25th UN/CEFACT Forum
2-6 November 2015, Marseille, France

Joint United Nations Regional Commissions
Trade Facilitation and Paperless Trade Implementation Survey 2015
Findings from the Global, and Europe and Central Asia Report

Khan Salehin
WTO TFA Focal Point
5 November 2015
Outline

I. Introduction

II. Scope of the Survey

III. Survey Instrument and Methodology

IV. Key Findings of the Survey
Introduction

• **Who are involved?** All United Nations Regional Commissions in collaboration with OECD, UNCTAD, ITC and other organizations.

• **Objective?** to enable countries better understand and monitor the process of Trade Facilitation, identify good practices, technical needs, support evidence based policy-making, and provide a cross-regional knowledge sharing platform.

• **How many countries covered?** 119 countries including 27 UNECE member States have been included in the survey. Central Asia – ESCAP data
Survey Instrument and Methodology

✅ **Step 1. Data submission by experts:** The survey questionnaire was sent by the UN Regional Commissions to trade facilitation experts
- Governments, private sector,
- UN/CEFACT HoDs,
- Chambers of commerce,
- Academia

✅ The questionnaire was also made publicly available online.

✅ The questionnaire was also sent to relevant national trade facilitation authorities or agencies and regional trade facilitation partners or organizations.

✅ **Step 2. Data verification by UN RCs:**
- The secretariat cross-checked the data collected in Step 1.
- Desk research and data sharing among UNRCs and survey partners were carried out to further check the accuracy of data.
- Face-to-face or telephone interviews with key informants were arranged to gather additional information when needed.

✅ **Step 3. Data validation by national governments:** The data were shared with national governments for review and feedback. The feedback from national governments was incorporated to finalize the dataset.
Scope of the Survey (Categories)

- General TF Measures:
  - Transparency
  - Formalities
  - Institutional arrangement and cooperation

- Paperless Trade
- Cross Border Paperless Trade
- Transit Facilitation

Includes WTO Trade Facilitation Agreement (TFA) measures and beyond including enabling paperless trade, or the conduct of trade using electronic rather than paper-based data and documentation.
## Scope of the Survey (2)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>General TF measures</th>
<th>Trade facilitation measure (and question No.) in the questionnaire</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Transparency        | 2. Publication of existing import-export regulations on the Internet  
                      3. Stakeholder consultation on new draft regulations (prior to their finalization)  
                      4. Advance publication/notification of new regulation before their implementation (e.g., 30 days prior)  
                      5. Advance ruling (on tariff classification)  
                      9. Independent appeal mechanism (for traders to appeal Customs and other relevant trade control agencies’ rulings) |
| Formalities         | 6. Risk management (as a basis for deciding whether a shipment will be or not physically inspected)  
                      7. Pre-arrival processing  
                      8. Post-clearance audit  
                      10. Separation of Release from final determination of customs duties, taxes, fees and charges  
                      11. Establishment and publication of average release times  
                      12. Trade facilitation measures for authorized operators  
                      13. Expedited shipments  
                      14. Acceptance of paper or electronic copies of supporting documents required for import, export or transit formalities. |
| Institutional arrangement and cooperation | 1. Establishment of a national trade facilitation committee or similar body  
                                                      31. Cooperation between agencies on the ground at the national level  
                                                      32. Government agencies delegating controls to Customs authorities  
                                                      33. Alignment of working days and hours with neighbouring countries at border crossings, and  
                                                      34. Alignment of formalities and procedures with neighbouring countries at border crossings |
### Scope of the Survey (3)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Trade facilitation measure (and question No.) in the questionnaire</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cross-border paperless trade</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25. Laws and regulations for electronic transactions are in place (e.g. e-commerce law, e-transaction law)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26. Recognized certification authority issuing digital certificates to traders to conduct electronic transactions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27. Engagement of the country in trade-related cross-border electronic data exchange with other countries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28. Certificate of Origin electronically exchanged between your country and other countries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29. Sanitary &amp; Phyto-Sanitary Certificate electronically exchanged between your country and other countries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30. Banks and insurers in your country retrieving letters of credit electronically without lodging paper-based documents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Transit facilitation</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35. Transit facilitation agreement(s) with neighbouring country(ies)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36. Customs Authorities limit the physical inspections of transit goods and use risk assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37. Supporting pre-arrival processing for transit facilitation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38. Cooperation between agencies of countries involved in transit</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Key Findings of the Survey: Global

Figure 1: Implementation of trade facilitation around the World
Key Findings of the Survey: Global

Figure: Trade facilitation implementation and Trade Costs

Trade costs, excl. tariff (ad valorem equivalent)

Trade Facilitation Implementation (%)
Key Findings of the Survey: Global

Figure: Implementation of different groups of trade facilitation measures
Key Findings of the Survey: Global

Table: Most and least implemented measures (within each group of trade facilitation measures)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Most implemented</th>
<th>Least implemented</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Transparency</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Publication of existing import-export regulations on the internet</td>
<td>1. Advance ruling (on tariff classification)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Independent appeal mechanism</td>
<td>2. Advance publication/notification of new regulation before their implementation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formalities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Post-clearance audit</td>
<td>1. Establishment and publication of average release times</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Risk management</td>
<td>2. Trade facilitation measures for authorized operators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutional arrangement and cooperation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Cooperation between agencies on the ground at the national level</td>
<td>Government agencies delegating controls to Customs authorities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Establishment of National TF Committee</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paperless trade</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Electronic/automated Customs System</td>
<td>1. Electronic Application for Customs Refunds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Internet connection available to Customs and other trade control agencies at border-crossings</td>
<td>2. Electronic Application and Issuance of Preferential Certificate of Origin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cross-border paperless trade</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Recognized certification authority</td>
<td>2. Banks and insurers retrieving letters of credit electronically without lodging paper-based documents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transit facilitation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Cooperation between agencies of countries involved in transit</td>
<td>1. Supporting pre-arrival processing for transit facilitation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Customs authorities limit the physical inspections of transit goods and use risk assessment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Key Findings of the Survey: Global

Figure: Implementation of “transparency” measures

[Graph showing various measures of transparency with global and regional data]
Key Findings of the Survey: Global

Figure: Implementation of trade “formalities” facilitation measures
Key Findings of the Survey: Global

Figure: Implementation of “institutional arrangement and cooperation” measures
Key Findings of the Survey: Global

Figure: Implementation of “paperless trade” measures
Key Findings of the Survey: Global

Figure: Implementation of “cross-border paperless trade” measures

- Banks and Insurers retrieving letters of credit electronically without lodging paper-based documents
- Electronic exchange of Certificate of Origin
- Electronic exchange of Sanitary & Phyto-Sanitary Certificate
- Engagement in trade-related cross-border electronic data exchange

Legend:
- Developed Economies
- East Asia
- Europe and Central Asia
- Latin America and the Caribbean
- Middle East and North Africa
- Pacific Islands
- South Asia
- Sub-Saharan Africa
- Global Average
Key Findings of the Survey: Global

**Figure: Implementation of “transit facilitation” measures**

Cooperation between agencies of countries involved in transit

Supporting pre-arrival processing for transit facilitation

Customs Authorities limit the physical inspections of transit goods and use risk assessment

- Developed Economies
- East Asia
- Europe and Central Asia
- Latin America and the Caribbean
- Middle East and North Africa
- Pacific Islands
- South Asia
- Sub-Saharan Africa
- Global Average
Key Findings of the Survey: Global

Figure: Moving up the trade facilitation ladder towards seamless international supply chains
Key Findings of the Survey: Europe and Central Asia

Figure: Implementation of different groups of trade facilitation measures
Key Findings of the Survey: Europe and Central Asia

Figure: Implementation Score as a Percent by Income Group

- Transparency
- Formalities
- Institutional arrangement and cooperation
- Cross-border paperless trade
- Paperless trade facilitation

Average High Income Countries
Average Middle Income Countries
Key Findings of the Survey: Europe and Central Asia

Figure: Implementation Scores for Transparency Measures as a Percent by Income Group

- Publication of existing import-export regulations on the internet
- Independent appeal mechanism
- Advance ruling (on tariff classification)
- Advance publication/notification of new regulation before their implementation
- Stakeholder consultation on new draft regulations (prior to their finalization)

Key Findings of the Survey: Europe and Central Asia
Key Findings of the Survey: Europe and Central Asia

**Figure: Implementation Scores for Formalities Measures as a Percent by Income Group**

- Risk management
- Pre-arrival processing
- Post-clearance audit
- Separation of Release from final determination of customs duties, taxes, fees and charges
- Establishment and publication of average release times
- Expedited shipments
- Trade facilitation measures for authorized operators
- Acceptance of paper or electronic copies of supporting documents required for import, export or transit formalities

Average Score High Income Countries  
Average Score Middle Income Countries
Key Findings of the Survey: Europe and Central Asia

Figure: Average Implementation Scores for Institutional Arrangement Measures by Income Group

- National Trade Facilitation Committee
- Government agencies delegating controls to Customs authorities
- Cooperation between agencies on the ground at the national level

Average Score High Income Countries
Average Score Middle Income Countries
Key Findings of the Survey: Europe and Central Asia

Figure: Implementation Scores for Paperless Trade measures in the UNECE region

- Electronic Application and Issuance of Preferential Certificate of Origin
- Electronic Application for Customs Refunds
- Electronic Application and Issuance of Trade Licenses
- Electronic Single Window System
- Electronic Submission of Air Cargo Manifests
- Internet Connection available to Customs and other trade control agencies at border-crossings
- Electronic Submission of Customs Declarations
- E-Payment of Customs Duties and Fee

Average Score High Income Countries
Average Score Middle Income Countries
Key Findings of the Survey: Europe and Central Asia

Figure: Implementation Scores for Cross-Border Measures as a Percent by Income Group
Survey Reports and Country Notes are available at:

http://unnext.unescap.org/UNTFSSurvey2015.asp
Thank You

khan.salehin@unece.org