Indicators
to measure the effectiveness
of the implementation
of the UNECE Strategy for ESD

Expert Group on Indicators for ESD:
progress made (7th and 8th meetings)

Geneva 20-2-2009

drs. R.M. van Raaij,
Ministry LNV, the Netherlands, Dutch NAP “Learning for SD”
Outline:

- report on progress:

- product 1: Revised Reporting format (approved by last SC meeting)
- product 2: Guidance for reporting, including QQ and descriptors
- product 3: Outline of Publication on UNECE ESD materials

- product 4: Revised Template for Good Practices in ESD

- product 5: Terms of Reference for EG on Competences in ESD

end of the mandate for EG on Indicators for ESD
Recall the Strategy:

**Strategy for ESD (Vilnius, March 2005):**
*To facilitate the introduction and promotion of education for sustainable development in the UNECE region towards the realization of our common vision.*

**The Aim of the Strategy:**
*To encourage UNECE member States to develop and incorporate ESD into their formal education systems, in all relevant subjects, and in non-formal and informal education.*

→ *policy driven process, focus on member states*
Recall objectives:

1) Ensure that policy, regulatory and operational frameworks support ESD

2) Promotion SD through formal, non-formal and informal learning

3) Equip educators with the competences to include SD in their teaching

4) Ensure that adequate tools and materials for ESD are available and accessible

5) Promote research on and development of ESD

6) Strengthen cooperation on ESD at all levels within the UNECE region.
Recall establishment of Expert group following Vilnius Mandate: “to develop indicators to measure the effectiveness of the implementation of the strategy”

- Setting up a “framework”
- Translating objectives into questions: what do we need to know, what do we want to know, which data are available, what methodology is available
- Than: constructing indicators out of these questions, as far as aggregation is possible and qualitative/quantitative data / methods are available
Recall establishment of Expert group:

Representatives from Armenia, Austria, Canada, France, Germany, Greece, Italy, Lithuania, the Netherlands, the Russian Federation, Slovenia, Sweden, the United Kingdom, UNESCO, Intergovernmental Central Asia Working Group on Environmental Education and ESD, European Eco-Forum, UNICEF (invited expert), ENSI (invited expert), Asia-Pacific ESD monitoring project (invited expert), OECD (invited expert), supported by UNECE secretariat:

*thank you Angela and Ella*

Eight meetings of 3 days work:


*thank you host countries and organizations*
We look for an evaluation model that covers:

a) the **process** of implementation

b) The **effectiveness** of the implementation (as a qualitative feature of both the process and long-term effects of ESD).

*There are several considerations given:*
- Operate within the mandate of expert group and the Strategy
- stick to the text / objectives of the Strategy as such
- our work has to be understood in different countries, cultures, educational systems, political systems, languages (!)
- Mostly based on existing data and methodology (Vilnius)
- not too much questions, keep it simple, look for aggregation
- UNECE ESD process is policy-oriented (international), so this is the main audience
Background for our work: Evaluation model

Check List

……. Y/n
……. Y/n

TYPE 1

Policy Framework

Type 0

Current Situation (baseline)

T=0

2015

TYPE 2

input

Throughput activities

TYPE 3

Output

Direct / Indirect

Effects, Impact On SD

Outcome

TYPE 4

outcome
**Specific Mandate for the 7th and 8th meeting:**

- ..... To finalise the draft list of descriptors as a tool to support the reporting format ............
- ..... To prepare a proposal ... for a mandate .... For a possible (new) expert group on competences in ESD ......

**Geneva Meeting:**

Revisions of Descriptors + further identification of examples / illustrations / good practices
Paris Meeting:

- Further development of the Guidance for Reporting
- Revision of the template for collecting good practices in ESD
- Proposal for a publication (including reflective chapter)
- Debate on Competences in ESD, including invited experts from ENSI and OECD
- Drafting a proposal for mandate for EG on Competences in ESD

Product 1:
Revised Reporting Format, that was adopted by the last meeting of the Steering Committee is now ready for use. The revisions included:
- Addition of question 2.1.3 Learning & Teaching Methods
- Revision of tables and appendix
Product 2: Guidance for Reporting

Contents:

Procedure: Reporting is a multistakeholder process!
Both quantitative and qualitative information are important

Indicators: How to understand indicators, concept of Reporting format, questions, how to see monitoring and evaluation: to learn!

Quality Criteria:
- Criteria to assess success
- Descriptors

Good Practices in ESD.....
Balanced approach: ESD1 (instrumental) vs. ESD2 (emancipator)

Most important: Annex II: Descriptors!!

+ Glossary (revised)
+ ISCED Levels
### Product 2: Guidance for Reporting (descriptors)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subindicator No.</th>
<th>QUESTION: …………</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of indicator</th>
<th>Sources of information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>…………</td>
<td>…………</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>……………………………………</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relevant passage(s) from the Strategy</th>
<th>Para xx of Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example(s)</th>
<th>Illustration ……</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Good Practice: ……</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Information ……</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Product 3: Outline for a UNECE Publication
“Learning from Each Other – UNECE strategy for ESD”

- Foreword
- UNECE Strategy
- Joint Statement on ESD of Ministers in Belgrade
- Progress in implementation (first reporting - Belgrade progress report)
- Reporting Format
- Guidance for Reporting
- Glossary
- Learning through developing indicators (reflexive chapter)

Publication to be ready for Bonn Conference DESD
“Learning from Each Other – UNECE strategy for ESD”

Brake in presentation for questions on Indicators and reporting process
Product 4: Template for Good Practices in ESD

What is new?

1) Prepare for use of example in database: easy to track down
2) More general areas of focus and themes
3) More systemic description, addressing WHO, WHEN, WHERE, WHAT, HOW
4) Specific questions about evaluation of the initiative

NEW ROUND of collecting Good Practices 2009-2011
Together with UNESCO, also to illustrate next reporting exercise
“Template for Good Practice”

Brake in presentation for questions on Template and collection of good practices in 2009 - 2011
Product 5: Proposal Mandate for Expert Group on Competences

Competence:
There is already quite some material! Good Starting point

First issue: competences for students -> ‘learners”

Second issue: competences for teaching -> “educators”

Third issue: who to address: effective political action: address policymakers what is needed for ‘educators’ to do the job.

-> Outcome of EG is to policymakers, while providing clear guidelines for educators

Competence: learning to know, learning to do, learning to be, learning to live together (the treasure within, Delors)
Product 5: continued

Competence:
WHY competences for ESD? → Vision
WHAT competence for ESD? → Flexible Framework (generic, specific)
HOW to teach and learn ESD? → practical implications, illustrations and good practices

→ By what interventions this competences are stimulated?

Different views and competences needed for this job:
- national and international policies
- Teaching EE and ESD
- Management of institutions
- Academia, both research and educators
- NGO
Product 5: continued

About 5 meetings during two years
Report to Steering committee in 2010 and 2011

Support of UNECE Secretariat

Lead country

Expenses

Open questions and remarks for start

Background documents and materials.

Interesting initiatives: ENSI, OECD, Transfer 21 etc....
Consideration of the proposed mandate to work on Competences in ESD:

- decision on establishing an EG on Competences in ESD
- composition of the group
- host countries
- cooperation with UNESCO
Words of thanks:
- To members of the expert group. A real hard working group of people, making long productive days!
- To UNECE secretariat
- To host countries who organised perfect arrangements for the work of this group
- To consultants (Wageningen University) and UNESCO MEEG for joining in the meetings
Thank you for your attention,
Lots of success to us all!