

SHAPING HOUSING FUTURES: CONTRASTING PRINCIPLES

DUNCAN MACLENNAN

PROFESSOR OF PUBLIC POLICY

UNIVERSITY OF GLASGOW

DUNCAN.MACLENNAN@GLASGOW.AC.UK

SHARED PERSPECTIVES

- 1) SHAPING FUTURES PROJECT REPORTS AT SAME TIME SG LOOK TO 2040. OVERLAPS?
- 2) UNCERTAIN CHANGING ECONOMIC, POLITICAL CONTEXTS: AI: AGEING; GREENTECH
- 3) A WIDENING, DEEPENING THREE-FOLD AFFORDABILITY CRISIS (HOMELESS, POOR AND MIDDLE INCOMES)
- 4) UNSTABLE AND INFLATIONARY HOUSING MARKETS: NEGATIVE IMPLICATIONS FOR DISTRIBUTIONAL FAIRNESS, STABILITY AND PRODUCTIVITY
- 5) CRITICAL ROLES (BUT WHAT) FOR THE STATE, REBALANCE CORE SETTINGS
- 6) IMPORTANCE OF PRINCIPLES (PASSIONS) AND EVIDENCE (REASON)
- 7) STRATEGY: A SET OF PRINCIPLES: BLUEPRINTS; ADAPTIVE, LEARNING ORGANISATIONS
- 8) MAZZUCATTO MISSION FRAMEWORK

CONTRAST INTERNATIONAL EXPERT VERSUS PERSON-CENTRED (AS REPORTED BY SCOTTISH GOVERNMENT)

AGREEMENT

SF

THE HOUSING SECTOR HAS TO BE SEEN AS A CONNECTED, DYNAMIC SYSTEM WHERE THE AIMS, DESIGN, AND RESOURCES FOR HOUSING POLICIES NEED TO BE SET IN THAT SYSTEMIC CONTEXT. HOUSING SYSTEMS WILL HAVE TO BE MORE CREATIVE, AND ACHIEVE MORE WITH LESS, AND BE FLEXIBLE.

THIS VIEW IS DRAWN FROM THE SCOTTISH HOMES STRATEGIC FRAMEWORK DOCUMENTS OF 1990-1999. WHERE ARE THE CREATIVITY INSTITUTIONS IN THE SCOTTISH HOUSING SYSTEM?

SG

A WELL-FUNCTIONING HOUSING SYSTEM

PRINCIPLE 1

The housing system should supply high-quality affordable homes for living in, to shift the balance away from the use of homes as a means to store wealth.

PRINCIPLE 14

Housing and the housing market should be highly flexible to enable people to meet their changing needs.

AGREEMENT

SF

IN CONTRAST TO CURRENT EXPERIENCE,
GOVERNMENTS AT NATIONAL LEVELS MUST MOVE
BEYOND THE IMPORTANT, BUT OVER-NARROW FOCUS
ON FINANCIAL STABILITY, AND SHOULD HAVE AN
EXPLICIT 'HOUSING MARKET' STRATEGY TO SUPPORT
PRODUCTIVITY, GROWTH AND FAIRNESS
(AFFORDABILITY)

*KEY ISSUE IN SCOTTISH CONTEXT; DOES SG HAVE THE
POLICY TOOLS OR TAX REFORM COMMITMENTS TO
ACHIEVE MORE STABLE HOUSING MARKETS, OR IS THE
BURDEN ALL ON SUPPLY SIDE ADJUSTMENT.*

SG

PRINCIPLE 2

Government policy (including taxes and subsidies, for example) should promote house price stability, to help underpin Scotland's standard of living and productivity and promote a Fairer Scotland.

PRINCIPLE 13

Government should ensure that there are affordable housing options across Scotland for households at all income levels.

PRINCIPLE 3

Everybody should be able to save for the future (as well as be secure in their home and make significant changes to it) whether they rent or own.

AGREEMENT

SF

HOUSING POLICY DECISIONS REQUIRE SPATIAL AWARENESS; THEY NEED TO HAVE REGARD TO THE PLACES THAT HOUSING INVESTMENT SHAPES AND MUST RECOGNISE THE GEOGRAPHY OF ECONOMIC CONNECTIONS THAT SHAPES SUPPLY AND DEMAND IN THE LOCAL HOUSING SYSTEM.

SG

PRINCIPLE 5

Tenure-neutral space and quality standards for new homes (and existing homes where possible) should be set specifically to improve and protect quality of living and of place.

PRINCIPLE 10

New housing⁴, and the required community resources, should only be provided where they help to create safer, stronger, attractive, sustainable and integrated communities.

PRINCIPLE 6

Government policy should promote a greater diversity of home builders and broader availability of land for development to reduce prices and improve building quality.

AGREEMENT

SF

THE STRATEGIC AND ECONOMIC ROLES OF HOUSING REQUIRE A METROPOLITAN (OR RURAL REGION) LEVEL FOCUS SO THAT GOVERNANCE IS ALIGNED TO THE KEY SCALES AT WHICH HOUSING SYSTEMS OPERATE.

SG NEEDS TO WORK THROUGH THE FUTURE HOUSING GOVERNANCE OF SCOTLAND. WHAT WILL CITY REGIONS AND REGIONAL ECONOMIC PARTNERSHIPS BECOME? WHAT OF REGIONAL HOUSING PARTNERSHIPS?

SG

PRINCIPLE 11

Local communities should be empowered to respond to housing need in their area, as part of a coherent regional economic approach (creating and maintaining jobs) and supported by provision of the right infrastructure.

PRINCIPLE 12

Government intervention should help existing and new communities to be physically, digitally, culturally and economically connected within a coherent geographic region; this includes retaining and attracting vibrant communities in areas facing depopulation.

AGREEMENT

SF

HOUSING POLICIES, INVESTMENT AND OTHER ACTIONS SHOULD BE DESIGNED AND DELIVERED TO CONTRIBUTE EFFECTIVELY TO WIDER GOVERNMENT GOALS IN TERMS OF, FOR EXAMPLE, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND SOCIAL INCLUSION AS WELL AS ENVIRONMENTAL SUSTAINABILITY

SCOTLAND HAS A GOOD NATIONAL PERFORMANCE FRAMEWORK BUT SEPARATE NARRATIVES ON PRODUCTIVITY, WELLBEING AND INCLUSION: THEY NEED TO BE RECONCILED AND THE HOUSING DIMENSIONS CLEARLY ARTICULATED. CURRENTLY THEY ARE NOT

SG

PRINCIPLE 4

Housing provision should be informed by whole life economic costs and benefits in the round and help to address inequalities in health, wealth and education.

PRINCIPLE 9

Decisions around the quality, location and utilisation of existing stock and new build should be ambitious in enhancing biodiversity, promoting Scotland's energy security, and be consistent with the target for Scotland's emissions to be net zero carbon by 2045.

AGREEMENT

SF

GOVERNMENTS, LIKE HOUSING PROVIDERS, SHOULD BE JUDGED NOT BY WHAT THEY PROMISE BUT BY WHAT THEY DELIVER AND IF THEY CONSISTENTLY FAIL TO DO SO A 'HOUSING RIGHTS' APPROACH MAY BE REQUIRED.

NEED A BETTER DEVELOPED HOUSING OUTCOMES FRAMEWORK AT LOCAL AND SCOTTISH LEVELS. CONSIDER EXTENSION OF RIGHTS

SG

PRINCIPLE 15

Everyone has a right to an adequate home⁵.

.....SF OMISSION....

SF

SHAPING FUTURES DID NOT INCLUDE ENOUGH
THINKING ON THESE ISSUES.

SG

PRINCIPLE 7

All tenures should apply the same high quality and safety standards and levels of consumer protection.

PRINCIPLE 8

New homes for sale should be built to high standards, defects should be identified and remedied quickly and all owners should be required to maintain the condition of their home.

SG SILENT.....

SHAPING FUTURES

FUTURE HOUSING POLICIES SHOULD BE INTELLIGENT, APPLY APPROPRIATE INSTRUMENTS TO REAL (NOT IDEAL) HOUSING SYSTEMS THAT ARE EMPIRICALLY UNDERSTOOD BY POLICYMAKERS, AND POSSESS WELL-DEVELOPED LOGIC CHAINS CONNECTING POLICY ACTIONS TO CHOSEN GOALS.

SCOTTISH HOUSING POLICY RESEARCH HAS VIRTUALLY DISAPPEARED AND THE CONVERSATION BETWEEN RESEARCHERS AND THE BUREAUCRACY IS NOT WHAT IT ONCE WAS. THERE IS AN URGENT NEED TO FRAME HOUSING-ECONOMY-ENVIRONMENT-SOCIETY CONNECTIONS MORE COHERENTLY AND NO ACTION PARTNERSHIP TO DO SO.

SCOTTISH GOVERNMENT

SG NARRATIVE WEAK

SF

SG

GIVEN THE RENEWED EMPHASIS ON THE ECONOMIC CONSEQUENCES OF HOUSING OUTCOMES, HOUSING MUST BE RECOGNISED AS ESSENTIAL ECONOMIC, AS WELL AS SOCIAL, INFRASTRUCTURE.

HOUSING POLICY NARRATIVES IN SCOTLAND HAVE BEEN NEEDS ORIENTED FOR THE LAST HALF CENTURY AND ARE NOT WELL CONNECTED TO ECONOMIC DRIVERS AND OUTCOMES.

AGREEMENT? DIFFERENT ADVOCACY

SF

GOVERNMENTS SHOULD JETTISON THE UNCRITICAL PRO-MARKET STANCE ADOPTED AFTER THE 1980S AND RETHINK THE POSITIVE ROLES OF NON-MARKET HOUSING AND NON-MARKET HOUSING PROVIDERS. THAT CASE IS ABOUT MORE THAN SIMPLY PROVIDING SHELTER FOR THE POOR; IT ALSO RECOGNISES THEIR REPUTATION AS PROVIDERS OF QUALITY CUSTOMER CARE AND PRACTITIONERS OF 'PATIENT CAPITAL'.

SG

THERE ARE MIXED MESSAGES ABOUT PROVIDER/ENABLER ROLES FOR COUNCILS, CITY-REGIONS AND NON-PROFITS. NEW GOVERNANCE IS BADLY NEEDED BUT SG SHOULD BE LAUDED FOR CONTINUING COMMITMENT TO THE AFFORDABLE HOMES PROGRAMME AND TRYING TO IMPROVE UPON ENGLISH HELP TO BUY EFFORTS.

SHAPING FUTURES: ASSOCIATIONS, COOPS, COUNCILS, MARKETS

DON'T FORGET YOUR PAST (DON'T LET POLITICS FORGET IT EITHER), KNOW YOUR PRESENT SOMEWHAT BETTER, BUT GRASP THE FUTURE, FOR THERE ARE KEY ROLES.

SPELL OUT THE MISSION ('HOUSING CHOICES AND INCLUSIVE GROWTH FOR ALL'?) AND CARVE OUT KEY ROLES

- CREATIVE, DISRUPTIVE AGENTS FOR LOCAL CHANGE WITH KEY ROLES
 - INTEGRATING THE LEAST ADVANTAGED INTO INCLUSIVE GROWTH STRATEGIES
 - RE-ENGINEERING HOUSING (WEALTH), CARE AND HEALTH IN OLD AGE
 - CREATING PATHWAYS INTO HOME-OWNERSHIP FOR YOUNGER HOUSEHOLDS
 - SHAPING ENERGY DESCENT WITHIN LOCAL COMMUNITIES

BE OUTWARD AND FORWARD LOOKING AND IMAGINE STRONGER ROLES.