

UNITED NATIONS ECONOMIC COMMISSION FOR EUROPE
SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH EDUCATION CENTRE “GREEN ACADEMY”

**REPORT OF THE SEMINAR-TRAINING ON “IMPROVING TRANSBOUNDARY WATER
MANAGEMENT”**

7 to 8 December 2015, Astana, Kazakhstan

This report has been issued without formal editing by the Environment Division of the UN Economic Commission for Europe (UNECE) Secretariat

A. ORGANIZATION OF THE MEETING

1. The seminar-training on “Improving Transboundary Water Management” took place in Astana 7 - 8 December 2015. The event was organized by United Nations Economic Commission for Europe (UNECE) in cooperation with the Scientific Research Education Centre “Green Academy” in the framework of the EU/UNDP/UNECE Joint Project on Supporting Kazakhstan’s Transition to a Green Economy Model. Organizational support for the meeting was provided by the SREC “Green Academy”.

1. Objectives of meeting

2. The main aim of the seminar-training was to present and discuss aspects of international water legislation, transboundary water management and experience of transboundary water cooperation with a focus on the organisation and financing of joint bodies.

2. Participants

3. The meeting was attended by 19 participants from Basin Inspections, Committee on Water Resources of the Ministry of Agriculture, Ministry for Foreign Affairs, Ministry of National Economy, Ministry of Energy. Together with the staff of the UNECE Secretariat, UNDP, international experts and representatives of other international and non-governmental organizations the meeting gathered 31 people. The list of participants is found in Annex 1 of this report.

3. Opening of the Meeting

4. The meeting was opened by Mr. Musilim Zhienbayev, Head of the Transboundary Rivers Management of the Department of water and biological resources of the Ministry of Agriculture. He welcomed the participants noting the importance of improving water legislation and transboundary water management policies in the Republic of Kazakhstan, and the need to pay closer attention to the activities of the joint basin management bodies and further development of the water cooperation. He wished all the participants of the meeting fruitful work in discussing such important issues for Kazakhstan.

5. Ms. Nazia Prmanova, Deputy Director of SREC “Green Academy” welcomed the participants in the premises of SREC “Green Academy” and underlined that water management in general and transboundary water management in particular, is a very important part of the Green Economy Concept pursued by Kazakhstan. She stressed the importance of international cooperation in such matters and thanked UNECE, EU, UNDP for the initiative and support in arranging the seminar.

6. The UNECE Regional Adviser on Environment Mr. Bo Libert welcomed participants of the seminar and informed them about the launch of the EU/UNDP/UNECE Joint project on Supporting Kazakhstan’s transition to a green economy model in June 2015. He stressed that this event is an important starting point to understand how within the Project it will be possible to facilitate transboundary water dialogue and enhance the role of water management bodies in Kazakhstan.

4. Election of officers

7. Mrs. Nazia Prmanova, Deputy Director of SREC “Green Academy”, Mr. Bo Libert, UNECE Regional Adviser on Environment, Mr. Alexander Nikolayenko, Expert of Transboundary Water Management Programme in Central Asia of GIZ, Mr. Amirkhan Kenshimov, Deputy Director of the Executive Board of IFAS in Kazakhstan, Mr. Bulat Yessekin, Member of the Global Water Partnership Steering Committee took turns in moderating the sessions of the meeting.

5. Approval of the agenda

8. The following programme was approved for the meeting:

1. Opening of the meeting.
2. Adoption of the agenda
3. Overview of International water legislation
4. International water legislation and Kazakhstan
5. Joint bodies: Organization and financing of cooperation.
6. Improving transboundary water cooperation of Kazakhstan.
7. Recommendations of the meeting.
8. Closing of the meeting.

9. The full programme of the seminar-training on “Improving Transboundary Water Management” is found in the Annex 2 to this report.

B. SUMMARY OF DISCUSSION

10. Mr. Bo Libert, UNECE Regional Adviser introduced the goals and objectives of the activities on transboundary water cooperation within the framework of the EU/UNDP/UNECE Joint Project “Supporting Kazakhstan’s Transition to a Green Economy Model”. He informed participants that the current seminar will lay the foundation for the review and recommendations on the trans-boundary water cooperation policy of Kazakhstan to be initiated in January 2016. He explained that the review will take into account implementation of bilateral agreements and/or protocols on specific transboundary rivers with the Russian Federation, Central Asian states and China, and will result in policy recommendations including possible changes in the national legislation for the future improvement of cooperation.

11. Ms. Gulzamal Issayeva, UNDP Project Manager of the EU/UNDP/UNECE Joint Project “Supporting Kazakhstan’s Transition to a Green Economy Model” outlined the overall tasks of the project.

12. An overview of the international water legislation was presented by Mr. Sergei Vinogradov, Professor of the Dundee University, an international expert.

13. Mr. Bo Libert, UNECE Regional Adviser shared practical implications and main results of UNECE conventions paying special attention to those having relevance to transboundary water management.

14. To inform participants about Kazakhstan’s chairmanship in the IFAS Mr. Alexander Nikolayenko reported on the experience and main results of the IFAS activities as well as possible directions of the IFAS reform.

15. Mr. Serik Akhmetov, Chairman of the "Water Initiatives Centre" informed participants about the UNECE Convention on the Transboundary Effects of Industrial Accidents, its main goals and applications areas, practical results of the Convention’s implementation, and activities of the Joint Expert Group on water and industrial accidents.

16. Under the agenda item “International water legislation and Kazakhstan“ Mr. Musilim Zhiembayev, Head of Transboundary Rivers Management under the Water and Biological Resources Department, Ministry of Agriculture, and Ms. Indira Akbozova, Head of the Kazakhstan Part of the Secretariat of the Chu-Talas Commission, informed about experience of Kazakhstan in furthering bilateral water cooperation. They shared information about the structure, legal base and cooperation mechanisms defining the work of bilateral transboundary water management commissions, experience of cooperation with international organizations, such as UNECE OSCE, UNDP, GEF and main results of this cooperation.

17. Special attention was given to the issues of organization and financing of joint bodies managing transboundary waters. Under this agenda item Mr. Bo Libert, UNECE Regional Adviser presented experience of the International Commission for the Protection of the Rhine highlighting the main steps preceding the creation of ICPR, its structures, legal basis and practical results. Mr. Dejan Komatina, Secretary of the International Sava River Basin Commission, gave a comprehensive overview of the work of the Sava River Basin Commission, paying special attention to the stage of the creation of the Commission, its financing and overall management. The session raised a lot of interest and practical questions from the side of participants.

18. The discussion on improving transboundary water cooperation of Kazakhstan was moderated by Mr. Bulat Yessekin, Member of the Global Water Partnership Steering Committee, and Mr. Amirkhan Kenshimov, Deputy Director of the Executive Board, IFAS in Kazakhstan. To kick-off the discussion, Mr. Kenshimov made a short presentation on existing joint bodies managing transboundary water resources in Kazakhstan. He highlighted principal international documents managing joint use of transboundary waters, presented main directions of the state water policy, paid special attention to existing issues in the bilateral water cooperation. During the discussion that followed the participants of the seminar recognized that since most rivers in Kazakhstan start in neighboring countries it is crucial to develop the most effective transboundary water management policy applying the principles of the UNECE Convention on the Protection and Use of Transboundary Watercourses and International Lakes and best local and international practices. They underlined the sensitivity of the transboundary water management issue by concluding that until now no common ground was found with neighboring countries with regards to this issue.

19. In drawing conclusions of the seminar, Mr. Zhumabek Moukhatov, Head of Shu Talas basin inspection on regulation of use and protection of water resources, the Committee on Water Resources, Ministry of Agriculture of the Republic of Kazakhstan, said that the event brought up a range of very important issues such as dam safety, information exchange in transboundary context, and the need to further develop joint bodies for cooperation. The exchange of opinions initiated at the seminar should pave the way to a continuous dialogue on these issues. He expressed the hope that there will be more opportunities under the EU/UNDP/UNECE project on Green Economy to come back to these problems and have more deep discussion on each of these issues separately.

C. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

20. The participants of meeting adopted the following decisions and recommendations on the issues raised in the meeting:

- To welcome the new EU/UNDP/UNECE Joint Project “Supporting Kazakhstan’s Transition to a Green Economy Model” and preparation of the review and recommendations on the trans-boundary water cooperation policy of Kazakhstan.
- To recognize the need to improve water legislation and transboundary water management policies in the Republic of Kazakhstan.
- To note the importance of having similar discussions on a regular basis to ensure that personnel of basin inspections and relevant water management bodies are kept informed about innovative water management practices and therefore are equipped to further improve national water management policy.
- To engage, when necessary, in the activities and provide information during preparation of the review and recommendations on the trans-boundary water cooperation policy of Kazakhstan
- To take note of the information and experience on activities of the joint management bodies on rivers Sava, Danube and Rhine, and use this experience to build up national and joint water management bodies.
- To express appreciation to the UNECE’s initiative to arrange this seminar and to the intention to further support issues on transboundary water cooperation in Kazakhstan.
- To express gratitude to SREC “Green Academy” for excellent organization of the meeting.

An evaluation of the meeting by the participants is found in Annex 3.

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

Seminar on Improving the Management of Transboundary Water Resources
in the Republic of Kazakhstan

7-8 December 2015

№	Name of participants	Position and place of work	Contacts
Government Agencies of the Republic of Kazakhstan			
1	Zhienbayev Musilim Rysmahanovich	Head of the Transboundary Rivers Management of the Department of water and biological resources of the Ministry of Agriculture	8 (7172) 749850 zhienbaev@minagri.gov.kz m.zhienbaev@mail.ru
2	Imasheva Gulmira Saginbaevna	Head of the Management on regulation of use and protection of water resources of the Committee on Water Resources of the Ministry of Agriculture	8 (7172) 749871 Imasheva.g@minagri.gov.kz
3	Karlykhanov Adil Khan Karlyhanovich	Head of the "Aral-Syrdarya basin inspection on regulation of use and protection of water resources of the Committee on Water Resources of the Ministry of Agriculture"	8(7242) 235850, 235670, 236075, 235607 as_bvu@mail.ru
4	Mukataev Serikkali Muhametkarimovich	Head of "Balkhash-Alakol basin inspection on regulation of use and protection of water resources of the Committee on Water Resources of the Ministry of Agriculture"	8(7272) 453252, 453618, 453616, 453608, 453253 babvu@mail.ru
5	Suleimenov Ryspek Karibayevich	Head of "Irtysh basin inspection on regulation of use and protection of water resources of the Committee on Water Resources of the Ministry of Agriculture"	8(7222) 307042, 307168 307183, 325330, 307042 irbvu@mail.ru
6	Meiramov Esengeldy Akimovich	Head of "Esilsky basin inspection on regulation of use and protection of water resources of the Committee on Water Resources of the Ministry of Agriculture"	274286, 274289, 274419, 370882 ishim_bvu@mail.ru
7	Kuanov Bissen Otarovich	Head of "Zhayyk Caspian basin inspection on regulation of use and protection of water resources of the Committee on Water Resources of the Ministry of Agriculture"	8(7122) 328622. 322392, 327514, 326909 ukbvu@mail.ru
8	Akkozhin Muslim Semserovich	Acting of the head of "Nur-Sarysu basin inspection on regulation of use and protection of water resources of of the Committee on Water Resources of the Ministry of Agriculture "	8(7212) 411330, 411350, 425963, +77212425437 nurasarisu@mail.ru
9	Ospanbekova Gulshat Kenesovna	Head of "Tobol Torgai basin inspection on regulation of use and protection of water resources of the Committee on Water Resources of the Ministry of Agriculture "	8 (7142) 501109 kostanay_bvi@mail.ru
10	Mukhatov Jumabek Sadvakasovich	Head of "Shu-Talas basin inspection on regulation of use and protection of water resources of the Committee on Water Resources of the Ministry of Agriculture "	8(7262) 456441, 433237, 457908, 87014451329, 431240 shu-talas@mail.ru
11	Kantarbekova Aida Maratovna	International Legal Department of the Ministry of Innovation and Development	8 (7172) 720215 a.kantarbekova@mfa.gov.kz
12	Duzbaeva Kalamkas Serikovna	First Secretary of the Department of Pan-Asian cooperation of the Ministry of Innovation and Development	8 (7172) 720115 720226, 720029 k.duzbayeva@mfa.gov.kz
13	Karbozin Kaisar Kayratovich	First Secretary of the Department of Pan-Asian cooperation of the Ministry of Innovation and Development	8 (7172) 720115 720226, 720029

14	Igenbaev Meirhanovich	Rauan	Expert of the Department of International Cooperation of the Ministry of National Economy	8 (7172) 743706 743740 r.igenbaev@economy.gov.kz
15	Kerey Duysenbaevich	Bekbergen	Director of the Department of "green economy" of the Ministry of Energy	8 (7172) 740198 b.kerey@energo.gov.kz
16	Rahimova Assel		Chief specialist of the Department of of "green economy" of the Ministry of Energy	8 (7172) 740288
17	Shotanov Ermek Igembaevich		General Director of JSC "NPO Eurasian Water Center "	8 (7172) 797389 watercenter@mail.ru
18	Lyudmila Shabanova		Deputy of the General Director of JSC "NPO Eurasian Water Center "	87758967848 watercenter@mail.ru
19	Abdulmanov Seilbekovich	Nurgazy	Chief Expert of the Department of Information Technology RSE "Information and Analytical Center of Environmental Protection" of the Ministry of Energy	8 (7172) 799646 ias.info@mail.ru nurgazy_777@mail.ru
International and regional organizations				
20	Bo Libert		Regional Adviser on Environmental Protection UNECE	+41 (0) 229172396 bo.libert@unece.org
21	Gulzhamal Isayeva		The manager of the UNDP / EU / UNECE project on "Supporting Kazakhstan's transition to a Green Economy Model"	8 (7172) 696544
22	Sergey Vinogradov		International Expert	
23	Alexander Nikolaenko		International Expert	
24	Dejan Komatina		Secretary of the International Commission on the Sava River Basin Management	
25	Natalia Golovko		The local coordinator of the project, the UNECE	87023061121 natala_golovko@hotmail.com
26	Yessekin Kamalbekovich	Bulat	Member of the Board of Directors of the Global Water Partnership (GWP, Stockholm), Vice-Chairman of the Committee on Environmental Policy UNECE (Geneva)	bulat.yessekin@gmail.com>
27	Kenshimov Kadyrbekovich	Amirkhan	Deputy Director of the Public Foundation "Executive Board of the International Fund for Saving the Aral Sea"	a.kenshimov@ifas.kz
28	Serik Kabdualievich	Akhmetov	Chairman of the Foundation "Center of Water Initiatives"	8 (7172) 798196 serik.akhmetov@wic.kz
29	Akbozova Indira Turebaeva		Chief of the Kazakhstan's part of the Secretariat of the Commission of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Kyrgyz Republic on the use of water facilities of interstate use of the rivers Shu and Talas	shutalaskz@gmail.com
"Green Academy" Scientific Research and Education Center				
30	Yessekina Kamalbekovna	Bakhyt	PhD, professor, director of Scientific Research and Education Center "Green Academy"	8 (7172) 277293 info@green-academy.kz
31	Prmanova Akimbekovna	Naziya	Deputy Director of the Research and Education Center "Green Academy"	8 (7172) 277294 nazi-ap@mail.ru

PROGRAMME

Seminar on Improving the Management of Transboundary Water Resources
in the Republic of Kazakhstan

December 7-8, 2015

7 December	
09.00 – 09.30	<i>Registration</i>
09.30 – 09.45	<p>Opening Remarks Bolat Bekniyaz, Deputy Chairman of the Committee on Water Resources of the Ministry of Agriculture of the Republic of Kazakhstan Ms. Bakhyt Yessekina, Director of the “Green Academy” Scientific Research and Education Center</p>
Session 1: Overview of International water legislation	
09.45– 10.00	<p>“Supporting Kazakhstan’s Transition to a Green Economy Model” Project: issues about transboundary cooperation. Bo Libert, Regional Adviser on Environmental Protection UNECE</p>
10.00– 11.00	<p>International water legislation: the basics. Sergei Vinogradov, an international expert.</p>
11.00– 11.30	Coffee –break
11.30– 11.45	<p>UNECE and the convention secretariats, The executive Committee. Bo Libert</p>
11.45– 12.30	<p>Experiences from Kazakhstan’s chairmanship of the IFAS, Sagit Ibatullin, a national expert</p>
12.30– 13.00	<p>Possible directions of the IFAS reformation. Sergey Vinogradov</p>
13.00 – 14.00	Lunch
Session 2: International water legislation and Kazakhstan	
14.00 - 14.30	<p>UNECE Convention on the Transboundary Effects of Industrial Accidents: Case Studies Serik Akhmetov, Chairman of the Foundation "Center of Water Initiatives"</p>
14.30– 15.30	<p>Discussion: The principles of international water law Moderator: Bo Libert</p>
15.30 – 16.00	Coffee break
16.00 – 17.00	<p>Kazakhstan’s experience on bilateral cooperation on transboundary water management: Chu-Talas, China, Russia. Musilim Zhienbayev, Indira Akbozova</p>
17.00- 17.30	<p>Discussion: Improving transboundary water cooperation policy of Kazakhstan. Moderator: Alexander Nikolaenko</p>
8 December	
Session 3: Joint bodies: Organization and financing of cooperation	
09.30 – 10.00	<p>Joint bodies of the UNECE Convention on the Transboundary Water Management (including the issues of the joint management of the Rhine Basin). Bo Libert, Regional Adviser on Environmental Protection UNECE.</p>
10.00 – 11.45 (Coffee break 10.45 – 11.15)	<p>International Sava River Basin Commission</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tasks of the Commission • Financing • Organization • Challenges <p>Dejan Komatina, Secretary, International Sava River Basin Commission.</p>
11.45 – 12.15	<p>The International Commission for the Protection of the Danube River (ICPDR). Dejan Komatina, Secretary, International Sava River Basin Commission.</p>
12.15 – 13.00	<p>Discussion: Joint bodies of the management of transboundary water resources of</p>

	Kazakhstan Amirkhan Kenshimov, Deputy Director of the Public Foundation "Executive Board of the International Fund for Saving the Aral Sea".
13.00 – 14.00	Lunch
Session 4: Improving transboundary water cooperation of Kazakhstan	
14.00 – 15.00	Presentation of the next steps and the final debate Moderator: Bulat Yessekin, a member of the Board of Directors of the Global Water Partnership, Deputy Chairman of the Committee on Environmental Policy UNECE

SUMMARY of EVALUATIONS

Seminar on Improving the Management of Transboundary Water Resources in the Republic of Kazakhstan

Astana, Kazakhstan, 7-8 December, 2015

The rating was made on the basis of 14 responses on a questionnaire with the following questions. A 5-mark scale was used, where 1 is "very badly" and 5 is "very good".

1. How relevant was the topic of the seminar and how well it corresponded with the actual agenda of the event?

Marks received: «5» - 12 (86%), «4» - 2 (14%).

Comments and suggestions:

1. Seminar like this is absolutely relevant and very useful for the national state bodies involved in water sector of Kazakhstan
2. Topics of the seminar are relevant and actual. At the same time, it would be good to hear about the existing gaps and problems in the use of water resources in Kazakhstan as well as in Central Asia. It would also be useful to learn about theoretical and practical experience of Mr. Vinogradov in the legal regulation of water resources management in China.
3. The seminar was very topical in the context of Kazakhstan's transition to a green economy and in for the cooperation with neighboring countries. It would be good to dedicate one of the future events to the quality of water resources entering Kazakhstan.
4. Seminar raised very important issues. It would be useful if the follow-up events would cover more issues of legal and technical regulation of protection and use of transboundary water resources.
5. Pay more attention to the quality of transboundary rivers.
6. Topics chosen are very important. At similar events in the future propose to review experience of those countries dealing with issues of water apportioning, not navigation and emergency situations.
7. Topics chosen are very actual. It is important to hold events on developing transboundary water cooperation in Kazakhstan more often.
8. Issues of restoration of navigation on rivers Irtysh and Black Irtysh from the border with China through Kazakhstan and further to Russia are very important. It is also important to restore navigation on river Ili from Kapshagaj to Xinjiang Uygur Autonomous Region of China.
9. It would be useful to invite to such seminars heads of ministries, subordinated bodies, akimats.

2. How interesting and relevant were statements and presentations?

Marks received: «5» - 9 (64%), «4» - 5 (36%).

Comments and suggestions:

1. Participation of international experts, such as Vinogradov, Libert is very important and their presentations have practical implications.
2. The most interesting presentations were made by Bo Libert, Sergey Vinogradov and Alexander Nikolaenko (on IFAS). In the future it would be good to hear more on progress of negotiating process in the framework of IFAS, bi-lateral Commissions on rivers Shu and Talas; and recommendations of international experts on further development of cooperation.
3. Very good presentations on international water legislation and international joint commissions on rivers Sava and Danube. It would be good to arrange exchange of experience in activities of joint bodies.
4. Presentations were very detailed, translation to Russian was organised.
5. It is necessary to review issues of improving transboundary water management in the light of concrete problematic areas existing in cooperation with China, Uzbekistan, Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan.

6. Very good detailed presentations. The most interesting was presentation on Secretariat of the Sava river commission.
7. All presentations were in line with announced topics for discussion. We learned many implications of water resources management and international water legislation.
8. Level of presentations was very high. It would be good to have overview similar to presentation made on Sava and Danube river on such rivers as Irtysh, Esil, and Ural.

3. *How well was the seminar arranged*

Marks received: «5» - 12 (86%), «4» - 2 (14%).

Comments and suggestions:

1. Organization of seminar was very good.
2. Very good work on arranging the seminar. Would like to express gratitude to organisers, moderators and speakers. Especially liked the practical level of presentations of national Kazakh speakers. It would be important to have a separate event on issues of water apportioning, international experience existing in this field, especially on existing principles of water apportioning.
3. Would like to express gratitude for the good arrangement of the seminar.
4. Seminar was arranged on a high level.
5. Good seminar organisation.
6. Very good seminar organisation. In the future it is proposed to arrange a round table on introduced and proposed amendments in the Water Code of Kazakhstan. It would be good to involve in this round table independent experts and Committee of Water Resources of the Ministry of Agriculture of Kazakhstan.
7. Seminar was arranged on the highest level. For the future events it would be important to involve representatives from the Ministry of Finance and National Economy.
8. Seminar was arranged on a high level. Similar events are necessary to arrange on rivers Irtysh, Esil and Ili.