	13374	16451	15804
(1) - (3)	7939	8491	9785	4258	6180	9344	9147	13144	17557	13750
(2) - (3)	-1043	-284	1272	-199	389	1346	479	-230	1106	-2054

TABLE 5.4

## Migration flows Portugal-Spain

	1995	1996	1997	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004
<b>Immigrants to Portugal (as registered in Portugal)</b>										
1) whose country of previous residence is Spain	59	75	103	260	1169	1344	1161	805	552	384
2) who were citizens of Spain	46	64	86	261	1175	1349	1154	779	547	373
3) who were born in Spain	46	63	81	243	1112	1285	1094	722	517	337
(1) - (2)	13	11	17	-1	-6	-5	7	26	5	11
(1) - (3)	13	12	22	17	57	59	67	83	35	47
(2) - (3)	0	1	5	18	63	64	60	57	30	36
<b>Emigrants from Portugal (as registered in Portugal)</b>										
1) whose country of next residence is Spain	498	0	420	584	211	337	247	404	0	1612
2) who were citizens of Spain	...	...	...	...	26	25	18	7	17	6
3) who were born in Spain	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
(1) - (2)	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	185	312	229	397	-17	1606
(1) - (3)	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!
(2) - (3)	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!
<b>Immigrants to Spain (as registered in Spain)</b>										
1) whose country of previous residence is Portugal	813	631	1121	1635	2304	3297	3244	3958	5505	8523
2) who were citizens of Portugal	689	506	967	1409	2063	2955	3057	3538	4825	9851
3) who were born in Portugal	675	496	960	1439	2075	2950	2884	3423	4605	9350
(1) - (2)	124	125	154	226	241	342	187	420	680	-1328
(1) - (3)	138	135	161	196	229	347	360	535	900	-827
(2) - (3)	14	10	7	-30	-12	5	173	115	220	501
<b>Emigrants from Spain (as registered in Spain)</b>										
1) whose country of next residence is Portugal	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	1105	627	790
2) who were citizens of Portugal	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	229	281	975
3) who were born in Portugal	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	260	280	925
(1) - (2)	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	876	346	-185
(1) - (3)	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	845	347	-135
(2) - (3)	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	-31	1	50

TABLE 5.5

## Migration flows Portugal-UK

	1995	1996	1997	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004
<b>Immigrants to Portugal (as registered in Portugal)</b>										
1) whose country of previous residence is UK	46	46	82	237	681	833	798	879	948	678
2) who were citizens of UK	42	40	85	237	739	868	828	918	964	667
3) who were born in UK	40	37	73	219	670	800	765	857	911	636
(1) - (2)	4	6	-3	0	-58	-35	-30	-39	-16	11
(1) - (3)	6	9	9	18	11	33	33	22	37	42
(2) - (3)	2	3	12	18	69	68	63	61	53	31
<b>Emigrants from Portugal (as registered in Portugal)</b>										
1) whose country of next residence is UK	436	1170	2325	584	233	675	502	881	2187	858
2) who were citizens of UK	...	...	...	...	62	46	12	14	24	8
3) who were born in UK	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	...
(1) - (2)	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	171	629	490	867	2163	850
(1) - (3)	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!
(2) - (3)	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!
<b>Immigrants to UK (as registered in UK)</b>										
1) whose country of previous residence is Portugal	1197	1344	4979	4271	557	2385	2133	1685	8772	5750
2) who were citizens of Portugal	1583	1374	2182	2496	1029	1811	4396	2875	9167	5132
3) who were born in Portugal	1421	996	2049	3877	939	773	2809	2600	5277	4874
(1) - (2)	-386	-30	2797	1775	-472	574	-2263	-1190	-395	618
(1) - (3)	-224	348	2930	394	-382	1612	-676	-915	3495	876
(2) - (3)	162	378	133	-1381	90	1038	1587	275	3890	258
<b>Emigrants from UK (as registered in UK)</b>										
1) whose country of next residence is Portugal	2952	928	1519	4602	1444	3797	...	2082	409	3262
2) who were citizens of Portugal	2024	1615	1191	1263	1444	3197	0	1909	1306	1238
3) who were born in Portugal	1946	1656	1221	1460	1444	2844	0	1910	482	1238
(1) - (2)	928	-687	328	3339	0	600	#VALUE!	173	-897	2024
(1) - (3)	1006	-728	298	3142	0	953	#VALUE!	172	-73	2024
(2) - (3)	78	-41	-30	-197	0	353	0	-1	824	0

TABLE 5.6

## Migration flows Spain-UK

	1995	1996	1997	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004
<b>Immigrants to Spain (as registered in Spain)</b>										
1) whose country of previous residence is UK	1812	1520	3554	5498	9102	12385	17114	27249	34177	46518
2) who were citizens of UK	1141	1094	2665	4519	7908	10891	16019	25298	31803	48446
3) who were born in UK	1209	1130	2723	4531	7889	10915	15939	25344	31774	47902
(1) - (2)	671	426	889	979	1194	1494	1095	1951	2374	-1928
(1) - (3)	603	390	831	967	1213	1470	1175	1905	2403	-1384
(2) - (3)	-68	-36	-58	-12	19	-24	80	-46	29	544
<b>Emigrants from Spain (as registered in Spain)</b>										
1) whose country of next residence is UK	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	5083	2335	2233
2) who were citizens of UK	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	299	287	974
3) who were born in UK	...	...	...	...	...	...	...	391	311	977
(1) - (2)	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	4784	2048	1259
(1) - (3)	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	4692	2024	1256
(2) - (3)	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	-92	-24	-3
<b>Immigrants to UK (as registered in UK)</b>										
1) whose country of previous residence is Spain	6933	9606	7249	12186	4965	5644	2886	13122	15493	12820
2) who were citizens of Spain	4640	3320	3255	6819	1949	3878	2729	8908	5298	8327
3) who were born in Spain	2824	3114	3283	6539	1546	4382	3362	8828	4151	9600
(1) - (2)	2293	6286	3994	5367	3016	1766	157	4214	10195	4493
(1) - (3)	4109	6492	3966	5647	3419	1262	-476	4294	11342	3220
(2) - (3)	1816	206	-28	280	403	-504	-633	80	1147	-1273
<b>Emigrants from UK (as registered in UK)</b>										
1) whose country of next residence is Spain	10019	5169	10820	9858	10661	18440	22394	36746	37658	34181
2) who were citizens of Spain	769	1387	2044	1468	4584	6305	8170	10734	3700	6079
3) who were born in Spain	491	1753	1919	1507	4303	6306	6450	10733	3700	6079
(1) - (2)	9250	3782	8776	8390	6077	12135	14224	26012	33958	28102
(1) - (3)	9528	3416	8901	8351	6358	12134	15944	26013	33958	28102
(2) - (3)	278	-366	125	-39	281	-1	1720	1	0	0

#### IV.4. Stocks

24. Two sets of tables were asked to the countries regarding migration stocks. The first respected to population by country of birth and citizenship, cross-cutting these categories for individuals born and citizens of the other countries of Group 2. The second regarded population by country of birth, country of birth of parents and citizenship. As mentioned above, all countries, except France, provided information for the first set, whilst only Spain provided a scarce amount of data for the second set.

25. Some of the data gathered in this exercise is displayed in the following tables. Table 6.1 portrays the situation of Portugal regarding the population born and holding citizenship of France. Since Portugal provided data from three different sources (Census, LFS and Alien and Borders Office), the information is compared for 2001. The main conclusions that can be derived from this evidence respect, firstly, to the differences existing between the variables under consideration (country of birth and citizenship). Migration stocks respecting one of these variables may be considerably different from the other. Secondly, we find more or less relevant differences according to the source. The most striking respects to citizenship: nationals of France indicated by the Census and the LFS are the double of legal foreigners holding a residence permit. Since there is not a case of irregular migration from France, this difference may result from errors of auto-declaration: individuals of Portuguese descent that declare themselves as French whilst also holding the Portuguese citizenship.

26. A similar type of conclusions can be derived from data coming from Spain. Table 6.2 displays data for 2001 originated in the Census and the Padrón, now corresponding to individuals born in and citizens of the UK. Again, differences can be found using the categories of country of birth or country of citizenship, and some other differences (slighter than in the Portuguese case) occur according to the source. Data from the UK, corresponding to individuals born in and citizens of Spain, is displayed in Table 6.3. Since they come from a single source, the LFS, they only allow the confirmation of the first conclusion. The consideration of other pairs of countries in Group 2, which could be drawn from the information sent by the countries, would confirm what was above said.

TABLE 6.1

Portugal - Population by country of birth and citizenship: the case of France

Country of birth	Citizenship	Census 2001 as of: 12 March	LFS 2001 as of: mid-year	ABO 2001 as of: 31 December
PERSONS BORN IN COUNTRY X (France)	Citizens of country X (France)	14469	12312	
	Citizens of your country ( <i>nationals</i> )	80361	56655	
	<i>thereof:</i>			
	- citizens of your country since birth			
	- citizens of country X at birth who became citizens of your country following naturalization			
	Persons with other citizenship	445	86	
	<b>TOTAL PERSONS BORN IN COUNTRY X (FRANCE)</b>	95275	69053	
PERSONS BORN IN YOUR COUNTRY (native-born)	Citizens of country X (France)	583	2113	
	Citizens of your country ( <i>nationals</i> )	9692065	9822630	
	<i>thereof:</i>			
	- citizens of your country since birth			
	- citizens of country X at birth who became citizens of your country following naturalization			
	Persons with other citizenship	11997	11027	
	<b>TOTAL PERSONS BORN IN YOUR COUNTRY</b>	9704645	9835770	
PERSONS BORN IN OTHER COUNTRIES	Citizens of country X (France)	307	113	
	Citizens of your country ( <i>nationals</i> )	350996	232688	
	<i>thereof:</i>			
	- citizens of your country since birth			
	- citizens of country X at birth who became citizens of your country following naturalization			
	Persons with other citizenship	204894	156511	
	<b>TOTAL PERSONS BORN IN OTHER COUNTRIES</b>	556197	389312	
TOTAL POPULATION	Citizens of country X (France)	15359	14539	7818
	Citizens of your country ( <i>nationals</i> )	10123422	10111973	
	<i>thereof:</i>			
	- citizens of your country since birth			
	- citizens of country X at birth who became citizens of your country following naturalization			
	Persons with other citizenship	217336	167624	
	<b>TOTAL POPULATION</b>	10356117	10294135	

**TABLE 6.2**

**Spain - Population by country of birth and citizenship: the case of UK**

Country of birth	Citizenship	Census 2001 as of: 1 November	Padrón 2001 as of: 1 January
PERSONS BORN IN UNITED KINGDOM	Citizens of UNITED KINGDOM	87511	98807
	Citizens of SPAIN	19379	20247
	<i>thereof:</i>		
	- citizens of SPAIN since birth		
	- citizens of UNITED KINGDOM at birth who became citizens of SPAIN following naturalization		
	Persons with other citizenship	904	995
	<b>TOTAL PERSONS BORN IN UNITED KINGDOM</b>	<b>107794</b>	<b>120049</b>
PERSONS BORN IN SPAIN	Citizens of UNITED KINGDOM	3413	3900
	Citizens of SPAIN	38603844	39075049
	<i>thereof:</i>		
	- citizens of SPAIN since birth		
	- citizens of UNITED KINGDOM at birth who became citizens of SPAIN following naturalization		
	Persons with other citizenship	67913	68623
	<b>TOTAL PERSONS BORN IN SPAIN</b>	<b>38675170</b>	<b>39147572</b>
PERSONS BORN IN OTHER COUNTRIES	Citizens of UNITED KINGDOM	3938	4619
	Citizens of SPAIN	652135	650889
	<i>thereof:</i>		
	- citizens of SPAIN since birth		
	- citizens of UNITED KINGDOM at birth who became citizens of SPAIN following naturalization		
	Persons with other citizenship	1408334	1193713
	<b>TOTAL PERSONS BORN IN OTHER COUNTRIES</b>	<b>2064407</b>	<b>1849221</b>
TOTAL POPULATION	Citizens of UNITED KINGDOM	94862	107326
	Citizens of SPAIN	39275358	39746185
	<i>thereof:</i>		
	- citizens of SPAIN since birth		
	- citizens of UNITED KINGDOM at birth who became citizens of SPAIN following naturalization		
	Persons with other citizenship	1477151	1263331
	<b>TOTAL POPULATION</b>	<b>40847371</b>	<b>41116842</b>

TABLE 6.3

UK - Population by country of birth and citizenship: the case of Spain  
(thousands)

Country of birth	Citizenship	LFS 1995 as of: quarterly average	LFS 2005 as of: quarterly average
PERSONS BORN IN COUNTRY X	Citizens of country X	24	49
	Citizens of your country ( <i>nationals</i> )	7	11
	<i>thereof:</i>		
	- citizens of your country since birth		
	- citizens of country X at birth who became citizens of your country following naturalization		
Persons with other citizenship	1	-	
<b>TOTAL PERSONS BORN IN COUNTRY X</b>		<b>33</b>	<b>60</b>
PERSONS BORN IN YOUR COUNTRY (native-born)	Citizens of country X	2	3
	Citizens of your country ( <i>nationals</i> )	53.245	53.058
	<i>thereof:</i>		
	- citizens of your country since birth		
	- citizens of country X at birth who became citizens of your country following naturalization		
Persons with other citizenship	74	147	
<b>TOTAL PERSONS BORN IN YOUR COUNTRY</b>		<b>53.321</b>	<b>53.207</b>
PERSONS BORN IN OTHER COUNTRIES	Citizens of country X	1	6
	Citizens of your country ( <i>nationals</i> )	1.953	2.460
	<i>thereof:</i>		
	- citizens of your country since birth		
	- citizens of country X at birth who became citizens of your country following naturalization		
Persons with other citizenship	1.831	2.980	
<b>TOTAL PERSONS BORN IN OTHER COUNTRIES</b>		<b>3.785</b>	<b>5.446</b>
TOTAL POPULATION	Citizens of country X	27	57
	Citizens of your country ( <i>nationals</i> )	55.206	55.528
	<i>thereof:</i>		
	- citizens of your country since birth		
	- citizens of country X at birth who became citizens of your country following naturalization		
Persons with other citizenship	1.906	3.128	
<b>TOTAL POPULATION</b>		<b>57.139</b>	<b>58.713</b>

27. Regarding the cross-cutting of data by country of birth, country of birth of parents and citizenship, the main conclusion respects to the enormous scarcity of data. As said before, only Spain provided a few data, derived from the 2001 Census. As a result, studies on immigrants' descent, resulting from the availability of the category "country of birth of parents", will continue to face scarce empirical support.

## V. CONCLUSIONS

28. Heterogeneity and complexity seem to be the main conclusions to derive from the set of tables presented in this report, regarding the comparison of migration flows and the consideration of migration stocks in France, Portugal, Spain and the UK. First, a wide range of methods of observation is used. Among these methods, shortcomings are widespread, mainly including sampling errors and partial coverage of the universe. Second, some gaps in data availability were met. The main case regards the measuring of emigration flows, as well as the category "country of birth of parents" in migration stocks. Third, difficulties for rigorous measurement of flows and stocks occur inside the same country: the same situations correspond to divergent evaluations obtained from different sources. Fourth, disparities occur when comparing the same flows from the point of view of host and receiving countries: differences in method, universe and definitions explain these differences. Fifth, data on country of previous / next residence, country of citizenship and country of birth reveal discrepancies, suggesting the complexity of human movements.

29. If recommendations were to be derived from the observation of these four countries, some could be drawn. These would include the need for common definitions on migration and resident population; the preference for statistics with no or reduced sampling errors; the priority of the improvement of statistics in the host countries for measuring inflows (flows measured by the receiving society); and the attention to the increasing variety of migration flows. Regarding the later point, flows between two countries do not only involve citizens from the first country moving to the second one: they include many bilateral contacts (return migration and shuttle movements) and a growing number of third country individuals crossing their frontiers.

\*\*\*\*\*