## Contents

**Case studies – Introduction** ................................................................................................................................. 2

**SDG 4: Quality education** ................................................................................................................................. 3

  - Round table: Learning without limits: lifelong learning and inclusive education ........................................ 3
  - Round table: The power of knowledge for change: education and learning as drivers of sustainable development ................................................................. 3

**SDG 8: Decent work and economic growth** ............................................................................................................. 28

  - Round table: The Growth We Want: Solutions for Sustained, Inclusive and Sustainable Economic Growth ............................................................................................................................................... 28
  - Round table: The future of work: productive employment and decent work for all ........................................... 28

**SDG 10: Reduced Inequalities** ............................................................................................................................ 72

  - Round table: Bridging the gap: achieving greater income and economic equality ........................................... 72
  - Round table: Towards a world of equal opportunity: tackling inequality caused by exclusion and discrimination ........................................................................................................................................ 72

**SDG 13: Climate action** .......................................................................................................................................... 102

  - Round table: Acting for climate: stepping up climate change policies, action and awareness in the region ......................................................................................................................... 102
  - Round table: Coping with climate change: strengthening resilience and adaptation .................................... 102

**SDG 16: Peace, justice and strong institutions** ...................................................................................................... 132

  - Round table: Strengthening institutions for change ........................................................................................... 132
  - Round table: Empowering people to protect the planet ................................................................................... 132
Case studies – Introduction

The Regional Forum on Sustainable Development
The Regional Forum on Sustainable Development (22-23 March 2019, Geneva) creates a regional space for peer learning and sharing of practical solutions in implementing the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). Governments and other stakeholders mutually learn from sharing concrete experiences, best practices and challenges. Case studies will form the basis of the peer learning round tables.

The SDGs under in-depth review
The Regional Forum is closely aligned with the issues addressed at the 2019 High-level Political Forum (HLPF). The focus of the peer learning round tables will therefore be on the five SDGs under in-depth review at the 2019 HLPF:

Peer learning round tables
Governments and other stakeholders were asked to provide case studies from their national experience in implementing these five SDGs. The case studies are compiled in this document. A selection of case studies are presented during the peer learning session at the Regional Forum. Based on these case studies, country representatives and other stakeholders share concrete policy measures, propose solutions to identified problems and discuss how best practices can be adopted by peers. Round table discussions are interactive and steered by participants.

Outcome
The Regional Forum aims to feed both into national and global processes. The round tables are designed to foster mutual learning and help countries accelerate national progress in implementing the 2030 Agenda. The Chair’s summary of the Regional Forum, which will also summarise the discussions at round tables, will provide the regional input for the High-level Political Forum (HLPF).
SDG 4: Quality education

Round table: Learning without limits: lifelong learning and inclusive education

- Reforming Assessment and Evaluation in Education for Improved Learning Outcomes
  Romania*
- Empowering older people for digital inclusion through life-long learning in Austria and Germany
  Austria and Germany*
- Quality Inclusive Education in Serbia
  Serbia*
- IT training and education of elderly persons
  France
- Assessing Poverty Alleviation Through Social Protection
  Armenia
- School Feeding Programmes and their Contributions to Inclusive and Lifelong Learning
  Kyrgyz Republic
- Setting Up National Advocacy in Adult Learning Policy
  NGO League of Professional Women, Ukraine

Round table: The power of knowledge for change: education and learning as drivers of sustainable development

- Institutional and Governance structure for implementing Education for Sustainable Development in Cyprus
  Cyprus*
- Learning in nature – an untapped strategy for enhancing implementation of the SDGs?
  SILVIVA Foundation, Switzerland*
- A Rounder Sense of Purpose: Educator Competences for Education for Sustainable Development
  University of Gloucestershire, United Kingdom
- Water and Sanitation Safety Planning in North Macedonia
  Journalists for Human Rights, North Macedonia*

* Note: Case studies that will be presented during the Round Table discussions
SDG 4: Reform of the assessment and evaluation in education for improved learning outcomes in Romania

Summary
The objective of this case study is to showcase Romania’s good practice in addressing the improvement of the learning outcomes at national level through the revision of the assessment and evaluation in the system of education. The assessment and evaluation review was a comprehensive review and covered not only student assessment but also teacher appraisal, school evaluation and system evaluation. Based on the review, the Ministry of National Education developed an Action Plan on Assessment and Evaluation in which it incorporated the policy recommendations formulated in the report. The review was conducted through a partnership of MoE with UNICEF and OECD.

Situation
Romania recorded a significant progress in modernizing its education system and raising the learning levels of its students. But student learning outcomes indicate that many Romanian children do not achieve their potential. PISA 2015 showed a stagnation of Romania’s scores, with large rates of students fail to achieve PISA Level 2 or above resulting in almost 40% of 15 year-old students in PISA 2015 ranked as functional illiterate. Many young Romanians continue to leave education early (ESL rate in 2017 was 18.1% and the provisional EUROSTAT data for 2018 shows a rate of 16.9% but still far from 11.3% target rate for 2020) and without mastering basic competences for life. This reflects the major structural challenges facing the education system such as insufficient financing, frequent changes in governance and strategic planning, and unequal access to quality education. Evaluation and assessment can help focus the education system on quality and equity, by setting the expectation that all young Romanians receive high quality education where they have a fair chance to learn and thrive.

Strategy
The embryo of an UNICEF – OECD – MoE Partnership on assessments and evaluations in education in Romania was launched in December 2013, when the Romanian Minister of Education participated at the Istanbul Regional Ministerial Conference on Education. The conference ended with a Call for Action: „Education equity now! Including all children in quality learning”, Romania being a co-signatory of this Call for Action. Subsequently, Romania participated in the Regional Workshop in Paris, organized by UNICEF in partnership with OECD, in 2015, and requested support for a review on assessment and evaluation. The partnership was finalized and signed by OECD, UNICEF and MoE in 2016. OECD planned two country missions in Romania (in partnership with UNICEF) during the review, and a National Steering Committee with stakeholders from MoE and other relevant central agencies under the coordination of MoE. In early 2017 consultation with national stakeholders were organized by UNICEF and OECD to discuss the preliminary findings of the review. The report was finalised and launched in May 2017. In 2017, MoE and UNICEF embarked on the initiative to develop an Action Plan for Assessment and Evaluation based on the policy recommendations of the review. In October 2017, UNICEF supported the organization of a Regional Workshop on Assessment and Evaluation, sharing its experience and Action Plan with four other countries in the region (Albania, North Macedonia, Moldova and Serbia).
Results and lessons learned
This first of its kind partnership between MoE, UNICEF and OECD in the European and Central Asia Region on assessment and evaluation in the Romanian system of education produced a review report including policy recommendations for each type of assessment and evaluation: student assessment, teacher appraisal, school evaluation and system evaluation. These policy recommendations are interconnected and structured on the short term, medium term and long term. Subsequently, MoE, with UNICEF support, developed the Action Plan on Assessment and Evaluation. This experience was also shared horizontally (also with UNICEF support) to four other countries in our region. Two key lessons were learned: 1) such a partnership presupposes a constant commitment and ownership along the longer period of implementation, and progress can be delayed by the frequent changes in the governance structures; 2) impact at the level of learning outcomes is visible in the medium term, as the policy reforms are revised and in place, and the different assessment and evaluation subsystems are aligned and impact the learning outcomes.

Contact
Name: Luminița Costache (Ms.)
Organisation: E-Mail: lcostache@unicef.org

Name: Iris Constantin (Ms.)
Organisation: National Commission of Romania for UNESCO
E-Mail: iris.constantin@cnr-unesco.ro
SDG 4: Empowering older people for digital inclusion through life-long learning in Austria and Germany

Summary
The project emerged from the fast development of science and technology in the past few decades that had enormous influence on every-day life. Experiences have shown that many people – and especially senior citizens – found it hard to keep up with technological progress. Older persons are less active on the Internet. However, they too are noticing that many aspects of every-day life, such as hotel reservations, online shopping, online banking or communication through messenger services, are increasingly webcasted. Anyone who is not on-line, is excluded from participation in a 21st-century society. Those who are on-line have more possibilities. To exchange good practices Austria hosted an expert conference on the ethical issues of modern technologies and especially on “Digitalization & Education – A Life-Long Learning Process” in November 2018.

Three case studies in the UNECE region were presented:
Austria: Low-threshold training for older persons “TiK - Technology in Brief – Tablet for everyone”
France: Digital Bus, Digital Voucher, Digital Culture Check
Germany: Digital Social Space for and in Old Age, Low-threshold digital communication and networking structures, Digital literacy skills

Situation
The number of people who are 65 years old and above has risen to 194.9 million among the UNECE region’s population of 1.27 billion (15.4 per cent) and will increase to more than a fifth of the total population in 2030. To empower older people and to ensure their inclusiveness and equality in full participation in social, economic and cultural life the access to new digital and communication technologies and the right to life-long learning and digital training for older persons is essential.

Austria: 80 percent of people between 55 and 64 years are using internet, but only 52% of people between 65 and 74 years.
Germany: In terms of figures, some 10 million persons in Germany over the age of 60 do not use the Internet – for a number of different reasons. (Compared with other states of the EU, where more than two-thirds of the elderly are online, Germany ranks only in the upper middle field)

Strategy
Austria: In the UNECE Ministerial Declaration of Lisbon 2017 on “A sustainable society for all ages: Realizing the potential of living longer” the strategy of e-inclusion plays an important role as well as in the Austrian Strategy on Life-Long Learning 2020 and the Federal Plan for Senior Citizens “Ageing and the Future”. Measures have been set in research, information, further training, quality assurance and support of pilot projects to leave no one behind. The prospect of life-long learning broadens the scope of individual options: empowerment, self-determination and fulfilment.
Germany: Germany is working on taking into account the interests of older persons and families, children and young people as best as possible. The strategy is to work on this jointly with several other
partners and in close exchange with welfare organisations, providers, the housing sector and education providers, with the joint goal of creating an enabling living environment.

Results and lessons learned

**Austria:** A good practice in adult education for senior citizens is the project “TiK – Technology in Brief – Tablets for everyone”. The high-tech project follows an intergenerational approach through the training offered by young volunteers (age 16 to 30) as so-called “Tablet-Trainers”, who are educated along a special Tablet-education-curriculum. The courses have the distinction of a multitude of methods and flexible leading questions and a special commitment of the young trainers. They offer low-threshold courses voluntarily for only a small expense allowance. The further development of the courses is ensured by the feedback of the participants and the trainers who also elaborated their own special materials and barrier-free hand-outs for the elderly. The courses are within easy reach for those interested and much attention is paid to a wide geographical distribution of the “TiK-modules” and of information on www.digitaleseniorinnen.at. Participants of the courses are persons and especially economically disadvantaged women on a low educational level. Until the end of 2018 more than 2000 persons learned with the modules and another 1000 persons participated in the course-programme. The oldest participant who just takes part in a course is 97 years old, he gets his education by a young man in a nursery home. A patent application was filed for the project and the German name is a registered trademark. The project was awarded several times on the federal and provincial level.

**Germany:**
1: Older persons require needs-oriented and user-oriented digital support in their every-day lives.
2: Older persons need low-threshold, digital communication and networking structures.
3: Older persons need digital skills and access to them.

Many multigenerational homes (federal program) are already advancing the topic of "Digital in Old Age" (through voluntary helpers, with special computer and Internet courses for the elderly, with practical support). Mentoring partnerships between younger and older generations help to eliminate barriers and promote social interaction.

Contact Austria
**Name:** Christoph Angster
**Organisation:** Federal Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs, Health and Consumer Protection
**E-Mail:** Christoph.angster@sozialministerium.at

Contact Germany:
**Name:** Martin Amberger
**Organisation:** Federal Ministry for Family Affairs, Senior Citizens, Women and Youth, Germany
**E-Mail:** Martin.Amberger@bmfsfj.bund.de
Summary
In 2019, Serbia is marking the 10th anniversary of quality and inclusive education reforms. In the past 10 years, the Government has undertaken extensive changes and reforms in the education system with a comprehensive focus on improving the equity, quality and efficiency dimensions of education. The main objective of current policies and strategies is to improve the access to quality preschool and primary education so to enhance the educational achievement of all students in general, and children from vulnerable social groups in particular.

In 2009, the Ministry of Education, Science and Technological Development (MoESTD) passed a Law on the Foundations of the Education System, which provided the legal framework for inclusive education.

The law supported the enrolment of all children within the regular school system and defined additional support in education for students with disabilities, students with learning difficulties and students with disadvantages. Inclusion is seen as a process of addressing and responding to the diversity of needs of all children, youth and adults through increasing participation in learning and reducing and eliminating exclusion within and from education.

Case study is summarizing the efforts of the Serbian MoESTD to introduce and support implementation of policies related to enrolment of all children within the regular school system and supporting schools and teachers to provide relevant additional support in education for students with disabilities, students with learning difficulties and students with disadvantages. In the last decade, inclusive education policies have enabled inclusive education of thousands of excluded children and young people.

Situation
Prior to the enactment of the Law on the Foundations of the Education System in 2009 in Serbia, children with disabilities predominantly attended special schools and classes. Entry in the first grade of children with disabilities in Serbia, prior to adoption of the Law in 2009, was determined by local commissions for categorization in health centers, comprising of a doctor, special education teacher and psychologist. Their assessments were based on whether the child can adapt to the existing requirements of schools and curricula, and if the assessment was negative, they would send the child to a special school, or categorized him/her as “uneducable” child, where the child remained at home or was housed into certain residential social protection institution. There was no further monitoring of the child and his/her progress: he/she remained in that "category" practically until the rest of his/her life. That policy resulted in a number of children separated from their families in order to attend school, a large number of children who unduly attended special schools and classes, and children outside the education system, either placed in social institutions or staying at home. A large number of children from Roma families, without disabilities, were enrolled in the special schools and classes, in multi-segregated environments. Without relevant and appropriate support drop-out of Roma children was high.
New legislative framework in 2009 and introduction of inclusive education including inter-sectoral commission for assessment of additional educational, health and social support completely changed the paradigm, and introduced transition from the medical model to social model, in which the school and whole social environment adapt to the needs of the child by removing physical and social barriers, in order to ensure his/her learning, acquisition of self-confidence and inclusion into community. At the same time, the MoESTD was trying to raise the overall quality of education for all students and launched reforms and adopted legislation and policies in almost all aspects of education.

**Strategy**

Inclusion is understood as a process of addressing and responding to the diversity of needs of all children, youth and adults through increasing their participation in learning in regular schools and reducing and eliminating segregation and exclusion. Children with disabilities are mainstreamed in regular schools and the ‘categorization of children’ based on disability was abolished. Legislation from 2009 was requiring the establishment of new support structures aimed at inclusive education at national, local and school levels.

Throughout the reform process, the Ministry of Education has been the main driver of change. In last 10 years, main strategies to support implementation of inclusive education were: establishment of school inclusive teams; introduction of individual education plans; establishment of intersectoral committees at local level comprising of education, social welfare and health sectors aimed at inclusive education; establishment of institutional capacities for management, coordination, monitoring and implementation of inclusive education policies; strengthening teacher’s competencies for inclusive education through teacher trainings and support to schools to implement inclusive practice.

The Parliament and independent bodies (Ombudsman and Commissioner for Equality) play an important role in monitoring the implementation of inclusive education. NGOs are an important factor when independent monitoring is concerned, and an important corrective to the whole educational system. Few external evaluation studies were conducted and served as a basis for policy development and fine-tuning.
Results and lessons learned

Impact on children
- Number of children with disabilities in “special” schools decreased from 5.348 (2013) to 4.760 (2017)
- Number of Individual Education Plans (IEPs) increased from 4826 (2014) to 8.149 for IEP1 and from 3.018 (2014) to 5.897 (2017) for IEP2†
- 345 schools and pre-schools were supported with 183 793 children (2583 children with IEP 1, IEP 2) and 10 298 teachers
- 1 525 children and 2 900 school staff and preschool teachers directly supported

Results

1. Since 2015, the Group for Social Inclusion of the MoESTD remains the main resource in the Government for strengthening institutional capacities, further development, monitoring and support to IE

2. Quality of teaching in diverse classrooms was improved through training of more than 30000 teaching staff through two “generations” of training programmes: 2009-2013 training programs were aimed at changing the mindset of individuals and educational institutions, as well as at acquiring and developing professional skills to work in a diverse classroom which includes children with disabilities; second phase 2013-2019, focus is on differentiation, classroom management; novelties in teaching strategies and support to students.

3. In all schools in Serbia, school Inclusive Education Teams are established (teachers, psychologists and pedagogues) and IEPs are introduced

4. Network for Support of Inclusive Education is composed of 120 practitioners and experts for inclusive education, covering the entire territory of Serbia. It is established and functional, fostering horizontal learning as a mechanism to spread good practice, peer learning and communities of practice is established and functional.

5. 30% of schools in 96 % of Serbian municipalities were supported through small grant programme to support inclusive education (WB loan, 2009-2012), to build capacity of the staff, eliminate physical and communication barriers, promote cooperation with parents, awareness raising activity in local communities on the importance of inclusive education etc.

† Resources:

III National report on social inclusion and poverty reduction in the Republic of Serbia for the period 2014–2017 - Education - 144-183 p


Statistical office of the Republic of Serbia - Education

6. In all municipalities, mechanisms of coordination have been established between the educational, health and social care sectors aimed at providing resources and additional support to education and social inclusions of children with disabilities and other children requiring additional support.

7. Monitoring the quality of inclusive education is integrated within the overall school quality assurance policy/quality standards for schools and it is part of the regular external evaluation of the Institute for Evaluation of the Education Quality.

Challenges

- Financial constrains to support inclusive education implementation.
- Functionality of EMIS
- Social norms, which were greatly based on belief that children with disabilities should be schooled in special education,
- Insufficient communication to actors and wide public to understand long-lasting impact of inclusive education to quality education for every child
- The transformation of special education in terms of its function, efficiency and pedagogical work.

Lessons learnt

- Introduction of inclusive education is comprehensive education reform that requires changes at national, local and school level. Most importantly, the progress was possible as inclusion and quality were seen as interlinked and inter-dependent. In addition, alignment with social welfare and health policies is needed.
- System of support for child, family and school staff needs to be developed and provided.
- Broad coalition of partners is needed.
- Communication campaigns are needed.

Contact
Name: Vesna Nedeljkovic
Organisation: Ministry of Education, Science and Technological Development
E-Mail: vesna.nedeljkovic@mpn.gov.rs
Summary
According to the World Health Organization, 22% of the global population will be more than 60 years old in 2050. Today, the development of online procedures, for instance to fill one’s tax return or to request social assistance, make it crucial for everyone to access and understand the use of IT devices and of the internet, especially vulnerable populations such as the elderly who are more likely to be left aside. Therefore, France focuses on developing concrete tools and making training opportunities available to the elderly, in order to improve their access to digital tools. This goal has translated into a national action plan launched in September, as well as several initiatives at a more local level, that aim at being generalized at the national level in a near future, depending on their impact.

Situation
There is a growing use of internet and digital technologies by seniors in France as in the rest of the world. According to the 2018 Digital Barometer (Baromètre du numérique 2018)†, 60% of the + 70 years old and 82% of the 60-69 years old report surfing on the internet, including respectively 45% and 63% having an every day use. However, one adult out of five reports never using IT tools because of difficulties to understand their functioning, while 36% of the + 70 and 23% of the 60-69 give up using them when they do not understand how they work. Since 2015 however, seniors can make use of their individual learning account (compte personnel de formation, CPF)—which allows a maximum of 150 hours of training over 9 years—to get IT training, although the account is automatically closed when a person exercises his/her rights to retirement.

Strategy
The national plan for an inclusive digitalization “For a connected France”§, launched on 13 September 2018 by the Secretary of State for digitalization, aims at training the population to the use of digital technologies, first by training social workers and providing them with tools such as the “Rapid impact package”** to help people go through administrative processes. The plan also launched the “digital pass” under the form of digital culture checks #APTIC, which allow their beneficiaries to follow free or discounted digital trainings and can be distributed by employers who wish to encourage their senior employees acquire digital competencies††.

Other initiatives have been taken over the past years. For instance, computer science schools such as L’École42 or Web@cadémie form seniors undergoing a career change to the main digital languages over a few weeks. Seniors can also learn how to code through online MOOCs like Code academy. As an example, Pôle Emploi has concluded a national agreement to allow job seekers to freely access Open classrooms classes for three months. The startup Geezkie puts in relation young teachers with seniors. Finally, a “digital bus”‡‡ crosses the French region Aquitaine to offer free 3-hour trainings to seniors to

** https://kit-inclusion.societenumérique.gouv.fr/
†† https://aptic.fr/
‡‡ http://www.lebusdigital.com/
learn how to use IT tools (send emails, stay in touch with their family, fill their tax form, access their retirement account, etc.).

Results and lessons learned

- The plans and initiatives mentioned above are still quite recent, but some the first results suggest that they are bearing fruit.
- Contrary to popular thinking, the development of these types of strategies allowed us to realize that older persons are today massive users of IT tools and of the internet. However, they mainly use them as practical tools rather than for entertainment. The remaining gaps in terms of use of digital tools surely lies in disparities of access among the territories, as retired persons often live in rural areas. Therefore, special attention should be paid to these populations, and special trainings and personalized help should be developed in those areas in order to reach quality education for all.
- Today, one of the main challenges regarding life-long training is the increase in the retirement age. Indeed, companies have to rethink and invest in the training of their senior employees although they are not likely to stay for long. Therefore, they tend to ask less their seniors employees if they need or desire training. However, companies of more than 50 employees now have to set up “generation contracts”, where the senior employee is in charge of handing down its knowledge and competencies to a new young employee.

Contact
Name: Alexis Rinckenbach
Organisation: European and International Affairs Unit - Social Cohesion General Directorate - Ministry of Social Affairs, Health and Women’s Rights of France
E-Mail: Alexis.RINCKENBACH@social.gouv.fr
SDG 4: Assessing Poverty Alleviation Through Social Protection in Armenia

**Summary**
The World Food Programme (WFP) together with The International Food Policy Research Institute (IFPRI) is conducting a study to assess to what extent poverty reduction or other measures of social welfare responds to the in-kind income transfer of school feeding programmes. The impact of school feeding programme was evaluated to illustrate approaches to quantifying the impact on welfare in Armenia, a lower middle-income country with high rates of school participation and declining levels of malnutrition (similar to other countries in former CIS region). Furthermore, two follow-up case studies are looking into particular areas of the school feeding programme with its nutritionally sensitive approach and it’s policy development of education sector, which directly impacts children’s access to education and quality of learning- SDG4.

Studies test the major impact related to access to education (keeping children in schools) through nutrition sensitive programming and enhanced national school feeding policy framework, which also overlaps with other SDGs (2 and 10 in particular).

**Situation**
Globally there has been substantial progress in school enrolment in recent years; after stagnating for a decade net primary enrolment increased from 82.8% in 1999 to 89.5% in 2016 (World Bank. 2018).

In Armenia, this could be attributed to school feeding programme, whereas in other contexts the education priorities primarily relate to existent policy gaps – policies that would enable effective and sustainable investment into human capital and ensure nutrition-sensitive programming. Two ongoing studies are directed towards filling the gaps and contributing to Government’s evidence-based policy development. Important tool used to ensure positive and sustainable effect on learning capacity of the children, is strongly related to national capacity strengthening and development.

**Strategy**
The initial study utilizes data on school enrolment from a household survey as well as the geographic coverage of school feeding programme to assess its impact on poverty and then to place the implicit transfer within the context of a class of social welfare functions, varying the parameter that indicates the social aversion to inequality and compare these results with a similar assessment of the impact of a targeted family benefit. This is done in close collaboration with National Statistics Services of Armenia (NSS RA).

Consequent follow-up studies involve primary data collection and analysis of a change that additional nutrition component can significantly change results, and evaluation of policy gaps related to educational sector in terms of its evidence-based development. The functioning of an inter-ministerial working group comprising representatives from the ministries of education, health, agriculture, finance, social affairs, and territorial administration is multiplying the overall positive effects.
Results and lessons learned
Along with the evidence of positive impact on poverty reduction and welfare enhancement, the Study suggests testing the assumption that school feeding programmes are one means of addressing food insecurity that are also associated with learning in middle- and upper-income countries (Rampersaud et al. 2005), which is being implemented though one of the follow-up evaluations. Another thesis that the initial study came up with, relates to evidence-based policy gap acknowledged by the Government. The latter is a major subject of the second evaluation study in cooperation with state research institutions and a number of international ones. This is supported essentially by WFP annual outcome data collection and the feedback received from the school headmasters and parents, specifically on reduction of dropout rates and increase of cognitive capacity of the children.

Contact
Name: Robert Stepanyan, Head of Division, MoES
Organisation: Ministry of Education and Science of Armenia
E-Mail: r.stepanyan@edu.am
**SDG 4: School Feeding Programmes and their Contributions to Inclusive and Lifelong Learning in the Kyrgyz Republic**

**Summary**
Healthy children learn better. For children to learn, they need to be in school, and for them to benefit the most from the education at hand, they need to be healthy. Furthermore, health status affects cognitive ability, educational attainment, quality of life, and the ability to contribute to society. Besides nutrition and health, one of the major impacts of school feeding programmes is access to education and learning. The school feeding programme transcends all contexts— with the power to keep children in school, it helps these children grow up to be healthier, wealthier and more productive adults and plays a key role in helping children realise their potential, both for themselves and for their nations. In the Kyrgyz Republic school feeding is an investment in human capital and directly contributes to SDG 4. The National School Feeding Programme is a successful case study showing increases in access to education and learning outcomes through a development of a strong national policy framework and its contribution to the Education System as a whole. The case study also highlights implicitly interdependent correlation between SDG4 and SDGs 2, 5, 8 and 10.

**Situation**
The political and social landscape of the Kyrgyz Republic has experienced several upheavals since the country gained independence in 1991. Existing challenges have placed a heavy demand on the financial and human resources of the country and occupied the attention of policy makers. The education system in the Kyrgyz Republic does not yet provide a significant part of the Kyrgyz people with the skills and knowledge necessary for professional and personal self-realization, as well as competitive participation in the regional and global labor markets. The quality of the educational infrastructure, and, consequently, of the related educational services, remains largely low, posing a real threat to the safety and health of school children. The potential of key stakeholders is not fully optimized, and few stakeholders are involved in the process of reforming education. The Ministry of Education and Science (MoES) is responsible for educational policy and its implementation, education strategy development, state education standards, curriculum development, state examinations, teacher upgrade, introduction of innovative practices, statistical support and monitoring, international cooperation, and ensuring the right to education and equal development between regions.

According to the National Statistics Committee of the Kyrgyz Republic, in 2016 there were 2,236 general education schools with a total enrollment of more than 1.1 million children, of whom 445,000 were primary education children.

There are multiple factors slowing reform in the education sector. Factors related to governance, market and economic conditions, and health and social protection affect the pace of reform. Low levels of funding incompatible with the country’s growing needs, weak teacher training, rapidly aging infrastructure are also contributors.

Moreover, the basic and underlying causes of malnutrition are multidimensional including: poverty, food insecurity, food price fluctuations, insufficient health services, lack of knowledge around optimal nutrition and care practices, underperforming social protection systems, lack of implementation of existing government policies. Although the national prevalence of undernutrition is relatively low per international standards, rates of both stunting and wasting are considerably higher in the Kyrgyz
Micronutrient deficiencies are a persistent problem. Among children under 5, approximately 43% suffer from anemia, which is associated with cognitive decline and increased morbidity and mortality. A key contributor to poor nutritional status is the decrease in dietary diversity observed in recent years. Consumption of nutrient dense foods including animal products has declined, with the population on average achieving only 33% of the norm established in the national food security programme.

**Strategy**

The National School Feeding Programme was launched by the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic in 2006 and covers all primary school children in the country (445,000). The programme falls under the mandate of the MoES and aims at contributing to the improved quality of education, socio-economic situation, and health status of primary school children.

The programme runs during the full academic year (i.e. on average 180 school days). In 2016-2017 the budget allocated for the national school meals programme constituted 467 mln Kyrgyz soms (over 6 million US$). The cost of a meal was 0.17§§ US$ per child per day, transferred to the MoES District Educational Departments to organize procurement at the district level.

In view of the above, the Kyrgyz Government requested technical support from the World Food Programme (WFP) to support the optimization of the National School Meals Programme, which has been implemented since 2013 and has already demonstrated several positive developments. To support this initiative, an Inter-Ministerial Working Committee chaired by the Vice-Prime Minister for Social Affairs was formed in 2012, tasked with coordinating the implementation of the project and ensuring linkages with education and nutrition at the national level.

The Inter-Ministerial Working Committee together with stakeholders oversees reconstruction and re-equipment of school kitchens/canteens and water and sanitation infrastructure; introduction of new nutritional menus; training of staff (management and cooks); and follow-up on daily menus. This successful cooperation between line ministries has also resulted in the development of the new National Policy on School Nutrition, as well as developing national capacity for the effective management of this multi-faceted school feeding programme.

The interest in and prioritisation of child nutrition in KR has also resulted in significant support from local authorities for the programme, such as funds for renovation, maintenance and other costs related to the operation of the canteens. The Kyrgyz programme is unique in its integrated approach and joint effort by the state and local communities, whereby communities/parents not only contribute to the organisation of school feeding, but also closely monitor and manage the process. Parents and local businesses participate in menu design, cooking, food procurement, spending tracking, monitoring food quality and sanitary requirements, as well as raising and following up issues that arise.

**Results and lessons learned**

The leadership, financial contributions and technical support from partners and stakeholders have created an enabling environment for policy reform. The national and district governments have displayed a strong political will and committed resources to continue developing the programme for years to come. The support of WFP and partners in both programme components – development of a strong national policy framework and programme implementation – has resulted in strong policies and a sustainable programme that has a real, measurable impact on the wellbeing of children.

§§ The United Nations currency exchange rate, December 2017, 1 US$ = 69 Kyrgyz som
Rigorous assessment, monitoring and evaluation have all been critical to informing programme design and ensuring a sustainable contribution to SDG4. The combined experiences from the optimized National School Meals Programme in Kyrgyz Republic provide an excellent model for effectively and efficiently improving a national school meals programme in a lower-middle-income country.

Contact
Name: Emma Khachatryan
Organisation: World Food Programme, the Kyrgyz Republic
E-Mail: emma.khachatryan@wfp.org
**Summary**
In 2018 started up advocacy activities by *NGOs under the auspices* Ukrainian side of the EU-Ukraine Civil Society Platform (lead by LPW) for achieve change in adult learning policy in Ukraine. Major milestones leading to the Action Research included the Policy Report "What Should Be the Adult Learning Policy in Ukraine?” Kyiv: “Sinergy Project”, 2018 and Policy Recommendations developed by public experts and validations by stakeholders. Achieve change in legislation including ongoing advising assist from public experts for the *Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine* on drafting Law of Ukraine on Adult Education and Learning in Ukraine. The case focuses in thematic sub-areas of the SDG#4 (on adult learning as part of lifelong learning) and SDGs#5, #17.

**Situation**
Modernization of the social, economic and cultural sectors in Ukraine is possible on condition of developing and introducing lifelong learning policy, with adult education and adult learning as its integral part. Expanding the scope of education through engagement of adults in formal, non-formal and informal learning should help resolve the issues. At present, one of key challenges for Ukraine’s development is lack of human resources with the level of competence that meets modern requirements of the labour market. Under national consultations on localization SDGs in 2016, LPW’s experts proposed a national SDG#4 with a specific task on “lifelong learning” and an emphasis on target 4.5, “Increase the prevalence of knowledge and skills required for decent jobs and entrepreneurship among the population”. It also added a new formulation for indicator 4.5.1, “Enrolment rate of adults in formal and non-formal, informal adult learning and professional training in Ukraine”. This indicator 4.5.1 included in Ukraine’s 2017 Baseline National Report on the SDGs. In 2018 started up advocacy activities for achieve change in adult learning policy in Ukraine.

**Strategy**

**Results and lessons learned**
Major milestones leading to the *Action Research* included
a) Policy Report “What Should Be the Adult Learning Policy in Ukraine?” Kyiv: “Sinergy Project”, 2018 by Dr. Olena Lazorenko and Dr. Rodion Kolishko (in Ukrainian)

b) Peer Learning Workshop “Adult Learning Policy as Pathway to Implement European Integration of Ukraine & SDG #4”, organized by NGO "League of Professional Women" (LPW) with partners and donors in-kind support in Kyiv, Ukraine 24 September 2018 and social media in 25 Sep. This was a progress meeting to present Policy Report and discuss the preliminary results: public experts and validations by stakeholders developed the Policy Recommendations.

Beginning Achieve change in legislation: drafting Law of Ukraine on Adult Education and Learning (AEL).

Action 1. Joint to the expert working group under the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine (MESU) on drafting Law on AEL (prescript by MESU from № 796 від 20.07.2018)


Action 3: Oral and writing consultations\negotiation of the public experts with state actors on drafting Law of Ukraine on AEL (incl. Policy paper "Advising assist on drafting Law on Adult Education in Ukraine" by Olena Lazorenko (in Ukrainian) in December 14, 2018; Review drafting Law on AEL in Ukraine" by members of the MESU’s working group (in 2018, January 2019)

Lessons learned: First, effective implementation of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development is essential to engage with CSOs, academia, local governments, private sector actors and citizens. Partnership has CSOs, academia, state actors, private sector actors and donors for some actions. We thinks, this is one of the first Ukrainian case in legislation development that CSOs leaders has so important role. Second, that authorities need to conduct national consultations based on the principles of deliberative democracy. In other words, it is important to hold expert roundtables and workshops that are open to dispute and where actual interaction can take place.

Contact
Name: Olena Lazorenko, LPW President
Organisation: NGO “League of Professional Women”
E-Mail: lpw.network@gmail.com

Name: Svitlana Olifira, LPW Board Member (Communication)
Organisation: NGO “League of Professional Women”
E-Mail: s.olifira@gmail.com
Summary
The objective is to set up at the level of policy and institutions a permanent unit on Education for Environmental and Sustainable Development for implementing, in a single, holistic, coherent and systematic manner SDGs in formal, non-formal and in formal educational. The Unit operation is based on synergies among all stakeholders (public and private sector, social partners, professional groups, local communities, NGOs, Organizations, Universities, etc.). It aims to shape an education system that will create environmentally literate and democratic citizens, who will be responsible for their choices, will seek alternative solutions, will participate in activities, will consult and co-plan, based on environmental protection, improve their quality of life and ensure a world based on the principles and values of sustainable development.

Situation
The creation of a permanent Unit for Education for the Environment and Sustainable Development is the result of the adoption and systematic implementation of the National Strategy on ESD, which is structured upon the UNECE ESD Strategy, which Cyprus has adopted with a view to establish ESD in a coherent, systematic and integrated way, at the heart of its policies. The development of ESD at all levels and forms of education, its’ integration of ESD into all national policies in a horizontal way and the recognition that ESD can make a substantial contribution to the qualitative upgrading of the education system, led to the foundation of this Unit. This Unit is responsible at governmental level for monitoring the implementation of the national strategy for ESD, updating and implementing it across the spectrum of the state mechanism, and more broadly in civil society.

Strategy
The process for the establishment of the Permanent Unit for ESD lasted for 4 years and the methodology followed was based on the involvement of all stakeholders from the Ministry of Education, from all the interested Ministries, the social partners, the NGOs, the private sector, Universities and the Cyprus Parliament. In particular, an expert group on ESD issues, management and planning was established with a mandate, of the Cyprus Minister of Education and Culture, to prepare a special study on the establishment of the Unit, taking in consideration creation, the challenges which it is faced, the international practices, its mission and objectives, its responsibilities, its institutional framework. The study discussed with all the interested parties for ensuring consensus, approved, by the Parliamentary Committee of the Environment and submitted to the Council of Ministers, which is the superior body of the State for political decision-making, which formally authorized the establishment of the Permanent Unit for ESD based on a specific study.

Results and lessons learned
The establishment of the Unit contributed to: (a) the integration of ESD and the issues of sustainable development into all Cypriot policies (adaptation to climate change, biodiversity, integrated maritime strategy, equality strategy, national strategy for ESD, etc.), (b) the foundation of ESD at the heart of the education system by developing comprehensive and integrated policies for the effective
implementation of ESD in the Cyprus education system (e.g. mandatory implementation of the ESD curriculum in Pre-Primary and Primary Education, the establishment of the State Network of Non-formal Environmental Education and Sustainable Development Centers, c) State commitment to support ESD from national resources (around 2 million Euros per year), (d) orienting research and raising important European funds to create infrastructures and develop actions on relevant issues (e.g. about 12 million were raised for the creation of non-formal environmental education and sustainable development centers); e) the development of synergies with all stakeholders, strengthening in a horizontal way the policies, decisions and actions on ESD; f) the activation of Cyprus in ESD not only at the national level, but also at the regional and international levels and in the up-taking of initiatives such as the Mediterranean Strategy for ESD, (g) the systematic and permanent engagement of professionals and scientists in the field of ESD, which is a key factor in the development and foundation of this field at the level of policies, decisions and practices. Indicatively, the Units personnel is 25 permanent and assigned professionals on ESD who have the responsibility of implementing ESD at the formal, non-formal and informal levels.

Contact
Name: Dr Aravella Zachariou
Organisation: Head of the Unit of Education for Environment and Sustainable Development, Cyprus Ministry of Education and Culture
E-Mail: aravella@cytanet.com.cy
**Summary**
Research shows that learning which activates as many senses as possible (seeing, smelling, touching, hearing, moving, ...), takes place in dynamic, real-life learning environments, and which demands active and self-guided involvement of the learners, is very effective. The SILVIVA-project “World of the forester” tries to translate these insights into an experiential, hands-on learning situation with authentic role-models. The aim is to provide students with a learning environment which provides the best possible conditions for deep, effective long-term learning, enabling feedback & transfer into daily life. In addition, deep connections to forests and an understanding about sustainable human-nature relationships is fostered.

**Situation**
The project “World of the forester” is a low-threshold school offer for 8 to 14 year old students, which communicates forest educational contents in a sustainable way. The pupils go into the forest with the local forester and get to know the forest as a place to live and work through practical work and activities. The school class visits the forest for two to three years four times a year (in each season) and observes developments and changes up close. If possible, they are assigned their own piece of forest to manage. In this way, the pupils learn more about the relationship between man and forest, between forest management and wood use and experience sustainability directly. The project thus contributes to education for sustainable development (ESD).

**Strategy**
To promote regular contact with nature and cooperation among the pupils, they work actively in the forest. They experience the effect of their work on the development of the forest during the different seasons, observe changes at close range and thus experience management and sustainability. Some tasks which may be accomplished: planting of young trees; game protection measures on young trees, ecological upgrading (creation of small structures, e.g. branch heaps for the benefit of the animal world); growth care (pruning of vegetation in favour of young trees); inventories (bat trees, diseased trees, dead wood, biotopes, etc.); tree felling.

**Results and lessons learned**
- School year: 2016/17: 12 classes, 5 foresters, 20 days in forest, 100 pupils; 2017/18: 21 classes, 14 foresters, 80 days in forest, 420 pupils; 2018/19: 37 classes, 23 foresters, 140 days in forest, 740 pupils.
• Challenges: the project depends on the availability of a designated forest area. So, the crucial partners to find are the foresters, not the classes.
• The intensity of the learning experience is impressive. Pupils truly understand what sustainability means when they select a tree which comes to full maturity 250 years later. They realise they can have a positive impact on the future. The project can easily be replicated in other contexts.

Contact
Name: Rolf Jucker
Organisation: Stiftung | Fondation | Fondazione SILVIVA
E-Mail: rolf.jucker@silviva.ch
SDG 4: A Rounder Sense of Purpose: Educator Competences for Education for Sustainable Development

**Summary**
This international project set out to ‘distil’ the UNECE educator competences for ESD to create a more concise framework of assessable learning outcomes that can form the basis of ESD qualifications for in-service and student educators across Europe.

**Situation**
A lack of awareness among educators on how to tackle ESD remains a ‘bottleneck’ as noted at the UNECE meeting in Belgrade in 2007. Members of the project had each attempted to operationalise the UNECE ESD educator competences in some way but had encountered difficulties because of the large number of competence statements (39) as well as a lack of measurability. Some repetition and ambiguity was also noted. It was agreed that a more concise and actionable set of competences lay at the heart of the UNECE framework but this needed to be made explicit.

**Strategy**
The process involved a careful review of the UNECE framework, matching statements that covered similar learning outcomes and reformulating them so that statements could be combined and the outcomes could be assessed. Gaps were also identified particularly in light of other recently published frameworks and related literature. The opinions of over 500 teachers, students and experts were sought within the six partner countries through delphi research procedures and closely monitored training programmes.

**Results and lessons learned**
The resulting twelve competences can be arranged in a 3x4 matrix using the original UNECE headings that reflect essential ESD characteristics: holistic approach, envisioning change and achieving transformation. The four rows suggest a reflective practice cycle: integration – involvement – practice – reflection; however, this cycle applies to all competences. Furthermore, as one student noted: “As soon as you start to teach one of the competences, you inevitably touch on the other eleven.” Therefore, the framework is also displayed as an artist’s palette thus demonstrating how the competences might be combined in creative ways by an educator depending on their context.

**Contact**
Name: Dr Paul Vare  
Organisation: University of Gloucestershire  
E-Mail: pvare@glos.ac.uk
Summary
The objective of the case study is promoting the society’s awareness and self-responsible ability to act in the field of environmental protection, water quality and sanitation in the rural areas of Macedonia as well as support for democratization in the countries, in particular through improved cooperation between NGOs, schools, experts and government authorities in the field of environment.

Situation
In Macedonia education in terms of environmental protection, and therefore of water, was at a very low level. In schools, even though they have a problem with access to water and sanitation, they have no knowledge of how to deal with this situation. As part of the project Water and Sanitation Safety Planning, we developed the Compendium for WSSP, together with WECF and partners, and we have slowly introduced it in the schools as an optional classis. Today, I am pleased to say that 5 municipalities work under this program, and another 10 are preparing for the next academic year. Over 500 children have spent summer camps where the environment is being educated through the Compendium, and since this year all private kindergartens in Skopje, have taken over and adapted part of the Compendium for education of preschool children.

Strategy
JHR is working closely with the National Health Service, Ministry if education and Bureau of education and we meet regularly with the authorities involved in the 8 rural areas to discuss the issue of water, sanitation in rural areas and discuss plans for the implementation of WSSP. The WSSP compendium serves as a guide and tool in educational process. Within the framework of UN human rights on water and sanitation and the Protocol on Water and Health, access to water and sanitation for disadvantaged population groups is also discussed and it was Students are offered practical activities within the framework of the WSSP program, for example water analyzes, excursions to the water catchment area, inspection of the toilets and an exchange of experiences with other schools, *part C of the WSSP compendium*. To this end, the existing experiences with the WSSP Compendium and the toolkit for schools are used.
Results and lessons learned

Through the implementation of the project, over 50,000 citizens from 10 municipalities in Macedonia, from the eight planning regions, were covered. Direct beneficiaries were 20 primary schools with or about 6000 children and 120 teachers who were trained in the subject of protection of the environment - access to water and sanitation ... Also included were 7 private kindergartens with 280 pre-school children and 21 pedagogues which works with children in kindergartens. In 2018 during the Water Day, 480 drawings and over 500 essays on the topic of Water have been received, which is 200% more than the previous year, which says that education has an impact and makes children aware of the topic of water and sanitation ... This example can be reproduced in each school and every garden, only good lobbying and work with the local self-government is necessary, to accept the idea of accepting the compendium as a tool in education. For the next academic year, the compendium will be introduced in facultative classes in the new 10 municipalities, which indicates that the project is sustainable and acceptable for all.

Contact

Name: Natasha Dokovska
Organisation: Journalists for Human Rights
E-Mail: dokovska@detstvo.org.mk
SDG 8: Decent work and economic growth

Round table: The Growth We Want: Solutions for Sustained, Inclusive and Sustainable Economic Growth

- Green finance for sustainable production: France’s flagship initiatives contribute to sustainable production
  *France*
- The German Resource Efficiency Programme
  *Germany*
- A forward-looking industrial policy to help SMEs make the most of the 4.0 economy
  *Italy*
- Public Private Partnerships building the virtual barcode for financial inclusion
  *The Netherlands*
- Trade as an engine of growth and the achievement of 2030 Agenda: the experience
  *Georgia*
- Advancing Financial Literacy in Turkey to Support Sustainable Development
  *Visa, Turkey*
- Frutti di Pace
  *Cooperativa Agricola Insieme, Bosnia and Herzegovina*
- Sustainable Growth and Social Innovation
  *Disability Hub Europe, Spain*
- Private sector involvement and needs within the policies of CEFTA parties
  *CEFTA*

Round table: The future of work: productive employment and decent work for all

- Empowering women in agriculture through gender responsive rural development policy making and budgeting in North Macedonia
  *North Macedonia*
- Investing in universal childcare and its effects on employment, economic growth and reducing gender inequalities in North Macedonia
  *North Macedonia*
- IT Girls Bosnia and Herzegovina: Increasing participation of girls and women in the ICT sector
  *Bosnia and Herzegovina*
• Ensuring the inclusive employment and decent work for all, with the focus on those most in need
  Turkmenistan*
• Joint work of ILO constituents in attaining the SDGs and addressing labour market challenges
  Azerbaijan*
• Ukrainian Pact for Youth 2020
  Ukraine*
• Digital and Entrepreneurial Skills of Rural Women in Serbia
  Equal Opportunities, Serbia
• Happy Tosti: A joyful workplace for everyone with a labour disability
  Happy Tosti, The Netherlands
• Supported Employment for Vulnerable Persons in Malta
  Federation of Organisations Persons with Disability, Malta
• Active Labour Market Policy - Care for Elderly as a Chance for Long-Term Unemployed
  WHO CC for Occupational Health, Croatia

* Note: Case studies that will be presented during the Round Table discussions
SDG 8: Green finance for sustainable production: France’s flagship initiatives contribute to sustainable production

**Summary**

In recent years, France has been fostering the rise of green finance among financial and non-financial market participants. This political will has enabled a substantial increase in green projects funding, which therefore impacted directly sustainable production among private and public actors. The objective of this case study is to introduce three main measures implemented in France in the past decade, and their contribution to sustainable production: *(i)* a pioneering regulation linked to climate disclosures; *(ii)* voluntary initiatives to value green investments and support investors; *(iii)* a benchmark-size financial instrument, the sovereign “Green bond” (or “Green OAT”).

**Situation**

The objective of these initiatives is to raise awareness, change behaviours and strengthen requirement levels for and from all stakeholders – ranging from investors to customers, through companies – regarding sustainable standards; all this has to be done by reorientating financial capital flows towards sustainable investments, activities and projects, whether the measures be mandatory or voluntary. In 2015, France implemented a pioneering regulation for financial actors – institutional investors and financial intermediaries – “the article 173-VI of the law on Energy Transition for Green Growth” to take into account Environmental, Social and Governance factors and fight against climate change in investment decisions. That same year, France implemented two ecolabels: the “Energy and Ecological Transition for the Climate” label, which target green investment funds, and the “Crowdfunding for green growth” label, that promotes projects in favour of ecological and energy transition. Lastly, in 2017, France issued a €7bn sovereign green bond, and highlighting the funding of the French government’s green projects and initiatives. The French debt management office, AFT, has been tapping the Green OAT after the initial issuance, and as of end of February 2019, the outstanding amount of the Green OAT reaches €16.5bn.

**Strategy**

Through disclosures obligations, investors must show their stakeholders that investing in companies implementing sustainable patterns and processes are at the heart of their strategy and decision-making process. With the help of green labels, and specifically the “Crowdfunding for green growth” label, France wish to raise awareness among individual investors and make them contribute to the ecological and energy transition, by investing directly in tangible and sustainable projects. Finally, the Green OAT, through its demanding reporting framework, has enabled the French government to assess the level of environmental impact of the green targeted expenditures.
Results and lessons learned

On one hand, as far as the “Energy and Ecological Transition for the Climate” label is concerned, 29 funds are labelled for a total amount of €7bn; regarding the “crowdfunding for green growth label”, to date, the labelled projects amount €9.5 million. On the other hand, the French Green OAT is, to date, the world’s biggest sovereign green bond on the market.

Overall, the French initiatives has had a direct effect on European policy and strategy regarding sustainable finance. Indeed, the European Commission, through its « sustainable finance » legislative proposal, decided to set up a backbone regulation linked with the classification of environmentally sustainable activities (or « green taxonomy »). The latter will, inter alia, serve as the main basis to design and implement an EU eco-label for financial products, thus leading the way towards a more sustainable production and consumption patterns among economic and financial participants.

Contact

Name: Elise Calais

Organisation: French Ministry for the Ecological and Inclusive Transition

E-Mail: elise.calais@developpement-durable.gouv.fr
The focus of the German Resource Efficiency Programme (ProgRes) is not only on enhancing resource efficiency, but also on showing how in many cases the use of raw materials – such as in environmental technologies – can actually conserve natural resources. In ProgRes, the Federal Government reports every four years on the development of resource efficiency in Germany, assesses progress, and further develops the resource efficiency programme itself.

The Federal Government embraces its responsibility regarding an increase of resource efficiency. As early as 2002, it set a target in the National Sustainable Development Strategy of doubling Germany’s raw material productivity by 2020 relative to 1994. The German Resource Efficiency Programme (ProgRes) of 2012 was directed towards achieving this target. ProgRes II (since its adoption by the Federal Cabinet on 2 March 2016) is based on the same four guiding principles as ProgRes I:

• Combining ecological necessities with economic opportunities, innovation focus, and social responsibility;
• Seeing global responsibility as a key guide of national resource policy;
• Making economic and production activities in Germany depend less and less on primary resources, and developing and expanding the circular economy;
• Securing sustainable resource use for the long term by guiding society towards quality growth.

Action areas for an implementation of resource policy as highlighted in ProgRes II include the following ten areas:

1. Securing a sustainable raw material supply,
2. Increasing resource efficiency in production,
3. Making production and consumption more resource-efficient,
4. Developing a resource-efficient circular economy,
5. Sustainable building and sustainable urban development,
6. Resource-efficient information and communication technology,
7. Cross-cutting instruments,
8. Exploiting synergies with other policy areas and resolving goal conflicts,
9. Supporting resource efficiency policy at local and regional level,
10. Strengthening resource policy at international and EU level.
Results and lessons learned

The raw material input productivity in Germany has shown a positive development and increased by approximately 20% from 2000 to 2011. The values for the years 2010 and 2011 continued the path of development that prevailed up to 2008. From 2010 to 2011, the value of the indicator grew by 2.39% and thus followed the positive trend from the preceding ten years. The actions as highlighted in ProgRess are considered to have contributed positively to this development.

Contact
Name: Dr. Clemens Helbach
Organisation: German Federal Ministry for the Environment, Nature Conservation and Nuclear Safety, Division IK I 2 – United Nations, 2030 Agenda, Developing and Newly Industrialised Countries
E-Mail: Clemens.Helbach@bmu.bund.de
SDG 8: A forward-looking industrial policy to help SMEs make the most of the 4.0 economy in Italy

Summary
The digital revolution currently in place has far reaching effects on productivity, employment and trade, and SMEs have a lot to gain out of it. As shown by several studies (i.a. by the OECD and the WEF), small digital enterprises tend to grow faster than non-digital ones, and digitalization is strongly correlated with successful start-ups and firm growth. However, SMEs generally lag behind in terms of digital uptake compared to larger companies, hampering competitiveness.

With this in mind, the Italian Government has embraced an inclusive, SME-centred model for industrial development. The National Plan on Industry 4.0 is a case in point. It puts digitalization at the core of the Italian industrial policy, and its ultimate goal is to help SMEs make the most of the ongoing digital revolution.

Situation
The Italian National Plan for Industry 4.0 is a good example of a cross-cutting strategy to promote digitalisation. The plan is grounded on three pillars:

1. Promotion of investment by Italian SMEs, especially in digital technologies;
2. Improvement of skills within the labour force, e.g. professional tertiary education, on the job training, digital literacy;
3. Strengthening of the national physical and digital infrastructure through ultra-broad band network and 5G coverage.

Reduced investment and, hence, declining productivity has been key in determining the setback recently suffered by a significant part of the Italian industrial sector. On the upside, sustained investment, notably in knowledge-based capital, is commonplace for many of the Italian world-class exporting companies. For this reason, the Plan’s first concern is to encourage laggards to catch up, by making it more convenient for them to invest in innovation.

This was obtained through the introduction of a vast array of fiscal incentives, which encompass an incremental tax credit on R&D expenditure, robust deductions on IP-related income (so-called Patent Box), and a “super-depreciation” scheme to make the purchase of new machinery, especially instrumental goods that fit the Industry 4.0 paradigm, more favourable for taxation purposes.

This package of measures allowed Italy to leapfrog international rankings on fiscal attractiveness for knowledge-intensive investment. According to the 2018 PwC Digital Tax Index, Italy’s tax treatment for digital business models is the first most favourable among all developed countries.

Strategy
A first, key tenet of the plan is technology neutrality: investment is encouraged tout court, with particular emphasis on innovation, but not limited to any specific sector. By so doing, Governments can avoid selection bias and undesirable crowding-out effects.
The plan results from a whole-of-government policy action. As a reflection of the various policy areas affected, several Ministries, including those of Finance, Industry, Education, and Labour, were involved in the design and implementation of the plan, each guiding their policy area of competence.

Its multi-stakeholder approach ensured that all concerned parties, including businesses, both SME and large, universities, research organisations and finance, were involved in devising the plan and would contribute to its adoption.

Another key feature of the plan is its evidence-based nature, i.e. the Italian Government committed itself to sharing in-depth information on the results achieved on a constant basis.

Results and lessons learned
- If duly supported, SMEs have much to gain from the ongoing digital revolution, which i.a. enables new business models and eases greater participation in GVCs.
- However, OECD work shows that SMEs generally lag behind in the digital transition compared with larger firms.
- This is particularly relevant for Italy, whose vast population of SMEs employs more than 60% of national labour force.
- The National Plan on Industry 4.0 is a case in point for a SME-centred industrial policy, given its focus on helping SMEs make the most of the digital revolution.
- Its strategic rationale can act as a source of inspiration for similar policy efforts by transition economies, who are largely relying on SMEs for job creation and economic growth.

Contact
Name: Stefano Firpo
Organisation: Italian Ministry of Economic Development (DG for Industrial Policy, Competitiveness and SMEs)
E-Mail: stefano.firpo@mise.gov.it
SDG 8: Public Private Partnerships building the virtual barcode for financial inclusion

**Summary**

Dutch Blockchain Coalition (DBC) is an initiative of the Dutch Ministry of Economic Affairs. In the view of the Ministry, blockchain is a transformational technology that requires next level collaborative efforts between governments, academia, regulators and business partners with multilateral and multisectoral business processes. The currently 35 DBC partners come from Government Service providers (Ministry of the Interior, Tax Authority, Chamber of Commerce, Cadaster), Dutch banks and Insurers, Notaries, Utility companies, Port of Rotterdam, Dutch Authority for Financial Markets, Science Institutes and DLT services providers.

DBC is a public private partnership, technology agnostic, 50% co-financed by Dutch government but fully managed by the partners themselves. DBC is designated to deliver all required basic and common functional components for blockchain applications. Industry sectors in so-called fieldlabs will apply these basic common components into their business applications.

One of the projects at hand in building the required common components for DLT applications are uniform and trusted Identifiers for goods and materials: *unbreakable virtual barcodes*.

**Situation**

On a daily basis billions of economic transactions are taking place within and across country and language borders. Each region or country has its own transaction language, with all the communication problems it entails. Even in spite of existing barcodes, banking, identity and reference numbers trade communication and trust provisioning still is very complex, slow and costly and expensive. Delivering trust currently occupies 25% for the US economy work force.

For small entrepreneurs in developing economies and markets the complexities and costs of doing transactions on large, formal and non-local markets are too high to participate. Trusted Identifiers, Verifiable Claims, Blockchain (DLT) and smart contracts can provide trust much more cheaply. In developing economies lower thresholds to markets will advance inclusion and resilience of SMSE’s.

Part of the solution is *virtual barcoding* through a Uniform Entity and Transaction Protocol (UETP). A cellular internet of entities will enable that, by using their smartphones, small producers or sellers can cheaply, quickly and unbreakably identify the origin and ownership of the products they offer. Part of this is geo- and timestamping and other biometrically unbreakable attestations on provenance and ownership. Strong multilingual capability in more than 80 languages provide accurate contextual and semantically precise translations. The Uniform Entity Transaction Protocol will dramatically improve supply chain efficiencies and transparencies.
**Strategy**

In order to come to large scale adoption of any kind of standards on any market, business driven collaboration between partners is key. In many markets diverging roles and interests lead to ‘market failures’ prohibiting the development and adoption of essentially required market functionalities. It is the role of Dutch Blockchain Coalition to help bridging the divides and support the effectuation of beneficial DLT solutions. DBC convenes and supports coalitions of the willing in minimal viable ecosystems of policymakers, regulators, science and businesses.

**Results and lessons learned**

Dutch Blockchain Coalition supports work in business areas such as agro- and consumer goods. Some stunning results can be demonstrated. There are still many technical issues to solve and establishing the minimal viable ecosystem is challenge in collaboration. Very important is an early phase attitude of un-partial collaboration for the common good of all, matching IP agreements and clear demand from governments and businesses. Policy support from governments and UNECE will help advancing this.

**Contact**

Name: Ad Kroft/ Floris Kleemans  
Organisation: Dutch Blockchain Coalition in collaboration with Focafet Foundation  
E-Mail: [apjkroft@gmail.com](mailto:apjkroft@gmail.com) and [floris.kleemans@focafet.org](mailto:floris.kleemans@focafet.org)
SDG 8: Trade as an engine of growth and the achievement of 2030 Agenda: the experience of Georgia

Summary
Georgia’s ambition is to contribute to best practices and approaches to harness trade to serve as an engine of growth and the achievement of the 2030 Agenda, particularly the achievement of Sustainable Development Goal 8.3 on promoting development-oriented policies that support productive activities, decent job creation, entrepreneurship, creativity and innovation, and encourage the formalization and growth of micro-, small- and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs) at the national level.

Situation
The industrial sector stands as the second source of income generation for the Georgian economy, with a 24.6 per cent share of domestic product (GDP) in 2017. However, its contribution to job creation was modest, with an 8 per cent share of total employment. In contrast, the agricultural sector, which generated only 7.1 per cent of GDP, accounted for the largest share of total employment (43 per cent), reflecting low productivity levels. In addition, exports continue to be dominated by a limited range of products, including beverages and tobacco, crude materials, manufacturing along with machinery and transport equipment. The challenge for Georgia is how to achieve a balanced structural transformation that involves increased specialization in capital intensive products as well as improving the productive capacity of existing labour-intensive industries in a manner that ensures consistent progress in the economic, social and environmental dimensions of the 2030 Agenda.

Strategy
Georgia’s strategy seeks to create synergies between trade and other economic policies. Trade policies aim at diversifying partners (recently, Free Trade Agreements with Turkey, CIS countries, EFTA, China and DCFTA with EU - about 2.3 billion consumers in total) and ensuring that non-tariff measures are compliant with the WTO requirements and those of main trading partner (EU). They are complemented by efforts to: (i) develop the institutional capacities of State agencies (for example, a Single Window Environment and a robust quality assurance system); (ii) transform Georgia into a regional transit hub; (iii) support start-ups and help existing enterprises develop their productive capacity; (iv) achieve energy efficiency; (v) develop the service sector, including outsourcing.

Results and lessons learned
- Reduced cost of trade: It takes a maximum of 30 minutes to complete if the trade documents are in order. Physical control is conducted on a selective basis only if the shipments are flagged by the system and is completed in a maximum of 4 hours. Enterprises do not need to engage customs brokers. Customs staff are helping enterprises fill out e-customs declarations (free of charge).

- Increased investments in the enterprise sector: Around 98 per cent of the traders interviewed as part of a recent ECE study (on regulatory and procedural barriers to trade in Georgia) had expansion plans for 2018-2019, involved hiring additional staff; purchasing new machinery; and establishing branches
in Georgia and abroad. The number of newly registered companies is also assuming an increasing trend standing at 50,426 in 2018 up from 50,120 in 2017. Similarly, the enterprise sector’s investments in fixed assets have increased from GEL 4.3 million in 2015 to GEL 5.6 million in 2017 up from GEL 4.7 million in 2016. This is a significant improvement from the low level of GEL 2.6 million in 2011.

- Addressing the skills gap in the labour market is critical and should be done on a continuous basis: (i) The Government is providing vocational training aid to help professionals across sectors improve their expertise skills; (ii) The Ministry of Economy and Sustainable Development along with the Ministry of Education, Science, Culture and Sports are developing a reform strategy to develop vocational educational (Currently, there are 67 vocational/community colleges); (iii) the ministries are also attracting top experts to provide training services. For example, mentors from the Silicone Valley participates in training services offered by the Georgian innovation center; (iv) special emphasis is given to developing skills in the IT sector, since IT is an important growth pillar. The Government’s specialized agency for promoting innovation (Georgia’s Innovation and Technology Agency – GITA) conducted needs assessment of the IT sector’s skills requirements, and the results will be used for developing IT training programs. In addition, GITA is providing training, coaching and mentorship (by international experts), and is further developing programs delivered as part of the incubation/acceleration program. GITA also conducts trainings in STEAM skills development (Robotics, microelectronics etc.) In 2017 GITA financed 62 micro grant projects (22, 1426 GEL in total) and 98 projects in 2018 (36,0318 GEL in total).

Lessons learned

1- Ensuring that trade reforms support economic growth requires maintaining continuous public-private consultations across sectors. One national consultative committee is not enough. In Georgia, reform decisions are developed by line Ministries in consultation with the private sector within the context of well-established institutional mechanisms. These mechanisms are supported by the Ministry of Environmental Protection and Agriculture; the Ministry of Economy and Sustainable Development; the Ministry of Labour, Health and Social Affairs; and, the Ministry of Finance, and serve as tool for monitoring progress in implementing national development plans/government decisions as well as commitments under regional and international trade agreements. The mechanisms also serve as a tool for engaging the business community during the decision-making processes on reform measures and associated legislation, and ensuring continuous feedback on the business community’s emerging needs. The Ministries work in close collaboration as a team and Informal discussions are also accorded much importance for gaining insights into key challenges reported during formal consultations.

2- Trade facilitation solutions integrating international standards and best practices should be home grown. This is important for ensuring sustainability and reducing the cost of trade (high costs reduce competitiveness). For example, Georgia’s move to a paperless trading system has been developed over several years building on international best practices. Today it offers a single window environment populated by several paperless systems that are linked to the Revenue Service Customs platform. The systems include ASYCUDA World (adapted to the national context); an in-house Border Risk Management Module; port authorities and shipping systems; the Unified Electronic System of Licenses, Permits and Certification; and, the Georgian railway system. The Ministry of Labour, Health and Social Affairs and the National Food Agency are also linked to the Revenue Service Customs Platform to enable continuous exchange of information.
Enterprise support should be championed by the Government. For example, the Government is implementing the State programmes “Produce in Georgia” and “Start-Up Georgia”. The first helps enterprises access funds for carrying out new investments, while the second supports high tech and innovative start-ups. Yet another initiative is the micro and small business grant programme, which provides financial support and capacity building services to enterprises. Enterprises, particularly micro and small enterprises, also benefit from targeted business development services offered by the Legal Entity of Public Law (LEPL) Enterprise Georgia. Moreover, in order to promote Georgian exports and access to new markets, the Government will establish an Export Credit Guarantee system.

Financial burdens assumed by enterprises, especially micro and SMEs, should be reduced. Since July 1, 2018, the preferential tax regime came into force to support and encourage micro, small, and medium-size businesses. In particular, changes were made to SME definition within the Tax Code: the status of small businesses is granted to entrepreneurs whose cumulative annual revenues are lower than 500,000 GEL, (about 120,000 entrepreneurs); FDI in 2018 amounted to 998.7 million USD (Q3) Reinvestment volume in 2018 has amounted to 504.7 million USD. FDI in 2017 amounted to 1.89 billion USD Reinvestment volume in 2017 amounted to 658.6 million USD. Reform of Profit Tax will ensure that GEL 2 billions will be retained by business sector by 2020 and, thereof, reinvested in the economy. In addition, according to the new regime income tax of a person with small business status is reduced from 5% to 1%. Small entrepreneurs will be able to register as VAT payers, besides enjoying concessional tax treatment.

Reforming tax handling is critical: Introduction of innovative approaches and online services, including Blockchain technologies will increase the efficiency of tax administration. With automatic system of value-added tax (VAT) returns businesses with receive GEL 1.5 billion in 2018-2020;

Sound results in fighting the poverty and unemployment should be context specific. One of the programs, which started from the September 2016, focused on the mountainous regions of Georgia (located above 1000 meters from sea level). It envisages special tax treatment for population living in those regions with small salaries, as well as tax exemption for start-up companies established in this region and employing the local population (as they are very vulnerable and depended only limited agricultural crops). This policy seeks to reduce poverty through employment creation in these regions, as they are very vulnerable and depended only limited agricultural crops.

Contact Name: Teimuraz Janjalia
Organisation: Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Georgia
E-Mail: t.janjalia@mfa.gov.ge
SDG 8: Advancing Financial Literacy in Turkey to Support Sustainable Development in Turkey

**Summary**
Visa Turkey recognizes the importance of financial literacy as key to enhance personal and national welfare, as well as to constitute more resilient economies, and sustainable and inclusive growth in the long run. With this in mind, *I Can Manage My Money* project was initiated in 2009 with the support of 27 banks in Turkey, in partnership with UNDP and Habitat Association.

The project aims to improve the financial literacy level in Turkey, offering nationwide financial trainings. The training content covers topics such as budgeting, spending, savings, investments, debt management and financial consumers’ rights and responsibilities based on different segments targeted.

**Situation**
Financial literacy is a key life skill in today’s societies and several studies revealed that young people in Turkey were not equipped with the necessary information and skills to make key financial decisions to help secure their financial future. Infakto Research indicated that 71% of the young people in Turkey did not budget regularly, and only 27% monitored and controlled their past spending. Youth research commissioned by Visa Turkey demonstrated that 97% of young people make important financial decisions without consulting an expert. 87% of them are not saving for their short-term and long-term financial goals such as education and housing. Among those who do save, only a very small minority keep their money in the banking system. 49% doesn’t have sufficient knowledge on consumer’s financial rights and responsibilities.

**Strategy**
In 6 different segments (high schoolers, university students, young adults, entrepreneurs, farmers and blue collar workers), the project teaches the participants how to efficiently make use of their financial resources. The training content is adapted to address the specific needs of these target audiences and delivered through various channels. Face-to-face trainings have been delivered to 1.2 million people by more than 2,000 volunteer trainers all across Turkey - 81 cities. In addition, a further 300k people are actively engaging with the programme via Facebook and Twitter. Online trainings are available on project’s website [www.paramiyonetebiliyorum.net](http://www.paramiyonetebiliyorum.net) and a mobile budgeting app is also offered for both IOS and Android users.

**Results and lessons learned**
Regular impact analysis indicate that the trainees’ level of financial literacy increase and they develop healthy financial skills. According to the results of long-term impact analysis in 2015:
- 81% of the trainees budget vs 55% for control group
- 62% of the trainees correctly calculate compound interest rate vs 31% for control group
- 66% of the trainees correctly calculate the impact of inflation vs 39% for control group
- 50% of the trainees save vs 23% for control group
To highlight the possible impact of trainings on Turkish economy and domestic savings, an economic benefit analysis was conducted in 2015 and it was estimated that if all young people aged 15 to 30 in Turkey attended these trainings; they would have saved an additional 11 billion TL (approximately € 1.8 billion) annually.

Based on its successful results, I Can Manage My Money inspired other Visa Europe countries such as Romania, Croatia, Bulgaria and Israel, to tailor the model and content in line with their needs.

Contact
Name: Alev Saman
Organisation: Visa Turkey
E-Mail: samana@visa.com
SDG 8: Frutti di Pace

Summary

The Cooperativa Agricola Insieme was founded in 2003 in Bratunac (10 kilometres from Srebrenica), on the border of Bosnia and Herzegovina with Serbia, by a group of women who understood that job creation was the key to reviving their territory. The cooperative, which with the support of large consumer cooperatives manages to access the markets, transforms small berry fruits grown by local families into jams and nectars, named Frutti di Pace (Fruits of Peace). Its aim was to contribute to peace, allow refugees to begin rebuilding their communities and create inclusive jobs for the prosperity of local communities.

Situation

Following the break-up of Yugoslavia in the early 1990s, Bosnia and Herzegovina descended into a situation of exacerbated tensions among various ethnic groups, resulting in a civil war lasting for more than three years (April 1992 - November 1995). In the wake of the war, society emerged fragmented, with a very high number of displaced people, an economy in tatters and severely damaged or destroyed infrastructure. One of the most shocking events of the Bosnian war was the massacre in Srebrenica, (July 1995) where more than 8,000 Muslim men were killed by Bosnian Serb troops, officially the most serious massacre in Europe since the Second World War.

Almost 20 years after the end of the conflict, with the economy of the country heavily dependent on loans from international donors rather than local businesses, women decided to found a cooperative in Bratunac, where the number of returning refugees was practically nil.

Strategy

The first activity carried out by the cooperative was to collect and cultivate the typical forest fruits of the area. The berries were then frozen and primarily exported to the European market, especially in Germany and Northern Europe. Given the low margin obtained by this type of processing, the cooperative later decided to focus on the transformation of the natural product, and began to produce jam and fruit nectars. With this, the “Fruits of Peace” were born. In 2013, the products were then sold outside Bosnia and Herzegovina, including by large consumer cooperatives in Italy, and supporting as well as promoting the values, ethics and story behind the products further helped to increase their sales.
Results and lessons learned

Given a conducive environment for Cooperatives at multiple levels that would allow them to accomplish their role as vehicles for inclusive and sustainable growth, it would make this success story easily replicable in post-conflict areas.

By disseminating the values of work and cooperation, the cooperative makes it possible to restore a sustainable rural economy as well as achieving a reconciliation to overcome the divisions created by the war through the promotion of the values of peace and working together. Key factor in the success is the fact that the cooperative provides continuous training both to its employees and to the producers, a key cooperative principle. Sustainability is also a key feature of the cooperative, both in terms of organic production and in terms of the high quality of products that derive from traditional Bosnian recipes.

The cooperative:

- Gives work to 500 families in the territory, engaged in the production and processing of forest fruits
- Enabled many displaced people to the area, mostly women, making Bratunac the area with the highest return of refugees in Bosnia after the war (roughly 30%)
- Ensured equal opportunities to women and men, and increased inclusion of all social groups irrespective of sex, race, ethnicity, origin and religion

Contact
Name: Francesca Ottolenghi
Organisation: Legacoop, member of Cooperatives Europe
E-Mail: f.ottolenghi@legacoop.coop
SDG 8: Disability Hub Europe for Sustainable Growth and Social Innovation

**Summary**
Disability Hub Europe for sustainable growth and social innovation (DHub). A new initiative led by Fundación ONCE and co-funded by the European Social Fund, aimed at building a reference space to work on the binomial Disability and Sustainability from a multistakeholder approach. Aligned with the Agenda 2030 and the Sustainable Development Goals, DHub final goal is to foster social and labour inclusion of people with disabilities in Europe while promoting inclusive and sustainable businesses. DHub is focused on disseminating best practices and mobilizing actors on how disability is or can be integrated in business and other organizations’ strategies looking for an inclusive sustainable future.

**Situation**
Over one billion of the world’s population have some form of disability. While about 80% are in working age approximately only the 20% participated in the labour force in 2016. Working does not only covers our material needs and make us independent but also give us a sense of belonging. The 2030 Agenda and the Sustainable Development Goals recognize people with disabilities as part of the existing vulnerable groups and different Goals expressly refer to them, building on the principle “leaving no one behind”.
Additionally, people with disabilities are considered an unexploited source of talent, innovation and diversity and what is more, they represent an underserved market of consumers that can bring new opportunities for companies.

**Strategy**
Disability Hub Europe, a multi-stakeholder engagement initiative aimed at building a reference space to work on the binomial Disability and Sustainability. Sustainability not only applies to environmental issues, but also to social aspects, such as inclusion, equal opportunities and non-discrimination. DHub, is built collectively based on key alliances and partnerships with companies, public administrations, Sustainability-related platforms, civil society entities and other organizations committed to sustainability and disability. DHub seeks to serve as a European meeting point for exchanging and disseminating good practice, contributing to advance on a sustainable inclusive future that leaves no one behind, with a 360º approach towards business and disability.

**Results and lessons learned**
DHub started in September 2018, is led by Fundación ONCE and co-funded by the European Social Fund. It will be officially launch in March 2019, first results:
- L’Oréal, CSR Europe, Global Reporting Initiative, The ILO Global Business and Development Network and European Disability Forum are already on board
- The guide “Disability in Sustainability Reporting” by GRI and Fundación ONCE has been updated in the framework of DHub
- The European Award for Social Entrepreneurship and Disability will be continued under DHub
- A publication regarding the future of work and people with disabilities is being elaborated

Contact
Name: Carla Bonino
Organisation: Disability Hub Europe/ Fundación ONCE
E-Mail: cbonino@fundaciononce.es
SDG 8: Private sector involvement and needs within the policies of CEFTA parties

Summary
The Project supporting trade facilitation within the CEFTA Region (implemented by GIZ and ITC) is designed to support identification of the trade barriers within the CEFTA Region and provide the CEFTA Parties with valuable information of the potential trade distortive measures that are creating barriers for the regional trade. Focus of the Project has been on piloting of a mechanism for regional private sector advocacy on trade facilitation topics: Regional Business Advisory Group (RBAG) that has been established for two sectors, vegetables and metal sectors, as an initiative for increased participation of the business community in addressing obstacles to trade within the CEFTA region.

The elimination of these barriers would lead to better export potential of the CEFTA Parties thus providing the economic growth of all the CEFTA Parties. The Project as well is twofold, from one side going bottom up, in the identification of trade barriers, and top down from the assistance on the regional level.

Situation
Liberalisation and facilitation of trade among CEFTA Parties and their integration in the EU single market continue to be a key priority in the enlargement agenda. Since trade in goods is fully liberalised among the CEFTA Parties through the elimination of tariffs, trade facilitation and reduction of the most trade-distortive market access barriers are top agenda items of the CEFTA Structures. Although CEFTA has launched a number of instruments to facilitate trade, significant measures distorting access to markets (legal regulations and their practical applications) are still maintained. Therefore, trading in CEFTA requires more documents and higher number of samples and physical controls that makes trade in the CEFTA region more time consuming and expensive. To address different challenges identified, the Project has a holistic approach covering different aspects of trade barriers, through work through 4 interrelated components.

The elimination of NTBs, identified by the Project, would have an increased impact on the expansion of trade between the Parties and the implementation of the CEFTA Agreement and the commitments taken under the Berlin Process, namely Regional Economic area Multiannual Action Plan (REA MAP).

Strategy
The Project offers an innovative framework for dealing with the key challenges in the CEFTA region: all activities are based on strong involvement of the private sector, in order to deliver concrete solutions for reducing clearance time, clearance documentation and frequency in physical controls for selected supply chains. Furthermore, the activities are built upon the EU Acquis and very result oriented. They are designed to increase capacity of the public authorities and to identify and contest eventual vested interests in the national markets.
Results and lessons learned
In order to achieve the expected results, regional and national co-ownership is required. CEFTA structures need to play an active role in communicating their needs. From the other side, a strong commitment by the business community is required.

This requires the Project to maintain effective communication channels between public institutions and business on a long-term basis to achieve sustainable results, while assisting the CEFTA Structures on the Regional level in the implementation of the requirements arising from the CEFTA Agreement.

The successful coordination between the different stakeholders and the flexibility in the Project implementation are of the utmost importance in the implementation of the complex Projects, such as this one is.

The results of the Project lead to the participation of the private sector in the development of Parties policies and streamlining them with the EU acquis providing the increased competitiveness, thus increasing economic growth within the CEFTA Parties.

Contact
Name: Emir Djikic
Organisation: CEFTA Secretariat
E-Mail: emir.djikic@cefta.int
SDG 8: Empowering women in agriculture through gender responsive rural development policy making and budgeting in North Macedonia

Summary
This case study will discuss the situation of women in the agriculture in the North Macedonia and explain how evidence-based advocacy resulted in the commitment of the Government to address the needs of women in agriculture that will potentially improve women’s employment and ensure decent work in the sector.

The project “Women Empowerment in Agriculture with survey based and experimental economics methods” has a main purpose to contribute to the empowerment of rural women and their increased participation and leadership in the agricultural sector. The project output is to revise the national policies related to agriculture and rural development in order to address gender inequalities and exclusion of women. The project aims to: 1) provide evidence on status and inclusion of women in the agricultural sector by analyzing five agricultural domains; 2) provide technical/expert support to the policy makers (Ministry of Agriculture) and associations of farmers on needs based and gender responsive policy making and 3) outreach and advocate for women empowerment in the agricultural sector.

Situation
Gender inequality is an important issue for any society and is especially pronounced in the agricultural sector. In general, agriculture is perceived as a male-dominated sector, but as an engine of growth and development, it should provide greater recognition of the importance of women (Alkaire, et al. 2013). The agricultural sector in North Macedonia accounts for about 10% of the national gross domestic product and employs 17% of the country’s workforce. Agriculture is also the main driver of the rural economy and the predominant source of employment in rural regions (European Commission 2014), where women represent about 32% of the workforce (State Statistical Office of RM 2017). The majority of agricultural workers, however, are men, and they dominate all age groups and management activities. Women participation in the management of agricultural holdings is very low, and the outlook is not positive, as it dropped from 11% in 2013 to 10% in 2016 (State Statistical Office of RM 2017, 2014). The low employment and participation of women in the management of agricultural enterprises reflect the limited inclusion of women in the decision-making process. Some of the possible reasons are the patriarchal structure of the Macedonian society, local customs, and cultural and traditional social norms that add to the poor socio-economic livelihood of rural women (Risteska et al., 2012; Petrovska Mitrevska and Tuna, 2017; World Bank and FAO, 2014).
**Strategy**

UN Women in North Macedonia supported a research study for measuring “Women Empowerment in Agriculture with survey based and experimental economics methods”. The study was carried out by the Faculty of Agricultural Science and Food. It’s is focused on analyzing five key domains that directly influence women’s empowerment: **Production** - input in productive decisions; **Resources** - ownership of assets and access to and decisions on credit; **Income** - control over use of income; **Leadership** - group membership and **Time allocation** – workload.

**Results and lessons learned**

The study revealed several key findings on women’s empowerment from which policy recommendations derived for strengthening women’s leadership in the agricultural sector.

There is a strong commitment by the Government of North Macedonia on applying the policy recommendations from the study within the programs for agriculture and rural development strategy. The established Project Advisory Body between Faculty of Agricultural Sciences and Food, Agency for financial support in agriculture and rural development, Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Water Economy (MAFWE), Ministry of Finance (MoF), Ministry of Labour and Social policy (MLSP), National Extension Agency, Network of women farmers and National Farmers Association, contributed to successful alignment and coordination between the institutions. Moreover, there is a strong voiced pledge by the MAFWE, and the ministry is actively working on introducing measures that directly address the needs of rural women/women in agriculture. It is expected that based on the policy recommendations and the Project Advisory Body guidance, the National Program for Agriculture and Rural Development for the period 2019-2022 will be engendered, specifically amending it with a specific measure designed for women in the agricultural economy. As declared by the Minister of Agriculture, the intention is, through this measure to create support in the form of non-refundable grants in the amount up to 180,000 denars per user, for performing additional activity within the agricultural holding. With this, women will be encouraged in entrepreneurship by enabling them to start a processing or craft businesses, using resources from their own production. Additional measures are to be developed/engendered to address other disempowerment causes identified with the study.

The study could be replicated in any country of the Region and could be adapted to specific needs and aspects of interest. The Institute of Agricultural Economics is available to technically support countries in the adaptation and implementation of the survey at the local and national level. The implementation of a similar study format would be an important milestone to be considered for action on women’s empowerment in agriculture.

**Contact**

Name: Ermira Lubani
Organisation: UN Women ECA RO
E-Mail: ermira.lubani@unwomen.org
SDG 8: Investing in universal childcare and its effects of employment, economic growth and reducing gender inequalities in North Macedonia

**Summary**

This case study will discuss the impact of available and high-quality childhood education and care on women’s employment rates, as well as will demonstrate efficiency of the evidence-based advocacy with the decision-makers.

At the request from the Government, UN Women engaged a team of experts to assess the costs of expanding early childhood education and care (ECEC) and its potential impact on women labor market participation rate. The study estimates the annual fiscal cost of public investment in early childhood education and care (ECEC) services. In particular, the study examines several important outcomes of investing in early childcare:

- direct and indirect employment creation;
- impact on gender employment gap;
- related increases in tax revenues.

Hence, the study makes the case for increasing the access and capacity of the public childcare services to contribute to building a care economy that will promote gender equality and high-quality employment.

**Situation**

Provision of childcare in Macedonia is inadequate, relying mainly on mothers’ informal care time and with unequal access to early childcare and education services despite relatively low prices. Quality of childcare services is also unequal. This impairs children’s development as shown by numerous studies (Huston et al., 2015). Children from disadvantaged backgrounds tend to benefit most from high quality formal childcare, from an early age, but are least likely to attend such facilities. Therefore, developing accessible, affordable childcare of high quality is essential to achieving multiple policy goals: it increases and equalises the life chances of all children and thus contributes to social mobility; it improves employment prospects of mothers by freeing their time and budget constraints for childcare responsibilities; it reduces poverty by enabling all families to acquire economic resources independently; it improves employment prospects in the economy overall by creating jobs directly and indirectly; it generates tax revenue in the long term for government to recoup the original investment and spend on other projects. As such it contributes to the Sustainable Development Goals (SDG) of SDG 5 (gender equality), SDG 4 (high quality education), SDG 3 (well-being and health) and SDG 1 (end poverty).

---

9 De Henau 2017a.
**Strategy**
The study makes the case for increasing the access and capacity of the public childcare services to contribute to building a care economy that will promote gender equality and high-quality employment. This study on Investing in free universal childcare in North Macedonia has shown that investing in free universal childcare of high-quality in North Macedonia has the potential to yield large employment creation effects likely to significantly improve women’s employment prospects and thus their lifetime earnings.

**Results and lessons learned**
In the past year, the Government embarked on large reform of the social protection system, including child protection. It is expected that the policy recommendations will be included in the ongoing reform of the child protection system. The Government has recently pledged to increase the enrolment rate of the children aged 3-6 from 40% to 50% and has announced opening of new 11 childcare facilities in 2019 which will increase the enrolment for 860 children and will create at least 100 new jobs. In addition, the draft Budget proposal for 2019 incorporated a 5% increase of the wages of teachers and nurses in kindergartens as of September 2019.

The study could be easily replicated in any country of the Region and could be adapted to specific needs and aspects of interest. Implementation of a similar study format would be an important milestone to be considered for action on care economy that will promote gender equality and high-quality employment.

**Contact**
Name: Ermira Lubani
Organisation: UN Women ECA RO
E-Mail: ermira.lubani@unwomen.org
SDG 8: IT Girls Bosnia and Herzegovina: Increasing participation of girls and women in the ICT sector

Summary
This case study will discuss efforts made in Bosnia and Herzegovina to provide girls with access to ICT skills and knowledge with a longer-term objective of increasing young women’s employment rates (specifically in the ICT sector). The case study explores inter-linkages of SDGs 8, 5 and 9, highlighting the importance of encouraging a new generation of women and girls in the ICT to tackle the major challenge of our time.

IT Girls is a pioneer initiative in Bosnia and Herzegovina, focusing on gender equality in the ICT sector by targeting adolescent girls, young women and successful women in ICT. The initiative is supported by three UN agencies in Bosnia and Herzegovina (UN Women, UNDP and UNICEF) and it is run by staff and volunteers from all three agencies.

IT Girls aims at increasing participation of women and girls in ICT through the following three areas:

1. Enabling girls to access technology and adopt new digital skills.
2. Awareness raising about the importance of increasing participation of girls and women in ICT.
3. Increasing economic opportunities for women through partnerships with the private sector.

Situation
In Bosnia and Herzegovina women pursue tertiary education more than men. In 2015, out of the total number of students studying in universities – 58% were women. Still, there were 3 times more men than women graduating from an ICT-related university programs. Women tend to study social sciences and humanities more which later makes them less competitive in the labour market. Labour market statistics for 2017 show that the unemployment rate for men in Bosnia and Herzegovina is 18.9%, while for women 23.1%. Bosnia and Herzegovina is one of the countries with the highest youth unemployment rate in the world. Young women’s (aged 15-24) unemployment rate is much higher than that of young men (51.4% and 43% respectively). In Bosnia and Herzegovina women make up 31.7% of all self-employed citizens, and 70% of all unpaid family workers. Labour force deficit in the ICT sector in 2018 was estimated to 6,000 immediately employable workers.

Strategy
IT Girls Initiative aims to provide for all girls and women equal access to technology and digital skills, as well as information and knowledge that will empower them to be proportionately represented in this field.

The Initiative aims at (i) providing girls as early as primary school with practical ICT skills through workshops and transforming the way computer science is taught in schools; (ii) giving women space for training and entrepreneurship in ICT and connecting their ideas with available resources; (iii) creating
a social environment free of (gender) stereotypes about technology, enabling women and girls to be proportionally represented in the field, while assuming women and girls are interested and inspired to take on new challenges and all stakeholders recognize the need to empower women and are willing to engage in doing so.

**Results and lessons learned**

During 2016-2018 IT Girls has achieved the following results:

- Over 190 girls aged 13-15 (including Roma girls and girls without parental care) took part in 13 face-to-face coding or robotics workshops in 8 different locations in Bosnia and Herzegovina.
- 380 girls and young women were reached through online coding challenges.
- Over 56 interviews of successful women in ICT in Bosnia and Herzegovina published and promoted on social media (www.itgirls.ba).
- Mobile-app idea competition to mark the International Girls in ICT Day with participation of 80 girls and young women from 7 locations. 18 girls went through mentorship to develop apps. 2 mobile apps developed by two teams of girls.
- In partnership with Bit Alliance (association of IT companies in BiH), first ever UN coordinated indiegogo crowdfunding campaign completed in November 2018, raising enough funds for 10 robotics workshops for girls in 10 different schools, reaching 150% of the set goal.

**Challenges and lessons learnt:**

- Socioeconomic disparities and belonging to a specific population group can influence access to technology. It is important to directly outreach to girls in their communities in order to increase their access.
- Direct engagement and commitment of the private sector is essential for adequate programming and sustainability of results.
- Cooperation with schools is one of the essentials, as many stereotypes can be found in school curriculum.

**Contact**

Name: Erma Mulabdic  
Organisation: UN Women CO Bosnia and Herzegovina  
E-Mail: erma.mulabdic@unwomen.org
SDG 8: Ensuring inclusive employment and decent work for all, especially for those in need

Summary

In 2016 Turkmenistan has introduced quota (2-5%) for all private and not private institutions on ensuring the availability of employment opportunities for the people from vulnerable groups (such as single parents, orphans, young specialists for the first time looking for job, people with disabilities and others). The quota just started it work but find positive feedback from the society and helps those in need. This initiative is started by the Government and now find support from the international organizations and private sector. However, efficiency of this policy has not been fully researched yet and Turkmenistan is interested to share his first steps in ensuring employment for all. Besides that, currently Turkmenistan is reviewing the experience of other countries on implementation of such quotas. This case study will introduce the main steps Turkmenistan has made to ensure decent work for all.

Situation

Turkmenistan is a country with transitional economy and forming market relations. Being the fourth country in the world in terms of natural gas reserves, Turkmenistan seeks to significantly expand its access to the international gas market in order to maximize the use of its natural resources. At the same time, work is under way in the country to diversify and restructure the economy, reducing its dependence on the export of natural gas and oil. The role of private sector is increasing and ensuring the production growth of domestic products for the import substitution and increasing the volume of exports of products manufactured in Turkmenistan. Thus, in agriculture, the percentage of the non-state sector is more than 92%, and in the whole economy (without the fuel and energy complex) - 68.5% (2017).

Considering that the private sector is expanding and creating a large number of working places, the government has adopted and is implementing a number of government programs aimed at: professional training and re-training of the personnel; providing necessary conditions for citizens with low competitiveness in the labor market (women, youth, and people with disabilities); stimulation of entrepreneurial activity of the population, etc.

One of such measures is the Decree (2016) regulating the quotas establishment (from 2 to 5 percent) to employers for the employment of citizens who especially need social protection. This group includes: single parents, large families, orphans, disabled persons, young specialists who are looking for work for the first time and others (Article 7. Law of Turkmenistan “On Employment of the Population”, 06/18/2016. Reference: minjust.gov.tm/ru/mmerkezi/doc_view.php?doc_id=15125)

In addition to that recently has been adopted the Concept of digital economy development in Turkmenistan for 2019-2025, which will have an influence on the structure of the labor market in many respects and require fundamentally new human resources, with opening up employment opportunities for everybody. These measures contribute the implementation of the SDGs, especially Target 8.5 – Target 8.5 by 2030 achieve full and productive employment and decent work for all.
Strategy

The transition to a market economy, and now the adoption of the Concept of a digital economy development in Turkmenistan, requires finding the most effective solutions to ensure the principle of “Leaving No One Behind!”

In the recent years the number of people looking for work in Turkmenistan are increasing. Labour and Employment Department of the Ministry of Labour and Social Protection of Population promotes improvement the situation on labour market and tries to coordinate supply and demand by forming a database on the availability of working places and registration of population who needs employment.

Currently, Ministry has created a website, where employers inform the public about vacancies. At the same time, job seekers can place their resumes. This helps to ensure sustainability of results and support to increase the level of employment of registered jobless people, for example: the Labor and Employment Department notes that in 2018 year among those who were registered 92.1% found a job. In addition, to ensure inclusive employment, a Decree (2016) regulating the quotas establishment (from 2 to 5 percent) to employers for the employment of citizens who especially need social protection, as well as a separate Plan to ensure the full realization of rights of disabled persons in field of labor and employment in Turkmenistan for 2017-2020 years was adopted.

This plan provides for the social and labor rehabilitation of disabled; expanding opportunities for self-employed and entrepreneurial activities of disabled persons, running their own business and provides for working with both the public and private sectors.

Ministry of Labor and Social Protection of Population holds informational meetings with state and private companies in all regions of the country to raise awareness of the creation of quotas for persons who especially need social protection to facilitate the implementation of the Plan.

A number of events were held jointly with UNDP to raise the awareness of the private sector about changes in labor legislation and the creation of quotas. For example, in 2017 an advocacy campaign has been conducted to pilot innovative way of mobilizing resources – crowdsourcing, that allowed to support individuals, who need social protection, mobilize resources for education and find employment. And in 2018, the first job fair for people with disabilities had been organized by UNDP, Union of entrepreneurs and industrialists of Turkmenistan and Ministry of Labor and social protection. http://orient.tm/en/2018/08/31/9753.html

To increase understanding of private sector about the regulations on establishing the quotas for the people who need social protection, a capacity building workshop has been conducted, where companies were familiarized with the measures taken by the Government of Turkmenistan to ensure inclusive employment. At the same time, master classes on how to prepare for the interview and develop the CV, were held for people who need of social protection, especially people with disabilities.
RESULTS AND LESSONS LEARNED

• The Decree regulating the quota establishment (from 2 to 5 percent) to employers for the employment of citizens who need social support is intended to increase inclusive employment. From the date of adoption of the quota to 5%, in 2018 year, the following progress was made in fulfilling this quota: out of the total number of employed persons, 2.2% were the people who need social support. Of all employed persons who need social support, people with disabilities were 6.0%, young professionals looking for work for the first time - 5.3%, single parents - 25.8%, persons with a low level of material security - 53.9%, persons affected by a radiation disaster - 0.3%.

• Ministry of labor and social protection created a website, where employers inform the public about vacancies. At the same time, job seekers can place their resumes.

• Thanks to an innovative investment attraction mechanism – crowdsourcing, more than 40 people who need social support, had the opportunity to receive secondary vocational education (Chart A, Distribution of persons who received secondary vocational education in regions of Turkmenistan) in such professions as: television and radio broadcasting, textile production, accounting, computer programming and others.

• More than 80 participants took part in the first job fair for people who need social support, which allowed them to find jobs among companies such as Coca-Cola Içecek, Bouygues Turkmen, Microsoft, CNPC branch in Turkmenistan, construction companies Aktam and Dünýädäne and other.

• In August 2017, the President of Turkmenistan adopted a resolution on the creation of an interdepartmental commission for the employment of young specialists in the country. According to the document, it is required to analyze the national legislation regulating the issues of providing young specialists with work, to carry out work to improve the regulatory legal acts in this area, to modernize the domestic system of staff training.

• Under the Ministry of Finance and Economy was created the Department on strategic and sustainable development, that serves as a platform for interagency cooperation and allows to engage the private sector and public organizations to effectively monitor the implementation of the SDG objectives, including SDG 8.
• Capacity is developed of the state enterprises on Decree about quotas implementation, and
couragement of the national and regional initiatives on partnership with the private sector
increases the awareness and corporate responsibility in respect of inclusive employment.

CHALLENGES

• Form on monitoring quotas implementation needs further elaboration. Studying the
international experience for creation of the effective mechanism for measurement of progress
of quota performance is required.
• Low private sector awareness of the opportunities and potential of people who need of social
support impedes inclusive employment.
• According to the data from the Ministry of Labot and social protection among those registered
as unemployed in 2018 - 59.9% had a general secondary and post-primary education, that is,
they lack professional training, which limits the choice of occupations in employment and
decline their opportunities to find decent job.
• High level of professional requirements also reduces the chances of employment, especially
among graduates of educational institutions, first-time job seekers and people with disabilities.

LESSONS LEARNED

• Program on improvement of jobs providing system of and creating new jobs for 2015-2020 and
the Plan for its implementation stimulates the entrepreneurial activity of the population,
including by creation of additional jobs in the field of small and medium-sized businesses.
• For the full implementation of the program, it is proposed to conduct an analysis of the labour
market to identify the private sector’s staffing needs, this will ensure the improvement of the
qualitative characteristic of the personnel potential by upgrading the system of training,
retraining, and advanced training of personnel; providing the necessary conditions for citizens
with low competitiveness in the labour market.
• There is a need to further enhance institutional capacity and improve the involvement of the
private sector in the implementation of Agenda 2030 and SDG 8, in particular.

CONCRETE EXPERIENCE COULD BE REPLICATED IN OTHER CONTEXTS

The specific steps taken may vary, depending on the country context and cultural differences, but in
general quota system shows their effectiveness and can be an example for other countries. The
measures taken cover various aspects of sustainable development and fulfilling SDG 8, allow also
achieving other goals, such as SDG 9,10,11,12 and 17. High government commitment to the
implementation of Agenda 2030 and active participation of all stakeholders (private sector, social
organizations and academic circles) will make a significant contribution and long-term results in
ensuring inclusive employment and adequate work with a focus on the most vulnerable groups.
Contact
Name: Mr. Silap Velbegov
Organisation: Ministry of Finance and economy of Turkmenistan
E-Mail: mft.int@online.tm
SDG 8: Joint work of ILO constituents in attaining the SDGs and addressing labour market challenges in Azerbaijan

**Summary**
- To develop capacities of constituents to design and implement policies, programmes and strategies in the realm of youth employment and formalization as the main SDGs accelerators in Azerbaijan.

- To provide policy advice to strengthen the analytical and reporting capacities of the government to identify the progress and gaps in areas related to the decent work agenda and SDG8.

- To support the Azerbaijani constituents to actively engage in collaborative mechanisms and partnerships with national and international actors to exchange knowledge and improve the coordination of the activities aimed at achieving the SDGs.

**Situation**
Azerbaijan has made significant progress in terms of human development and poverty reduction during the last few years. Due to inclusive growth strategies and balanced, coherent policy frameworks Azerbaijan recorded reduction in poverty from 48% in 2003 to 5% in 2014. However, the Azerbaijani economy remains highly dependent on the hydrocarbon sector. In order to address challenges arising from the economic crisis and reduced petroleum revenues, the Government has launched an ambitious programme to diversify and revitalise the Azerbaijani economy, focusing at implementing reforms in economic sectors such as agriculture, industry, tourism, infrastructure and ICT.

Applying efforts on agriculture, tourism, IT sectors, coupled with active policies aimed at formalization of employment, are core elements of new course of the Government, formulated and being implemented with the ILO support. Moreover, the government has prioritized formalization of employment to reduce informality in the non-oil sector in Azerbaijan. Diversification in Azerbaijan will therefore necessarily involve transformation of self-employment into formal and productive businesses, as well as addressing the significant occupational gender segregation that exists in the labour market.

Strategy

This work focuses on the implementation of actions aimed at strengthening the capacity of ILO constituents in Azerbaijan to support processes towards making significant progress in attaining the SDGs through the promotion of decent work and inclusive economic growth in rural and urban areas. It prioritises action on SDG accelerators, in particular youth employment and formalization.

This project contributes to the country’s efforts to advance towards the attainment of SDG targets 8.2 and 8.3.

Results and lessons learned

These (ongoing) interventions have so far led to the formulation of a comprehensive employment policy framework. Support was also provided for the development of Active Labour Market Policies targeting rural youth entrepreneurship and quality apprenticeships in urban areas. The implementation of two pilot programmes on wage subsidies for young jobseekers in Baku and another on subsidies to young entrepreneurs in rural areas, the latter covering 1,600 households, also resulted in the allocation in 2016 of US$4 million from the Presidential Reserve Fund for the institutionalization of a new national programme on entrepreneurship development. Since January 2018, the newly established Unemployment Insurance Fund has been providing support to about 7,500 self-employment projects per year. These interventions and measures have since been incorporated in the National Employment Strategy 2019–2030, which was developed with ILO support and is aligned with the SDGs.

Capacities of ILO constituents were strengthened to build better understanding of evidence-based justifications for new macroeconomic approaches. Better policy co-ordination resulted in a new role for the Ministry of Labour as co-lead of the Tripartite Commission working group on improving labour conditions in the informal economy, as established in June 2017 by a Presidential Decree. The Commission is chaired by the Vice Prime-Minister and consists of the ILO tripartite constituents and key stakeholders, including the Ministry of Finance and the Ministry of Taxation. In addition, as a result of a series of the ILO trainings for the national Public Employment Service, including in collaboration with UNDP, Labour market institutions have been strengthened in providing inclusive and innovative services to the population.

Contact

Name: Daniel Smith
Organisation: ILO
E-Mail: smithd@ilo.org
Summary
“Ukrainian Pact for Youth: 2020” is a joint innovative initiative of the Ministry of Youth and Sports, Center for Corporate Social Responsibility and UNFPA Ukraine that joins efforts of business, government and educational sector to create 700 partnerships between business and education and to provide 50,000 first employment and internship opportunities for young people in Ukraine by 2020. The initiative is being implemented in all regions of Ukraine, in big and small cities by the national NGO “Center of Corporate Social Responsibility” with technical and financial support from UNFPA Ukraine.

Situation
Ukraine’s labour market shows severe signs of non-inclusiveness. Employment indicators have recently worsened disproportionately for youth, women, and for rural residents. The unemployment rate for youth (15-29) reached a worrisome 22% in 2016. The 29% share of those not in education, employment, or training (NEET) among recent school-leavers aged 15-29—double the EU28 average—shows severe social strain, exacerbated further by the high incidence of informal employment and undeclared work. Ukraine “Mainstreaming, Acceleration and Policy Support” (MAPS) mission report identified Implementing a youth employment plan, transitioning to the formal economy as one of the key SDG accelerator for the country and in particularly recommend to foster the role of the private sector in creating decent jobs for young people and to enhance the employability of youth to improve their labour market prospects. This case study presents a solution to achieve Ukraine commitment towards SDG and particularly to SDG 8.

Strategy
“Ukrainian Pact for Youth: 2020” was launched as joint initiative to unite the efforts of the companies, government and education to contribute to employing young people. The Pact’s Goals until 2020 are: To create 700 partnerships between business and education sectors and to establish 50,000 new good quality places for apprenticeship, traineeships or entry level jobs for young women and man. In order to promote the Pact on regional level, advocate local business to join the pact, improve employability and create new employment opportunities for youth living in the regions UNFPA has launched Regional forum “Business-Youth: WOW effect from cooperation” across the country.

Results and lessons learned
**Key Pact Results:**
- 123 companies, including local business from 15 cities joined the Pact;
- Over 32,000 internships/job places created and over 596 partnerships with educational institutions established provided mentorship to 1,700 young people.
- Over 150 employers and over 1000 young women and man benefited from master classes and training through WOW Forums;
- National Action Plan on Youth Employability (NAP) developed;
Lessons learned and future plans:

- An interest of companies to join and commit to the Pact results were underestimated.
- Pact requires virtual platform to manage it which already being established: http://careerhub.in.ua/;
- Need to enhance engagement of vulnerable and marginalised youth, particularly young people with disabilities;
- The Pact provides an excellent entry point for developing partnerships with private sector to enhance resilience and competitiveness of young people: removing gender stereotypes in education and employment/income generation choices, promotion of gender equality through engaging man in family and child care, prevention of GBV.

Contact
Name: Mr. Oleksandr Yarema, Deputy Minister, Ministry of Youth and Sports of Ukraine
Organisation: Deputy Minister, Ministry of Youth and Sports of Ukraine
E-Mail: o.yarema@gmail.com

Ms Olesia Kravchenko, Deputy Head of Department;
Organisation: Ministry of Youth and Sports of Ukraine
E-Mail: krav4enko2011@ukr.net

Mr. Taras Derkach,
Organisation: Canter of Corporate Social Responsibility Development, Ukraine
E-Mail: td@csr-ukraine.org
SDG 8: Digital and Entrepreneurial Skills of Rural Women in Serbia

**Summary**
UN Women partnered with a women’s CSO Equal Opportunities, with the aim to increase capacity of rural women for new digital economy, employment and self-employment. The goal of the project is to develop new digital knowledge, skills and competences of women in six rural areas across Serbia. Through this, unemployed and underemployed rural women, as a group facing multiple and intersecting forms of discrimination, are enabled to take equal part in the economy using ICT for entrepreneurial activities in agricultural production, access to information related to modern trends and innovations in organic agriculture and rural tourism and related business opportunities. Furthermore, active network is established between women from different rural areas to share ideas, experiences.

**Situation**
The rapid advancement of digital technologies is opening the development potential for women, bringing new social, political and economic opportunities. However, great number of women are very little or not at all included in this trend, especially women living in rural areas. Therefore, it is of outmost importance to foster girls’ and women’s acquisition of digital skills to enable their participation in today’s digital society on an equal basis, as digital technologies can significantly improve women’s capabilities to join the labour market and initiate entrepreneurship.

**Strategy**
In order to build and improve the digital and entrepreneurial skills of rural women and girls, Equal Opportunities have partnered with six local self-governances across Serbia to jointly organize and implement comprehensive 5-day capacity development programme for women in six selected rural areas in different regions of Serbia. Furthermore, this partnership includes advocacy for better integration of rural women’s rights in programmes, policies and budgets of local self-governances. Equal Opportunities will establish and maintain a network of supported women, to strengthen further their employability through peer exchanges of experiences and entrepreneurial ideas.

**Results and lessons learned**
**Results:**
- 120 women from rural areas have increased their ICT skills and are empowered to use digital technologies for business purposes, during 5-day capacity development programmes;
- Women were inspired to create entrepreneurial ideas, develop business models and put them in practice;
- Networking of women for sharing ideas and experiences and liaise closely with women in same business segments from different regions.

**Challenges:**
- Low level of ICT skills among women in rural areas;
- Not enough time for self-development;
• In general, this kind of support is not budgeted at the local level.

Lessons learned:
• Women have enormous potential to contribute to economy that need to be stimulated and supported by local and national government, business and non-government sectors and society as a whole.
• Targeted programmes or budget lines for supporting rural women entrepreneurial ideas should be established at the national and local levels.

This experience can be easily replicated in other regions of Serbia, and in different contexts.

Contact
Name: Natasa Gospic
Organisation: Equal Opportunities
E-Mail: n.gospic@gmail.com
SDG 8: Happy Tosti: A joyful workplace for everyone with a labour disability

Summary
Happy Tosti is a restaurant company, serving high-quality and organic products to create an extensive menu, from ham cheese to choco-banana sandwiches. Happy Tosti is a responsible and happy place, where we hire staff with labour limitation and disabilities.

Our dream is to provide an educational, enjoyable and paid workplace, bringing out the best results in each one of our staff, with or without disabilities.

Currently, Happy Tosti employs around 75 persons with disabilities. We already had an outflow of 25 people to a new labour market.

Situation
Happy Tosti is a 100% commercial restaurant, serving tasty sandwiches throughout the Netherlands in The Hague, Amsterdam, Breda, Delft, Hoofddorp, Deventer and Leiden. More than 60% of all our working hours are reserved to employees with disabilities. We currently have 75 persons with disabilities hired in our restaurants.

We receive guidance from the UWV which stands for Employee Insurance Agency. It is a governmental institution and they provide expert and efficient implementation of employee insurance, such as the Unemployment Insurance Act, Sickness Benefits Act and more. We offer labor market and data services. This institution is connected to our employees and Actor Consultancy.

Strategy
Happy Tosti collaborates with Actor Consultancy job coaching. It means every Happy Tosti location has one job coach that helps employees. Job coaches support our staff, called the “Happy Heroes”, by guiding them on the work floor or with customers’ interactions. Most of the Happy Heroes have not been on the job market (e.g., left school, just graduated or unemployed) so we showcase real working conditions with working rules, vacations hours, the necessity to be on time and more. Our employees can learn new skills such as: coffee classes, product techniques, kitchen skills, language skills (mainly English) and communication skills.

Results and lessons learned
Our biggest lesson learned is that it is very difficult to make a fair connection between the help received from the government and the staff working for us. The policies are the same for everybody, but individuals have different needs at different moments. Policies need to be there for everybody, but result is not made with policies, but with individualised attention.
Contact
Name: Paulien Verburg
Organisation: Happy Tosti
E-Mail: communicatie@happytosti.nl
Summary
Since 2010, the Malta Federation of Organisations Persons with Disability (MFOPD) introduced professional Supported Employment (SE) in Malta. With the support of the President of the European Union of Supported Employment (EUSE), MFOPD established the Malta Association of Supported Employment (MASE). After raising awareness with the Government about the necessity of this service, the Minister for Social Solidarity decided to fund it. The programme in 2016 included persons with disabilities, prisoners, persons who experienced domestic violence, refugees, mental health, homeless persons, persons in the poverty bracket and persons who were illiterate. It reached over a thousand beneficiaries. 520 beneficiaries were successful in open employment.

Situation
The official number of unemployed persons as at September 2018 is 9,065, 398 of whom are persons with disabilities. Vulnerable persons find it hard to find a job for various reasons: illiteracy, lack of knowledge about job seeking and required skills, disability, mental health, language barrier. Also, persons benefitting from social services prefer to remain unemployed due to minimal difference between salary and benefits. Vulnerable persons wanting to work register with Jobsplus which is a State entity. Quoting Jobsplus own website, its mission stands as: “to enhance accessibility to the labour market through modernised and targeted services, whilst facilitating labour mobility and promoting investment in human capital”. Persons with disabilities must register with both Jobsplus and the Lino Spiteri Foundation, which in itself is a Public Social Partnership between Jobsplus and Empower Coop Ltd. This partnership is funded partially from penalties of firms who fail to hire 2% of workers with disabilities, which is the legal quota for the hiring of persons with disabilities in workplaces.

Strategy
MFOPD was advised by the President of the European Union of Supported Employment (EUSE) to establish MASE as a separate association focusing on Supported Employment for vulnerable persons. This strategy benefitted the newly established Association in terms of direct links with EUSE, and therefore being kept continuously updated with new concepts and good practices. Over time, MASE gained knowledge, training and expertise both locally and abroad. However, there was limited funding for the implementation of the Supported Employment Programme by the Maltese Government and the programme was discontinued at the end of 2016.

Results and lessons learned
Discussions about Professional Supported Employment with the Maltese Government started back in 2010 by MFOPD supported by the President of the European Union of Supported Employment. At the time, there was little understanding by the Government of the necessity to ensure the inclusion of persons with disabilities on the labour market. The then Employment Training Centre (now Jobsplus) was responsible for a department catering solely for persons with disabilities, but it wasn’t
functioning well. A 6-month pilot project proved the efficiency of MFOPD/MASE in the field. It led to a funded national programme (2016) which nearly doubled the State forecasted number of secured employments. In one year, we enabled the 345 vulnerable persons as well as 181 persons with disabilities to work. This had an incredible positive and sustainable impact on the lives of the participants in this programme.

Contact
Name: Ms Marthese Mugliette
Organisation: Malta Federation of Organisations Persons with Disability
E-Mail: info@mfopd.org

Name: Dr Marion Steff
Organisation: European Disability Forum
E-Mail: marion.steff@edf-feph.org
SDG 8: Active Labour Market Policy - Care for Elderly as a Chance for Long-Term Unemployed

Summary
In Croatia, the percentage of older than 65 is over 18% and 8.5% of unemployed (61.1% are women). As the proportions of people who become dependent and of long-term unemployed are increasing, the Ministry of Labour and Pension System started the “Wanted - Women's Employment Programme”. Provided together with the Croatian Employment Service, under Active Labour Market Policy, the programme is in line with European and national recommendations on improving the position of women in the labour market and in line with the employment policy guidelines of the EU Member States focused on promoting social inclusion and combating poverty.

Situation
The trend of population aging, lack of support for health care and social inclusion of elderly and long-term unemployment in Croatia is common challenge for the all society, particularly in rural areas and islands. The 19.8% of population is older than 65, and during the year 2018 in the active labour market policy programmes, there were 36,935 new entrants. Programme "Wanted" is the largest programme provided by the Croatian Ministry of Labour and Pension System and funded by the European Social Fund. It is planned, across the whole of Croatia, to employ over six and a half thousand women to care for over 35,000 older households and disadvantaged in their communities, through the local projects supporting people in need at their homes. Projects are implemented in hard-to-reach areas (rural areas and islands) and in those areas where the unemployment rate and long-term unemployment rate are higher than the Croatian average.

Strategy
This programme will contribute to the deinstitutionalisation of the care of Croatian older citizens due to the lack of capacity in rural areas and employment and integration of women, since June 2017 local and regional self-government units and non-profit organizations applied for the programme with their projects. The call is conducted for up to 30 months, intended for employment of disadvantaged women in the labour market, focusing on women over the age of 50, women with the most completed secondary education, women with disabilities, women victims of trafficking, drug addicts, women victims of domestic violence, homelessness.
Results and lessons learned
Till now over five and a half thousand women are employed (out of six and a half planned)
- Everyone has the possibility of additional education and training- becoming home care worker/home care assistant (in Croatia named geronto-host or geronto-housekeeper)
- They are fitted out to provide material conditions for carrying out support to the elderly and disadvantaged in the local community: procurement of hygiene supplies, supplies for the maintenance of households for whom they care
- They become more employable and competitive on the labour market
- The programme has the role of public advocacy to influence policymakers

Contact
Name: Professor Jadranka Mustajbegovic, MD, PhD
Organisation: WHO CC for Occupational Health, Rockefellerova 4, Zagreb, Croatia
E-Mail: jmustajb@gmail.com
SDG 10: Reduced Inequalities

Round table: Bridging the gap: achieving greater income and economic equality

- Achieving Economic Equality Through Remittances modality in Moldova
  Moldova
- Supporting rural livelihoods by bridging the gap between policy and community level in Georgia
  Georgia*
- Empowering rural women in the Kyrgyz Republic
  Kyrgyz Republic
- Social Protection and Safety Nets for Enhanced Food Security and Nutrition in Armenia, Kyrgyz
  Tajikistan
  Armenia, Kyrgyz Republic and Tajikistan*
- Regional disparities and income inequalities in Kazakhstan
  Whiteshield Partners, Kazakhstan
- Stringent realities of the economic inequalities in urban Moldova
  Moldova
- Measuring SDG Indicator 10.1.1 and monitoring of income and expenditure growth of the
  bottom 40% in Serbia
  Serbia*

Round table: Towards a world of equal opportunity: tackling inequality caused by exclusion and discrimination

- Comprehensive policy response to Gender Based Violence prevention and services in Tajikistan
  Tajikistan*
- Amplifying the voices of women with disabilities in Ukraine
  Ukraine
- Tackling Inequality through Social Cohesion in Turkey
  Turkey*
- Improving social inclusion of young Roma in Serbia through UN Community Volunteers modality
  Serbia*
- Economic and personal well-being improvement of marginalized Roma women in North
  Macedonia through social enterprise creation “Care+”
  Health Education and Research Association, North Macedonia
- Comprehensive approach to addressing skewed sex-at-birth ratio (SRB) in Armenia
  Armenia*
- Men’s Sheds: Learning Through Empathy
  Ireland*

*Note: Case studies that will be presented during the Round Table discussions
SDG 10: Achieving Economic Equality Through Remittances modality in Moldova

Summary
- The **PARE 1+1** Programme uses remittances to stimulate Moldova’s economy by financing businesses in rural areas - particularly those who are hindered by access to financial services.
- Moldova’s expatriates are mobilised to support Moldova’s sustainable economic development, especially in rural areas with limited access to financial and informational resources; that witness low level of entrepreneurial and financial education; have huge number of emigrants; where there is a low level of start-up survival, etc.
- Today, the programme is run by the government of Moldova. Given its success (see below), it will be expanded to other groups in turn contributing to reducing even further the income and economic inequality between *inter alia* rural and urban communities.

Situation
- The population of Moldova is estimated at 3.55M persons, and has continued to be faced with mass emigration - as high as 25% of its population according to some estimates
- As many as 1M Moldovans live abroad with the Russian Federation and Italy as top destinations
- Remittances are valued at +20% of Moldova’s GDP - raking it in the top 10 countries worldwide
- Recognising the challenge of large emigration, but also the opportunities and benefits that can be reaped therefrom, PARE 1+1 was established, and is an exemplary initiative of how migration contributes to bridging the gap to achieve greater income and economic equalities.

Strategy
- With high emigration that hamper development, and considerable remittances which may contribute to economic development and equality, IOM and the Government of Moldova designed PARE 1 + 1 to incentivize expatriates to contribute to sustainable, productive and income generating activities particularly in rural areas, targeting also disadvantages communities.
- Today, the Government of Moldova is running PARE 1-1 and together with IOM the programme will develop even further to reach more beneficiaries
- IOM suggests inviting the Government of Moldova to present PARE 1+1, - highlighting also that 30% of beneficiaries are women.

Results and lessons learned
- Since the inception of PARE 1+1, 1,246 enterprises have been funded;
- Grants amount to 242.4M Leu ($±60M), attracting investments for 767.7M Leu ($±185M);
- The programme helped open 538 new businesses - mostly in rural area - creating 3200 jobs;
- 1,975 people have been trained on topics related to SME establishment and development;
- 48% of entrepreneurs are under 35 years old, and ±30 percent are women.
The programme facilitates access to finance to disadvantaged groups while contributing to the economic development of the Republic of Moldova.

Contact
Name: Amr TAHA
Organisation: International Organization for Migration (IOM)
E-Mail: ataha@iom.int
SDG 10: Supporting rural livelihoods by bridging the gap between policy and community level in Georgia

Summary
The case study demonstrates the work done in Georgia on agricultural and rural development both at policy level and at community level through supporting the formulation of the national Rural Development Strategy as well as implementing rural development pilot projects in selected communities through small-scale investments. This integrated approach to rural development aims at increasing agricultural productivity and supporting income diversification on-farm and off-farm, as well as improving the quality of life in rural areas. The results presented here were implemented with the technical support of FAO funded by EU ENPARD programme as well as by Austrian Development Agency.

Situation
Nearly 43 percent of Georgia's population lives in rural areas. Rural populations are particularly affected by poverty due to fewer employment opportunities and weaker social protection systems than urban residents, especially those working informally in agriculture. The relative poverty in Georgia in 2017 was 22.3 percent. Rural poverty was 29.6 percent, while urban poverty was 17 percent (GEOSTAT, 2017). During the recent 10 years, disparity between urban and rural areas is increasing. The unemployment rate was 13.9 percent in 2017 (15% man and 12.7% woman). In rural areas low-intensity subsistence farming provides the principal source of livelihood for self-employed people engaged in agriculture. Hence, there is a strong consensus in Georgia among the Government, the international community and private businesses that agricultural and rural development offers investment opportunities and is essential for the development of the country, and particularly for employment, growth, poverty reduction, income diversification and food security.

Strategy
Supporting smallholders to achieve greater income growth and socio-economic inclusion through enhancing rural development has become one of the main objectives based on the priorities of the Strategy for Agricultural Development in Georgia 2015-2020 and the Rural Development Strategy of Georgia 2017-2020. One of the examples is the local rural development activities implemented in high mountainous areas characterized with high outward migration, where value chain development, small-scale processing as well as rural tourism were supported through small-scale investments. Additional support was provided to improve the livelihoods of the most vulnerable groups of Internally Displaced People (IDP), namely single parents with minors, households with members with disabilities, and households led by youths and the elderly.
Results and lessons learned
In 2016 the Government of Georgia adopted its first ever Rural Development Strategy (2017-2020), where Ministry of Environmental Protection and Agriculture has the coordinating role among the ministries. This was followed by small-scale investment projects on income diversification in selected rural areas. This comprehensive approach of shaping and implementing rural development policy enables to bridge the gap between top-down and bottom-up approaches, and enhance a well-informed and consistent policy making process, which is built on lessons learnt at all administrative level. The experience in local rural development is planned to be replicated in a recently launched project.

Contact
Name:
Organisation:
E-Mail:
SDG 10: Empowering rural women in the Kyrgyz Republic

Summary
The purpose of this case study is to demonstrate the work done in Kyrgyzstan to overcome inequalities, by addressing the needs of rural women, by increasing their income in agricultural productivity, and ensuring better livelihoods and food security for them and their families. The practical solution included comprehensive approach that focused on rural women economic empowerment, but complemented it by efforts to enhance their leadership and participation, in in their communities, in rural institutions but also in shaping laws, polices and systems of service provision at local and central levels. The bulk of the work has been implemented under the UN Joint Programme on Rural women economic empowerment, and other activities (FAO GAPo).

Situation
More than 64 percent of Kyrgyz women live in rural areas. They account for a significant proportion of the agricultural labour force, play a key role in food production – especially in subsistence farming – and perform most of the unpaid domestic, care and agricultural work in rural areas. In fact, more than 52 percent of women who work in agriculture do so as unpaid family members. At the same time, fewer than 18 percent of Kyrgyz women head their own farms, and many rural women and girls have restricted access to productive resources such as land, agricultural inputs, finance and credit, extension services, and technology. This limits not only the enjoyment of their rights and of decent livelihoods, but also limits their productivity, and in turn the efficiency of the agricultural sector. This is why this programme targets rural women, especially those who are the most vulnerable, unemployed and without opportunities to earn an income from agricultural activities.

Strategy
The strategy is to address the needs of the neediest rural women from the households in remote areas by aiming primarily increasing their incomes sustainably. Rural women, but also men, are provided with access to knowledge, technologies and agricultural skills to enable them to start new activities – plastic greenhouses, vegetable seeds and fertilizers, poultry and improved fruit and vegetable processing. Rural women have been also receiving training in leadership skills to strengthen their agencies, improve workload distribution and contribute to decision-making at their households and communities for better livelihoods.

Results and lessons learned
Since 2014-2015, thousands of women have been trained (5 000) and improved the livelihoods of their families. Many women reported that as a result of the programme, they learned skills, started earning higher incomes, improved nutrition of their families and stopped considering migration to other areas and countries as a solution. The work underlined the importance of paying particular attention to the disadvantaged women living below the national poverty line, being single parent, having 3 and more children or disabled children, and women facing other forms of discrimination. The work also underlined the need for a more gender responsive policy environment which is a key for the economic empowerment of rural women but also for overcoming all types of inequalities.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Name: Darya Alekseeva</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organisation: FAO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E-Mail: <a href="mailto:darya.alekseeva@fao.org">darya.alekseeva@fao.org</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Summary
Social protection is recognized as an effective tool to improve human welfare and well-being by governments in the Europe and Central Asia region, as reflected in the comprehensive social protection systems in place. Yet food insecurity and malnutrition are still current issues in Armenia, the Kyrgyz Republic and Tajikistan, while the prevalence of undernourishment is particularly alarming in Tajikistan. Recent studies and experiences offer insights on how to enhance the contribution of social protection systems to food security and nutrition in the Central Asia region.

### Situation
The populations of Armenia, the Kyrgyz Republic and Tajikistan are affected by the double burden of malnutrition due to poverty, low nutrition awareness and food import dependency. Poverty affects approximately one third of the population in all three countries and contributes to malnutrition through undermining households’ economic access to food. Certain population groups, such as rural populations and women and girls have a higher risk of being poor and food insecure.

After the collapse of the Soviet Union, Armenia, the Kyrgyz Republic and Tajikistan inherited social policy frameworks including social insurance systems and at least one kind of social assistance programme targeted at poor and vulnerable groups. School feeding programmes in all three countries are increasingly being integrated into social protection systems and are yielding positive returns in poverty reduction, nutrition and human capital accumulation. Yet the performance of social protection programmes remains mixed. Remittances from migrant family members provide an important informal safety net.

### Strategy
Social insurance, especially old-age pensions, contributes substantially to poverty reduction in all three countries, while social assistance is characterized by low coverage and adequacy, particularly in Tajikistan and the Kyrgyz Republic. Although all governments direct considerable shares of their budgets towards social protection, social assistance programmes are relatively underfunded.

Despite the comprehensiveness of social protection systems, gaps in shock-responsive safety nets, promotive measures or programmes that consider the specific needs of vulnerable populations, remain. Nutrition-sensitive approaches are embedded in programmes such as school feeding run with WFP assistance, but are yet to be strongly integrated in government-run safety nets.
Results and lessons learned

Recent studies by WFP in collaboration with IFPRI and Maastricht University highlight lessons on how to enhance the contribution of social protection systems to food security and nutrition in the CIS region.\textsuperscript{10}

Comprehensive safety nets are required to break the cycle of hunger and poverty, reduce inequalities and achieve the SDGs. The most pressing challenge is to increase coverage and transfer adequacy and improve targeting effectiveness. Further improvement to the design of existing policies is possible and advisable, for instance with the incorporation of appropriate graduation objectives as a mid-term goal. Governments can be assisted to develop normative frameworks based on agreed-upon standards for promotive social protection programmes.

The financing of social protection remains a key obstacle in scaling up programmes and addressing gaps. Fiscal space may be sustainably created by reallocating spending from other government sectors, increasing tax revenues or expanding social insurance coverage and contributions.

A common understanding of minimum standards must underpin the establishment of social protection systems that address the specific vulnerabilities of populations in the region. Policy dialogue should be fostered around the development of a set of minimum standards for social protection, food security and nutrition.

Contact

Name: Muriel Calo
Organisation: UN World Food Programme, Regional Bureau Cairo
E-Mail: muriel.calo@wfp.org

\textsuperscript{10} These include a 2018 IFPRI-WFP study on school feeding and poverty reduction in Armenia and a 2018 Maastricht University-WFP set of scoping studies on social protection for food security and nutrition in Armenia, Kyrgyz Republic and Tajikistan.
Summary
Kazakhstan’s strong overall human development performance over the last fifteen years hides a more uneven performance at the regional level in terms of capabilities, human development and sustainable development. Among other challenges, Kazakhstan faces issues with regional income inequality. Although GRP per capita has grown rapidly over the last decade in all of Kazakhstan’s regions, the regional disparities continue to be striking.

Situation
Despite Kazakhstan’s strong overall human development performance over the last fifteen years, social and regional disparities had widened, and Kazakhstan faces issues with regional variations of income inequality. While measuring inequality in terms of GRP per capita and GRP per capita growth, Kazakhstan has different clusters of regions. Despite positive dynamics of GRP per capita and personal income growth across the regions, it was notably advantageous for bottom 40% only in Astana, Pavlodar and Almaty region, but not in the remaining regions.

On the other hand, while GDP per capita and GDP per capita growth provide an indication of differences in wealth creation between regions, they do not measure inequality within regions. Analysis of GINI index for the regions of Kazakhstan shows that rapidly growing economies typically generate higher levels of inequality in the short term.

Strategy
While GDP per capita and GDP per capita growth provide an indication of differences in wealth creation between regions, they do not measure inequality within regions. Therefore, the report also employs regional GINI index to measure inequality.

Another way to measure income inequality is to consider the share of population below subsistence level on the regional level. South Kazakhstan had 15 times the level of population under the subsistence level compared to the city of Astana (6.1% vs. 0.4%). All these different measures of inequality in Kazakhstan highlight existing strong discrepancies between regions.

Results and lessons learned
- Kazakhstan’s HDI value of 0.788 in 2014 placed the country in the high human development category and ahead of the average for peers in Europe and Central Asia, however HDI value falls to 0.694 when it is discounted for inequality (primarily due to its income component).
- Analysis of GINI index for the regions of Kazakhstan support the empirical evidence that rapidly growing economies typically generate higher levels of inequality in the short term.
• The regions with high levels of inequality were also among the poorest in the country. Further analysis should be conducted to pinpoint the sources of growth in these regions and why it is not trickling down to the broader population.

• Strong discrepancies between regions could be addressed through targeted policies such as income supplements, sustainable and smart urbanization and a more progressive tax policy.

Contact
Name: Fadi Farra / Nadia Klos / Georgy Kalashnov
Organisation: Whiteshield Partners
E-Mail: [to be inserted]
SDG 10: Stringent realities of the economic inequalities in urban Moldova

**Summary**
The objective of the study is to analyze the situation regarding different forms of inequality persisting in urban Moldova, with a special focus on its capital, Chisinau city. The study presents different aspects of inequality: monetary and non-monetary ones, particularly taking the analysis of incomes and expenditures, insufficiency of incomes being recognized as the main factor inducing inequality in the capital city. The life in Chisinau implies higher living costs compared to other localities in Moldova. The study shows that the work renumeration is under the population’s expectations and does not always cover the basic needs of a family. Food expenditures in case of the poor population exceed half of their incomes, while payment for utility services accounts for one fifth of total disposable incomes. Hence the poor population from Chisinau is covering its needs in the detriment of other goods and services, thus increasing inequality in accessing other services such as education, healthcare, etc.

**Situation**
In the context of continuous decrease of population in Republic of Moldova, the population in Chisinau municipality, as well as in Chisinau city, is continuously increasing. In this regard, the rise of population in Chisinau is in line with urbanization trends at the global level. The challenges encountered by the capital city are limited possibilities to create decent and well-paid jobs, lack of funds for provision of qualitative basic services, limited access to adequate housing, infrastructure of low quality – and all these lead to social-economic inequalities between different groups of capital city inhabitants.

The economic inequalities in urban Moldova is evidenced not only through unequal disposable incomes of the population, but also through disparities encountered when accessing goods and services (non-incomes inequality). Inequality is generated by number of factors which correlate substantially with the opportunities of gaining incomes, as well as with access to goods and services, which ensure social equity.

The main factors generating inequality mentioned by respondents of the study are:
- Human capital: the unequal opportunities to obtain incomes derive from capacities of the persons and the human capital the society has
- Social capital: in the form of social cohesion, which is expressed though the support of family and the possibility to obtain some advantages through relatives and friends.
- Corruption: those who are placed in situation to offer money are disadvantaged and this leads to disparity in access to services
- Unequal business environment prevailed by “protectionism” policy in Moldova, where selective application of legislation to entrepreneurs as “protected” and disloyal competition makes difficult to manage a profitable business.
- Lack of dwelling space
• Social-economic instability: this prevents persons from high expenditure and using bank loans.

The statistical data complements the subjective perception data of the population about widening gap between rich and poor in urban areas. An income-based approach to poverty and inequality analysis reveals significant differences by areas of residence. Evolution dynamics of the average incomes per persons for 1st and 5th quintiles shows that the gap is wider in the urban area compared to rural one. The structure of income for 1st quintile shows that rather big share of the poor’s incomes derives from social benefits, mainly from pensions (~20% of average disposable incomes). The data shows that pensioners represent important share among the poorest. Consumption pattern also differs depending on the level of well-being. Food expenditures in case of the poor population exceed half of their incomes, while payment for utility services accounts for one fifth of total disposable incomes.

The differentiation in work remuneration in different social-economic sectors leads to discrepancies and inequality of opportunity in obtaining incomes. Inequality is also provoked by employment modalities. Informal employment without the work contract with no social risks’ insurance for employees has a considerable impact on generating economic inequalities.

**Strategy**

The method of quantitative analysis of data, as well as qualitative method – including group discussions with categories of vulnerable persons were used for carrying out the study. The quantitative analysis was based on existing statistical and administrative data, analytical reports and annual progress reports. The qualitative sociological study had a goal to survey inequality in Chisinau from the perspective of vulnerable categories (unemployed; persons with small incomes; young families with children without dwelling space). The qualitative study showed that the population consider that there is a persisting trend of deepening the gaps between different categories of population in Chisinau. The subjective perception of the population is confirmed by statistical data which determine a big gap between the poor and the rich in the urban area.

**Results and lessons learned**

The study pointed out the rather high inter-dependence in the Chisinau between the inequality of incomes and non-incomes, reflected through access to opportunities in in obtaining incomes in a volume that would ensure an adequate living for a family, access to education, health, recreation, access to dwelling, etc. Study identified needs and suggestion how to tackle them:

• The decrease of income-based inequality would reduce significantly other types of inequalities persisting in Chisinau (such as inequality in access to dwelling conditions, inequality in opportunity to obtain incomes, etc.).
• There is need to increase access to social security: formal employment ensure more adequate access to the pensions’ system and healthcare services.
• Reducing informal payments in accessing services is one of the preconditions which would diminish inequality.
• Access to dwelling and housing conditions deepens inequality between different groups of persons.
• There is need to improve infrastructure quality in the capital city (missing sewerage, inaccessible lighting, etc.)
• Improving infrastructure and provision of services in rural area would decrease the migration flow towards urban areas.

Contact
Name:
Organisation:
E-Mail:
SDG 10: Measuring SDG Indicator 10.1.1 and monitoring of income and expenditure growth of the bottom 40% in Serbia

**Summary**
The case-study deals with inequalities in income and income growth in Serbia as a part of the SDG agenda. A special focus is on the SDG 10.1.1 income growth indicator “Growth rates of household expenditure or income per capita among the bottom 40 per cent of the population and the total population”. The case-study explores the status of income inequality in Serbia using and comparing the results from two surveys – SILC (Survey on Income and Living Conditions) and HBS (Household Budget Survey). Trends in the SDG Indicator 10.1.1 differ depending on the data source (SILC or HBS) since different measure approach is being used (income or consumption). The significant discrepancies can be explained by methodological differences in SILC and HBS surveys, including different treatment of in-kind income and negative income in the respective surveys. The paper suggests that focusing on bottom 20 percent is even more essential for the country than bottom 40.

**Situation**
Trends in the SDG Indicator 10.1.1 differ depending on the data source (SILC or HBS) and the measure being used (income or consumption).

Inequality in Serbia worsens according to the SDG 10.1 indicator based on SILC data. According to the SILC survey, the living standard of the population in Serbia measured based on income is falling and in the period 2012-2015 real disposable income of the bottom 40% declined to a greater extent than for the total population. The deterioration of living standards is even more pronounced for the poorest quintile (bottom 20%) whose real income from 2012 to 2015 has declined at a rate of -5%.

However, the overall picture is different when the same SDG indicator is based on HBS data. In the period 2013 - 2016, both real incomes and consumption per capita of the bottom 40% grew slightly compared to the total population. The difference is more pronounced when based on the consumption data. Also, the real consumption of the poorest quintile (bottom 20%) increased most, at a rate of almost 4%.

**Strategy**
The discrepancy between income based on SILC and HBS in Serbia have been quite puzzling (such discrepancy is uncommon in the EU countries). The major difference lies in the 1st decile and 10th decile, while the difference is also obvious in other bottom deciles. The discrepancy in the 1st decile is enormous - 70% lower SILC income than income reported in the HBS, while in the 10th decile it is higher than HBS by 10%.
**Results and lessons learned**

Methodological specificities may explain why SILC data for Serbia report very low income of the poorest. There is no standardised procedure or methodological consistency regarding:

- treatment of negative income and outliers;
- treatment of values of goods produced for own consumption;
- the underestimation of the number of social assistance and child allowance beneficiaries in the SILC.

The cause of such high reported SILC income inequality lies within the unfavourable position of the poor population on the labour market. A large share of poor persons lives in households with low work intensity, while a high proportion of those who are working are in non-standard forms of employment (i.e., part-time, temporary, and self-employment arrangements), mostly in the informal sector. In addition, the low coverage of social transfers (particularly financial social assistance and child allowance benefits), and the very low level of progressivity of Serbian personal tax system explain the relatively modest (by international standards) redistributive role of direct taxes and social transfers.

The higher incomes among the poorest recorded in the HBS are largely due to different treatment of in-kind income and negative values that most commonly appear for income from agriculture and unregistered self-employment, which are in HBS changed to zero. In addition, the HBS gathers income data based on diaries kept by survey respondents during three-month periods, while the SILC survey requires respondents to recall and estimate their income during the previous year. Bearing in mind that the poorest in Serbia often generate intermittent and irregular (and informal) incomes, it is likely that the shorter time horizon increases the reliability of the HBS data.

Recently received UN inter-agency SDG mission to the country (MAPS) suggested the efforts in increasing the growth of bottom 40 percent population to be an SDG accelerator.

**Contact**

Name: Gordana Matkovic  
Organisation: Center for Social Policy (CSP)  
E-Mail: gordana.matkovic@csp.org.rs
SDG 10: Comprehensive policy response to Gender Based Violence prevention and services in Tajikistan

Summary
Within UNFPA Country programme, Country office focused on creating enabling environment for delivery of multi-sectoral services and address gender-based violence and discrimination in line with international human rights treaties obligations. This initiative is promoted through evidence based advocacy for strengthening the legislation system, technical assistance for policy and strategy development, capacity development for institutionalization and sustainability of the programme and introduction of innovative approaches in service delivery for better addressing gender inequalities and GBV response. International standards such as Essential Service Package and SOPs for health, policy and psycho-social services are in the process of adaptation by sectoral ministries.

Situation
Gender relations in Tajikistan are characterized by patriarchal attitudes and deep-rooted stereotypes, on the roles, responsibilities and identities of women and men. According to DHS 2017, 25% of married women age 15-49 were employed. The majority of employed women (71%) reported that they earn less than their husband. 42% of women age 15-49 report experiencing at least one problem in accessing health services. Getting money for treatment is the most commonly cited problem (35%). Less than half of married women age 15-49 have sole or joint decision making power in their own health care, major household purchases, and visits to her family or relatives. About 24% of women age 15-49 have ever experienced physical violence since age fifteen. 17% of women have experienced physical violence in 2016. 31% ever-married women age 15-49 have ever experienced spousal violence (physical, sexual, or emotional). 2% of women aged 15-49 have ever experienced sexual violence.

Strategy
UNFPA advocated strengthening the national policy and strategy for addressing GBV including The Law on “Prevention of domestic violence”. Law on the Reproductive Health and Rights (RHR) is also currently under review. This Policy commitment created environment for introduction of innovative programmes. UNFPA has initiated strengthening of health system response to GBV. More than 400 service providers are trained within new programmes. Victim Support Rooms are established in health facilities. This approach promoted multi-sectoral cooperation for addressing GBV. Innovative “Health Fairs” and “RH caravans” increased access of rural women and girls (more than 12000) to legal and health services.
Results and lessons learned

- Law on prevention of domestic violence and national strategies provide strong political foundation for addressing GBV. Recommended

- Victim Support Rooms institutionalized and being expanded to other regions. Recommended

- UNFPA/WAVE guidance is integrated into Reproductive health and Primary health care institutions. Recommended

- Multi-Sectoral Response to GBV is being successfully implemented at the sub-national level in Tajikistan

Multi-Sectoral Cooperation strengthened the referral system

Challenges and lessons learned:

- Persistence of discriminatory attitudes, social norms and cultural stereotypes are an issue in promoting gender equality

- Lack of single registration and reporting system of GBV cases.

- Demand creation is important in women and girl’s empowerment

Contact

Name: Nargis Rakhimova
Organisation: UNFPA CO Tajikistan
E-Mail: nrakhimova@unfpa.org
SDG 10: Amplifying the voices of women with disabilities in Ukraine

**Summary**
Ukraine ratified the key human rights treaties and adopted national policies and laws on human rights and gender equality. These are yet to be translated into practical action through national and local plans and budgets, which are not inclusive of the needs of women with disabilities. UN Women partnered with the National Assembly of People with Disabilities in building capacity of grass-root women to conduct a Gender Accessibility Audit in Kramatorsk city, conflict-affected Donetsk region. A group of women with disabilities and those having children with disabilities audited 8 institutions providing services of priority for them, assessing the gender-responsiveness and accessibility. The Audit findings informed their advocacy with authorities and resulted in higher municipal budget allocation to address the voiced needs.

**Situation**
In Ukraine about 2.6 million persons experience disability, with the estimated 178,265 living in conflict-affected region of Donetsk is. UN Women’s Vulnerability Analysis (VA)\(^{11}\) provided evidence of the intersectional discrimination faced by women with disabilities making them along with IDPs, older women, women living with HIV and others the most vulnerable. Inaccessibility of public buildings causes their social isolation, marginalization, and exclusion. Women with disabilities are restricted in exercising their basic human rights, participation in public life, employment and education. Limited understanding of gender perspective in addressing the disability issues and poor engagement with civil society, explains a lack of actions by the decision makers to address the particular needs of women with disabilities in local planning and budgeting.

**Strategy**
In 2017 to address the needs of women with disabilities and those having children with disabilities, UN Women partnered with the National Assembly of People with Disabilities and the grass-root women in piloting the Gender Accessibility Audit in Kramatorsk city\(^{12}\). The Audit identified infrastructure, information and communication barriers restricting access of women to public services, thus causing direct and indirect discrimination against women with disabilities. UN Women built capacities of women with disabilities in evidence-based advocacy and effective engagement with Kramatorsk city authorities. As a result, the 2018 municipal plan and budget integrated the measures and resources to address the gaps. Additionally, the same group of women advocated with the Ministry of Regional Development, Construction and Housing and Communal Services, which took their recommendations on board, as it developed the new state construction norms.

---


Results and lessons learned

Evidence-based advocacy by women with disabilities, based on the Gender Accessibility Audit (GAA) conducted with UN Women’s support, resulted in integration of concrete measures to address the needs of women in the municipal plan, supported by the budget. It also informed the decentralization reform policy making at the national level:

- At the local level, Kramatorsk City Council in the conflict-affected Donetsk Oblast, allocated UAH 8 million (USD 275,000) for infrastructure accessibility of public services through the Local Programme on Accessibility for 2018, which is a fourfold increase over 2017 allocations. In 2018 25% of the earmarked budget, was spent on eliminating barriers and increasing accessibility to public services for women and men with disabilities.
- At the national level, the Ministry of Regional Development of Ukraine took on board the GAA methodology in revising the state construction norms, resulting from the women’s advocacy.
- Based on the findings of the GAA 56 conflict-affected and IDP women with disabilities spearheaded the advocacy by submitting a Resolution to the Government. If integrated into the national and regional policies, their recommendations will further advance the rights of women with disabilities.

The National Assembly of People with Disabilities with UN Women technical support developed a Methodology and Toolkit on Gender Accessibility Audit, that provides practical recommendations on how to conduct the GAA with the direct participation of women and men with disabilities and may be further replicated in other contexts.

Contact
Name: Tetiana Shapkovska
Organisation: UN Women Ukraine Country Office
E-Mail: tetiana.shapkovska@unwomen.org
SDG 10: Tackling Inequality through Social Cohesion in Turkey

**Summary**
- Empirical evidence demonstrates that positive inter-group interactions prevents social tensions between host communities and out-groups (in this case, refugee and migrant communities) while contributing to Social Cohesion.
- IOM suggests inviting the Government of Turkey to present its ongoing Social Cohesion programme jointly implemented with IOM which promotes interaction between members of the different social groups, tackles inequality, prevents and preempts discrimination and eventual exclusion.
- The project targets men, women and youth taking into account gender considerations.

**Situation**
- Turkey’s Directorate General of Migration Management reports almost 4 million foreign nationals present in Turkish territory seeking international protection, including over 3.6 million Syrians under Temporary Protection, making Turkey host to the largest refugee population in the world.
- More than 96% of the above reside in host communities throughout Turkey, with data confirming that internal mobility of Syrians in Turkey towards larger cities with better employment opportunities occurs on a regular basis.
- In addition, over 850,000 foreign nationals are present in Turkey holding residency permits.
- The rapid expansion of migrant communities in Turkey has understandably resulted in challenges for integration and social cohesion, in the worst cases leading to discrimination, exclusion and social tensions between resident communities and out-groups.
- To tackle inequality caused by exclusion and discrimination and ensuring equal opportunities to both residents and out-groups, IOM and the Government of Turkey are implementing various initiatives which bring together the two groups.

**Strategy**
- Social cohesion activities aim to bring together members of host and migrant communities for short or medium-term activities in an atmosphere that promotes positive and friendly interaction between members of the different social groups. In supporting such activities, the expectation is that this interaction will have a positive impact on participants' perceptions and attitudes not only towards one another, but towards members of the out-group as a whole. Activities include:
  - Sports & Entertainment events and courses for youth
  - Cultural events and courses such as arts & crafts, and culinary programmes;
  - Cultural and social excursions such as sightseeing trips and picnics
  - Community festivals and celebration of important days;
  - Inter-group cooperation in the design and creation of public art.
Results and lessons learned

▪ IOM supported municipalities, particularly in south-east Turkey, in organizing inter-group social events; delivery of essential services such as language classes and information campaigns for thousands of host and migrant/refugee communities.

▪ An important lesson learned from these projects is that rigorous monitoring and evaluation of impact is required to understand the nuances of what an effective social cohesion activity can be.

▪ IOM’s social cohesion activities base themselves on inter-group contact theory, for which there is ample empirical evidence from studies spanning several decades that demonstrate the impact of positive inter-group interactions on people’s perceptions and behaviour toward out-groups. However, the research does demonstrate certain nuances (both in terms of who may be most impacted and what types of interaction are most impactful) and such studies have never been conducted in cases of large-scale immigration flows (either forced or voluntary).

Contact
Name: Amr Taha
Organisation: International Organization for Migration (IOM)
E-Mail: ataha@iom.int
SDG 10: Improving social inclusion of young Roma in Serbia through UN Community Volunteers modality

**Summary**

The main objective of the case study is to showcase how UNV programme’s UN Community Volunteer Modality, implemented for the first time in partnership with UNDP and UNHCR in Serbia, supported the development of skills and employment of 30 young Roma in local institutions to formulate, implement and monitor Roma inclusion policies at the local level.

**Situation**

Roma belong to the largest ethnic minority in the Republic of Serbia and are still among the most deprived communities, often facing discrimination, social exclusion and unequal access to employment, education, housing and health services.

The Government of the Republic of Serbia is intensifying the work of national and local institutions dealing with social inclusion of Roma, reducing their poverty and combating discrimination, as well as creating conditions for full access to human rights.

Through the pilot UN Community Volunteer Modality, UNV, UNDP and UNHCR were able to employ 30 young Roma women and men in local governments and other governmental or non-governmental institutions at the local level and improve their social inclusion. Initial employment was for duration of 6 months (from 1st of May till 31st of October 2018). After 6 months of employment, 19 out of 30 contracts were extended till the end of 2018. In the beginning of 2019, 15 out of 19 contracts have been further extended until the end of April 2019. Due to the success of this project, UNDP has announced a new call for applications for the new group of 15 UN Volunteers to be contracted from May 2019 for 6 months.

**Strategy**

The latest Regional Survey on socio-economic position of vulnerable Roma in the Western Balkans, commissioned by UNDP in 2017, with the support of EC and in cooperation with the World Bank, showed that the biggest challenge for social inclusion of Roma in Serbia are their high unemployment and inactivity rates. While the education aspect has improved for Roma, it is not resulting in their employment. With this evidence available, UNDP started searching for options to contribute to improved employment and expanding economic opportunities of young educated Roma. Given that there is very low percentage of Roma working in governmental institutions, this was yet another factor taken into account. The UNV UN Community Volunteer Modality proved to be appropriate for young Roma, and a possible flagship for expanding economic opportunities in the sub-region.
Results and lessons learned

30 selected young Roma, with the support of UNDP and UNHCR, became UN Community Volunteers and increased their knowledge on human rights, discrimination, legally invisible people, stateless persons, internally displaced persons and returnees; vulnerable group rights (access to social welfare, employment, education); functioning of mechanisms for social inclusion and Roma inclusion at the local level.

Selected UN Community Volunteers were deployed in 24 municipalities across Serbia to work in different institutions, such as the Ministry of Culture and Information, Provincial government in Vojvodina, local self-government units, health centres, and centres for social work as accountants, legal advisers, social workers, nurses, administrative workers and human resource advisers etc.

The project invested efforts in negotiating with the local stakeholders to maintain these young Roma and Roma IDPs employed beyond the completion of their engagement as UN Volunteers. So far, out of 30 Roma engaged through the project, continued employment has been already secured for 8 people.

Contact
Name:
Organisation:
E-Mail:
SDG 10: Economic and personal well-being improvement of marginalized Roma women in North Macedonia through social enterprise creation “Care+”

**Summary**
Being a Macedonian CSO working in the area of Roma health, particularly Sexual and Reproductive Health (SRH), helped HERA to identify the need of Roma women for their economic empowerment and inclusion into the labour market. Hera used social entrepreneurship as an innovative model for social inclusion promotion, resocialization and employment of marginalized communities, like Roma women. There is a lack of home care services for elderly people in Macedonia. This need matched with the primarily detected skills of Roma women as traditionally connected with their homes and taking care of the elderly in the family. Hence, certified training in palliative care was provided for the Roma women and a marketing strategy was developed for reaching out to the potential clients of ‘Care+’ social enterprise, where Roma women would work as professional care providers.

**Situation**
Despite all of the efforts over the years, poverty is still widely spread among Roma people in Macedonia. Roma are excluded (especially Roma women) from different aspects of social and economic life, including employment, housing and education. According to the data from the Employment Service Agency of the Republic of Macedonia 13,5% of all unemployed people in Skopje on 31.12.2018 are from Roma nationality and 49% of them are female. Also, there is an evident decrease in the number of active job seekers. The number of passive job seekers have a slight increase, which suggests that Roma are not registering in the Employment Agency in general either because of their possible mistrust in the institution to solve their unemployment problem, or because of the lack of information about the benefits of registering as an active job seekers.

**Strategy**
After carrying out market research and developing a business plan, it was time to start recruiting unemployed Roma women by making personal contact with their families. In this process we collaborated with Roma CSOs and activists. We then included them in the Program for palliative care licenced by the Ministry of Education which enabled their professional involvement in the ‘Care+’ enterprise. In addition, we kept on assisting them in developing various skills in order to improve their social and economic life. Offering a variety of services through ‘Care+’, tailored to the specific needs of each individual client proved to be a very useful approach.
Results and lessons learned
Since its establishment, ‘Care +’ social enterprise has accomplished the following outcomes:

- Full time employment of 2 Roma women and many others engaged occasionally
- Services provided to more than 30 clients,
- 19 Roma women trained and certified as professional care takers
- Increased interest among Roma women to be part of ‘Care +’

2018 was also a year with many challenges:

- To provide various trainings in order to improve the performance of the care givers;
- To highlight the qualities of the enterprise in comparison to similar services provided on the informal market;
- To gain trust and to remove negative stereotypes about Roma women.

The success of running a social business lies in having a highly motivated team prepared to provide the needed support for the marginalized communities engaged in the enterprise. Financial support is also crucial. For more information, visit: [https://www.facebook.com/negaplus/](https://www.facebook.com/negaplus/)

Contact
Name: Marija Angelovski
Organisation: HERA – Health Education and Research Association
E-Mail: marija.angelovski@hera.org.mk
SDG 10: Comprehensive approach to addressing skewed sex-at-birth ratio in Armenia

**Summary**
The sex-at-birth (SRB) ratio in Armenia decreased from 115 boys/100 girls (2013) to 110 boys/100 girls (2017). It was the result of seven years of intensive work of UNFPA Armenia Country Office and its partners to tackle prenatal sex selection, all the way from identification and thorough research, wide-scale advocacy and communications efforts and alliance building to focused technical support. The objective of the case study is to, based on the Armenian experience, help other countries that face a similar problem.

**Situation**
For a few years, UNFPA Armenia was screening official birth data from the National Statistical Service. It showed deviation from natural sex-at-birth ratio (SRB) (102-106 boys to 100 girls) from early 90s onwards, reaching a peak of 120 boys to 100 girls in 2000-2001 and then stabilizing around 115 boys to 100 girls in early 2010s.

UNFPA studies confirmed that prenatal sex selection existed in Armenia. They also uncovered a deep preference for boys - six times more than daughter preference. It was mainly explained by the necessity to continue the family tree, boys being the inheritors of the property, as well as more active role and higher social mobility of boys and men in the society. Continued skewed SRB rates would result in almost 93,000 “missing” women or gender gap by 2060. Skewed SRB ratio would have negative impact on marriage and may also be cause for further out-migration.

**Strategy**
- Identification and research: screening statistical data, two major studies including projections, analyses of international experience, expert conference and group meetings, supplementary analyses.

- Advocacy and communications campaign: series of advocacy meetings with stakeholder groups, wide media coverage, communications products and targeted awareness raising projects.

- Work with the Media: expert meetings for journalists, awards to promote GBSSS coverage.

- Targeting the roots: interactive theatre and puppet theatre plays, creation and promotion of Ne, the Girl Child, essay contest for fathers.

- Work with medical and social workers, priests, military conscripts including development of guidelines, awareness raising materials, and training.

- Large alliance-building and technical support.
Results and lessons learned

Results:
• The sex ratio at birth decreased
• The Government, parliament, ombudsman’s office, media, academia, medical workers, civil society, international organizations, church, and a large portion of the public are on board
• Armenia is successfully fulfilling its international obligations

Challenges:
• Risk of villainizing
• Abortions debate
• Seemingly conflicting human rights
• Social pressure
• Unresolved Nagorno-Karabakh conflict

Lessons learned:
• Research well
• Know the culture
• Stay away from the abortions debate
• Base on equal value of girls and boys
• Use facts and figures
• Ally with the media
• Ally with FBOs wisely and respectfully
• Be patient, keep repeating
• Youth are key

Contact
Name: Tsovinar Harutyunyan
Organisation: UNFPA Armenia
E-Mail: harutyunyan@unfpa.org
Summary
The purpose of this case study is to demonstrate that peer-led, informal learning environments with strong behind-the-scenes support can deliver positive, measurable outcomes for members of marginalized demographic target groups. We further wish to demonstrate the paramount importance of a sympathetic environment which encourages a sense of ownership and mutual trust amongst learners. Additionally, the case study of men’s sheds invites us to broaden the scope of the term “learning”, to arrive at a definition which values both the process and the outcome equally.

Situation
Men’s sheds are community spaces catering to men of all ages and backgrounds. Originating in Australia, where they were found to have a profoundly positive impact on community cohesion and individual wellbeing, men’s sheds swiftly spread to Ireland less than a decade ago. Ireland now has the greatest per-capita concentration of men’s sheds in the world, with over 450 sheds spread throughout all 32 of Ireland’s counties.

Sheds operate a schedule of activities entirely of their members’ choosing. These range from traditional male activities such as woodwork and engine repair, to painting, writing, poetry, gardening and community engagement projects. The Irish Men’s Sheds Association also operates a pioneering health-and-wellbeing initiative known as Sheds for Life.

According to Dr. Lucia Carragher’s study Men’s Sheds in Ireland: Learning through Community Contexts (Netwell Centre, 2013), over 90% of men who attend a men’s shed feel that doing so enhances their sense of wellbeing.

Strategy
The 2018 Men’s Shed Survey indicates that 42% of men’s sheds engage in formal educational activities categorised as “classes and talks”. While this percentage is impressive in and of itself, it obscures a much broader phenomenon within the men’s shed movement. The worldwide men’s shed movement’s motto is, “Men don’t talk face to face; they talk shoulder to shoulder”. This reflects the male propensity to engage on an emotional level in a practical, rather than a clinical, environment. The Irish Men’s Sheds Association applies this central insight to help support peer-based learning in the shed.

Results and lessons learned
- The learning environment is as crucial as the method and materials
- Peer learning works best where learners are encouraged to share skills drawn from their own life experiences
- The absence of pressure, compulsion and a rigid formal structure works well amongst older adults and those disenchanted with the classroom experience
• A strong, pre-existing sense of friendship and *esprit-de-corps* breaks down barriers and inhibitions, such as the fear of asking “stupid” questions
• Reciprocity is a vital component of a peer learning model; learners dearly prize the opportunity to both learn and teach at the same time

**Contact**
Name: Barry Sheridan
Organisation: Irish Men’s Sheds Association
E-Mail: barry@menssheds.ie
SDG13: Climate action

Round table: Acting for climate: stepping up climate change policies, action and awareness in the region

- Gender and Climate Change in Serbia
  Serbia*
- Strengthening climate action through access to international climate finance in Tajikistan
  Committee on Environmental Protection, Tajikistan*
- Implementing SDGs in the private sector with the Economy for the Common Good
  VAUDE, Germany*
- Local Institutions for Climate Action in Ukraine
  EcoClub, Ukraine*
- Water-Energy-Food nexus solutions in Aral Sea basin (Central Asia)
  University of Geneva, Switzerland
- Promotion of Low-Carbon Sustainable Lifestyles in Armenia
  Armenian Women for Health and Healthy Environment, Armenia
- Water and Sanitation Safety Planning Compendium in schools for inclusive and innovative water and wastewater solutions in the Balkan region
  Women engage for a common future, The Netherlands

Round table: Coping with climate change: strengthening resilience and adaptation

- The second French national adaptation plan (2018-2022)
  France*
- Montenegro’s DRR Strategy addressing resilience and adaptation
  Montenegro*
- Tackling the interrelationships between climate change, agriculture and health
  EASAC*
- Advancing on Climate Change Agenda - Accessing Climate Finance for Adaptation in the Food Security Sector in Tajikistan
  Tajikistan
- Strengthening climate change resilience and health adaptation through heat health action planning in Croatia
  Academy of Medical Sciences, Croatia*
- FLUMEN: Public-private cooperation to address resilience and adaptation to climate change
  Tecnofilm spa Compounds Termoplastici, Italy*
- Connecting climate change, disaster risk and sustainable finance
  E3G – Third Generation Environmentalism*

* Note: Case studies that will be presented during the Round Table discussions
Summary
On 20th of December 2018, François de Rugy, Minister of State, Minister for an Ecological and Inclusive Transition, launched the second French National Adaptation Plan for Climate Change (PNACC-2) for the period 2018-2022. Its objective is to implement the necessary actions to adapt the territories of mainland and overseas France to the anticipated regional climate change by 2050. The hypothesis adopted involves an increase in the global mean surface temperature of 2°C compared to the preindustrial era, even if France acts on the national and international level to limit this increase to 1.5°C.

Situation
In line with the latest assessment report from the IPCC published in 2014, several projects initiated under the first NAP have made it possible to specify the changes to be expected in the different French regions:

- a temperature increase higher than the global mean of 2°C, with heat waves becoming increasingly frequent and severe and extending beyond traditional summer periods; cold waves will be less severe and less frequent;
- more intense rainfall, even in areas where the annual amount of precipitation will decrease, increasing the risk of a rise in water levels and flooding; at the same time, droughts will become more frequent and severe with the water flows of rivers falling sharply, increasing pressure on the water resources and the risk of forest fires;
- warming of the ocean and an acceleration of the rate of sea level rise;
- an uncertain change in the frequency and severity of storms, except in tropical overseas regions where the severity of hurricanes is expected to increase.

Strategy
The second French NAP is the continuation of a long-standing adaptation process to increase the resilience of all stakeholders and started with France’s Adaptation strategy in 2006 and aims to foster increased resilience of all stakeholders. Following the assessment of the first French NAP, and in line with the Paris Agreement, the development of the PNACC-2 was based on a national consultation that mobilized for two years over 300 experts, representatives of civil society, local authorities and ministries concerned. The work was organized according to six clusters: Governance and Steering; Knowledge and Information; Prevention and resilience; Adaptation and Preservation of Natural Environments; Economic sectors; strengthening International Action.
Results and lessons learned

Over the course of a 12-month working period, the participants of the consultation met 3 or 4 times depending on the group. A seminar was an opportunity to gather participants from all the groups and allow them to collectively discuss the conclusions drawn by each group. 34 thematic sets of recommendations were finalized in this way, overseen by the group presidents. Not all the recommendations were the subject of a full consensus. In cases where groups were unable to reconcile diverging opinions on a given matter, this was reflected in the formulation of recommendations. The full sets of recommendations fed into the 2nd NAP.

Contact

**Name:** Marie Carrega, Deputy secretary general  
**Organisation:** National observatory on the effects of climate change / General directorate for energy and climate change / French Ministry for an ecological and solidary transition  
**E-Mail:**
SDG 13: Montenegro’s DRR Strategy addressing resilience and adaptation

Summary
Drafting of the National Strategy for DRR for Montenegro (MNE) included various competent state and local institutions, and as one of the most important – Ministry of Sustainable Development and Tourism which is in charge of implementing SDGs and Paris Agreement in MNE. Having said that, the Strategy for DRR in MNE directly address specific competences of the Ministry for Sustainable Development related to DRR field as well as activities which will be implemented in the following period with regard to resilience and adaptation. The most important ones include the following: - development of the Study on Natural Disasters and Man-made Disasters for the needs of the Spatial Plan of MNE; - preparation of the Spatial plan for MNE; - drafting of the Plan of General Regulation for the whole territory of MNE including all hazards endangering citizens and environment, which we never had before in the past; - drafting the Analysis of Seismic Risk as a part of the Plan of General Regulation of MNE; - preparation of the Law as well as National and Local Plans of Adaptation on Climate Change by 2020 etc.

Situation
The implementation of DRR-related activities in MNE are under the competence of Ministry of Interior (MoI) – Directorate for Emergency Management. Having said that, in accordance with responsibilities set by Sendai Framework for DRR and Road Map prepared by UNISDR for the period 2015-2030, MoI defined further steps to be taken in DRR field on the national and local level and initiated activities related to development of the National Strategy for DRR in December 2017, as the most important document in this area. Its integral part is the Action Plan for the implementation of the Strategy for the period 2018-2023 which for the first time included numerous activities of various national bodies and local government bodies encompassing three most burning fields – SDG, climate change and DRR. The whole Action Plan for 2018-2023 has 105 activities with the total of cca EUR 34 million.

Implementation of the Strategy is being carried through three two-year Action Plans. The first one was adopted by the Government of MNE in March 2018. The first two-year Action Plan has the total of 68 activities for 2018 and 2019 amounting to cca EUR 12 million. The Government adopted the Report on the implementation of the activities for 2018 and according to it the following was published: 21 activities have already been implemented, 15 activities are still in progress and 10 activities are not implemented (the total of 46 activities for the first two-year Action Plan).
Strategy

The process of drafting the National Strategy for DRR was initiated by assembling the core group of experts from various state institutions and bodies as well as from the local level who, in the domain of their competences prepared materials and activities related to DRR field to be included in the Strategy. Thus, we provided the pool of expert knowledge who directly was involved in preparation of the Strategy and planning of the most important activities through three two-year Action Plans. Upon receiving the initial draft of the Strategy for DRR, different ministers gave their opinion and at the last stage approved the material to be sent to the Government. The Government adopted the Strategy for DRR together with the Action Plans for 2018-2023 in December 2017.

Results and lessons learned

With the involvement of various experts from different ministries and institutions, we raised awareness of competent bodies on the importance of DRR activities and interlinkages of SDGs, climate change and DRR framework. We also attracted attention of decision-makers in this field at the national as well as local level and clearly defined their competences which was the biggest challenge at the beginning of the process. Lastly, through the reporting phase to the Government, Ministry of Interior created preconditions to palpably measure the success of the established cooperation and the process of implementation of planned activities within the Strategy.

Contact

**Name:** MSc Ljuban Tmušić Head of Department for Civil Protection and Humanitarian Aid Directorate for Emergency Management  
**Organisation:** Ministry of Interior of Montenegro
SDG 13: Gender and Climate Change in Serbia

**Summary**

Recognizing climate change as a threat to human rights and equalities – particularly gender equality, UN Women implemented an initiative to integrate gender perspective in specific resilience, adaptation, and mitigation measures. Thus, UN Women established strategic partnership with the Ministry of Environmental Protection of the Republic of Serbia, provided gender advisory services to Climate Smart Urban Development Project funded by GEF, built capacities of civil servants, representatives of CSOs and community groups to incorporate gender considerations into climate action, conducted a survey on Gender Patterns of Household Waste Management accompanied by a public awareness raising campaign reaching over 21,000 citizens, and initiated a strategic partnership with GCF. Furthermore, with UN Women support, the Republic of Serbia developed a first Voluntary Gender report to the UNFCCC.

**Situation**

The degree to which women and men are affected by climate change is interrelated with their social status, gender and access to and control over resources. Women’s unequal participation in decision-making processes and labour markets compound inequalities and often prevent women from fully contributing to combating climate change. However, in many countries women are being recognized as agents of change who make valuable contributions to climate change mitigation and adaptation efforts. In global climate policy and action, gender equality is gaining recognition. At the Climate Change Conference in Bonn (COP23), held in November 2017, Parties to UNFCCC adopted Decision 3/CP23 – Establishment of a gender action plan, under the Lima work programme on gender. In parallel, the Global Environment Facility, as a specialized global fund for climate change actions, requests that minimum of 5% of funds in each project must be dedicated to gender equality, gender mainstreaming and women’s empowerment, which until now has not been monitored nor enforced.

**Strategy**

UN Women mapped and developed strategic partnerships with government and academic institutions, local self-governments and CSOs that are working in the fields of climate change and/or gender mainstreaming. More specifically, UN Women provided expert knowledge on interlinkages of gender and climate change and importance of mainstreaming gender into climate policies and actions through developing gender criteria for specific projects, preparing knowledge products (e.g. brochures, training manuals, etc), building capacities of civil servants and representatives of CSOs and conducting specific innovative analysis and surveys (e.g. Research on Gender Patterns of Household Waste Management). Also, UN Women opted for a wide outreach campaign providing environment for intensive exchange of experience and transfer of knowledge with various stakeholders, to add gender perspective in their work and promote gender equality in their activities.
Results and lessons learned
As initiative results, civil servants, representatives of NGOs and community groups have increased knowledge and skills to incorporate gender perspective into climate actions. Additionally, the project ensured that the Ministry has a clear overview of existing practices of mainstreaming gender into climate policies, plans and actions, in line with respectful UNFCCC Decision 3/CP.23.
The initiative stressed the need for further identification of gender sensitive strategies in response to the needs of human security and environmental safety both in Serbia and in the region. This can be only achieved through partnership of different organisations and institutions, both national and international.

Contact
Names:
Milana Rikanovic, Gender Specialist /head of the office
Natalija Ostojic, Gender Mainstreaming Associate
Organisation: UN Women Serbia
E-Mail:
milana.rikanovic@unwomen.org
natalija.ostojic@unwomen.org
SDG 13: Strengthening climate action through access to international climate finance in Tajikistan

Summary
This case study aims at providing information on the mitigation efforts conducted by the Government of the Republic of Tajikistan (GoT), particularly those related to renewable energy and efficiency, considering the importance of additional sources of climate finance and technology transfer on the part of the international community as a tool to strengthen climate action and contributing to the Convention’s goal of preventing global warming of more than 2°C. The case study will also provide information on in-country coordination mechanisms and participatory processes facilitating capacity development processes at different levels to step up climate action.

Situation
The existing assessed contribution of the Republic of Tajikistan to global greenhouse gas emissions is less than 0.02%. However, the NDC of the Republic of Tajikistan with respect to the reduction of greenhouse gas emissions has determined a flexible target, not exceeding 80-90% of the 1990 level by 2030, which amounts to 1.7-2.2 tons in CO2 equivalent per capita, as the country’s contribution to anthropogenic GHG emission reductions. Particularly, the country is conducting important efforts to put in place the programmes, strategies and legislative instruments aimed at developing renewable sources of energy, energy saving and energy efficiency. It’s important to highlight that the country has made significant efforts to move from a high-emissions energy matrix including coal power into a very high share of hydro-power in the energy matrix (more than 90%); the GoT, through the Ministry of Energy has in this sense conducted efforts to strengthen energy security and overcome the energy crisis.

Strategy
To achieve the country’s NDC and enhance climate action, the Government of the Republic of Tajikistan has conducted important efforts to strengthen country ownership through the role of national institutions in the coordination of all climate action and the development of monitoring tools for climate change mitigation and climate finance. Particularly, Tajikistan has strengthened in-country multi-stakeholder coordination mechanisms, and has enhanced the role of the Committee on Environmental Protection as the entity leading climate action at the national level. Additionally, the country has clearly identified important gaps concerning monitoring, evaluation and reporting of the impact of climate change projects and is conducting important work to develop a detailed system to report on GHG emissions.
Results and lessons learned

- Monitoring and evaluation of activities & projects funded through CIF were conducted under PPCR, both at the national level and at the level of projects. In accordance with the CIF methodology, information on the contribution of the GoT to key sectors was presented annually (adopted strategies, programs, capacity building, national & international contributions to climate resilience).

- A Coordination Mechanism (CM) was established with the participation of key ministries, agencies, academia and public organizations where 30% of CM members were women. The main problem of the CM under the membership was the staff turnover in key ministries and agencies.

- A number of consultative meetings were held with representatives of key Ministries and Agencies on the obligations and opportunities of Tajikistan to reduce greenhouse gas emissions, adaptation measures and the use of renewable energy. Lessons learned under the PPCR are used as a tool to interact with the GCF.

- Currently, the creation of a national MRV system is being considered based on the country's obligations to the UNFCCC. As part of the creation of the MRV, it is necessary to develop regulatory documents to track national climate actions and the implementation of measures under the Paris Agreement and the NDC roadmap.

Contact
Name: Mr. Nasimjon Rajabov
Organisation: Committee on Environmental Protection of the Republic of Tajikistan
E-Mail: nasim.rajabov@gmail.com
SDG 13: Implementing SDGs in the private sector with the Economy for the Common Good

Summary
The Economy for the Common Good is a “New Sustainable Economic Model“ that started in 2010 in Europe upon the initiative of Austrian and German small and medium size enterprises. Its main tool, the so called “common good balance sheet“, has so far been implemented by more than 500 organizations – private businesses, cities, schools and universities. The common good balance sheet measures how a company fulfills fundamental values from human dignity to sustainability to participation. Hundreds of practical examples in the private sector have proven the positive impact of the instrument on implementing SDGs, e.g. acting for climate protection, fair distribution, safe and decent working conditions, and holistic well-being.

Situation
Today, the private sector presents both opportunities and risks to the achievement of the SDGs. Companies can contribute to more eco-efficient and climate-friendly economic products, services, and logistics; however, the private sector can also have the contrary effect. The same holds true for ensuring human rights, decent working conditions and leaving no one behind in a changing environment. Regular calls for corporate responsibility in these fields were limited by their voluntary approach. This gives a competitive advantage to companies that externalise costs and internalise benefits – in contradiction to the SDGs – whereas companies that externalise benefits and internalise costs – and thus promote the SDGs – suffer from competitive disadvantages. Intrinsic motivation to do good in all ethical aspects exists in all stakeholder groups: producers, consumers, investors. Yet the coexistence of voluntary good-doers and ethical free-riders does not have a sufficient effect on the overall system. A combination of a) increased transparency of good-doing, b) legal incentives for good deeds, and c) legal regulation against all types of abuses are needed to successfully implement SDGs in the private sector.

Strategy
Companies use the common good balance sheet to investigate how SDG-related negative social, economic and environmental impacts can be reduced, or positive impacts improved e.g. "Human Dignity in the supply chain; in the workplace and working environment", "Use of funds in relation to the environment", the company's "Contribution to the community", just to name a few. Companies reduce their ecological footprint and try to become CO₂ neutral. They pursue strategies of (eco-)efficiency, consistency (Polarstern/Munich provides 100% renewable electricity, neither from fossil nor nuclear sources) and sufficiency (companies advise their clients not to buy, on occasions – asking them if they really need what they consider to buy). The German VAUDE (542 employees) has a comprehensive SDG strategy based on the common good balance sheet, including a focus on decent work (SDG 8) and profound climate protection measures (SDG 13).
**Results and lessons learned**

According to a study by the University of Valencia conducted on 206 companies, businesses committed to ECG reported:

- reduced carbon footprint
- minimize ecological effects of their products in the whole life-cycle
- increased employee motivation and well-being
- employee input into decision-making

87% of companies reported positive impacts with no adverse impact on profit (19% reported a positive impact on profit). VAUDE, an outdoor equipment supplier, has radically diminished its climate footprint - see more results here. The health insurer Pro Vita incentivises its clients to consume less meat. Polarstern saves 32.000 t CO₂ compared to conventional energy suppliers.

**Lessons learnt:**

- Companies (and municipalities) start to encourage each other to do better.
- Next step: legal incentives such as lower taxes, interest rates or tariffs or priority in public procurement for higher scores and vice versa;
- Long term goal: Fusion of best existing non-financial reporting frameworks into a legally binding standard that is 1. measurable and comparable, 2. externally audited, 3. linked to legal incentives.

**Contact**

Name: Christian Felber  
Organisation: Economy for the Common Good  
E-Mail: info@christian-felber.at
SDG 13: Local Institutions for Climate Action in Ukraine

**Summary**

Energy efficiency and RES have a great economically attractive potential in Ukraine and lead to a significant reduction in greenhouse gases emissions. The role of municipalities is crucial for utilizing this potential. To launch local climate actions, NGO Ecoclub supports establishment of local institutions with the participation of local authorities. As result, 4 revolving funds and 1 cooperative were created through the capacity building of local officials, study tours, legal and mentoring support. The Ecoclub recommends such approach as: a) institutionalized support for local climate policies; b) effective use of funds; c) outreach to locals.

**Situation**

Climate policy at the local level in Ukraine means increasing energy efficiency and moving to 100% renewable energy in municipalities. A significant reduction in governmental subsidies to suppliers of fossil fuels and the introduction of feed-in tariff resulted in a commercially attractive conditions for energy efficiency and renewable energy. Energy efficient measures with a payback period of less than 10 years alone can halve greenhouse gas emissions in residential and public facilities. Energy efficiency and renewables contribute to the communities’ development due to reduced energy costs from efficiency and replacing imported energy. However, the achieved indicators lagging far behind the corresponding governmental plans. Our experience shows that the main obstacles are: a) poor awareness and low capacity of local authorities; b) very high interest rates on loans; c) lack of known successful examples. At the same time, local officials are often the main driving force of reforms.

**Strategy**

The strategy of NGO Ecoclub focuses on establishment of local institutions which statutory tasks are increasing energy efficiency and the share of renewables. Ecoclub implements the approach by capacity building activities for representatives of municipalities that were selected on a competitive basis (theoretical knowledge, calculations of the potential of EE and RES of their communities and the visits to successful examples). Interested participants receive further support: legal assistance, mentoring support and backing in seeking investment. Ecoclub ensures local stakeholder engagement in decision-making to ensure local ownership and sustainability of the institutions.

**Results and lessons learned**

Since 2015, with support of Ecoclub municipalities has created four revolving funds and an energy cooperative. The first revolving fund in Slavuta has already issued loans for the insulation of houses valued several times more than its statutory capital. All these institutions achieve high efficiency in using public funds thanks to attracting private capital, reusing same funding multiple times, and long term operation. For more successful activities, it is necessary to continuously inform inhabitants of municipalities and continue to increase the capacity of local authorities.
Contact
Name: Andriy Martynyuk
Organisation: NGO Ecoclub
E-Mail: martynyuk@ecoclubrivne.org
SDG 13: Water-Energy-Food nexus solutions in Aral Sea basin

Summary
The objective behind applying water-energy-food nexus solutions in Aral Sea basin is to provide scientific and practical evidence that integration of interdisciplinary sciences provides multiplication effect towards mitigating negative consequences of climate change in Central Asia. And, finding decentralized solutions in remote communities provides convenience to the local community while insuring the sustainable supply of green energy, clean water, organic agriculture products that lead to prolong wellbeing of the community.

Situation
The Aral Sea Basin, extending to five Central Asian countries including Uzbekistan, has ominous recognition for man-made ecological crisis resulting in the collapse of eco-systems, deterioration of health and livelihood of the population and threat to further sustainable development of the whole region (Frenken, 2013). Providing access to clean water for drinking and other everyday uses would improve the hygiene and sanitation of around 5 million people in Uzbekistan, particularly women, and would create better conditions for rural development. For most of the year (320 days), Uzbekistan experiences sunny days with 8-10 hours solar radiation per day. The geographic latitude produces 2.88 kW of solar energy per square meter per day. Benefiting from this opportunity, solar energy technologies can supply off-grid water desalination system in remote communities of the Aral Sea Basin while agriculture waste can be utilized to generate biogas and bio-fertilizers.

Strategy
The approach is a bottom-up approach where local environmental situation is assessed towards choosing the most applicable biogas and solar water desalination plants in villages of Aral Sea basin. REPIC project on recycling agriculture waste has been conducted in Uzbekistan that recommended the most-applicable renewable energy technologies that can further make interdisciplinary impact on other domains: agriculture, waste, water and economic development.

Results and lessons learned
Based on the REPIC project feasibility analysis, the consortium developed a new biogas model matching to ecological-environmental-economic conditions of the region. Generated biogas and bio-fertilizers can return the cost of the investment and have the following water-energy-food nexus impact:
   1) increases the yield by +20%;
   2) decreases water consumption by -15%;
   3) Land is protected from wild plants;
   4) Chemical fertilizers are not utilized to the plant;
   5) decreases land mineralization rate;
   6) Fossil fuels are not used for cooking as biogas replaces is used at households;
   7) Women’s labor will not be used to collect firewoods;
Contact
Name: Olimjon Saidmamatov
Organisation: The University of Geneva
E-Mail: Olimjon.Saidmamatov@etu.unige.ch
SDG 13: Promotion of Low-Carbon Sustainable Lifestyles in Armenia

**Summary**

Main objective: To contribute to the Sustainable Lifestyles and Education (SLE) Programme of the One Planet Network (10YFP) objective 3 (Develop tools and incentives, provide capacity-building for achieving sustainable lifestyles and disseminating good practices) by promoting the practical use of renewable energy and energy efficiency in rural Armenia for climate change mitigation and environmental sustainability.

Specific objectives: Strengthen the target communities providing them with modern mechanisms for solar energy use, opportunities to enhance local initiatives for improving quality of life and the environment;

- Reduce energy costs (up to 50%) of the involved communities via implementation of renewable solar energy pilots.

**Situation**

Over 70% of electricity demand is satisfied through nuclear and thermal generation relying on imported energy in Armenia. This is inefficient and expensive.

Armenia is rich in sunny days, but is inefficient in solar energy use, lacking experience with low-cost environmentally friendly renewable energy technologies (e.g. solar fruit dryers, cooking stoves, water heaters, street lamps).

Armenian Women for Health and Healthy Environment (AWHHE) designed a project paying attention to following aspects:

- Water heating: Due to collapse of municipal heat supply services currently only 2,5% of former capacity was in operation in Solak.
- Street lighting: Replace conventional lighting with solar lighting in Malishka.
- Dried Fruit: Lack of skills in management of agricultural activities to prevent losses of yield in Aygevan.

Thus the project will promote the replication of small-scale energy efficiency projects by communities by focusing on the financial benefits that energy saving technologies generate for users.

**Strategy**

The project aimed to improve the quality of life and mitigate climate change in poor regions of Armenia. This was an innovative rural development project with low-cost environmentally friendly renewable energy pilots (solar fruit dryers, water heaters, street lamps). The project strengthened self-supporting communities and provided them with opportunities to enhance local initiatives in energy efficiency, climate change and renewable energy. A participatory method was used for implementing local sustainable development plans. Malishka lightened the intra-streets. Aygevan organized solar fruit drying
for low-income households. Solak kindergarten installed solar water heaters. Thus, each village solved specific challenges using solar energy technologies.

### Results and lessons learned

- **Aspects of sustainability**: environment (solar energy); social (community strengthening); cultural (traditional use of sun energy); economic (income generation).
- **Community engagement and women empowerment**: each community came up with ideas on use of solar energy. Women are main drivers of the project.
- Highlighting **potential of solar energy** for local policy makers, and the need to empower **women entrepreneurs** for the benefit of the community.
- The project managed to bring in local politicians on board and very diplomatically make them see the benefits of the project (and the potential of solar technologies) for the communities.

### Contact

**Author**: Knarik Grigoryan  
**Name**: Gohar Khojayan  
**Organisation**: Armenian Women for Health and Healthy Environment  
**E-Mail**: office@awhhe.am
SDG 13: Water and Sanitation Safety Planning Compendium in schools for inclusive and innovative water and wastewater solutions in the Balkan region

Summary
Schools and local authorities in rural communities of Albania, Macedonia and Romania are using an educational tool, the “Water and Sanitation Safety Planning Compendium” (WSSP) to map and understand the risks to drinking water sources and the health situation of sanitation and waste water. The WSSP has different modules, including a module for schools. Rural municipalities mostly lack access to safe water and sanitation. The WSSP methodology includes 10 practical steps to engage young people in mapping the risks and sources of pollution, and to identify affordable solutions.

Situation
Rural communities in Albania, Macedonia and Romania mostly are not connected to centralized drinking water or to a centralized sewage systems. The local authorities lack staff with capacities to monitor the water and sanitation situation. Households depend on unsafe onsite systems, shallow wells or on small semi-centralized systems that are often badly maintained. The water wells are often polluted with different pollutants, depending on the season and local activities. Schools often do not have safe drinking water, nor safe toilets, let alone toilets equipped for menstrual hygiene management. However, affordable solutions exists. The first step is to understand where the problems occur in the system. By adapting the World Health Organisation’s Water Safety Planning methodology to a simple 10 step approach, the WSSP Compendium for rural communities and schools engaged local stakeholders in monitoring their water and sanitation situation. In Macedonia special attention was given to the menstrual hygiene management in schools and resulted in a campaign “Let’s eradicate the menstrual poverty in Macedonia”. In Albania schools in the Shkodra region are using the WSSP methodology and have been raising awareness and improving school toilets and menstrual hygiene management. In Romania the national association of Water Operators (Aquademica) has adopted the WSSP methodology to work with small municipalities and to carry out quick risk assessments of the water and sanitation situation and from there plan improvements.

Strategy
The case study will present good practices showcasing reducing inequalities in access to safe drinking water and sanitation in Eastern pan-European region, through using the WSSP compendium in schools in rural municipalities (SDGs 4, 6 and 16). The event will show good practises and progresses achieved by government and civil society stakeholders from Macedonia, Albania and Romania on access to safe water and sanitation in remote rural areas, and how all stakeholders can be engaged. The event will also highlight how all stakeholders can be engaged through interactive educational programmes. It will emphasize the framework the coherence with other policy processes in the UNECE region such as the Protocol Water and Health and the Environment and Health process.
**Results and lessons learned**

The ministry of National Education in Romania had approved a WSSP continuous training programme - A 40 hours “Training for trainers “course on Water and Sanitation Safety Planning among teachers of primary schools started in Romania. The course aims to provide the teachers (SDG4) with the necessary know-how and relevant tools for teaching the pupils on water issues – in general, drinking water, water supply services, wastewater & sanitation systems among environmental environment. Students handbooks had been successfully developed as well. The Balkan WASH network is a result of the project activities and implementation and is expecting next possibility in the Balkan Countries where similar activities can be introduced, developed and successfully result in achieving the Sustainable Development Goals in the region: [https://balkanwashnetwork.org](https://balkanwashnetwork.org)

**Contact**

**Names:** Bistra Mihaylova, Verena Demmelbauer  
**Phone:** +49 89 23 23 938 -10  
**Mobile phone:** +49 176 35 37 27 82  
**Organisation:** Women Engage for a Common Future  
**E-Mail:** bistra.mihaylova@wecf.org, verena.demmelbauer@wecf.org
SDG 13: Tackling interrelationships between climate change, agriculture and health

Summary
Climate change is impairing food and nutrition security worldwide and the challenges will increase. Changes in temperature and water availability, in pests and diseases act to reduce crop productivity and current agricultural practices are a major contributor to greenhouse gas emissions. The InterAcademy Partnership (IAP), the global network of more than 130 science academies, is completing a project with four regional working groups (Europe, Africa, Asia, the Americas) taking a robust evidence-based approach to explore options for improving food and nutrition security, including innovation for climate-smart agricultural adaptation and for mitigating agriculture’s contribution to climate change.

Situation
In parts of Europe, declining crop yields will affect cereal, fruit and vegetable availability. Direct climate impacts may be compounded by increasing problems of plant disease and pests (e.g. European corn borer). Health consequences encompass obesity as well as micronutrient deficiencies. It is vital to capitalise on all scientific opportunities to adapt to climate-smart agriculture, e.g. improved plant breeding to counter biotic and abiotic stresses. Furthermore, it will be impossible to achieve IPCC goals without reducing the contribution made by agriculture to greenhouse gas emissions. This requires changing agronomic practices but also, in Europe, changing dietary habits in ways that will relieve environmental pressures, e.g. reducing meat consumption. Adjusting consumption patterns brings health co-benefits as well as climate change mitigation. But there is still much to do to establish characteristics of sustainable, healthy diets, while protecting vulnerable groups and linkage with most relevant SDG-13 indicator, 13.2.1.

Strategy
EASAC, the European Academies’ Science Advisory Council, provided one of four regional academy network working groups for IAP, bringing scientific experts from across Europe to evaluate major challenges and opportunities. The project adopted a food systems perspective covering all the steps from growing to consuming, also assessing interrelationships with the environment, including climate. Since publication of the European report December 2017, EASAC has discussed conclusions, recommendations and next steps with the EU Institutions and other stakeholders, with follow-up by individual academies at the national level. European outputs also contributed to the IAP global phase work, published November 2018.

Results and lessons learned
- Challenge resided in scale of task to cover issues for food systems, environment, climate change and health.
• Recommendations made for using available evidence base to inform policy development and support innovation and practice e.g. for EU Common Agricultural Policy, circular economy, bioeconomy and links with multiple SDGs.
• Identified research gaps and how European research agenda can contribute globally.
• Innovative IAP project design was highly valuable in collecting, sharing and analysing evidence and engaging in follow-up at national, regional and global levels.
• This pioneering project design will be applicable to other regional-global topics requiring input from natural and social sciences.

Contact
Name: Robin Fears
Organisation: EASAC
E-Mail: robin.fears@easac.eu
Summary
This case study demonstrates how Tajikistan is advancing on the climate change agenda by accessing climate finance for adaptation in the food security sector. Tajikistan is the most vulnerable country to the adverse impacts of climate change in Central Asia. Climate change will increase the frequency and severity of natural disasters such as flood, mudflows and droughts. Already, recurrent natural disasters are damaging arable lands and irrigation facilities which undermine food security. To respond to these challenges, Tajikistan is developing a National strategy for adaptation to climate change, which will allow the introduction of adaptation measures in the country’s development planning process. The Government of Tajikistan (GoT) recognizes the need to reduce the agriculture sector’s vulnerability to climate change, especially given its significant contribution to the national GDP and employment rate: it accounts for 21.9% of GDP and employs over 60% of the population of Tajikistan. Therefore, the national climate change adaptation strategy aims to build synergies and ensure efficiency in the use of resources by linking the adaptation strategy with existing national strategies and programmes, such as National Development Strategy and Agriculture Reform Programme (2012-2020). However, as Tajikistan does not have sufficient national financial capacity, accessing climate finance is therefore a key enabling factor for Tajikistan to tackle climate change and avoid negative impact on food security.

Situation
Tajikistan is an active member of the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change and has the lowest level of absolute and per capita emissions in Central Asia. It has so far submitted three national communications and has ratified the Paris Agreement. Tajikistan’s food and nutrition situation was classified as “serious” in the 2017 Global Hunger Index. Tajikistan developed its Nationally Determined Contributions and is in the process of finalizing its new National Climate Change Adaptation Strategy (NCCAS). Tajikistan is one of the Eastern Europe and Central Asian (ECA) countries most severely affected by climate change and yet has little capacity to adapt to changes to its climate. Climate projections point to higher temperatures and reduced precipitation, with a greater frequency of extreme events such as flooding, droughts, and storms. These changes primarily have adverse effects on water resources, energy generation and the fertility of soils and pasture land and consequently on the productivity of agriculture and ultimately on food security and the livelihoods of the rural population. Agriculture yields could drop by up to 30% by 2100 in some parts of the country—potentially affecting about 2 million people who are food insecure, of which 800,000 are directly

---

14 Third National Communication to the UNFCCC, 2014
threatened by hunger. Though the rate of undernourishment has been declining over the past two decades, the number of undernourished people remains high, due to population growth. In 2016, the proportion of undernourished people stood at 30 percent, compared with 39 percent in 2000. Therefore, accessing climate finance for climate change adaptation is of essence for Tajikistan.

**Strategy**

The government of Tajikistan has been engaging with various donors and development partners in order to meet the commitments undertaken under the Paris Agreement. Knowledge of climate finance and respective funds has been rising since the 2009 Copenhagen climate summit. Tajikistan is the first country in the EECCA region which has participated in the Pilot Program for Climate Resilience (PPCR), managed by the CIF and supported by multiple donors. Implementation of the PPCR programme has increased awareness about the procedures involved in getting access to climate finance. Moreover, Tajikistan has benefitted from GIZ Climate Finance Readiness Programme and GCF Readiness and Preparatory Programme which support countries in planning, accessing and managing climate finance. As a key priority sector, climate projects indicate that all dimensions of food security in Tajikistan will be adversely impacted. A WFP study found out that a warming climate is likely to increase water needs for basic agricultural crops by 20 or 30 percent. In view of this, Tajikistan has leveraged climate finance for adaptation in the agriculture and food security sector which is one of the most vulnerable to climate change. An example is GCF funded WFP project “Building climate resilience of vulnerable and food insecure communities through capacity strengthening and livelihood diversification in mountainous regions of Tajikistan”. The project aims at strengthening the adaptive capacities of the most vulnerable and food insecure communities residing in mountainous regions of Tajikistan by supporting livelihood diversification into more climate resilient incomes, and by strengthening capacities such as climate services which will allow the government and farmers at local level to make more informed decisions and better manage climate related risks.

**Results and lessons learned**

**Specific results:**

- Tajikistan successfully managed to access climate finance a number of funding streams (GEF, CIF, GCF, AF) in support of climate change mitigation and adaptation, for different priority sectors such as agriculture and food security, as well as energy, etc.

**Challenges encountered and lessons learned:**

PPCR was the first nationally coordinated program involving national government institutions as the Executive Agencies. Under PPCR six investment projects were designed and supported through the multilateral development banks. Implementation of the investment projects has granted the Executing Agencies a sheer opportunity to increase their capacity and knowledge on climate adaptation/mitigation activities and learn about the climate finance architecture. Based on PPCR experience Tajikistan was better prepared to access the Green Climate Finance with its development partners like WFP, UNDP, and MDBs.

---

The biggest challenge to date remains the technical capacity and low awareness on climate resilience issues at the sectoral level. Even nowadays, the design of the some of the new projects lack climate resilience component. Since agriculture composes over 70% of the communities’ income in the rural area, wider awareness on climate adaptation measures will play a important role in sustainable development. CEP in close collaboration with international and national development partners thrives to introduce and practice sustainable land and natural resource management at various levels.

Potential for replication:
- Since the countries of Central Asia share similar economic and social characteristics and all countries are susceptible to climate change with food insecurity affecting all of them, Tajikistan strategy used to access climate finance for adaptation in food security sector could be replicated to other countries of the region.

Contact
Name:
Organisation:
E-Mail:
SDG 13: Strengthening climate change resilience and health adaptation through heat health action planning in Croatia

Summary
As a result of climate change, health systems need to prepare for and adapt to gradual changes in health outcomes caused by extreme events such as heat-waves. The objectives of the heat-health action plan (HHAP) are to give health and social care services the capacity to act quickly and responsibly to reduce morbidity and mortality during heat-waves, especially in vulnerable population groups. This requires the health community to play an active role in awareness-raising and advocacy, strengthening the evidence base and climate and health programming. It requires the health sector to work in a coordinated manner with other actors.

Situation
Climate change is expected to increase the frequency and intensity of heat-waves, affecting the health of people across Europe. Croatia has experienced heat-waves in the past: data for Zagreb show an increasing trend in midsummer temperatures from 1900 to 2015, which is particularly intense for the last 25 years. An increasing trend of mean summer maximum temperatures for the period is even steeper. Climate scenarios for Croatia, according to RCP4.5, show that summer temperatures will increase, with a maximum air temperature above 35˚C. In the near future 3–5 more extremely hot days are expected during summer periods for most parts of northern Croatia, the northern coastline and central Dalmatia. In other parts of Croatia 1–3 more days with these maximum air temperatures are expected. An increase in the number of extremely hot days will be even greater in the middle of the 21st century.

Strategy
The SDGs 13 and 3 present a major opportunity to embed activity on the determinants of health across all sectors of policymaking, and through engagement with a wide range of stakeholders. The core elements and structure of the HHAP are designed in line with WHO guidance. This includes advice on the plan’s scope and core elements, responsibilities at national and local level for alerting the public once a heat-wave has been forecast, advice on what to do during a heat-wave and recommendations for health professionals.

Results and lessons learned
Strengthening health security would require:
• maximizing synergies with existing instruments, including HHAP;
• preparing the health and social care sector workforce to respond to health-related consequences of climate change and strengthening health services to address climate-related events like HHAP in a timely manner;
• building capacity in the health and social care sector workforce.
• Information on the impacts of climate change needs to be translated from the scientific research domain into language and timescales relevant for policy-makers.
- It is very important to acknowledge the need for national data and to recognize the limited human capacity for its implementation.

**Contact**  
Name: Dr Inge Heim  
Organisation: Croatian Academy of Medical Sciences, Croatia  
E-Mail: inge.heim@zg.t-com.hr
SDG 13: FLUMEN: Public-private cooperation to address resilience and adaptation changing climate

**Summary**

Flumen is a collaborative project between several Institutions and Loccioni Group with the aim of securing a stretch of the Esino river in order to prevent dangerous floodings for the company and the territory. After this investment, the entire territory and the headquarters of Loccioni are safe and the potential risk of flooding is not only mitigated but transformed into an opportunity.

**Situation**

Flumen is a project of adoption of a stretch of Esino River, bordering Loccioni headquarters.

The rebel character of the Esino River has always been known over the centuries. As proved by many historical documents, various flooding events have affected the Esino Valley. Among the latest ones, the event of December 1990 can be mentioned as one of the most devastating.

An extraordinary rainfall, which reached 170 mm, affected all Esino area: the entire Esino basin was hit at the same time, in an intense manner and for more than 24 hours, reaching a flow rate of over 1000 cubic meters / sec. According to theoretical calculations and historical series, in fact, a flood of this scale should occur once every 200 years: this means that the conditions and environmental variables have changed so much that they undermine the validity of the forecasting model.

**Strategy**

Flumen project is collaboration between private and public sector to give safety and value to the whole river. A group has been created that unites and involves the Province of Ancona, together with several institutions, such as the Marche Region, the surrounding Municipalities of Rosora and Maiolati, in a joint debate and collaboration with Loccioni Group.

- Public and private sector invested in:
  - Preventive activities (excavations and hydraulic tests, restoration of the original river, reinforcements etc)
  - Monitoring activities (hydrometers, water quality, sedimeters for bottom-river monitoring)
  - Bridge consolidation (local reinforcement and monitoring)
  - Energy production (3 micro hydro power plants for 480 MWh year; recovery of organic material)
  - Renovation of wash houses
  - Bike path realization
  - Reforestation and maintenance (replanted 8500 trees for consolidation of the embankments).
Results and lessons learned
Flumen is a valid model of collaboration, easily implemented and replicable, which allows to have a systemic and functional view of the river and territory. Even the Mayor of Rosora acknowledged that “the works that Loccioni carried out in the stretch of the river Esino, in addition to protecting the company from floodings, also defended part of the territory and several families.”

This type of collaboration allows a prudent and intelligent management of the economic resources on the territory: investments in predictive and periodic maintenance activities, preventing the hydrogeological instability, lead - in the long term - to a reduction of the resources necessary for activities related to the security, relief and reconstruction.

Contact
Name: Roberto Cardinali
Organisation: Tecnofilm spa Compounds Termoplastici, Italy
E-Mail:
SDG 13: Connecting climate change, disaster risk and sustainable finance

**Summary**
The Sendai Framework emphasizes the need for risk informed investments to achieve disaster resilience. In March 2018, the European Commission published the EU Action Plan on Financing Sustainable Growth setting out a range of planned policy and legislative measures to reorient capital flows towards sustainable investment and manage financial risks stemming from climate change. In order to support these measures, which have a strong expert and stakeholder engagement, E3G is working with forward-thinking institutions, investors and civil society to embed sustainability, disaster risk and climate change as a core outcome. Through analysis, thought leadership and outreach, E3G is working to facilitate the shifting of private capital to support climate resilience, low carbon and a sustainable European economy that can be a blueprint for regions around the world.

**Situation**
The economic damages from disasters caused by natural hazards are increasing. Over the last 20 years natural disasters have cost the world USD 2,908 billion: 91% of disasters were climate-related (drought, storms, floods, heatwaves) which alone cost USD 2,245 billion. Three European countries are among the ten worldwide suffering the greatest economic losses: Germany (losses of USD 57.9 billion, due mostly to floods); Italy (USD 56.6, caused mainly by earthquakes); France (USD 43.3, principally as a result of gales/storms). These impacts pose unsustainable losses on the economy and drive greater inequality. Action on sustainable finance aims to tackle this growing problem. It aims to connect finance with the specific needs of the economy to the benefit of the planet and our society. In short, it’s about making sure the financial system works towards the SDG’s, Paris Agreement and Sendai Framework.

**Strategy**
E3G mapped the disaster risk and physical climate risk implications for the financial system and identified the near term finance regulations where action could be taken to improve this situation. This included around the classification system for investments (taxonomy), disclosure, corporate reporting, corporate government for capital markets and implications for financial products and labelling. E3G, in collaboration with the UN Office for Disaster Risk Reduction, convened an expert workshop to seek input on the opportunities and challenges across EU sustainable finance action. A report will be shortly published capturing this analysis and feedback to be shared widely with the financial, disaster risk reduction and climate change communities.

**Results and lessons learned**
- As initial results, decision makers, investors, civil society and institutions have increased knowledge awareness on incorporating disaster and climate risk into sustainable finance.
• E3G, in collaboration with the UN Office for Disaster Risk Reduction, has drafted a report setting out a contribution on how to incorporate disaster risk reduction into EU sustainable finance and globally, including opportunities, challenges and good practices.
• The initiative stressed the need for further identification of entry points to comprehensively integrate disaster and climate risk into global financial markets and overcome key challenges. This can be only achieved through partnership of different organisations and financial institutions, both national, regional and international.

Contact
Name: Kate Levick, Programme Lead, Sustainable Finance Nick Mabey, CEO
Organisation: E3G – Third Generation Environmentalism
E-Mail:
SDG 16: Peace, justice and strong institutions

Round table: Strengthening institutions for change: fostering effective and inclusive governance for sustainable development

- Gender responsive budgeting for more effective and responsive institutions
  North Macedonia*
- Enhancing Strategic Planning and Governance in Public Administration at All Levels
  Czech Republic
- Enhancing accessible and inclusive public service delivery system in Albania
  Albania*
- Fostering Effective and Inclusive Governance in Greece
  Council of Europe
- Referral mechanisms involving vulnerable groups to respond to gender-based violence
  Kyrgyzstan*
- Human-centered and gender-sensitive electoral education
  Moldova*
- Eliminating discrimination in the security sector through women’s participation and leadership
  UN Women Ukraine Country Office

Round table: Empowering people to protect the planet

- Public participation in the EIA procedure in Transboundary Context in Serbia
  Serbia*
- Conserving a Cave Ecosystem within a mining environment
  German Speleological Federation, Germany
- Quashing water management law in representation of the public, the scientific sector and future generations
  Office of the Ombudsman, Hungary*
- Safe and enabling space for public participation
  Earth Justice, Switzerland*
- Fostering effective governance for sustainable development and protecting the planet
  Ukraine*
- Strengthening the capacity of judges in Kazakhstan to promote access to justice and rule of law in environmental matters
  Kazakhstan*

*Note: Case studies that will be presented during the Round Table discussions
SDG 16: Gender Responsive Budgeting for more effective and responsive institutions

**Summary**
This case study will discuss the application and institutionalization of Gender Responsive Budgeting (GRB) as a tool for strengthening gender responsiveness of line ministries and state institutions in the Republic of North Macedonia. It showcases the historical overview of how GRB was introduced as a concept for transformative financing for gender equality and as a policy making tool that advances country’s national and international commitments on gender equality.

The case study demonstrates interlinkages between SDGs 16 and 5 and relates to an indicator 16.6.1 “Primary government expenditures as a proportion of original approved budget, by sector (or by budget codes or similar)”, as well as indicator 5c1: “Proportion of countries with systems to track and make public allocations for gender equality and women’s empowerment”. The case study explains how GRB is used to track budget allocations for gender equality and women’s empowerment to better respond to the needs of those facing multiple forms of discrimination. The case focuses on the experiences in the application of the Government Methodology on GRB, which was adopted to support the operationalization of the gender provisions set in the Budget Circular (budget instructions for central budget users) and the development of Gender Budget Statements for selected sectoral programmes.

**Situation**
Gender Responsive Budgeting was introduced as part of the UN Women’s country programme framework in the Republic of North Macedonia. Comprehensive interventions were undertaken to create enabling legal, institutional and social environment for implementation of GRB.

The Law on Equal Opportunities of Women and Men (2012) introduced new obligation for central (article 11) and local (article 14) governments to: incorporate the principle of equal opportunities of women and men in the strategic plans and budgets and track the impact of their programs on women and men. To comply with the Law, The Government developed its first Strategy on Gender Responsive Budgeting (2013-2017) with the aim to operationalize legal obligations of central and local institutions and provide platform for systematic inclusion of gender equality in strategic planning and budgeting. In response to the adoption of the GRB Strategy, the Ministry of Finance (MoF) amended the budget instructions (budget circular for central level budget users), while the government adopted a specific methodology on GRB. Moreover, as of 2018, the General Secretariat of the Government for the first time improved the strategic planning process through mainstreaming gender in the Strategic Planning Methodology. The methodology requires that line ministries conduct a gender assessment of policy measures and their impact on gender equality. This is a significant achievement, since the methodology closely regulates the preparation process and monitoring of strategic plans and annual work plans of the line ministries.

**Strategy**
The methodology for gender responsive budgeting is an instrument and a guide for successful implementation of the obligations arising from the Law on Equal Opportunities for Women and Men. It contributes to improved efficiency and effectiveness of programs by mainstreaming gender equality in the policies and sectoral programmes. The methodology explains the process and the ways in which the state administration bodies should mainstream gender in policies, programs, subprograms, plans and budgets.

With the Gender Budget Statements, line ministries are better equipped to monitor spending and to recognize that programmes and budgets have different impact on women and men, because of their different needs and social and economic status.

Results and lessons learned

- As a result of longstanding expert mentoring and capacity development trainings for civil servants, coupled with the sustained integration of gender provisions in the annual budget instructions, to date 14 line ministries and 3 state institutions have submitted gender budget statements for their sectoral programmes to the Ministry of Finance.
- Additionally, the MoF Budget Circular contains a template for gender budget statements as an integral part of the annual budget requests. Budget users will be expected to develop a gender output indicator for the medium-term period (triennial planning which is linked to SDG 16.6.1 “Primary government expenditures as a proportion of original approved budget, by sector“)
- With the GRB Statements, line ministries are following the progress of their programmes and expenditures in the course of three years and compare realization against initially panned budget, and this improves fiscal transparency and monitoring of budgetary allocations for gender equality.
- Key challenge for sustainable and effective application of GRB is the line budget system, which is soon to be replaced with a programme-based budgeting, foreseen under the ongoing public financial management reform.

The approach could be easily replicated in any country in the region and could be adapted to specific context and relevant sectoral policy/programme.

Contact

Name: Ermira Lubani
Organisation: UN Women ECA RO
E-Mail: ermira.lubani@unwomen.org
## Summary
The case study presents the activities aimed at increasing efficiency of strategic planning and governance in public administration, including public investments, in the Czech Republic at national, regional and municipal levels. Governments at any levels are not perceived only as public service providers, but also as pro-active shapers of the public sphere in the political, economy, social and cultural domains. With the aim to improve the efficiency of processes related to strategic planning and implementation of strategic goals in the fields of national, regional and urban development, the Czech Government has developed a system involving a range of practical instruments focused at better functioning of public institutions at all levels.

## Situation
No universal legislative framework for strategic planning is in place in the Czech Republic, with the exception of regional development (in relation to European Cohesion Policy). Similarly, no central authority exists to coordinate strategic planning; however, there are some instruments and activities worked out by the Czech Government, which help strengthen efficiency of public institutions in this field.

### Strategic planning:
- Methodology for preparation of public strategies at all levels, and tool enabling the preparation of strategic documents – eMethodolgy (www.dotaceeu.cz);
- Database of strategies – library of strategic documents and maps, available on line (www.databaze-strategie.cz);
- Educational tool STRATeduca increasing the qualification of the employees in public administration working in the field of preparation, implementation and evaluation of strategic documents (www.kurz.strateduka.cz);
- Online application for municipalities – strategic tool including templates for planning process (www.obcepro.cz).

### Governance and implementation of strategic goals:
- E-Procurement – National electronic instrument for public procurement at all levels, including methodologies and e-learning for any public contracting authority (https://nen.nipez.cz; www.portal-vz.cz);
- Information system on public contracts – publishing data on contracts of public contracting authorities at all levels at Central Address (https://smlouvy.gov.cz).
Strategy

Methodology for Preparation of Public Strategies, approved by the Government, imposed on members of the Government and other central administrative authorities and Mayor of the City of Prague use the Methodology in the preparation of their strategic documents. For regional and municipal authorities, the Methodology is recommended. The Methodology has been incorporated into the e-system Database of Strategies, in which strategic documents can be created directly using electronic methodology, interactive forms and templates. Methodological Instruction on Typology of Strategic and Implementing Documents is also available there.

Database of strategies, available online, nowadays gathers together a number of 900 up-to-date documents. Since its launch in 2011, the Database portal has seen more than 520,000 visits. It was designed to thematically and functionally interconnect strategic goals from the international level, documents of ministries and national institutions, up to regional and local level. The Database can also serve as a tool to create new documents and to monitor connection between strategic goals.

National electronic instrument is an online platform, free of charge, for administration, and concessions in all categories of public procurement, fully supporting planning activities as it is used for public procurement under long-term investment projects.

Results and lessons learned

Please elaborate on the specific results, challenges encountered and lessons learned. If possible, briefly elaborate whether the concrete experience could be replicated in other contexts. Preferably, summarise your answer in bullet points (max 100 words).

The instruments worked out by the Czech Government with the aim to enhance the efficiency of strategic planning and governance at all levels of public administration supports professionalism, transparency, and reliability of public institutions at national, regional and municipal levels. They help create adequate political, organizational and capacity conditions and assumptions, including linkages among the implementation of strategic plans to budgeting and budgetary projections and, where appropriate, help create linkages with the preparation and use of land-use planning documentation and various investment projects. The Czech Republic is continuing to take actions that will increase transparency and efficiency in public procurement, including effective functioning and proposals for further procedure in the use of electronic public procurement marketplaces, and use of the National Electronic Instrument by public contractors. All these measures are being implemented on an ongoing basis, and include also e.g. monitoring of foreign best practices in the computerisation of public procurement, with an assessment of potential implementation of the best solutions in the Czech legislative environment; awareness campaigns on the introduction of electronic public procurement; advisory services for contracting authorities and contractors; the revision and creation of methodologies, etc.
SDG 16: More accessible and inclusive public service delivery system in Albania

Summary
Since September 2015 the GoA has worked to integrate and mainstream Agenda 2030 across the national development policy framework. An inter-Ministerial Committee and inter-Institutional Working Group have been operational since May 2017. The Prime Minister’s office in 2017 released a Baseline Report that presented available data against the SDG indicators. The Parliament in December 2017 unanimously approved a resolution committing to the promotion, implementation, and monitoring of Agenda 2030 and the SDGs, through inclusive and broad-based development processes, in line with Albania’s development priorities and EU integration. A Voluntary National Report (VNR) was presented to the UN High Level Political Forum on sustainable development in July 2018. In light of Agenda 2030’s transformative set of commitments, the GoA with UN support used the Mainstreaming, Acceleration, and Policy Support (MAPS) platform to localize SGDs and for national transitions to human-centered, rights-based sustainable development. Governance reforms are at the heart of the EU accession process and have been prioritized as key to addressing Albania’s socio-economic challenges. Major investments have therefore been made by the GoA in reforming the public administration and judiciary, and in efforts to reduce corruption, strengthen the rule of law, and rationalize relations between central and sub-national state bodies. Delivery of quality and inclusive public services, including at local level is one of the many important interventions the GoA is intensively working on. To make A2J equitable and inclusive for the most vulnerable individuals, Ministry of Justice (MoJ) in close cooperation with courts and specialized CSOs and support of UNDP Albania took action aiming at legislative and normative framework improvement and adequate law. The improved Free Legal Aid (FLA) Law that ensures equitable and inclusive A2J to the most marginalized individuals was followed with the establishment of six FLA centers at district courts.

Situation
Issues of transparency and accountability, quality and inclusive public services in respect of the rights of the most vulnerable segments of the society have been consistently flagged by the EU annual progress reports and by Albanian civil society. For example, barriers to accessing quality health services are apparent in relatively high (albeit declining) high out-of-pocket health costs — despite the fact that citizens are legally entitled to free health care services. Albania’s judiciary remains unable to defend the rights or welfare of marginalized and excluded segments of society, or of specific groups of rights holders, such as women and children. According to 2017 Access to Justice Survey by UNDP Albania, almost half of the population interviewed has experienced legal problems in the last five years and nearly three quarters of Albanians believe the national justice system does not protect their rights adequately. The FLA scheme covers only a fraction of the needs of low-income and other disadvantaged
groups. In addition, three key factors contribute to a fragile framework for access to justice in Albania, namely, low levels of legal literacy, dubious attitudes on what is just, and a lack of trust in the justice system. Albania is in the process of carrying out a complete overhaul of its free legal aid (FLA) system. This is the first effort in 29 years of democratic transition to build a modern and comprehensive FLA scheme.

**Strategy**

Pursuant to SDG16.3 which aims at promoting rule of law at the national level and ensure equal A2J for all and the general SDG16 that aims at strong institutions that ensure inclusive and effective governance for sustainable development, MoJ, judicial bodies and CSOs through the A2J project aims at strengthening people’s A2J by supporting the development of the FLA system and promoting legal awareness and empowerment. Albania A2J project serves individuals in difficult economic situations in urban and rural areas that cannot afford to pay for legal services and marginalized communities including GBV&DV victims, Roma and Egyptian communities, PWDs, members of the LGBTI community and elderly persons. There are six areas where the project has provided support in establishing six FLA Centers in Tirana, Durres, Fier and Lezha, Shkodra and Peshkopi District Courts. The interventions undertaken in this area undoubtedly contribute to fulfilment of other SDG 16 indicators such as SDG 16.5, SDG16.6, SDG 16.10, SDG16.b and other SDGs such as SDG 10 (10.3) and SDG5.

**Results and lessons learned**

The A2J project had tangible results: 1. A new FLA law that ensures equitable and inclusive FLA services to the most vulnerable populations. 2 piloted free legal services in four districts in Albania in close partnership with specialized CSOs. For the period of end of September 2017-end of April 2018 778 vulnerable people (401 females (52%), 377 males (48%)) benefited from both primary (644 beneficiaries) and secondary FLA services, (134 beneficiaries: 79 females (59%), 55 males (41%)). Figures indicate an average of 23 primary FLA services per month per each FLA center and average of 4.8 cases per center per month. Various family law matters are by far the most common, followed by retirement and disability benefits, property law disputes and criminal matters. Building upon the results of ongoing A2J project MoJ, CSOs, District Courts and all relevant stakeholders, supported by UNDP is continuing to establish two more FLA centers in Peshkopi and Shkodra District Courts. There is potential for scaling up the good practice established already in six FLA Centers responding to the growing demand for FLA quality, inclusive and equal services to the most vulnerable populations. MoJ has planned to establish 4 new FLA Centers during 2019 in the national cross sectorial justice strategy.

**Contact**

Name of Presenter: Besmir BEJA, Councilor to the Minister of Justice  
Organisation: Minister of Justice  
E-Mail: Besmir.Beja@drejtesia.gov.al  
UNDP Albania contact: Entela.Lako@undp.org
SDG 16: Fostering Effective and Inclusive Governance in Greece

Summary
The objective is to illustrate how implementation of the legal advice and capacity-building projects fosters better governance and stronger institutions.

Situation
The Council of Europe Centre of Expertise for Good Governance implements projects in about 25 countries. This specific example will focus on one project implemented in Greece in 2017-18.

The CoE –EU Technical Assistance Project on Institutional Enhancement for Local Governance in Greece was specifically designed at the request of the Hellenic Ministry of Interior to support the administrative reform process. Policy advice and capacity building assistance was provided by the Centre of Expertise to:
- Improve the Greek institutional framework on decentralisation and local governance; and
- Strengthen capacities of local authorities to enhance implementation of reforms and provide better services to citizens.

Strategy
Legal and policy advice according to the European standards was complimented by capacity-building, based on implementation of the CoE capacity-building tools, which produced stronger results.

Inclusive approach:
During the implementation of the Project, the CoE enabled an impressive number of stakeholders (including citizens, local representatives, officials of central and local Public Administration, associations and universities) to participate in the decentralisation reform process by contributing to the needs analysis and the review of the existing framework.

The extensive collection of qualitative and quantitative data was carried out at the beginning of each activity. The involvement of stakeholders in any inception phase was important to build a sense of ownership and commitment to the project. Focus groups, interviews, study visits, workshops and trainings provided stakeholders with a space for open debates where they could exchange views and experiences, learn from each other and familiarise with European and national good practices. In addition, the Centre of Expertise utilised these discussions to promote CoE standards and to build a common understanding of good governance across Greece.

More than 70% of Greek municipalities were involved in the project. Participation was voluntary, based upon request of local authorities themselves. 13% of participating municipalities took part in more than 4 components of the project, meaning that they benefitted from a regular and continued assistance throughout the 21 months of project implementation. All types of municipalities were engaged, which contributed to the harmonisation of the level of governance across the country, including remote regions, islands, mountain and rural areas. The use of skype, video conference facilities, as well as the creation and regular update of the dedicated website allowed to reach a great number of municipalities, and ensured smooth communication and transparency of actions and results.
impressive level of participation could be explained by the pertinence of activities, the openness of local governments to innovative international activities and the capacity of the CoE to adapt to and meet local needs.

**Results and lessons learned**

Better legal and institutional framework:

The impact of the project is evident in the new law on local government reform, Cleisthenes I, which contains provisions in line with several recommendations and lessons learnt. The new law extends the application of the European Charter for Local Self-Government to the country’s second tier of local government, namely the regions. Furthermore, the explanatory statement of Cleisthenes is enriched with mentions and conceptual links to the CoE Congress of Local and Regional Authorities recommendations for Greece. Cleisthenes I was adopted by the Hellenic Parliament on 12 July. The next reform phase, Cleisthenes II, is planned to take place after the constitutional reform, foreseen in 2019.

Distribution of competencies was improved through the legislation.

**Insular municipalities:**

- Provisions of Law 4483/17 were in line with CoE recommendations (e.g. Rec. 3 “Provide effective incentives for public administration employees to move to island municipalities” is reflected in Art 32 “Mountain Municipalities and the island municipalities with less than 18000 inhabitants (...) can provide suitable accommodation and meals to non-resident employees”)

Stricter Inter-municipal cooperation leading to better public services:

- For the first time in Greece, the establishment of the IMC Network was agreed by 7 municipalities
- The MoI was provided with IMC agreements/contracts, enabling any Greek municipality to establish IMC schemes by itself (according to CoE standards and based on Greek legal framework)
- Leadership and cooperation skills of local authorities were strengthened through workshops

**Better Metropolitan governance:**

- Policy advice on metropolitan areas to inform and support the local government reform process. The Cleisthenes law contains provisions which are in line with the recommendations

**Better Local Finance and Fiscal supervision:**

- The Ministry of Interior was provided with a policy advice to improve the allocation of financial resources to local government, and to improve fiscal supervision of local authorities. The Cleisthenes law contains provisions which are in line with the recommendations

- Strengths and weaknesses of fiscal decentralisation and municipal financial management were assessed through the Local Finance Benchmarking
Training and Capacity Needs Assessment:
- The TNA findings will be used to feed into a long-term National Training Strategy to raise the standards of training, develop local training capacity within each local authority, introduce modern training methods, and ensure a sharing of training information and materials.

Enhanced municipal economic initiatives and creation of growth strategies in the field of agriculture, tourism, renewable energy and new technology:
- Greek best practices on local development (tourism and new technology) were identified and promoted (in Greece and abroad) through the implementation of Best Practice programme.
- The Award ceremony, the open day and the study visit provided an opportunity for networking and development of new partnerships among local and international stakeholders.
- The MoI was provided with BPP guidelines, enabling the continuation of the programme.

Strategic Municipal Planning
Was improved through the introduction of the CoE Tool on SMP.
According to participants this pilot project helped them to:
- raise awareness on the positive impact of strategic planning among local staff and elected representatives;
- reflect on each directorate’s objectives;
- learn how to “measure” objectives, setting clear indicators;
- understand the importance of cooperating with colleagues and involve other bodies and social partners;
- consider action plans as communication tools, which can enhance transparency, accountability and civil participation in the decision-making process;
- change their attitude towards business plans and understand that more concise action plans could be easily shared with stakeholders;
- recognise the need to create a department responsible for the continuous and systematic support of the municipality’s services involved in all phases of business planning;
- value and use various consultation methods in order to identify and utilise the opinion of stakeholders and citizens.

One of the participants stated that “right after first seminar (Athens 20/9/17) we have updated our vision statement using the SWOT analysis provided by the Council of Europe expert. Implementation of the tool has resulted in a considerable change in the vision since new areas of development were revealed. Now we are in the process of updating the strategic plan in order to fit again with the vision. The most important result from the second seminar (Athens 9/1/18) was the World Cafe tool as a public participation method. We already knew the methodology, but getting to know the tool through an interactive process actually made a difference. Now in the context of the Planning Department projects, we have already concluded to use it in the forthcoming participatory events. Third seminar had the most significant impact, not only because of the actual toolkit but also because of the whole workshop context. Council of Europe experts managed to put things that we have heard before in a meaningful order. Subsequently, we are already preparing to use the toolkit in two initiatives. (...) All in all, it has been a substantial capacity building for us. The city was already a leading Local Government Authority regarding civil participation and strategic municipal planning, and now it has the confidence to move forward, towards strengthening even more the democratic processes in decision making. Our goal is to further build on the gains of these seminars by developing relevant project proposals. Another positive
side-effect from the seminars was having the chance to know people that are now part of our extensive network (…).”

Enhancement of civil participation in decision-making through legislation:
i) Article 175 (of Cleisthenes Law) on the use of all consultation methods available in the framework of strategic planning.
ii) Articles 189-192 on:
   - taking into account the opinion of the Consultation Committees on the preparation of the annual budget
   - the discussion of alternatives on annual budgets and programme plans;
   - the obligation to publish the adopted budget.
iii) Articles 78, 105 on the strengthening of the competences of the Local and Regional Consultation Committees;
iv) Articles 133-150 on the framework of the Local and Regional Referenda;
v) Articles 152-174 on the Municipal and Regional Mediators

Strategic Planning:
i) Article 175 and 176 on:
   - the adoption of and the requirement to have already adopted the annual business plan, in line with the 4-year strategic plan in order to be able to adopt the annual budget;
   - setting the key elements on strategic planning and ensuring the link between 4-year and annual plans as well as with the national and regional priorities and guidelines;
   - customising the content and complexity of strategic planning to the different municipal categories.
ii) Article 177 on the establishment of the Monitoring and Implementation Committee on Spatial and Development Planning for Local and Regional Level, tasked with monitoring, support and multi-level coordination of strategic planning.

Good Governance – ELoGE
According to the participating mayors, this unprecedented benchmarking of Good Governance helped them reflect on the strengths and weaknesses of their performance, taking into consideration the opinions of citizens and local staff.

Public Ethics
The corruption risk analysis process enabled participating municipalities to define and systematise corruption prevention procedures. Moreover, the introduction of service cards helped to increase transparency and minimise the impact of subjective factors on administrative processes carried out at the office. As said by the Deputy Mayor of Larissa during the Conference, “The risk assessment cards helped us in building a common understanding of public ethics (...) and putting on paper in black and white what had been intangible till then. (...) By filling in the Benchmark we realised that the Greek municipalities can benefit from many rules and pieces of legislation on the matter, but these don’t make the system uncorrupted.” By taking part in this activity “we understood that we don’t own the laws in place, a change of attitude cannot be forced by law. We need these kinds of exercises, where different members of local administration can have open discussions, take the time and reflect on the administrative procedures and possible risks of corruption. Only by doing so we can raise awareness on
public integrity, it cannot be a taboo if we want to improve ethics. And to succeed we must keep working on it, we need assistance and good collaboration with the Central Government.”

Contact
Name: Alina Tatarenko
Organisation: Council of Europe
E-Mail: alina.tatarenko@coe.int
SDG 16: New referral mechanisms involving vulnerable groups to respond to gender-based violence in Kyrgyzstan

**Summary**

The objective of this case study is to share the experience of Kyrgyzstan in engaging the vulnerable groups in strengthening the protection mechanisms and ensuring access to justice and fundamental rights for survivors of gender-based violence.

The case study highlights the importance of joint efforts of the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic, the civil society, the beneficiaries and UN agencies’ team in ensuring fundamental rights of gender-based violence survivors, and establishing participatory referral mechanisms based on the new Law on Protection from Family Violence (endorsed in April 2017).

**Situation**

In the Kyrgyz Republic, gender-based violence takes such forms as family violence (physical, psychological, economic, neglect), sexual violence, early marriage, forced marriage, polygamy, trafficking in persons. Cases of violent acts of a sexual nature are annually registered both against women and against minor girls and boys. Since 2000 there has been a tendency to increase of such crimes.

GBV statistics 2018:

Registered cases of domestic violence – 7178 (women - 6562, men - 616)
Issued protection orders - 7114
Criminal cases initiated - 369
Brought to administrative responsibility - 4963
**Strategy**

Adoption of the new Law on Protection from Family Violence was actively lobbied by a network of 48 women NGOs and community leaders, based on a public monitoring of the GBV law-enforcement practice, with involvement of women from vulnerable groups and former survivors of violence.

To support implementation of the Law, the Kyrgyz Government in partnership with the UN agencies’ team developed the priority by-laws. In 2018, based on the regulation on issuance of orders to protect GBV survivors, the police registered 7,178 cases of domestic violence and issued 7,114 restraining orders. This is almost 50% increase since 2015, a year before the Law was adopted (3524 registered cases and 3358 restraining orders).

In 2018, GBV committees were established to comprise local municipal administrations, social and medical workers, police and non-government organizations, including representatives of local crime prevention and crisis centers, to collectively respond to gender-based violence cases.

Today, the leading role in establishing and managing the GBV committees is with the local women NGOs and crisis centres’ association, who actively attract vulnerable communities to be a part advocacy efforts for strengthening the role of women in achieving gender equality in line with SDG 5 and ensuring state response to violence in line with SDG 16.

---

**Results and lessons learned**

In 2018, GBV committees were established in 16 territorial administrations of Kyrgyzstan. 949 protection orders were issued by police to GBV survivors, who received various types of support - legal advice on property rights, child support, social benefits, divorce process, professional education and employment of women.

*Story: K.K. from Karasu municipality has been married for 12 years and had 4 kids. After death of her husband, the woman was subjected to psychological violence and turned out of the house by her husband’s family. The GBV committee brought this woman to a lawyer, performed as intermediate in negotiations with the husband’s family, helped to file an application to the court on property rights.*

Lessons learned:
- Comprehensive measures should be in place to address gender-based violence and ensure that victims of violence have access to immediate means of protection and perpetrators are adequately punished;
- Capacity building of involved officials should be a part of the National Action Plan to ensure application of gender-sensitive procedures to deal with victims of violence;
- Adequate assistance should be provided to victims of violence in cooperation with non-governmental organizations providing shelter and rehabilitation to victims;
- Disaggregated statistical data should be collected on domestic and sexual violence.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Contact</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Name:</strong> Aidai Arstanbekova/UNDP, Olga Tkachenko/UNODC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Organisation:</strong> UNDP, UNODC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>E-Mail:</strong> <a href="mailto:Aidai.arstanbekova@undp.org">Aidai.arstanbekova@undp.org</a>; <a href="mailto:olga.tkachenko@un.org">olga.tkachenko@un.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Presenter:</strong> Aida Kasymalieva, Vice-speaker, Kyrgyz Parliament</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SDG 16: Human-centered and gender-sensitive electoral education in Moldova

Summary
The case study will present the efforts made by the Central Electoral Commission (CEC) in pioneering inclusive civic engagement tools to enhance voters’ participation in the electoral processes. The study will focus on providing best examples of targeted innovative electoral education and voter information programmes for a more transparent and fair elections and establishment of the sustainable information networks.

Situation
- The change of the electoral system in Moldova (July 2017) brought considerable challenges to the CEC to inform the voters, including first-time voters, vulnerable and marginalized groups, about the particularities of the newly adopted mixed electoral system.
- The knowledge gap on new voting provisions derailed important democratic processes and led to misinformed, confused and disillusioned citizens/voters.
- The recent changes in the electoral legislation brought better opportunities to the women’s participation in politics, however, they continue to be underrepresented in the political sphere.
- To date, the young and first-time voters demonstrate high absenteeism on the E-Day, and people with disabilities do not enjoy sufficient conditions for independent voting.

Strategy
To bring the change through multi-layered civic engagement based on person-to-person approach, innovative results-oriented solutions and sustainable interventions at national and local levels.

The initiative contributed to widening institutional partnerships to generate a transformative change and bridge the knowledge gap in electoral matters for a better engagement of citizens in the democratic processes and decision-making. Strong partnerships were established with ministries and public institutions committed to support the electoral education efforts. Information networks were created with civil society actors representing the interest of women, youth and people with disabilities. Such comprehensive cooperation approach contributed to a more effective engagement of the public institutions and a broader access to information, the CEC continuing to be the driver for change in delivering more credible and transparent elections.

Results and lessons learned
- In premiere, the CEC delivered innovative and human-centered civic education programmes reaching out to over 340,000 direct and 1,720,000 indirect beneficiaries.
- These efforts contributed to the SDG 16, but also to SDGs 4, 5, 10 and 17.
• Innovative and inclusive approach provided new opportunities to increase public trust in the
election management body and in the electoral process. However, the overall low level of trust
of citizens in public institutions due to existing political environment prevent an increased level
of confidence in democratic reforms.
• More efforts are required to achieve a mentality shift and build a strong civic participation
culture.
• Enhanced education and awareness efforts are necessary to further promote a balanced and
multisource information to citizens, which is an important condition for fostering a healthy
democratic process.

Contact
Name: Alina Russu
Organisation: Chairperson of the Central Election Commission of the Republic of Moldova
E-Mail: alina.russu@cec.md
SDG 16: Eliminating discrimination in the security sector through women’s participation and leadership

Summary
Women in the armed forces and veterans in Ukraine have faced discrimination and exclusion from decision-making. In response, since 2015, women veterans, academics and activists have worked together to increase the availability of data on discrimination and advocate for greater women’s participation and access to services in the security sector. This case study demonstrates how the "Institute of Gender Programmes" through the Invisible Battalion advocacy campaign has given voice to women in the security sector and contributed to the repealing of discriminatory legal provisions and practices. It is a vivid example of how cooperation between state officials, MPs, UN Women and a women veterans’ collective (NGO) in support of women’s participation can contribute to progress on SDG 16, as well as SDG 5 and SDG 10.

Situation
Women have played an active role in the security and defence sectors since the beginning of the conflict in the eastern part of Ukraine. According to 2018 official data, women represent 9.8% of active duty military personnel in the Armed forces and make up 3.5% of war veterans. Until 2016, little research and data was available on the needs, challenges and experiences of women serving in the armed forces and demobilized women. Women veterans remained “invisible” in Ukrainian society after their demobilization, often deprived of their full veteran’s rights and entitlements. Re-integration policies or programmes specifically for women ex-combatants did not exist. Women did not have full and effective opportunities for leadership in decision making structures in the security sector, due to remaining discriminatory policies and practices.

Ukraine since 2016 has nevertheless committed to significantly improving the condition of women in the security forces. It passed its first National Action Plan on the implementation of UN Security Council 1325 in 2016, which was revised in September 2008 following a mid-term evaluation supported by UN Women. Within the framework of the Ukraine-NATO partnership, the Ministry of Defence included a new partnership goal on the gender perspective (Goal G 0013). Ukraine is strongly supportive of the “leave no one behind principle” and has developed national development SDG indicators and targets including for SDGs 5, 10 and 16 (2017 National Baseline Report).

Strategy
UN Women partnered as of 2015 with a collective of women veterans to increase the availability of data, information and awareness of women in the security sector. The collective, later registered as “Institute of Gender Programmes” carried out the 2016 study “Invisible Battalion: women’s participation in ATO operations.” It demonstrated existing forms of discrimination including how women were placed in so called “feminine” positions (as medics, accountants, working in logistics and
communications) while serving in combat roles. While their full participation in security structures was invisible, women’s access to services, remuneration and promotions was negatively affected. They encountered gender discrimination and biased attitudes from their superiors and were isolated from decision making in the army.

Women-veterans used the findings of the “Invisible Battalion” research to develop a 2016-2017 strategy to achieve gender equality in the armed forces. They advocated for integration of their rights and priorities into national re-integration programmes and plans. The research and advocacy also informed an awareness raising campaign about demobilized women’s reintegration and rehabilitation needs. As part of the campaign, the documentaries “Invisible Battalion and “No Obvious Signs” were produced (here).

In 2018 the "Institute of Gender Programmes" carried out a second large scale study on “Women veteran’s returning to peaceful life,” with UN Women funding. It found that involvement in combat operations had difference effects on men and women, requiring different rehabilitation mechanisms and gender responsive budgeting of reintegration programmes. The report included a list of specific policy recommendations on social protection, medical care, training and education and reintegration.

Through its research and advocacy, the Institute has contributed to the government’s implementation of its 1325 NAP commitments and well as its efforts to meet its SDG 5,10,16 targets. The Institute also cooperated closely with Parliament’s Equal Opportunities Inter-factional Caucasus to ensure legislative changes that repealed discrimination against women in Ukraine’s armed forces (see below).

**Results and lessons learned**

The evidence-based advocacy of women in military and women veterans contributed to Ukraine’s SDG target 16.9 “strengthen social stability and promote peacebuilding and community security;” target 10.2 “prevent manifestations of discrimination in society;” target 5.1 “Create an environment for ending all forms of discrimination against women and girls” and target 5.4 “Ensure equal opportunities for representation at all levels of decision making in political and public life.” More specifically it led to the following:

- Legislative changes in 2016 that opened an additional 63 combat positions that were previously prohibited for women;
- Discriminatory provisions against women in the armed forces were repealed by enforcing an equal retirement age for men and women: 60 years in times of conflict and 45-60 years in peacetime (depending on rank). Restrictions that previously applied to servicewomen on duty travel and during military training were repealed, and men and women were provided equal opportunities/responsibilities in fulfilling their military service contracts. These changes were part of Law 2523 “On amendments to certain laws of Ukraine concerning the provision of equal rights and opportunities for women and men throughout their service in the Ukrainian Armed Forces and other military formations” adopted in September 2018. This landmark achievement will benefit approximately 25,000 women currently in the military, as well as incumbents, by guaranteeing the opportunity to advance their military careers and obtain higher ranks.
- Establishment of the women’s veteran movement and increased security and defense sector authorities’ willingness to recognize the issues of sexual misconduct against women in military, and
the need for reintegration programmes for demobilized female combatants etc. Women veterans now have increased access to decision-making and can more effectively advocate for inclusion of their needs into national programs.

Contact
Name: Svitlana Zakrynytska
Organisation: UN Women Ukraine Country Office
E-Mail: svitlana.zakrynytska@unwomen.org
Summary
The Youth Score Card aims to estimate the situation of young people at local level, to reveal the inequalities and provide a solid evidence for development and implementing of youth policies. The Youth Score Card also represent a monitoring tool for the implementation of SDGs at local level.

Situation
The successful integration of young people in socio-economic processes is a prerequisite for any country’s sustainable development. Young people from Republic of Moldova (14-35 years old) represent more than 1/3 of the total population. The situation of the youth differ quite significantly from one region to another in a country, and the specific needs for youth may differ too. Many times, the national indicators tend to hinder the inequalities between different regions and different groups. The Youth Score Card comes to close the gap about data for youth at the local level.

Strategy
The Youth Score Card was developed under the leadership of the Ministry of Education, Culture and Research to respond to the need to address data gap at local level and reveal inequalities in youth development. The Youth Score Card represents a composite indices that integrate youth development indicators into one single figure that guide local youth policies. The Youth Score Card is based on 6 key areas (i) education; (ii) participation in decision-making process; (iii) employment; (iv) risk situations; (v) health and (vi) social inclusion. For each key area separate indicators were selected based on criteria such as relevance, availability, publication periodicity, etc. Priority was given to the indicators for the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) from the 2030 Agenda (2 indicators on education and 4 on health). The Youth Score Card produces a ranking of all administrative units from Moldova in terms of youth development and provides evidences for policy makers to address specific needs of young people at local level. The Youth Score Card will be updated every two years to monitor the progress and to adjust youth policies at local level.

The Youth Score Card is available on www.scorecard.md and it includes an interactive map of Moldova and its administrative units. This interactive website provides options to compare different indicators and different regions of the country among them.

Results and lessons learned
Based on the Youth Score Card we obtained: (i) Organised database of indicators related to young people’ development, (ii) The comparison of youth development different regions of Moldova, and (iii) Key areas for young people that need separate attention from the national and local authorities.

The development of Youth Score Card was challenging because of lack of administrative data for some specific indicators at the local level. The youth score card is a good advocacy tool for evidence based youth policies and it also support participation of young people in local and national policy agenda.
We truly believe that the experience of developing the Youth Score Card can be replicated at the local level by any country that sees the investment in young people as a premise for its sustainable development.

Contact
Name: Valeriu Drăgălin
Organisation: National Youth Council of Moldova
E-Mail: valeriu.dragalin@cntm.md / dragalinvaleri@gmail.com
SDG 16: Public participation in the EIA procedure in Transboundary Context in Serbia

**Summary**
The subject of the EIA procedure in Transboundary Context is the planned project envisages the construction of the new block B3 350 MW power plant at the existing location of TPP KOSTOLAC, where Kostolac A (100 + 210 MW) and Kostolac B (2x350MW) thermal power plants are already situated. Kostolac B3 is situated on the right bank of the Danube (within 5 km) - about 100 km downstream from Belgrade. The plant will be built in accordance with BAT and the applicable EU Directives.
The Administrative Court rendered the decision 24.06.2016, which contested the legality of the adopted decision due to the non-implementation of the Espoo procedure and incomplete explanation of the decision.
Procedure had to start from the beginning.
Public participation in this process played a key role as the Administrative Court made a decision to repeat the complete procedure.

**Situation**
In the period from October to December 2013, the competent authority, carried out the procedure of decision-making on Environmental Impact Assessment by:
- adopting a decision on determining the scope and content (17/05/2013). In this stage there was no public participation and the documentation was not available on website of the Ministry.
- adopting a decision on the approval of the Environmental Impact Assessment Study (30/12/2013)
The Republic of Serbia, which ratified the Espoo Convention, did not apply the provisions of this Convention to the project concerned.
After reviewing the documentation and announcing the approval decisions, an NGO filed a complaint with the Administrative Court against the decision that has been rendered, which is based on a claim of an incomplete procedure and failure to comply with provisions of the Espoo Convention Between 2014-2016, the Ministry was obliged to inform the Implementation Committee in Geneva about the following steps the Republic Serbia would take regarding the realization of this project.
The Citizens Association of the Center for Ecology and Sustainable Development of NGO (CEKOR) initiated proceedings before the Administrative Court of Serbia, Nemanjina Street No. 9. Belgrade – the appeal was registered under number III-U6832/14 of 6 May 2014, and the Ministry of Agriculture and Environmental Protection (formerly the Ministry of Energy, Development and Environmental Protection, Nemanjina No. 22-26, 11000 Belgrade) is in the capacity of the defendant.
Public Company Electric Power Plant of Serbia – Company TE KO Kostolac, Nikole Tesle Street No.5-7. 12208 Kostolac (Document No. 3301 dated 29 October 2014) submitted a reply to the appeal in the capacity of a stakeholder.
The Court decision was rendered on 24 June 2016, three years after the legal process started.
Strategy
Public Company Electric Power Industry of Serbia initiated a new procedure for the development of the Study on the assessment of the Environmental Impact of the Project for the construction of new Block B3 at Thermal Power Plant (TPP) Kostolac B, on cadastral parcel 303, Cadastre Municipality (CM) Kostolac-Selo, on the territory of the city of Požarevac.

In accordance with Article 12 of the Law on the Environmental Impact Assessment (“Official Gazette of the Republic of Serbia”, Nos. 135/04, 36/09), the Ministry of Agriculture and Environmental Protection received a Request for determining the scope and content of the Study on the assessment of the environmental impact of the Project for the construction of new Block B3 at TPP Kostolac B, on cadastral parcel 303, CM Kostolac-Selo, on the territory of the city of Požarevac on 14 April 2016. In accordance with Art. 3 of the ESPOO Convention, we sent the Notification to an affected Party-Romania of a proposed activity as required by article 3 and by Decision I/4 of the Espoo Convention on 30 June 2016. Romania decides to participate in the procedure.

On 13 February 2017 was submitted a Request for the approval of the EIA Study. A public hearing and a presentation of EIA Study were held on 9 March 2017 in Pozarevac. Representatives of the local government, NGOs and interested public were present, who asked questions and received explanations regarding the project. All remarks were submitted to the competent authority in writing.

In accordance with the Environmental Impact Assessment Law, a Technical Commission for the Review of the Study was formed, comprised of national experts. The Commission held three meetings where remarks and comments by NGOs and the interested public, as well as individual remarks by the commission members, were considered. The project owner was asked to amend and update the Study accordingly.

The Updated Study, together with official remarks, was delivered to the NGO CEKOR and to the interested public who were an interested party in the proceedings.

At the meeting of the Technical Commission, remarks sent by the Ministry of Environment of Romania on 18 May 2017 were also discussed as well as the answers provided by the project owner. Accordingly, it was agreed to update the answers for some points.

At the third meeting held on 15 June 2017, the Commission members noted that the Study was amended and updated in accordance with all remarks and comments and that it could be accepted. The procedure for assessing the Study, according to national legislation, was thereby completed. It was also concluded that the Remarks of the Ministry of Environment of Romania were answered and the Study was amended in accordance with the latter.

The final version of the Study, accepted by the Technical Commission, was delivered to the NGO CEKOR as a party to the proceedings and to Romanian side to final review.

Results and lessons learned
Serbia notified Romania in June 2016, and Romania entered the cross-border impact assessment procedure for this Project under the Espoo Convention.

• In February 2017, Serbia made available to Romania the environmental impact study for this Project.
• The Ministry of the Environment (MM) published on its website the first version of the EIA Report for Public Consultation, and points of view were required to the Romanian authorities. Comments were received from NGOs Greenpeace and Bankwatch.
• Between May-July 2017, a correspondence exchange was held between Romania and Serbia on the comments made by the interested public in Romania and Serbia’s responses to these comments.
• In July 2017, Serbia submitted the final version of the EIA Report, which was translated into Romanian and published by MM on its own website on 08.08.2017, along with the press release and the announcement of a public debate and a consultation meeting between the Romanian and Serbian authorities on 31.08.2017, town ORAVIȚĂ, Caraș Severin County
• The Environmental Protection Agency Caraș Severin released the EIA Report on 09.08.2017 and informed all municipalities in the area of influence of the project in order to make known among the population, data on the Project and its possible environmental effects.
• All statements and opinions have been noted in the Minute, which was approved by both parties, through the competent bodies in the field of environmental protection.
• The Minute was prepared and signed in three original copies in English at Oravița, on 31st of August 2017.
• Decision on the approval of the Environmental Impact Assessment Study was made on 28 September 2017 and submitted to the Romanian side in English.
• Romanian and Serbian parties have agreed on the implementation of post-project analysis in accordance with Article 7 of the ESPOO Convention (The obligation of the project developer is to provide for the implementation of the post-project analysis to Romania through monitoring activities-air and water monitoring).
• ESPOO procedure was completed.

Contact
Name:Sabina Ivanovic
Organization: Ministry of Environmental Protection
E-Mail:sabina.ivanovic@ekologija.gov.rs
SDG 16: Conserving a Cave Ecosystem within a mining environment

Summary
A cave ecosystem was newly discovered in an active limestone quarry and threatened by further extraction. The local caving society assessed the cave and became active in requesting the conservation of this unique environment. An agreement was reached and the cave is now protected. A small part is open to public as show cave for karst education. A karst nature trail and a museum are developed and local ecotourism established. The example shows how to balance the interests of the mining industry and the protection of the environment. The project was supported by the German Speleological Federation (VdHK).

Situation
In 1993 the Speleological Association Hesse discovered an access at an active limestone quarry to an extensive cave system. The so called “Herbstlabyrinth” cave with its 12.5 km of total length is one of the largest cave systems in Germany. The high scientific value results in particular from an untouched deposit of fossil cave bear bones, unknown microbes, cave animals as well as a high variance of speleothems. The fact that the cave was able to develop undisturbed over millions of years is an important factor in the assessment of historical climatic events. A permanent protection of the cave was required and a solution for all participants had to be achieved.

Strategy
A solution has to be found by all participants like institutions, offices, researchers, industries and owners. The only possibility was barter or a mass balance of limestone elsewhere. The municipality of Breitscheid and the Kalkwerk Medenbach agreed to refrain from mining in the area of the cave system. At the same time, the approved mining area was extended. In 2002 once again the contract had to be amended due to newly discovered cave passages. Due to the realistic assessment that protection was not economically justifiable and a renewed exchange of land was difficult, attempts were made to find a new compromise. The idea was to deepen the open pit with more soles. This required a change to the permit, which in turn needed to be hydrologically assessed. To reach this goal, the speleologists supported the mining industry with their karst expertise.

Results and lessons learned
The valuable ecosystem cave could be protected by reaching an agreement between the cave society, local government and mining industry. The solution was a mass balance of limestone at areas where no caves are. The learning is that it needs an open constructive discussion and balance of interests between all stake holders. It is important to overcome mutual reservations. The consensus was that all participants supported the idea of ecotourism development. Germany’s latest show cave was opened. A karst nature trail and a new museum were developed and ecotourism established. Karst education is given to school classes and visitors. The Breitscheid Cooperation shows that nature conservation and the interests of the industry need not contradicting each other. It has a nationwide model character and is applicable for similar situations.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Contact</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Name:</strong> Oliver Heil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Organisation:</strong> German Speleological Federation (VdHK)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>E-Mail:</strong> <a href="mailto:vorsitz@vdhk.de">vorsitz@vdhk.de</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SDG 16: Quashing water management law in representation of the public, the scientific sector and future generations

Summary
This case study offers a good example of how a National Human Rights Institution (NHRI) can offer a useful channel for public participation (private citizens, NGOs and scientific expert community) in a complex matter to enable informed decisions related to the environment and public health. A proposed legislation would have allowed drilling water wells without any permitting requirement, aggravating the situation of the already drained groundwater resources in Hungary. Building on citizen complaints and through discussions with the professional and scientific community and NGOs, using the powers allowed by its constitutional mandate, the NHRI effectively advocated for invalidating the proposed legislation.

Situation
The mandate of the Ombudsman for Future Generations (OFG) within the NHRI is anchored in the Constitution to safeguard a) the human right to a healthy environment and b) the common heritage of mankind including natural resources for future generations. Some of its powers include:

- investigations into citizen complaints or launching ex officio investigations and concluding with recommendations to decision makers;
- submitting legislative proposals and commenting on proposed new pieces of legislation;
- publicly issuing general opinions to flag important issues and raise awareness,
- proposing the Commissioner to challenge the constitutionality of an act before the Constitutional Court, and submitting amicus briefs to the Court.

The OFG regularly receives citizen complaints regarding groundwater matters and in 2017 has learnt of a draft legislation proposing to allow drilling of wells down to 80 meters without permitting or notification requirements, thereby greatly endangering groundwater resources.

Strategy
After consultation with multiple stakeholders the OFG published a general opinion detailing why the legislation would violate constitutional provisions and endanger groundwater resources and public health – the OFG has also tabled these arguments in Parliamentary Committees. The Parliament first annulled the draft but it was submitted again later after parliamentary elections and was enacted. The Head of State initiated an ex ante constitutional review of this piece of legislation before the Constitutional Court. The OFG provided an amicus brief to the Constitutional Court with arguments that were echoed in the final decision of the Court in annulling the proposed legislation.
Results and lessons learned

• **Result** was the annulment of the legislation based on arguments developed by the OFG through discussion with multiple stakeholders - the process could and has been replicated via successfully channelling views into decision making.

• **Challenges** encountered: lack of real public participation and impact assessment by the legislators and associated inability to consider long-term environmental impacts and risks.

• **Lessons learned**: even in an inherently flawed process an adequately mandated institution can act as a vehicle to channel public participatory views into decision-making. A specifically appointed spokesperson representing long-term interests of future generations can influence law-making processes.

Contact

Name: Anna Martinez-Zemplén
E-Mail: anna.martinez-zemplen@ajbh.hu
SDG 16: Safe and enabling space for public participation

Summary

Art. 3.7 of the Aarhus Convention requires Parties to promote its 3 pillars in International Forums. France has provided an interesting example when hosting in Paris the UNFCCC COP21 in 2015. Another relevant Forum is the Human Rights Council where an Aarhus Party, Norway, has tabled a resolution on the « recognizing the contribution of environmental human rights defenders to the enjoyment of human rights, environmental protection, and sustainable development ». Norway went even further by including in a bilateral agreement a stop on harassment of organizations involved in environmental protection when providing assistance to another European country.

Situation

- France: even in the terrible context of a terrorist attack on Paris in 2015, France kept open the possibility for civil society to participate actively in COP21, inside and outside of the UN zones.
- Norway plays an active role in the protection of human rights defenders at the international level and continuously resists to the pressures to water down provisions protecting them or preventing violation of State obligations in this matter. It also aligns its position in bilateral relations.

Strategy

- France counted on the active support of civil society in achieving a positive outcome of COP21 and kept open the conference spaces open to participation, even after terrible terrorist attacks. It promoted in-depth consultations with the public on the substance of the documents and on formats of public participation in advance of the COP. As a result, the space for discussion open to the general public was next to the UN reserved COP21 area, making it possible for all delegates to move easily and quickly from one area to the other.
- Norway has kept a constant open dialogue with civil society organizations and defenders under threat on trends affecting environmental defenders. This has helped to provide precise examples to motivate the provisions included in its draft resolution to the HRC.

Results and lessons learned

- The example of France as a host of an international event is replicable by all other UNFCCC COP Presidencies. It will be even particularly needed as UNFCCC enters now a period focusing on reporting mechanism in order to evaluate progress in combating climate change and fixing ambition to avoid severe and irreversible damages.
- The Norwegian engagement at the international and national levels produces effective outcomes that have positive impacts enabling people to act for the Planet.
Contact
Name: Yves Lador
Organisation: Earthjustice
E-Mail: y.lador@bluewin.ch
SDG 16: Fostering Effective and Inclusive Governance for Sustainable Development and Protecting the Planet

Summary
It was a challenge for Ukraine to establish a transparent environmental impact assessment mechanism. Ukrainian EIA system must be in compliance with obligations under the international agreements and also achieve a list of goals on national level such as:

- the EIA system should minimize corruption risks;
- to ensure public participation in decision-making process;
- to ensure access to information;
- to create transparency mechanism for implementing the rights to access information and participation.

For these purposes, the new Ukrainian law On EIA established the obligation of the authority to create a public registry of EIA [http://eia.menr.gov.ua/](http://eia.menr.gov.ua/)

Situation
Before the establishing EIA procedure in Ukraine, we had a system of state ecological expertise. System of expertise had many gabs, among them:

- all information was closed, access to project documentation was possible only for request;
- information was not systematized, which complicated access to it and, as a result, created obstacles for public participation in decision making process;
- there was no public control over the quality of project documentation;
- decisions had been made behind the «closed doors»

Strategy
The EIA Registry started to work at December 2017, when Law On EIA took into force. Since that time:

- More than 2000 EIA procedures carry out;
- Registry provides the procedure online, without direct contact between the developer and the authority;
- the Registry contains all the information created in the EIA procedure (from notification to EIA conclusion);
- the dates of public hearings and terms of public consultations also published in Registry;
- all information included to the Registry is free;

Click or tap here to enter text.
Results and lessons learned

✓ The introduction of electronic systems significantly affects for the improvement of access to environmental information;
✓ EIA Registry allowed making the work of public authorities and the local self-governance authority’s transparency and open;
✓ EIA Registry also contributed to the improvement of the mechanisms for the implementation public rights under the Aarhus convention

Contact
Name: Krevska Olga
Organisation: Ministry of Ecology and Natural Resources of Ukraine
E-Mail: krevskaolga@gmail.com
SDG 16: Strengthening the capacity of judges in Kazakhstan to promote access to justice and rule of law in environmental matters

Summary
This case study focuses on the approaches for strengthening the capacity of judges in Kazakhstan to promote access to justice and rule of law in environmental matters. In practical terms, this work results in the quality of handling environmental cases. For example, a situation around the Kok-Zhailyau ski resort can be considered. On 4 November 2018, public hearings were held in Almaty, Kazakhstan, on the construction project of the ski resort. As recorded on the video footage and in media articles, the developer claimed that the “zero option”, i.e. cancelling the project, to date was not considered by the city authorities. Following on this information, environmental nongovernmental organization “Green Salvation” submitted a request to the competent public authority for information on the availability of “zero option”. On 26 November 2018, the competent public authority answered the request claiming that the term “zero option” came about through appeals of this non-governmental organization and there was no precise interpretation of this term. The non-governmental organization challenged such response in court as inadequately answered. The Economic Court recognized the response by the public authority concerned to be inadequate with the requirements of the Aarhus Convention and the Kazakh legislation on freedom of information and ordered the competent public authority to provide the applicant with the reliable information.

Situation
The problems of environmental protection and compliance with environmental law are important for Kazakhstan. The Supreme Court monitors and controls the quality and quantity of environmental cases. In all areas there are specialized economic courts that deal with environmental disputes between government agencies and legal entities. District court considers such disputes if one of the parties of the dispute is an individual. Administrative offenses are dealt with, in specialized administrative courts. Criminal cases in the field of environmental law are considered by specially trained judges. Appeals against judicial acts of courts of first instance are considered by special judges of regional courts.

The quality of handling environmental cases given their legal and technical complexity remains in a particular focus. For example, a situation around the Kok-Zhailyau ski resort can be considered. On 4 November 2018, public hearings were held in Almaty, Kazakhstan, on the construction project of the ski resort. As recorded on the video footage and in media articles, the developer claimed that the “zero option”, i.e. cancelling the project, to date was not considered by the city authorities. Following on this information, environmental non-governmental organization “Green Salvation” submitted a request to the competent public authority for information on the availability of “zero option”. On 26 November 2018, the competent public authority answered the request claiming that the term “zero option” came about through appeals of this non-governmental organization and there was no precise interpretation of this term. The non-governmental organization challenged such response in court as
inadequately answered. The Economic Court recognized the response by the public authority concerned to be inadequate with the requirements of the Aarhus Convention and the Kazakh legislation on freedom of information and ordered the competent public authority to provide the applicant with the reliable information.

**Strategy**

To help strengthening expert capacity of judges, the following forms of capacity building on the application of environmental legislation were introduced: (a) Training programs for graduate students in the Institute of Justice; (b) Training programs for judges in the training courses; (c) Training of judges in the Supreme Court; (d) Training of judges in the training centers of the regional courts; (e) Coaching and mentoring and (f) International judicial cooperation.

The special arrangements were adopted to collect the necessary statistics with regard to environmental cases. This allows to inform environmental decision-making and law-making with the outcomes of law enforcement and judicial practice.

To improve efficiency of the administration of justice, a number of e-justice initiatives were introduced. Wholly audio, - and video recording of all processes was introduced and conducted, in the courts there are observation rooms, where everyone can track controversies. An electronic document management system was installed. When the application arrives to the court, the applicant receives an SMS-message with the notification of his/her registration. For five days, the judge shall decide on the acceptance or rejection of the application to the court proceedings, on this decision the plaintiff shall also be notified via SMS. Further indicated that the application is accepted, it is in proceeding of the judge, as well as a notice of the time, place and date of the meetings shall be sent. In practice, the courts also use a «hybrid mail»: summons or judicial act shall be forwarded by email to the recipient’s post office, where they are printed out and delivered in a single day.

**Results and lessons learned**

**Results:**

• Improved quality of handling environmental cases as exemplified by the judgment in the case on access to information related to the construction of the Kok-Zhailyau ski resort;

**Challenges:**

• Lack of understanding among public authorities on benefits of transparency and inclusive participation in decision-making for achieving sustainable development; • Limited capacity of courts to handle environmental cases effectively that can be legally and technically complex especially given that a judge handles more than 100 cases monthly with a sharp increase of cases in big cities while environmental disputes account for only 5% of the total number of cases; • Absence of specialized courts dealing exclusively with environmental matters; • Necessity to further develop environmental legislation to remove existing gaps and contradictions that pose difficulties in resolving environmental cases; • Need to continuous capacity-building programmes for judges on ongoing basis;

**Lessons learned:**

• Independent judiciary and judicial process is vital for the implementation, development and enforcement of environmental law and the protection of public’s rights and interests relating to the
Being a Party to the Aarhus Convention had a positive effect in Kazakhstan on public access to environmental information, public participation in decision-making affecting the environment and access to justice and its implementation is continuously advancing; Importance of monitoring the effectiveness of access to justice in environmental matters supported by quantitative data and taking account of the outcomes of court practice and law enforcement in the environmental decision-making and the development of legislation; Significant added value of capacity-building activities for judiciary with regard to national and international environmental law and in particular the Aarhus Convention; Promoting effective administration of justice through access to global scientific and analytical legal publications, comparative legal analysis, peer-learning and long-term education in different courts promoting environmental adjudication; Improving efficiency of administration of justice through e-justice initiative designed in consultation of all relevant stakeholders.

Contact
Name: Justice Beibut Shermukhametov
Organisation: Supreme Court of Kazakhstan