REVIEW

of the UNECE activities under the Espoo Convention on Environmental Impact Assessment in a Transboundary Context and its Protocol on Strategic Environmental Assessment
MANDATE and METHODOLOGY

• Mandatory for all UN programmes
• Conducted by independent & external evaluator (George Safonov)
• Desk review (treaty texts; workplans; financial reports, etc.)
• Survey
  • in March-April 2016
  • Sent to all focal points and stakeholders
  • Only 20 responses: Armenia, Azerbaijan, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Bulgaria, Denmark, Finland, Georgia, Germany, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Mongolia, Norway, Poland, Russia, Slovakia, Spain, Switzerland, Ukraine, as well as the European Commission - DG Environment, and Caucasus Environmental NGO Network (CENN).
• Interviews (selected and available)
  • (selected and available): Armenia, Azerbaijan, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Bulgaria, European Commission, Kyrgyzstan, Switzerland
• Evaluation forms of Working Group’s 5th meeting (April 2016)
Aims

• Evaluate **relevance, effectiveness and efficiency** of UNECE activities under the Convention and Protocol
• Contribute to ensuring continued relevance + increased effectiveness and impact of the activities
• Contribute to ensuring relevance of policy and workplan activities for 2017–2020
• Enable more effective procedures for delivery of future activities, where necessary
RELEVANCE of workplan activities

• i.e. whether meet Treaties’ aims and countries’ needs
• review of work under 2011–2014 and 2014–2017 workplans (and receive feedback on proposals for 2017-2020 draft workplan)
  • Compliance and implementation;
  • Subregional cooperation and capacity-building;
  • Exchange of good practice
  • Promoting ratification and application of the Protocol on SEA (including outreach, strategic planning, etc.)
  • Financial and in-kind contributions
EFFECTIVENESS of secretariat support...

• to governing and subsidiary bodies – in bringing results, achieving goals, meeting objectives

• Issues assessed:
  • Procedure of the review of compliance
  • Reporting and review of the implementation of the Convention and the Protocol
  • Communication between the Secretariat and the Parties
  • The capacity building activities
EFFICIENCY of the work

• Whether carried out in an optimal way of spending available resources
• Elements assessed:
  • Organization of the meetings
  • Preparation of the meeting documentation
  • Implementation of the workplan activities
  • Review of compliance
  • Reporting and the review of implementation of the Convention and the Protocol
  • Monitoring of expenditures based on the reports on use of funds by the Secretariat
  • Communication between the Secretariat and Parties
  • The capacity building activities
  • **Maintaining the gender equality** in the work
Quantitative analysis of estimates (scores)

1 - highly ineffective/irrelevant
2 - somewhat ineffective/irrelevant
3 - somewhat effective/relevant
4 - mostly effective/relevant
5 - very effective/relevant
Outcomes = positive

• Overall effectiveness, efficiency and relevance of UNECE activities assessed very positively, with majority of “mostly and very satisfactory” estimates (95% of estimates)
• No evidence of failures, poor performance, inefficient use of resources, misleading in treaty implementation
• Total score of 4.19 (out of 5)
• Highest level of satisfaction: Armenia, Azerbaijan, Georgia, Kazakhstan, Mongolia, Russia, and Spain (average > 4.5).
• Lowest average estimates (< 3.5) from Bosnia and Herzegovina; and Finland
• Remaining 11 respondents’ average (close to 4 and above)
Quality of meetings = very high

- level of participation/interaction; representativeness: 4.25
- conduct: 4.55
- quality of interpretation: 4.32
- follow-up: 4.70
- servicing the meetings: 4.60
- preparation of the meetings: 4.80
Effectiveness of preparation of meeting documentation = very high
Efficiency in preparation of documentation = highly efficient

- Quality of work of the secretariat in supporting delivery of meeting:
  - 4.53

- Timeliness of informal documentation:
  - 4.26

- Timeliness of French and Russian translations of agendas and documents:
  - 4.31

- Timeliness of the agendas and documents in English:
  - 4.47

- Timeliness of agendas and documents in English:
  - 37
Degree of implementation of workplan + secretariat’s support = mostly effective
Effectiveness of the review of compliance= mostly effective

- Performance of the secretariat in supporting the...: 4.35
- Follow-up on the decisions on compliance by the...: 4.05
- Deliberations by the MoPs: 4.15
- Procedure within/ functioning of the IC: 3.95

The chart on the right shows the distribution of responses:
- 0 responses for 1 and 2
- 3 responses for 3
- 39 responses for 4
- 25 responses for 5
Compliance review = highly efficient

Efficiency of the secretariat promote the timeliness of the review of...

Timeliness of the compliance review

- Efficiency: 4.31
  - 4.3 4.3 4.3 4.3 4.3 4.3 4.4 4.4

- Timeliness: 4.35
  - 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4

- Frequency of occurrence for quality:
  - 0 0 4 16 16
Reporting and review of implementation = mostly effective

Quality of the review of the implementation
Reviews of implementation by the secretariat: - Quality
Reviews of implementation by the secretariat: - Usefulness
Performance of the secretariat in supporting Parties
Quality of the questionnaires
Quality of Parties’ reporting

3.4 3.6 3.8 4.0 4.2 4.4 4.6
0 1 2 3 4 5
Reporting and review of implementation = highly efficient

Performance of the secretariat in supporting review of implementation and communication...

Performance of the secretariat in supporting the timely reporting

Timeliness of reporting on implementation
Monitoring of expenditures = highly effective
Communication between Secretariat and Parties = highly effective; Between Parties = moderately effective

Communication between the Parties

Communication between the secretariat and national focal points

Bar chart showing frequency distribution.
Communication between Secretariat and Parties = highly efficient; Parties’ direct communication = moderately efficient
Effectiveness of capacity building activities = highly effective
Maintaining gender equality = highly effective
Relevance of workplan 2014-2017 = high

b. Technical advice in legal drafting (to Parties)
c. Pre-accession legislative assistance (to non-Parties)
d. Subregional overview of legislation and practice (on SEA but also EIA)
e. Collection of findings and opinions from IC
f. Guidance on the Implementation
g. Alignment of the language versions of the treaty texts
h. Update of Guidance on EIA in a transboundary context for CA
i. Video to promote benefits of the Protocol on SEA

II. Subregional cooperation and capacity-building:

(a)...

(b) Exchange visit (study tour)

III. Exchange of good practice - 1. Workshops within WG meetings on:

(b) Global application of the Convention and the Protocol
(c) Additional activity: Joint workshop on land-use planning with...

2. Development of good practice guidance on application of the...

IV. Promoting ratification and application of the Protocol on SEA (a)...

(b) IAIA informal pamphlets
(c) Training of trainers workshops at national level
(d) Other national SEA training (please specify)
(e) Local training events
(f) National guidance documents
(g) Pilot projects
2011-2014 workplan = highly relevant

I. Outreach activities: Promoting the Convention...
   - 3.75

II. Compliance and implementation - General...
   - 4.07

III. Exchange of good practice - Workshops/seminars...
   - Renewable energy
     - 4.14
   - Nuclear energy
     - 4.43
   - Sharing good practice and tools for...
     - 4.00

IV. Promoting ratification and application of the...
   - Translation of the resource manual and simplified...
     - 4.54
   - Preparation of format for SEA notification
     - 4.29
   - Joint workshop with Aarhus Convention on public...
     - 4.14
   - Guidance on public participation in SEA-
     - 4.47
Proposals for 2017-2020 draft workplan = relevant

I. Update and revision of the 1990 guidance on post-project analysis in EIA
II. Subregional cooperation:
   (a) Subregional conference/workshop on the...
   (b) Subregional training workshop on quality control of SEA documentation
   (c) Subregional capacity-building to promote public participation in decision-...
   (d) Organization of subregional capacity-building workshop on transboundary...
   (e) Workshop/dedicated session on implementation of the Convention [and the...]
III. Exchange of good practices:
   - Workshops on:
     (a) Application to the Protocol...
     (b) Application of the Protocol on SEA to climate change adaptation and...
     (c) Improving intersectoral cooperation and institutional arrangements
     (d) Linkages with transboundary EIA and SEA with biodiversity assessment
   (b) Development of good practice recommendations on the application of SEA...
   (c) Development of guidance on the application of the Protocol on SEA to urban...
   (d) Translation into national languages of the video promoting the benefits of...
   (f) Pilot SEAs in selected countries, in selected sectors
   (g) National guidance documents on the implementation of SEA
   (h) Preparation of fact sheets on application of the Protocol on SEA
   (i) Preparation of two-page informal pamphlets or “fastTips” on key issues in SEA...
V. Opening of the Convention and the Protocol:
   (a) Development of a strategy...
   (b) Development of a strategy for the contribution to the achievement of...
   Effectiveness of process of developing draft new workplans
   Relevance of work of the secretariat in promoting the implementation of the...
   Availability of funding or in-kind contributions for the implementation of the...
Most relevant proposals for 2017-2020 draft workplan

- National guidance documents on the implementation of SEA (4.40)
- Informal pamphlets or “FasTips” on key issues in SEA practice (4.33)
- Preparation of fact sheets on application of the Protocol on SEA (4.29)
- Subregional capacity-building activities to promote public participation in decision-making on EIA and SEA (4.29)
- Pilot SEAs in selected countries, in selected sectors (4.25)
- Subregional training workshop on quality control of SEA documentation 4.07
- Improving intersectoral cooperation and institutional arrangements for the application of the Protocol and the Convention (4.07)
- Development of good practice recommendations on the application of SEA to climate change mitigation (4.07)
- Development of guidance on application of the Protocol to urban planning (4.07)
- Development of strategy for the implementation of Conv. and Prot. at global level
- Translation of video on SEA to national languages (4)