

ANNEX III (CEP/AC.13/2005/9. Rev. 1 March 2006)  
DRAFT OUTLINE OF INDICATORS

Subject for evaluation: objectives of the Strategy <sup>1</sup>	Indicators	Underlying questions	Indicator Type	Means & Source of Verification	Status of indicator	Timeframe for completion <sup>2</sup>
<i>Objective 1 Ensure that policy, regulatory and operational frameworks support the promotion of ESD</i>						
	1.1 Organisation of the institutional arrangements <sup>3</sup> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Not started (0 yes)</li> <li>• In progress (1-2 Yes)</li> <li>• Developing (3-5 Yes)</li> <li>• Completed (6 Yes)</li> </ul>				Required	
		(a) Is the Strategy available in your national <sup>4</sup> language(s): Yes/No;	Qualitative; "Checklist"	Government reports		Phase I
		(b) Do you have a coordinating body for implementation of the Strategy? Yes/No. Pls. describe its mandate and	Qualitative; "Checklist"	Government reports		Phase I

<sup>1</sup> Subjects for evaluation in accordance with the UNECE Strategy for Education for Sustainable Development (CEP/AC.13/2005/3/Rev.1)

<sup>2</sup> [Indication of when an indicator has to be made available first time.](#)

<sup>3</sup> There will be further work on the grouping of several underlying questions in order to develop an aggregated indicator. This indicator serves as an example of this exercise.

<sup>4</sup> For countries with a federal governmental structure, all references to "national" apply to "State", as appropriate [In this context, data at national level means an aggregated data received from sub-state entities.](#)

		coordinating mechanism;				
		(c) Do stakeholders participate in the coordinating structure? Yes/No;	Qualitative; "Checklist"	Government reports		Phase I
		(d) Does a formal structure for interdepartmental <sup>5</sup> co-operation relevant to ESD exist in your government? Yes/No;	Qualitative; "Checklist"	Government reports		Phase I
		(e) Does a multi-stakeholder cooperation on ESD exist in your government Yes/No (please describe) <sup>6</sup> ;	Qualitative; "Checklist"	Government reports		Phase I
		(f) Have you appointed a national focal point? Yes/No.	Qualitative; "Checklist"	Government reports		Phase I
	1.2 Implementation of the policy, regulatory and operational frameworks to support the Strategy.				Required	
		(a) Do you have a national Strategy on SD? Yes/No;	Qualitative; "Checklist"	Government reports		Phase I
		(b) If yes, is ESD a part of this Strategy?	Qualitative; "Checklist"	Government reports		Phase I
		(c) If not, is ESD addressed in any other national policy document? Yes/No. Explain how it is included;	Qualitative; "Checklist"	Government reports		Phase I

<sup>5</sup> Between State bodies.

<sup>6</sup> For explanation see paragraph 46 of the Strategy.

		(d) Do you have any national policy documents <i>specifically dedicated</i> to ESD? Yes/No;	Qualitative; "Checklist"	Government reports		Phase I
		(e) Do you have a national plan for implementation of the Strategy for ESD? Yes/No;	Qualitative; "Checklist"/ "Input"	Government reports		Phase I
		(f) Are informal and non-formal learning <sup>7</sup> addressed in your national implementation plan on ESD? Yes/No;	Qualitative; "Checklist"/ "Input"	Government reports		Phase I
		(g) Are there any operational frameworks for non-formal education at national/local level that address ESD? Yes /No. Please specify;	Qualitative; "Checklist"/ "Input"	Government reports		Phase I
		(h) Is there a 'public awareness component in relevant national documents that address ESD? Yes/No;	Qualitative; "Checklist" / "Input"	Government reports		Phase I
		(i) Are public budget and economic incentives to support ESD available? Yes/No. Please describe and, if feasible, provide figures/ratio;	Qualitative; "Input"	Government reports		Phase I
		<a href="#">To which extent ESD supports policy, regulatory and operational frameworks to achieve SD?</a>				

<sup>7</sup> [For explanation, see Explanatory notes to the UNECE Strategy For Education for Sustainable Development \(CEP/AC.13/2004/8/Add.2\)](#)

		<u>Describe the synergies at the national level between UNECE ESD process, the UNESCO process of the UN Decade on ESD, and other national and international policy processes for SD</u>				
	1.3 To what extent is ESD addressed in relevant national legislation <i>at all levels of formal education, as understood by your education system in accordance with ISCED</i> <sup>8</sup>	a) Pre-primary b) Primary c) Secondary d) Higher/ Tertiary e) Teacher education Specify for each level: Not at all In progress Specified	Qualitative; "Input"	Reports of relevant Ministries	Required	Phase I
	1.4 To what extent is ESD included in your national curricula and/or national standards/ ordinances/ requirements at all levels of formal education, as understood by your education system in accordance with ISCED?	a) Pre-primary b) Primary c) Secondary d) Higher/Tertiary e) Teacher education Specify for each level: Not at all In progress Specified	Qualitative; "Input"	Reports of relevant Ministries	Required	Phase I
<b>Objective 2. Promote SD through formal, non-formal and informal</b>	<b>Aggregated indicators to be developed on the basis of these questions ( for</b>					

<sup>8</sup> International Standard Classification of Education (ISCED), UNESCO, 1997

<i>learning</i>	<i>example, see objective 1)</i>					
	2.1 Which key themes of SD <sup>9</sup> are addressed explicitly in the curriculum <sup>10</sup> at various levels of formal education. Please specify for each level in accordance with ISCED		Qualitative; "Input"	Education institutions and Ministries responsible for Education	Required	Phase <b>I II</b>
	2.2 In what subjects are SD themes integrated? Please specify for different levels of <i>school</i> system in accordance with ISCED.	Fields of study: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Social sciences</li> <li>• Natural sciences</li> <li>• Technical sciences</li> <li>• Humanities</li> <li>• Art</li> <li>• Other</li> </ul>	Qualitative; "Input"	Educational institutions and Ministries responsible for Education	Required	Phase <b>I II</b>
	2.3 Is ESD: (a) addressed as a cross-curriculum approach? Please specify for different levels of school system; (b) delivered through the provision of specific subject programmes and courses? Pls. specify for different levels of school system in accordance	a) Pre-primary b) Primary c) Secondary d) Higher/Tertiary e) Teacher education  Specify for each level: Not at all      In progress Specified	Qualitative; "Input"	Educational institutions and Ministries responsible for Education	Required	Phase <b>I II</b>

<sup>9</sup> For explanation see paragraph 15 of the Strategy.

<sup>10</sup> At State level, where relevant

	with ISCED.					
	2.4 Availability of post-graduate courses: a) on ESD <sup>11</sup> : <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• for MSc (Yes/No)</li> <li>• for PhD (Yes/No)</li> </ul> b) related to ESD <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• for MSc (Yes/No)</li> <li>• for PhD (Yes/No)</li> </ul> Pls. specify.		Qualitative; "Input"	Educational institutions and Ministries responsible for Education	Required	Phase I
	2.5 Are SD themes included in the study programmes of IHE <sup>12</sup> ? Yes/No.		Qualitative; "Input"	Educational institutions, Ministries responsible for Education	Required	Phase II
	2.6 Are SD themes addressed in formal vocational and continuing education? Yes/No; Pls. describe how.		Qualitative; "Input"	Educational institutions and Ministries responsible for Education	Proposed	Phase II

<sup>11</sup> ESD is addressed by substance and/or by approach

<sup>12</sup> Institutions of higher education

	2.7 Are there any incentives that support "a whole institution approach to SD/ESD" <sup>13</sup> ? Yes/No.	a) Ratio of educational institutions adopting a "whole institution approach" to SD/ESD b) What is the proportion of educational institutions that have received or applied to receive recognition or a reward for SD?	Quantitative; "Input" and "Output"	Educational institutions, funding agencies	Proposed	Phase II
	2.8 (a) Do you have quality assessment systems for education <sup>14</sup> ? Yes/No; b) Does it address ESD? Yes/No; pls. describe for various levels of your education system in accordance with ISCED.		Qualitative; "Input"	Educational institutions or agencies and relevant Ministries	Required	Phase II
	2.9 a) In which way are key competences (e.g. 'critical thinking', 'systemic thinking', "citizenship") addressed in: -educators' training; -quality assessment system(s); -student-oriented initiatives;		Qualitative; "Output"	Educational institutions and relevant Ministries; Surveys among staff of educational institutions, parents, pupils and students	Proposed	Phase III

<sup>13</sup> "a whole institution approach" means that all aspects of an institution's internal operations and external relationships are reviewed and revised in light of SD principles. Within such an approach each institution would decide upon its own actions addressing the three overlapping spheres of Campus (management operations); Curriculum; and Community (external relationships)

<sup>14</sup> The issue of a quality assessment system to be further discussed

	-other; at various levels of your education system (see ISCED)?					
	2.10 In which way are methodologies, required for ESD, addressed at various levels of your education system in accordance with ISCED (e.g. ‘participatory approach’; links to local, regional and global problems; integrative approach to environmental, economic and social issues; orientation to understanding, preventing and solving problems).		Qualitative; ”Output”	Educational institutions and relevant Ministries; Surveys among staff of educational institutions, relevant ministries, parents, pupils and students	Proposed	Phase III
	2.11 a) Are NGOs involved in ESD-related informal and non-formal education? Yes/No; b) Pls. provide an indication of the volume of these activities (e.g. based on number of relevant NGOs, programmes, financial expenditures); c) What are the incentives		Quantitative& Qualitative ; ”Input”/ ”Output”	NGO and donor organizations, relevant authorities	Required	Phase II

	that support ESD-related activities by NGOs?					
	2.12 (a) Which other stakeholders (e.g. trade unions, chamber of commerce, professional associations, local authorities) are involved in ESD-related learning? (b) Pls. provide indication of volume of learning activities (e.g. programmes and courses) offered by the trade unions, professional associations, civil servant training bodies, etc.		Qualitative and Quantitative; "Input"/ "Output"	Reports by the trade unions and professional associations, relevant Ministries	Required	Phase II
	2.13 Are there any community-based participatory projects with an ESD aspect supported by the public authorities (e.g. local Agenda 21)? Yes/No. If feasible, pls. provide indication of volume (e.g. communities involved, people involved).		Quantitative; "Output"	Reports by public authorities	Required	Phase II
	2.14 Pls. describe how informal and public awareness raising activities address SD		Quantitative; "Input" /"Output"	Media, sociological Centers reports,	Proposed	Phase II-III

	issues (e.g in press articles, TV and radio programs promoting environmentally friendly goods and services, sustainable lifestyles, public lectures). If feasible, provide indication of volume.			Ministries (press Case study, research (local Agenda 21)-officers)		
	2.15 Provide information on outcomes of social learning <sup>15</sup> programmes conducted under your implementation plan on ESD.		Qualitative; "Outcome"	Educational institutions, relevant Ministries, surveys, case studies	Proposed	Phase III
<b>Objective 3. Equip educators with the competence to include SD in their teaching</b>	<b>Aggregated indicators to be developed on the basis of these questions (for example, see objective 1)</b>					
	3.1 Is ESD <sup>16</sup> part of initial Teacher Education? Yes/No		Qualitative; "Input"	Educational institutions, Ministry of Education	Required	Phase II-III
	3.2 Is ESD <sup>17</sup> part of in-service training? Yes/No	(a) Ratio of teachers who received training on ESD/SD issues to total number of teachers who receive in-service teacher training, annually (training on	Quantitative and Qualitative; "Output" (a) and "Input" (b-d)	Educational institutions, Ministry of Education	Required	Phase I-II-III

<sup>15</sup>For definition of social learning, see addendum 2 of the Strategy (CEP/AC.13/2004/8/Add.2)

<sup>16</sup> [ESD is addressed by substance and/or by approach](#)

		<p>the content and methodology: e.g. innovative teaching methodologies and technologies, such as interactive lessons, life-cycle analyses and the use of ICT tools). Pls. indicate for various levels of your education system in accordance with ISCED;</p> <p>b) Do you have ESD-related courses for teachers/lectures in IHE? Yes/No;</p> <p>c) Do you have ESD-related courses for educators of non-formal education? Yes/No;</p> <p>d) Do you have ESD-related training for school leadership (e.g. heads and principles) Yes/No.</p>				
	<p>3.3 Are networks / platforms of educators who are interested in ESD available? Yes/No. What part of them is supported by government? Pls. Describe.</p>		<p>Qualitative; "Output"</p>	<p>Educational institutions, relevant Ministries</p>	<p>Proposed</p>	<p>Phase II</p>
	<p>3.4 Are quality criteria for evaluating teacher performance in relation to ESD defined in your</p>		<p>Qualitative; "Input"</p>	<p>Educational institutions, Ministry of Education;</p>	<p>Proposed</p>	<p>Phase III</p>

<sup>17</sup> [see footnote 14](#)

	country? Yes/No.			NGO's; research institutions; inspector reports		
	3.5 Is ESD a part of the formal system of teacher performance criteria? Yes/ No.		Qualitative; "Output"	Educational institutions, Ministry of Education; self evaluation; inspector reports	Proposed	Phase III
<b>Objective 4. Ensure that adequate tools and materials for ESD are accessible</b>	<b>Aggregated indicators to be developed on the basis of these questions (for example, see objective 1)</b>					
	4.1 Existence of State strategy/ mechanisms for encouragement of development, production and dissemination of ESD materials? Yes/No. Provide an indication of public authority money invested into this activity (annually, amount in Euros).		Qualitative and Quantitative; "Input"	Relevant Ministries	Required	Phase II
	4.2 Do you have quality criteria for ESD-related teaching materials? Yes/No.		Qualitative; "Output"	Educational institutions, Ministry of Education	Required	Phase II

	Are they used in: a) State approval system; b) guidelines for teaching materials; c) selection of materials by schools.					
	4.3 The same questions as in 4.2, but related to non-formal education.		Qualitative; “Output”	Relevant Ministries, NGOs; Research Institutions	Proposed	Phase II
	4.4 Are teaching materials, including text books, reflecting ESD principles: a) Available in relevant state language(s) at different levels of education? Yes/No. Pls. specify for each level; b) Accessible at reasonable costs Yes/No. Pls. Specify; c) Accessible through Internet (% of educational institutions for each level of education system with Internet access).		Qualitative; “Output”	Educational institutions, Ministry of Education	Required	Phase II
	4.5 The same questions as in 4.3, but related to non-formal education.		Qualitative; “Output”	Relevant Ministries, NGOs;	Proposed	Phase II

				Research Institutions		
	4.6 a) Number of websites dedicated to ESD in state/local languages: Yes/No; b) Number of these website(s) supported by public authorities; c) Availability of register of publications devoted to ESD through the(se) website(s): Yes/No; d) Availability through internet of database/register of existing ESD-related teaching materials: Yes/No.		Quantitative and Qualitative; "Output"	Educational institutions, Ministry of Education	Required	Phase II
<b>Objective 5. Promote research on and development of ESD</b>	<b>Aggregated indicators to be developed on the basis of these questions (for example, see objective 1)</b>					
	5.1 Existence of state policy/ mechanism supporting: a) Research that addresses content and methods for ESD (e.g. concepts; formation of attitudes and values; development of		Qualitative and Quantitative; "Input"	Relevant Ministries	Required	Phase III

	competences, teaching and learning; school development; implementation of ICT; means of evaluation including socio-economic impacts) Yes/No; b) Research that evaluates the outcome of the State implementation of the UNECE Strategy for ESD Yes/No; c) Indication of allocated budgets (annually, sum in Euros).					
	5.2 The same questions as in 5.1, but related to non-governmental and/or other relevant mechanisms.		Qualitative and Quantitative; "Input"	Relevant institutions and organisations	Proposed	Phase III
	5.3 Existence of state policy/ mechanism supporting SD-related research programmes conducted by interdisciplinary teams <sup>18</sup> : Yes/No. Please describe.		Qualitative; "Output"	Ministry of Education; relevant institutions and organisations	Required	Phase II
	5.4 Number of scientific publications devoted to		Quantitative; "Output"	Education and research	Required	Phase II

<sup>18</sup> For explanation see paragraph 60 of the Strategy.

	ESD and/or SD (annually).			institutions, relevant Ministries, NGO, publishers		
	5.5 Existence of public authority support for mechanisms of sharing the results of research and examples of good practices in ESD among authorities and stakeholders (e.g. conferences, summer schools, journals, periodicals, networks) Yes/No; If feasible, indicate amount of activities and budget allocated (annually, amount in Euros).		Quantitative and Qualitative; "Output"	Ministry of Education <u>Governmental agencies outside education system</u> Institutions of Higher Education, NGOs.	Required	Phase II
	5.6 Availability of scholarships supported by public authorities for post-graduate and postdoctoral research in ESD Yes/No.		Qualitative; "Output"	Ministry of Education Institutions of Higher Education	Proposed	Phase I
<b>Objective 6 Strengthen co-operation on ESD at all levels within the UNECE region</b>	<i>developed on the basis of these questions (for example, see objective 1)</i>					

	6.1 Does your public authorities co-operate in /support international <sup>19</sup> networks on ESD (associations, working groups, programmes, partnerships)? Yes/No; Indicate total number and list major ones.		Qualitative and Quantitative; "Input"/ "Output"	Reports of relevant authorities	Required	Phase II
	6.2 Do educational institutions/ organisations (formal and non-formal) in your country participate in international networks <a href="#">on/about ESD?</a> Indicate total number of institutions/organisations and list major ones.		Quantitative and Qualitative; "Output"	Reports of relevant authorities	Proposed	Phase II
	6.3 How many state bilateral and multilateral cooperation mechanisms/agreements, explicitly including an ESD component, exist? Please list the major ones.		Quantitative and Qualitative; "Output"	Reports of relevant authorities	Required	Phase II
	<a href="#">Efforts of Governments in promoting ESD in international fora outside the UNECE region</a>					

<sup>19</sup> In this context, "international" covers "global", "regional" and "sub-regional"

Describe how knowledge of indigenous peoples is conserved, used and promoted Indicators on issue of conservation, use and promotion of knowledge of indigenous people with respect to ESD are to be developed