ECONOMIC COMMISSION FOR EUROPE

Meeting of the Parties to the Convention on Environmental Impact Assessment in a Transboundary Context
Second meeting
(Sofia, 26-27 February 2001)
(Item 4 (iii) of the provisional agenda)

DRAFT DECISION TO BE TAKEN AT THE SECOND MEETING OF THE PARTIES

Submitted by the Working Group

DECISION II/3

DRAFT GUIDANCE ON PUBLIC PARTICIPATION IN ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT IN A TRANSBOUNDARY CONTEXT

The Meeting,

Recalling decision I/6 on the adoption of the work plan taken at its first meeting,

Convinced that public participation forms an important part of transboundary environmental impact assessment,

Acknowledging that the Convention on Access to Information, Public Participation in Decision-making and Access to Justice in Environmental Matters may contribute significantly to the further strengthening of public participation in the implementation of the Convention on Environmental Impact Assessment in a Transboundary Context,

GE.00-33608 (E)
1. **Recognizes** the need for guidance to assist competent authorities and the public in organizing effective public participation in environmental impact assessment in a transboundary context;

2. ** Welcomes ** the work carried out by the Russian Federation in developing draft guidance on public participation in environmental impact assessment in a transboundary context as annexed to this decision;

3. ** Recommends ** the Parties to develop this guidance further, *inter alia* on the basis of case studies, and to put forward proposals for consideration at the third meeting of the Parties;

4. ** Decides ** to take the outcome of the Workshop held in Moscow in June 2000 into account in its work plan for the period 2001-2003.
Annex

Introduction

1. Principle 10 of the Declaration of the United Nations Conference on Environment and Development (UNCED) in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil, emphasizes that environmental issues are best handled with the participation of all concerned citizens, at the relevant level.\(^1\) Item 23.2 of Agenda 21, adopted at the Rio de Janeiro Conference, recognizes the important role of public participation in environmental impact assessment in achieving sustainable development.\(^2\)

2. The Convention on Environmental Impact Assessment in a Transboundary Context (EIA Convention)\(^3\) is one of the basic documents in the implementation of ideas and principles of UNCED on sustainable development and in the development of the principles of civil society and democracy in the region of UN/ECE.

3. At the first meeting of the Parties to the EIA Convention (Oslo, 18-20 May 1998), it was agreed that the work plan for the implementation of the Convention in 1998-2000 should include work on public participation in (environmental impact assessment in) a transboundary context.

4. Guidance was developed by the Russian Federation, as lead country, with financial support from Italy, and with assistance from the secretariat of the EIA Convention and an international group of experts from Armenia, Azerbaijan, Bulgaria, Estonia, Finland, Georgia, Germany, Italy, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Latvia, Lithuania, Norway, Poland, Russian Federation, Slovakia, the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, Turkmenistan, Ukraine, United Kingdom, United States of America, European Bank for Reconstruction and Development, European Commission and international NGOs: European ECO-Forum, Global Environment, International Public Network for Environmental Impact Assessment (IPNEIA) and International Social-Ecological Union (SEU).

5. Most of these experts from the ECE region, including many from NGOs and countries in transition, took part in the international Workshop in Moscow (18-20 June 2000) where the draft Guidance was discussed, further developed and generally approved.

I. GOALS AND OBJECTIVES OF THE GUIDANCE

6. The main goal of this Guidance is to assist competent authorities and the public in organizing effective public participation in environmental impact assessment in a transboundary context (below: “transboundary EIA”) under the EIA Convention. The authorities in the UN/ECE member countries (including Parties and non-Parties to the EIA Convention) may use this Guidance to further develop national regulations and bilateral and multilateral agreements pursuant to the EIA Convention.

7. The main objectives of public participation in transboundary EIA are to:

(a) Improve the quality of decisions with transboundary impacts;
Annex

(b) Stimulate comprehensively balanced and open environmental decision-making;

(c) Stimulate public debate of proposed activities among all interested groups at an early stage of decision-making, and to prevent conflicts;

(d) Help to prevent or mitigate adverse global and regional environmental consequences of decisions with transboundary impacts;

(e) Develop an understanding of final decisions with transboundary impacts at international and national levels.

8. Public participation in EIA in a transboundary context will help to:

(a) Improve relations between peoples and countries, and prevent transboundary environmental conflicts;

(b) Develop civil society and democracy in the countries of the ECE region;

(c) Promote the timely disclosure of relevant information to participants in the environmental decision-making process;

(d) Make people understand and respect the final decisions on projects;

(e) Give an insight into environmental protection and long-term environmental problems.

II. RECOMMENDATIONS DEALING WITH THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PROVISIONS OF THE CONVENTION

9. The EIA Convention states (art. 2, para. 2) that “Each Party shall take the necessary legal, administrative or other measures to implement the provisions of this Convention, including ... the establishment of an environmental impact assessment procedure that permits public participation ...”. This implies that:

(a) The Party of origin should support participation by its own public and the public of the affected Party in transboundary EIA by taking the necessary legal, administrative or other measures; and

(b) The affected Party should support participation by its own public in transboundary EIA, including, if necessary, participation by the public of the affected Party in appropriate procedures in the Party of origin, by taking the necessary legal, administrative or other measures.

10. The EIA Convention also states (art. 2, para. 6) that “The Party of origin shall provide, in accordance with the provisions of this Convention, an opportunity to the public in the areas likely to be affected to participate in relevant environmental impact assessment procedures
regarding proposed activities and shall ensure that the opportunity provided to the public of the affected Party is equivalent to that provided to the public of the Party of origin.” This is the main provision on public participation in the Convention, and is especially important because it indicates that the public participation procedures should be equivalent for both Parties. This implies, for example, that if the public in the Party of origin has an opportunity to take part in public hearings on proposed activities, the Party of origin should provide the same opportunity to the public in the affected Party.

11. The EIA Convention stipulates (art. 3, para. 1) that “For a proposed activity … the Party of origin shall … notify any Party which it considers may be an affected Party as early as possible and no later than when informing its own public about that proposed activity.” This implies that:

(a) The Party of origin should notify its own public as early as possible about the proposed activity and about the start of the EIA procedure; and

(b) The Party of origin should notify any Party which it considers may be an affected Party (including the public in that Party) as early as possible and no later than when informing its own public about the proposed activity.

12. According to the EIA Convention (art. 3, para. 2), “This notification shall contain, inter alia:

(a) Information on the proposed activity, including any available information on its possible transboundary impact;

(b) The nature of the possible decision; and

(c) An indication of a reasonable time within which a response under paragraph 3 of this article is required, taking into account the nature of the proposed activity;

and may include the information set out in paragraph 5 of this article.”

13. The information mentioned in article 3, paragraph 5, of the Convention includes:

“(a) Relevant information regarding the environmental impact assessment procedure, including an indication of the time schedule for transmittal of comments; and

(b) Relevant information on the proposed activity and its possible significant adverse transboundary impact.”

This implies that the Party of origin should send the information mentioned in paragraph 12 above to its own public and to the public in any Party which it considers may be an affected Party (translated into the language of that Party) as early as possible and no later than when informing its own public about the proposed activity.
14. The EIA Convention states (art. 3, para. 8) that “The concerned Parties shall ensure that the public of the affected Party in the areas likely to be affected be informed of, and be provided with possibilities for making comments or objections on, the proposed activity, and for the transmittal of these comments or objections to the competent authority of the Party of origin, either directly to this authority or, where appropriate, through the Party of origin.”

This paragraph is part of the article dealing with notification and makes it clear that public participation should begin as early as possible. The Parties concerned are expected to make the practical arrangements for such public participation.

15. This implies that:

(a) The Party of origin is responsible for the translation into the language of the affected Party of all documentation disseminated as part of the transboundary EIA procedure, for providing the information and for receiving comments from the affected Party and the public there;

(b) The Party of origin, if necessary, can recover the cost from the proponent of the activity;

(c) The Party of origin can distribute the information to the public by means of the mass media, e-mail, the Internet, public hearings or in other appropriate ways;

(d) The affected Party is responsible for collecting comments from the public, analysing them and forwarding them to the Party of origin.

16. The EIA Convention lays down (art. 4, para. 2) that “The Party of origin shall furnish the affected Party, as appropriate through a joint body where one exists, with the environmental impact assessment documentation. The concerned Parties shall arrange for distribution of the documentation to the authorities and the public of the affected Party in the areas likely to be affected and for the submission of comments to the competent authority of the Party of origin, either directly to this authority or, where appropriate, through the Party of origin within a reasonable time before the final decision is taken on the proposed activity.”

This implies that:

(a) The Party of origin must transmit the EIA documentation to the affected Party and receive comments;

(b) The Party of origin is responsible for the translation of the EIA documentation, the comments received from the affected Party, and all the documentation which the Parties concerned send each other during the transboundary EIA procedure;

(c) The Party of origin undertakes to ensure that the comments received from the affected Party, including the comments from the public, will be reflected in the final decision;
(d) The affected Party must specify the arrangements for distributing the EIA documentation to its own authorities and the public and for collecting comments and forwarding them to the Party of origin or its competent authorities.

III. GENERAL RECOMMENDATIONS

17. The competent authorities and the public in the Parties concerned and joint bodies (where they exist) should consider public participation in transboundary EIA as one of the most important elements of this procedure, helping to make environmental decision-making of this kind more effective.

18. Public participation in transboundary EIA should take place in a manner that takes full account of the rights and responsibilities of the competent authorities and the public. It should also take into account national traditions, institutions and social structure.

19. The EIA Convention defines (art. 1 (x)) “The public” as “one or more natural or legal persons”. This is a broad definition, but the Convention also imposes some restrictions on public involvement in transboundary EIA. That is why it is recommended that the Parties concerned should where possible use, for the purpose of this Guidance, a definition of the public developed by UN/ECE for the 1998 Convention on Access to Information, Public Participation in Decision-making and Access to Justice in Environmental Matters:

“The public means one or more natural or legal persons, and, in accordance with national legislation or practice, their associations, organizations or groups” (art. 2, para. 2) and “the public shall have the possibility to participate in decision-making in environmental matters, [including transboundary EIA] without discrimination as to citizenship, nationality or domicile” (art. 3, para. 9).

20. The information for the public on transboundary EIA should be readily available for inspection free of charge. Means of accomplishing this include the establishment of international and national documentation centres, libraries, databases, Web sites on the Internet, e-mail and other means of communicating and disseminating information.

21. Procedures for public participation in transboundary EIA should allow the public to submit, in writing or, as appropriate, at a public hearing or inquiry with the proponent of proposed activity, any comments, information, analyses or opinions that it considers relevant to the proposed activity. The Parties, the competent authorities, public and the secretariat of the EIA Convention must foster the creation of international and national public networks and centres on EIA to facilitate public participation in EIA at the international and national levels. The details of public participation in transboundary EIA may be incorporated into bilateral and multilateral agreements or other arrangements in order to give the Convention full effect. Cooperation between the public and the competent authorities of the Parties concerned should be encouraged so as to make public participation in transboundary EIA more effective.
22. The participation of the proponent of the proposed activity in the transboundary EIA procedure, including financial support for public participation in this procedure, is very important for the implementation of the EIA Convention. Proponents should provide financial support for public participation in transboundary EIA. This support may be used for:

   (a) Translating the EIA documentation into the language of the affected Party and the comments and recommendations of the public in the affected Party into the language of the Party of origin;

   (b) Distributing materials within the affected Party;

   (c) Public meetings in the Parties concerned; and

   (d) Other purposes relevant to public participation in transboundary EIA.

IV. RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE PARTIES

23. The Parties concerned should notify the public in the Party of origin and in the affected Party as early as possible about a proposed activity, about the start of the transboundary EIA procedure and about opportunities for the public to participate in that procedure. This is a prerequisite for effective public participation in transboundary EIA.

24. The notification should include the following:

   (a) Information on the proposed activity and the application on which a decision will be taken, including any available information on its possible transboundary impact. This information shall, as a minimum, contain:

      (i) A description of the proposed activity and its purpose;

      (ii) A description, where appropriate, of reasonable alternatives (for example, geographical or technological) to the proposed activity and the zero-action alternative;

      (iii) A description of the features of the environment likely to be significantly affected by the proposed activity and alternatives;

      (iv) A description of the potential environmental impact of the proposed activity and alternatives, and an estimation of its significance;

      (v) A description of mitigation measures to keep adverse environmental impact to a minimum;

      (vi) An explicit indication of predictive methods and underlying assumptions and of the environmental data to be used;
An identification of gaps in knowledge and uncertainties encountered in compiling the required information;

Where appropriate, an outline of monitoring and management programmes and any plans for post-project analysis; and

A non-technical summary including a visual presentation as appropriate (maps, graphs, etc.);

The nature of the possible decisions and information about other forms of possible mutual assistance in reducing any significant adverse transboundary impact of the proposed activity;

An estimate of a reasonable time for receiving comments from the public, taking into account the nature of the proposed activity;

The public authority responsible for making the decision;

The envisaged transboundary EIA procedure, including, as and when this information can be provided:

The commencement of the procedure;

Opportunities for the public to participate;

The time and venue of any public hearing envisaged;

An indication of the public authority from which relevant information can be obtained and of where the relevant information has been deposited for examination by the public;

An indication of the relevant public authority or any other official body to which comments or questions can be submitted and of deadlines for transmittal of comments or questions; and

An indication of what environmental information relevant to the proposed activity is available.

25. The Parties are called upon to ensure that all members of the public have access to the transboundary EIA procedure. In particular, they are encouraged to:

Promote the application of the principles of public participation in transboundary EIA at all levels of the decision-making process;

Develop ways to involve the public further in transboundary EIA;
(c) Keep the public informed of their activities so that they can work as partners in decision-making and the implementation of the EIA Convention;

(d) Support the participation of representatives of the public as observers in meetings of joint bodies (when they exist) and subsidiary bodies of the EIA Convention.

Where appropriate, the Parties should give the public additional assistance with and explanations of public participation in transboundary EIA.

26. The Parties concerned should provide for public participation at the outset of transboundary EIA, when all options are open and effective public participation can take place. They should provide reasonable time-frames for the public to participate in the different phases of transboundary EIA, allowing sufficient time for informing the public and for the public to prepare and participate effectively during the transboundary EIA procedure.

27. In designing the procedure for public participation in transboundary EIA, attention should be paid to the following: who the public will be (by impact and interest, sector or location); what techniques should be used and at what stages of the project, taking into account the purpose of public participation.

28. The Parties concerned should ensure that in the decision on the proposed activity due account is taken of the outcome of the public participation in the transboundary EIA. The Party of origin should ensure that, when the decision has been taken by the competent authority, the public is promptly informed of the decision in accordance with the appropriate procedures. The Party of origin should make accessible to the public the text of the decision along with the reasons and considerations on which it is based, including information about which recommendations from the public were used and which were not, and the reasons for this.

29. The Parties should promote environmental education and training for the general public, specified target groups and competent authorities, especially regarding the methods and techniques of organizing public participation in transboundary EIA and the implementation of this Guidance. Joint training and education of representatives of the competent authorities and the public is the most effective.

30. The Parties should actively publicize available information about the implementation of the EIA Convention, together with relevant resolutions, recommendations and other documents concerning events and structures under the EIA Convention, in the official languages of UN/ECE and in their own languages.

31. The Parties are urged to give effect to legal rights to the dissemination of information about proposed activities and possible public participation in transboundary EIA. They should facilitate public participation in transboundary EIA. Special efforts should be made to involve local communities that live near the border in this procedure.
32. The Parties are urged to involve the public in the process of determining whether, and to what extent, a post-project analysis should be carried out according to the provisions of the EIA Convention and national legislation.

33. They are urged to support public participation in the preparation of decisions on plans and programmes with potential adverse transboundary impact, and in the preparation of international treaties relating to transboundary EIA. They must ensure that those involved in a transboundary EIA procedure are not penalized in any way for activities that are otherwise lawful.

34. The Parties concerned should, within the framework of their national legislation, ensure that any person who considers that his or her request for participation in transboundary EIA has been ignored, wrongfully refused, whether in part or in full, or inadequately answered, has access to a review procedure before a court of law or another independent and impartial body established by law.

V. RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE PUBLIC

35. The public should participate in transboundary EIA to increase the quality of environmental decisions.

36. The public should organize itself for effective participation in transboundary EIA by:

   (a) Developing contacts and cooperation with local, national, foreign and international NGOs and experts that may be involved in transboundary EIA;

   (b) Organizing and participating in activities of national and international public networks and public centres on EIA;

   (c) Taking part in education and training programmes on EIA;

   (d) Supporting the dissemination of information about the provisions and the implementation of the EIA Convention, case studies, and other pertinent information about transboundary EIA.

37. If the public in a Party considers it may be affected by the significant adverse transboundary impact of a proposed activity and no notification has taken place in accordance with the EIA Convention, it should apply to its competent authority to enter into a process of discussions with the competent authorities of the Party of origin on whether there is likely to be a significant adverse transboundary impact within the meaning of the Convention. In this situation, the public in the Party considering that it may be so affected may request the competent authorities of the Parties concerned to allow it to participate in a transboundary EIA procedure under the provisions of the EIA Convention and this Guidance. In such cases the Parties concerned are urged to include the public that made the request in the transboundary EIA procedure.
38. If the public in an affected Party sends its comments to the competent authority of the Party of origin, either directly or, where appropriate, through the Party of origin, it should also send copies of those comments to the competent authorities of the affected Party.

39. The public should take part in transboundary EIA together with representatives of the competent authorities of the Parties concerned, the public of their own and other countries and the secretariat of the EIA Convention on a basis of partnership, cooperation and objectivity.

VI. RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE SECRETARIAT OF THE CONVENTION

40. The secretariat of the EIA Convention must play an important role in disseminating information about the application of the Convention and projects being implemented under the Convention in the UN/ECE region, and in supporting public participation in transboundary EIA. For that purpose, it should have a budget that allows it to support the development and maintenance of Web sites on the Internet, databases, the distribution of information and other activities relating to public participation in transboundary EIA under the provisions of the Convention and this Guidance.

VII. IMPLEMENTATION OF THE GUIDANCE

41. The Parties, the competent authorities, the public and the secretariat of the EIA Convention are urged to adopt the necessary measures for the implementation of this Guidance. These include the establishment of a clear regulatory framework providing procedural and institutional mechanisms and proper compliance programmes. Special regard should be had to the role of regional and local authorities and populations and indigenous people.

42. The Guidance should be placed in the Convention’s database (ENIMPAS). Nothing in this Guidance shall be construed as diminishing any rights of the public to participate in impact assessment or in other environmental decision-making processes which are or may be guaranteed under the laws of any Parties or under any agreement to which it is a Party. The provisions of this Guidance shall not affect the right of a Party to maintain or introduce measures providing for more extensive public participation in environmental impact assessment than required by this Guidance.

VIII. REVIEW

43. The Parties, the competent authorities and the public (at national, regional and local levels), and the secretariat of the EIA Convention should collect and disseminate information on all aspects of public participation in transboundary EIA. Such information will be used to develop and review this Guidance.

44. The Parties should consider the extent to which this Guidance has been implemented, and review it at their third meeting on the basis of national reports to be submitted to the secretariat by June 2002 at the latest.
Notes


4 Only the “public in the areas likely to be affected” may be involved in transboundary EIA under the Convention (art. 2, para. 6, art. 3, para. 8, and art. 4, para. 2).

5 EIA Convention, article 7 and appendix V.

6 EIA Convention, article 3, paragraph 1.

7 EIA Convention, article 3, paragraph 7.

8 EIA Convention, article 4, paragraph 2.
Appendix

LIST OF INTERNATIONAL REGULATIONS, METHODOLOGIES, INFORMATION AND OTHER MATERIALS USED FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE DRAFT GUIDANCE


Annex


Note: These references have been reproduced as received.